- 1 Growth performance, feed utilisation and body composition of
- 2 advanced nursing Nile tilapia (Oreochromis niloticus) fed diets
- 3 containing Black Soldier Fly (Hermetia illucens) larvae meal

5 Emilie Devic¹, William Leschen¹, Francis Murray¹, and David C. Little¹

6 ¹Institute of Aquaculture, School of Natural Sciences, University of Stirling, UK

8

4

7

- 9 <u>Correspondence:</u>
- 10 Emilie Devic, Institute of Aquaculture, University of Stirling, Stirling, FK9 4LA, UK.
- 11 Email: e.d.devic@stir.ac.uk
- 12 Phone: +44 (0) 1786 467874; Fax: +44 (0) 1786 472133

13

14 Accepted for publication in *Aquaculture Nutrition* by Wiley-Blackwell.

15

16 **Running title**: BSF larvae meal in advanced nursing tilapia diets

17

18 **Keywords:** Insect meal, strategic, fingerlings, alternative, nutrient utilisation, feed

Abstract

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

A 32-day experiment was conducted to evaluate the effects on the performance, feed utilisation efficiency and body composition of a strategic inclusion of Black Soldier Fly larvae meal (MM) in a commercially formulated diet for advance nursing Nile tilapia (Oreochromis niloticus). Four isonitrogenous and isoenergetic diets were commercially formulated and manufactured as a control and 3 test diets with strategic inclusions of MM inclusions (0, 30, 50 and 80 g kg⁻¹) and poultry byproduct meal substituting gradually three conventional expensive feedstuffs: fish meal, fish oil and soybean meal. Fish (5.7±0.5 g fish-1) were nursed in a cage-in-lake system (Volta Lake, Ghana), under conditions similar to commercial farming practices. Control and experimental diets were fed to triplicate cages by hand to visual satiety, 6 times day⁻¹. Growth performance (final weight; weight gain and SGR); feed utilisation efficiency indices (FCR and PER) and feed intake were not significantly different (P≥0.05) between treatments. Survival was significantly different (P<0.05) but more likely explained by the stress related to frequent handling on the smaller fish. Fish whole body composition (dry matter, crude protein, lipid, ash and fibre) was unaffected by the treatment ($P \ge 0.05$), except for the fatty acid compositions which mirrored that of the diets.

Introduction

38

39 Farmed fish contribute to food security and represent a rich source of dietary animal 40 protein, micronutrients and fatty acids (FA) in low-income countries (Beveridge et al. 41 2013). In Ghana, for instance, most aquaculture production (around 80%) consists of Nile 42 tilapia (Oreochromis niloticus) (FAO 2005), but local fish farmers struggle to compete 43 with cheaper imports from China and are constrained by both availability, quality and 44 cost of pelleted fish feeds and feed ingredients (Hecht 2007; Rurangwa et al. 2015). 45 Conventional feed ingredients such as fish meal (FM), fish oil (FO) and plants protein 46 sources (oilseed plants, grain legumes, etc.), for which there is an increasing demand due 47 to the intensification of farming methods relying on complete fish feeds (Tacon & Metian 48 2008), are available in low income countries such as Ghana, consisting either of poor 49 quality local products or high-cost imported items (Gabriel et al. 2007; Obirikorang et al. 50 2015). Importance of quality ingredients and artificial feeds, even for herbivorous species 51 such as tilapia, makes perfect sense at critical stages (juveniles or broodstock) when fish 52 are maintained under intensive clear-water farming conditions and depend entirely on 53 nutritionally complete diets (Tacon 1988). Global research for the identification of cost-54 effective substitutes to conventional materials continues (El-Sayed & Tacon 1997; El-55 Sayed 2004; Karalazos 2007; Hasan *et al.* 2007; Ayoola 2010; Obirikorang *et al.* 2015). 56 Insect meals such as fly larvae or maggots meals (MM) have been identified as high 57 protein and valuable feed ingredient for livestock in general (Veldkamp et al. 2012; van 58 Huis et al. 2013; Makkar et al. 2014) and freshwater fish specifically, given their natural 59 feeding habits (Bailey & Harrison 1948; Randall 1967; Odesanya et al. 2011; Barroso et 60 al. 2014; Henry et al. 2015). Previous research on tilapia juveniles have shown that both 61 meals from housefly larvae (Musca domestica) and blowfly larvae (Chrysomya

megacephala) can replace up to 100% of the FM in practical diets for tilapia fingerlings without affecting fish performance compared to FM-based control diets (Ogunji et al. 2008a, b, c; Sing et al. 2014). On the other hand, fresh Black Soldier Fly (BSF, Hermetia illucens) larvae fed whole or chopped to blue tilapia (Oreochromis aureus) reduced significantly the fish growth (Bondari & Sheppard 1987). BSF larvae meal has been used as a substitute to FM in several fish species diets except tilapia (Makkar et al. 2014; Henry et al. 2015). In complete diets, BSF meal, which can be produced locally (Devic et al. 2013), may be blended with other good protein sources such as poultry byproduct meal (PBM) to substitute high-priced FM, FO and soybean meal (SBM). This study investigates the effects on the performance, feed utilisation efficiency and body composition of the strategic inclusions BSF larvae meal (MM) in commercially formulated diets for juvenile Nile tilapia (O. niloticus).

Material and Methods

76 Diets

BSF larvae (*H. illucens*) meal (MM) was produced within a pilot system located in Greater Accra (Ghana) described by Charlton *et al.* (2015). Larvae were fed on a substrate mix composed of 35% spent grain (brewery solid waste) or wheat bran (depending on availability), 22% processing wastes from a local fish feed factory, 12% yeast slurry (brewery waste water) and 31% water (bringing the moisture content to approximately 50%) and were harvested after 13 days of development (prior reaching the prepupae stage). Oven-dried larvae (60-80°C, 2 hours) were subsequently ground into a fine and homogeneous meal using a flour mill machine. Nutritional composition of the MM was

analysed (Table 1) according to the methods described below in order to assist in diet

86 formulation.

Raanan Fish Feed West Africa (Prampram Fishfeed Factory, Ghana) supplied the other feed ingredients, formulated and prepared the diets. Raanan PG40 commercial diet (370 g kg⁻¹ crude protein and 95 g kg⁻¹ total lipid) was used as control for the experiment (PG40). Three test diets (MM30, MM50 and MM80) were formulated to be comparable to PG40 (isonitrogenous and isoenergetic) by gradually replacing high-priced imported FM (20; 50 and 70% substitution, respectively) and SBM (10, 20 and 35% substitution, respectively) with locally available MM (30, 50 and 80 g kg⁻¹, respectively) and cheaper PBM (80, 100 130 g kg⁻¹, respectively). The substitution levels of FM and SBM were driven by the limited quantity of MM available for the experiment. Then, nutritional composition (protein levels) was adjusted by addition of PBM as part as a least-cost strategy. Furthermore, FO was not included in the 3 test diets due to the high lipid content of the MM (244.5 g kg⁻¹). Chemical compositions of the diets was analysed as described below (Table 1). Commercially packaged diets were kept on-farm under cool and shaded conditions (25°C, 50-60% relative humidity) and used within two months after manufacture.

- [Insert Table 1]
- 103 Experimental Design

In order to demonstrate the relevance of the results, the experiment was conducted onfarm (commercial tilapia producer, Volta Lake, Ghana) under conditions similar to commercial husbandry practices. All-male, hormonally sex-reversed Nile tilapia fingerlings (*O. niloticus*) were obtained from a local commercial hatchery. Prior the start of the experiment, twenty-five thousand (25,000) fish were transferred into a single floating cage (3x3 m) suspended in Volta Lake where they were fed six times a day with a standard diet (480 g kg⁻¹ crude protein and 50 g kg⁻¹ total lipid) for 3 weeks as an acclimation period to the lake conditions. Twelve floating cages (1 m² cage⁻¹), set up in the outermost part of the grow-out and nursery site of the farm (500 m from the shore, water column of 30-35 m depth), were then stocked at random with one thousand five hundred (1,500) acclimated fingerlings (5.7±0.5 g fish⁻¹) each. The experiment was conducted between the months of September and October 2014, for 32 days which was equivalent to the commercial advanced nursing period and allowed a body increase of at least 300% recommended for juvenile fish studies (NRC, 2011). Control and test diets were distributed daily by hand to triplicates cages; fish were fed to visual satiety, over 6 feeding sessions day⁻¹ (at regular intervals of 2 hours) and amount of feed distributed was determined by difference with pre-weighed feed containers prepared daily. Water temperature (°C), pH and dissolved oxygen (DO; mg L⁻¹) were recorded daily at 07:00 hrs and 16:00 hrs using OxyGuard® Handy digital probes (Polaris and pH) immersed at 50 cm under the water surface within cages. At the start and on termination of the experiment, all the fish in each cage were counted and bulk weighed (Tanita KD 200 digital scale, precision: 0-1000gx1g). Growth was monitored through intermediate samplings carried out every 10 days, by counting and recording bulk weights of 3 separate sub-samples from each cage (representing approximately 20% of the population), using a scoop net of fish concentrated in the corner of the cage. Fish were starved for 24 hours prior samplings in order to limit stress and mortalities related to handling. Whole fish samples were collected at the start (n=20 fish from initial population) and on termination (n=5 fish cage⁻¹) of the experiment, following

109

110

111

112

113

114

115

116

117

118

119

120

121

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

an overdose of metacaine sulfonate (MS-222) anaesthetic. Samples were systematically pooled and homogenized (on a cage basis) and stored at -20°C until further analyses.

Chemical analyses

132

133

134

135 MM, diets and whole fish samples were analysed at the University of Stirling (Stirling, 136 UK) using standard methods to determine dry matter by drying at 110°C until constant 137 weight (AOAC 1990); ash content by combustion in a muffle furnace at 600°C (AOAC 138 1990); crude protein using the Kieldahl method (calculated as N×6.25; Persson 2008); 139 crude fibre using Foss FiberCap 2021/2023 system (Foss Application Note ASN3801; 140 Foss Analytical, Hillerød, Denmark) and energy by bomb calorimetry (Gallenkamp 141 autobomb, calibrated with benzoic acid). Lipid content in MM and diets was determined 142 by Soxhlet extraction (Soxtec auto extraction unit; Foss Analytical, Hillerød, Denmark; 143 Christie 2003) following acid hydrolysis (Tecator Soxtec method, Foss Analytical, 144 Hillerød, Denmark). Total lipid from samples was extracted according to Folch et al. 145 (1957) and determined gravimetrically. Fatty Acid Methyl Esters (FAME) were then 146 prepared from total lipid by acid-catalysed transesterification (Christie 1993). Extraction 147 and purification of FAME were performed as described by Tocher & Harvie (1988) and 148 separated and quantified by gas-liquid chromatography using a Fisons GC-8160 (Thermo 149 Scientific, Milan, Italy) equipped with a 30 m x 0.32 mm i.d. x 0.25 µm ZB-Wax column 150 (Phenomenex, Cheshire, UK), 'on column' injection and flame ionisation detection. 151 Hydrogen was used as carrier gas with initial oven thermal gradient of 50°C to 150°C at 40°C.min⁻¹ to a final temperature of 230°C at 2°C.min⁻¹. Individual FAME were 152 identified by comparison to known standards (Supelco™ 37-FAME mix; Sigma-Aldrich 153 154 Ltd., Poole, UK) and published data (Tocher and Harvie, 1988). Data were collected and 155 processed using Chromcard for Windows (Version 1.19; Thermoquest Italia S.p.A.,

- Milan, Italy). Fatty acid content (g kg⁻¹ of sample) was calculated using heptadecanoic
- acid (17:0) as internal standard. Amino acid composition of the MM and diets (g kg⁻¹ of
- sample) was determined by ALS Food and Pharmaceutical (Chatteris, UK) using HPLC
- method.
- 160 Calculations and statistical methods
- 161 Fish performance and feed utilisation were evaluated according the following indices:
- Live Weight Gain (WG, g) = Final live weight (Wf, g) − Initial live weight (Wi, g)
- Specific Growth Rate (SGR, % day⁻¹) = [Ln(Wf)–Ln(Wi)/days]*100
- Food Conversion Ratio (FCR) = Feed distributed (g DM) / WG
- Daily feeding rate (% biomass day⁻¹)= [(Feed distributed (g DM) / number of feeding
- 166 days)/Biomass (g)]*100
- Protein Efficiency Ratio (PER) = WG / Total protein fed (g DM)
- Survival Rate (%) = [(Fish stocked initially–Mortality) / Fish stocked initially]*100
- Statistical analyses were carried out using IBM SPSS Statistics software (version 21).
- Data were subjected to one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) followed by Tukey's
- 171 HSD test for unplanned multiple comparisons. Correlations between the dietary
- inclusions of MM + PBM and the performance or nutritional results were analysed using
- 173 Pearson's coefficient. A significance of P<0.05 was considered for all analyses
- 174 performed.

176 Results

- Water temperature and dissolved oxygen varied slightly during the course of the
- experiment and the diurnal periods with values ranging from 26.8 to 30.5°C and 5.1 to
- 8.1 g L⁻¹, respectively. All the values were within tolerance limits for tilapia (Beveridge

& McAndrew 2000; El-Sayed 2006). Growth and feed utilisation of the fish fed the control and experimental diets were not affected by the treatments (Table 2). During the 32-day experimental period, fish grew from an initial weight of 5.7 ± 0.5 g fish⁻¹ to a final weight 16.6 ± 0.5 g fish⁻¹. Live weight gain and SGR of the fish fed the control and the MM-based diets were not significantly different (P \geq 0.05). Overall feeding response was good with total amounts of feed distributed (26.0 ± 0.3 kg cage⁻¹) and feeding rates (4.2 ± 0.2 % biomass day⁻¹) not significantly different between treatments (P \geq 0.05), indicating similar feed intake. Feed utilisation efficiency (FCR and PER) was not compromised by the dietary treatments (P \geq 0.05). However, MM30 diet led to a significantly lower survival (81.7 ± 1.9 %) compared to others (P<0.05) and MM80 survival rate (90.1 ± 0.5 %) was found significantly higher than PG40 (86.1 ± 0.3 %).

[Insert Table 2]

Analysed fish body compositions compared between treatments indicated no significant differences ($P \ge 0.05$) for dry matter, crude protein, crude lipid, ash and crude fibre (Table 3). However, whole carcass FA composition varied significantly between dietary treatments. Strong linear relationships were found between the dietary inclusion of MM and selected FA; in particular, MM dietary inclusion was positively correlated to the total saturated FA (r 0.672; P<0.05) and a negatively to the n-3 PUFA (r -0.725; P<0.05).

Discussion

[Insert Table 3]

Nowadays, feed formulation strategies account for the feed ingredients nutritional quality but also cost, availability and sustainability. Local constrains identified in Ghana (cost of importation, poor quality of local materials, etc.) increase the pressure on feed manufacturers to find cost-efficient alternative feed ingredients to replace always more costly feedstuffs such as marine ingredients (Gabriel et al. 2007; Obirikorang et al. 2015). According to recent publications (Barroso et al. 2014; Henry et al. 2015), insect meals from dipterans such as the common housefly (M. domestica) or the black soldier fly (H. illucens) feature nutritional characteristics similar to FM suggesting that they could be suitable substitutes for this conventional feed ingredient. Nevertheless, compared to highquality FM such as anchovies, herring or menhaden (NRC, 2011), the BSF meal produced in Ghana for the purpose of the experiment, displayed a lower protein content and higher lipid content. Similar observation was made by Barroso et al. (2014) for a BSF meal which presented even lower levels of crude protein, lipid and ash (362 g kg⁻¹; 180 g kg⁻¹ and 93 g kg⁻¹, respectively) compared to the BSF meal produced in Ghana. Insect life stage, feeding substrate and processing methods influence their nutritional composition (Aniebo & Owen 2010; van Huis et al. 2013) which explains the differences reported here. Also similar to that previously found by Barroso et al. (2014), the amino acid profile of the MM was comparable to conventional FM including 9 out of 10 of the essential amino acids (BSF meal is known to be low in tryptophan; Newton et al. 1977; Henry et al. 2015). It is therefore a great source of protein. MM used in the current experiment was also a rich source of FA, in particular saturated and monounsaturated and it was slightly richer in EPA and DHA compared to MM used in other studies (St-Hilaire et al. 2007b; Kroeckel et al. 2012; Barroso et al. 2014) owing to the substrate mix on which the larvae fed (St-Hilaire et al. 2007a). Although MM is locally available (Devic et al. 2013) and a suitable source of nutrients for fish as demonstrated in several other studies (St-Hilaire et al. 2007b; Kroeckel et al. 2012, Lock et al. 2015), inclusion in a complete diet in substitution of conventional ingredients such as FM, FO and SBM requires adjustments

204

205

206

207

208

209

210

211

212

213

214

215

216

217

218

219

220

221

222

223

224

225

226

in the formulation. Lower protein content of the MM was therefore corrected by increasing the PBM inclusion in the test diets, which is considered as a good source of protein although lacking of some essential amino acids (NRC 2011). In addition, according to El-Sayed (1998), PBM can replace totally FM in practical diets for tilapia and that inclusion up to 470 g kg⁻¹ did not compromise the fish performance. Total substitution of FO related to the high lipid content of the MM resulted in MM30 and MM50 dietary lipid contents being about 18% lower than PG40 and MM80. Low-fat diets are preferred for warmwater omnivorous fish such as tilapia (El-Sayed 2006) and recommended dietary lipid content for tilapia fingerlings vary between 80 and 120 g kg⁻¹ ¹ (Jauncey 1998). Greater inclusion of MM in such a formulation would have certainly led to lipid contents exceeding the recommended range. Nevertheless, a possible solution could be to use defatted MM instead of crude, which would enable higher inclusion levels as suggested by Fasakin et al. (2003). The FA composition of the MM-based diets was also affected by the substitution of FM and FO, nonetheless, essential FA requirements for optimal growth of tilapia fingerlings (C₁₈ PUFA such as 18:2n-6 and 18:3n-3) were satisfied (NRC 2011). Finally the formulation strategy applied in the current allowed the production of comparable diets in terms of macronutrients and meeting the requirements for tilapia fingerlings (Jauncey 1998; El-Sayed 2006; NRC 2011). Fish performance were acceptable for tilapia farmed in cages (El-Sayed 2013) and not significantly different among treatments, indicating that dietary treatments did not compromise the growth. This result is comparable to those of other studies where MM or PBM were used as alternative ingredients in practical diets for tilapia in substitution of FM (Ogunji et al. 2008a, b; El-Sayed 2013; Sing et al. 2014). Also, similar to that previously reported in other studies (Fasakin et al. 2003; Ogunji et al. 2008a;

228

229

230

231

232

233

234

235

236

237

238

239

240

241

242

243

244

245

246

247

248

249

250

Karapanagiotidis et al. 2014; Sing et al. 2014), overall survival was good during the 32day experimental period. Significant differences in survival were more likely explained by the stress related to frequent sampling and handling which would have more deeply affected the smaller fish (Bolivar et al. 2004; MacNiven & Little 2001); indeed, although initial weights were not significantly different between treatments, the fish stocked at a slightly smaller size had significantly lower survival rates than the larger fish. In addition, in comparison with other treatments, the significantly lower survival of MM30-fed fish could explain the slightly (but not significant) better weight gain and SGR (11.8±1.9 g fish⁻¹ and 3.7±0.4 % day⁻¹, respectively) probably owing to a reduction of the competition for the resources. The feeding method applied in the experiment (manual distribution), which is common practice in countries where labor costs are low, limits feed wastage and prevents starvation as it is based on the fish feeding response (El-Sayed 2013). Multiple feeding can also improve growth and feed efficiency in species such as tilapia with relatively small stomachs and a continuous foraging behaviour (Shiau 2002; NRC 2011). Feed utilisation efficiency, measured through feeding rates, FCR and PER, was comparable between treatments. Feed intake was not affected by the MM dietary inclusions and the retroactively calculated feeding rates indicated that the fish were appropriately fed. Indeed, at 28°C, it is recommended to feed 5 to 20 g tilapia fingerlings at 6-4 % biomass day⁻¹ (Shiau 2002; Ng & Romano 2013). Palatability of feeds containing insect meal seems to be related to various factors such as the fish species and its feeding response but also the insect meal characteristics (species, farming and processing methods) (Henry et al. 2015). For instance, a diet containing defatted BSF meal seemed to be poorly palatable for juvenile turbot, *Psetta maxima* (Kroeckel et al. 2012), whereas inclusion of blowfly

252

253

254

255

256

257

258

259

260

261

262

263

264

265

266

267

268

269

270

271

272

273

274

meal in juvenile red tilapia feed did not affect the feed intake (Sing et al. 2014). Consistent with other studies (Ogunji et al. 2008; Sing et al. 2014), PER values were comparable between dietary treatments indicating that dietary proteins were similarly and efficiently used by the fish fed the different diets (Steffens 1989; De Silva & Anderson 1994). The proximate composition of the fish was also not affected by the dietary treatments. However, the FA profile of the fish carcasses mirrored that of the diets and strong correlations indicated that dietary inclusions of MM, in particular its FA composition, influenced the FA composition of the whole fish body. The total substitution of the FO in the 3 experimental diets explained the n-6 and n-3 PUFA levels (respectively increasing and decreasing with increasing MM inclusions). Sánchez-Muros et al. (2015) made similar observations while replacing 50 % FM and 100 % FO with a Tenebrio molitor larvae meal in a diet for Nile tilapia fingerlings. At the juvenile stages, the farmers prioritize optimal growth and survival, using cost-effective and sustainable feeds and ingredients, and FA composition of the fish carcass is less concerning than for a marketsize fish (Turchini et al. 2009). To restore the n-3 PUFA levels, which have beneficial effects on human health (Ruxton et al. 2004), finishing diets containing essential PUFA could be used during the last weeks of farming (fattening stage), improving, therefore, the nutritional quality of the marketable size fish (Karapanagiotidis et al. 2007). Commercial aquafeed manufacturers continue to produce feeds for tilapia including 20 to 250 g kg⁻¹ FM due to its high nutritional quality (FAO 2012). In the current study, the absence of differences between the fish growth performance, feed utilisation and body composition under the different dietary treatments lead to the conclusion that inclusions of up to 80 g kg⁻¹ MM and 130 g kg⁻¹ PBM, substituting FO totally, up to 70% FM and 35% SBM do not affect the feed quality for advanced nursing tilapia. Providing that the

276

277

278

279

280

281

282

283

284

285

286

287

288

289

290

291

292

293

294

295

296

297

298

market price of the MM is competitive, feed production costs would be alleviated by the reduction of FM, FO and SBM and the strategic use of quality ingredients such as MM and PBM to balance the diet. More broadly, inclusions of cheaper, sustainable and locally available feedstuffs in juvenile tilapia commercial feed could support the sustainable intensification of aquaculture and contribute more widely to food security.

Acknowledgements

This study and findings are part of the research carried out through the EU FP7

PROteINSECT project (Grant Agreement n°312084). Authors would like to acknowledge the help and support of Raanan Fish Feed, the tilapia farm owner and its professional staff and to Nicole Pelusio (intern).

311

312 References

313 Aniebo, A.O. & Owen, O.J. (2010) Effects of age and method of drying on the 314 proximate composition of housefly larvae (Musca domestica Linnaeus) meal 315 (HFLM). Pakistan J. Nutr., 9, 485–487. AOAC (1990) Official Methods of Analysis, 15th ed. Association of Official Analytical 316 317 Chemists, Inc., Washington, D.C., USA. 318 Ayoola, A.A. (2010) Replacement of Fishmeal with Alternative Protein Sources in 319 Aquaculture Diets. North Carolina State University. 320 Bailey, R.M. & Harrison, H.M.J. (1948) Food Habits of the Southern Channel Catfish 321 (Ictalurus Lacustris Punctatus) in the Des Moines River, Iowa. Trans. Am. Fish. 322 Soc., 75, 110–138. 323 Barroso, F.G., de Haro, C., Sánchez-Muros, M.-J., Venegas, E., Martínez-Sánchez, A. 324 & Pérez-Bañón, C. (2014) The potential of various insect species for use as food 325 for fish. Aquaculture, 422-423, 193-201. 326 Beveridge, M.C.M. & McAndrew, B.J. (2000) Tilapias: Biology and Exploitation. 327 Kluwer Academic Publishers. 328 Beveridge, M.C.M., Thilsted, S.H., Phillips, M.J., Metian, M., Troell, M. & Hall, S.J. 329 (2013) Meeting the food and nutrition needs of the poor: the role of fish and the 330 opportunities and challenges emerging from the rise of aquaculture. J. Fish Biol., 331 83, 1067–1084. 332 Bolivar, R.B., Jimenez, E.B.T., Sugue, J.R.A. & Brown, C.L. (2004) Effect of stocking 333 sizes on the yield and survival of Nile tilapia (Oreochromis niloticus L.) on-grown 334 in ponds. In: 6th International Symposium on Tilapia in Aquaculture Philippine

335 International Convention Center Roxas Boulevard, Manila, Philippines September 336 12-16, 2004. pp. 574–583. 337 Bondari, K. & Sheppard, D.C. (1987) Soldier fly, Hermetia illucens L., larvae as feed 338 for channel catfish, *Ictalurus punctatus* (Rafinesque), and blue tilapia, 339 Oreochromis aureus (Steindachner). Aquac. Fish. Manag., 18, 209–220. 340 Charlton, A.J., Dickinson, M., Wakefield, M.E., Fitches, E., Kenis, M., Han, R., Zhu, 341 F., Kone, N., Grant, M., Devic, E., Bruggeman, G., Prior, R. & Smith, R. (2015) 342 Exploring the chemical safety of fly larvae as a source of protein for animal feed. J. 343 Insects as Food Feed, 1, 7–16. 344 Christie, W.W. (1993) Preparation of Ester Derivatives of Fatty Acids for 345 Chromatographic Analysis. In: Advances in Lipid Methodology -Two (Christie, 346 W.W. ed.), pp. 69–111. The Oily Press, Dundee, UK. 347 Christie, W.W. (2003) Lipid Analysis - Isolation, Separation, Identification and Structural Analysis of Lipids, 3rd ed. The Oily Press, Dundee, UK. 348 349 De Silva, S.S. & Anderson, T.A. (1994) Fish nutrition in aquaculture, 1st ed. Chapman 350 & Hall, London, UK. 351 Devic, E., Little, D.C., Leschen, W. & Jauncey, K. (2013) A Model for Substitution of 352 Fishmeal with Maggot- Meal in Tilapia Feeds - A Commercial Production Farm in 353 West Africa. Isr. J. Aquac. - BAMIGDEH, ISTA 10 special Issue. 354 El-Sayed, A.-F.M. (1998) Total replacement of fish meal with animal protein sources in 355 Nile tilapia, Oreochromis niloticus (L.), feeds. Aquac. Res., 29, 275–280. El-Sayed, A.-F.M. (2004) Protein nutrition of farmed tilapia: searching for 356 357 unconventional sources. In: New Dimensions in Farmed Tilapia: Proceedings of

358 the Sixth International Symposium on Tilapia Aquaculture. pp. 364–378. 359 El-Sayed, A.-F.M. (2006) Tilapia Culture. CABI Publishing, Wallingford, UK. 360 El-Sayed, A.-F.M. (2013) Tilapia feed management practices in sub-Saharan Africa. In: 361 On-farm feeding and feed management in aquaculture (M.R. Hasan M.B. New 362 eds.), FAO Fish. Aquac. Tech. Pap. No. 583, pp. 377–405. FAO, Rome, Italy. 363 El-Sayed, A.-F.M. & Tacon, A.G.J. (1997) Fishmeal replacers for tilapia: A review. In: 364 Feeding Tomorrow's Fish (Tacon, A.G.J. & Basurco, B. eds.). Cahiers Options 365 Méditerranéennes, 22. pp. 205-224. 366 FAO (2005) National Aquaculture Sector Overview. Ghana. National Aquaculture Sector Overview Fact Sheets. In: National Aquaculture Sector Overview Fact 367 368 Sheets. FAO Fisheries and Aquaculture Department [online]. 369 FAO (2012) The State of World Fisheries and Aquaculture 2012. FAO, Rome, Itlay. 370 Fasakin, E.A., Balogun, A.M. & Ajayi, O.O. (2003) Evaluation of full-fat and defatted 371 maggot meals in the feeding of clariid catfish Clarias gariepinus fingerlings. 372 Aquac. Res., 34, 733–738. 373 Folch, J., Lees, M. & Sloane Stanley, G.H. (1957). A simple method for isolation and 374 purification of total lipides from animal tissues. J. Biol. Chem., 226, 497–509. 375 Gabriel, U.U., Akinrotimi, O. a, Bekibele, D.O., Onunkwo, D.N., Anyanwu, P.E. & 376 Harcourt, P. (2007). Locally produced fish feed: potentials for aquaculture 377 development in subsaharan Africa. African J. Agric. Res., 2, 287–295. 378 Hasan, M.R., Hecht, T., De Silva, S.S. & Tacon, A.G.J. (2007) Study and analysis of 379 feeds and fertilizers for sustainable aquaculture development. FAO Fisheries 380 Technical Paper No. 497, pp.510. FAO, Rome, Italy.

381 Hecht, T. (2007) Review of feeds and fertilizers for sustainable aquaculture 382 development in sub-Saharan Africa. In Study and analysis of feeds and fertilizers 383 for sustainable aquaculture development (Hasan M.R., Hecht T., De Silva S.S. & 384 Tacon A.G.J. eds). FAO Fish. Tech. Pap. No. 497, pp. 77–109. FAO, Rome, Italy. 385 Henry, M., Gasco, L., Piccolo, G. & Fountoulaki, E. (2015) Review on the use of 386 insects in the diet of farmed fish: Past and future. Anim. Feed Sci., Technol. 203, 387 1-22.388 Jauncey, K. (1998) Tilapia Feeds and Feeding. Pisces Press Ltd., Stirling, UK. 389 Karalazos, V. (2007) Sustainable alternatives yo fish meal: Effects on growth, tissue 390 fatty acid composition and lipid metabolism. University of Stirling. 391 Karapanagiotidis, I.T., Bell, M. V., Little, D.C. & Yakupitiyage, A. (2007) Replacement 392 of dietary fish oils by alpha-linolenic acid-rich oils lowers omega 3 content in 393 tilapia flesh. Lipids, 42, 547–559. 394 Karapanagiotidis, I.T., Daskalopoulou, E., Vogiatzis, I., Rumbos, C., Mente, E. & 395 Athanassiou, C.G. (2014) Substitution of Fishmeal by Fly Hermetia illucens 396 Prepupae Meal in the Diet of Gilthead Seabream (Sparus aurata). HydroMedit 397 2014, 110–114. 398 Kroeckel, S., Harjes, A.-G.E., Roth, I., Katz, H., Wuertz, S., Susenbeth, A. & Schulz, C. (2012) When a turbot catches a fly: Evaluation of a pre-pupae meal of the Black 399 400 Soldier Fly (Hermetia illucens) as fish meal substitute - Growth performance and 401 chitin degradation in juvenile turbot (Psetta maxima). Aquaculture, 364-365, 345-402 352. 403 Lock, E.-J., Arsiwalla, T. & Waagbø, R. (2015) Insect larvae meal as an alternative

- 404 source of nutrients in the diet of Atlantic salmon (Salmo salar) postsmolt. Aquac. 405 Nutr. Doi:10.1111/anu.12343 406 MacNiven, A.M. & Little, D.C. (2001) Development and evaluation of a stress 407 challenge testing methodology for assessment of Nile tilapia (Oreochromis 408 niloticus, Linn.) fry quality. Aquac. Res., 32, 671–679. 409 Makkar, H.P.S., Tran, G., Heuzé, V. & Ankers, P. (2014) State-of-the-art on use of 410 insects as animal feed. Anim. Feed Sci. Technol., 197, 1–33. 411 Newton, G.L., Booram, C.V., Barker, R.W. & Hale, O.M. (1977) Dried Hermetia 412 illucens Larvae Meal as a supplement for swine. J. Anim. Ecol., 44, 395–400. 413 Ng, W.-K.K. & Romano, N. (2013) A review of the nutrition and feeding management 414 of farmed tilapia throughout the culture cycle. Rev. Aquac., 5, 220–254. 415 NRC (2011) Nutrient requirements of fish and shrimp. National Research Council, 416 National Academy Press, Washington DC, USA. 417 Obirikorang, K.A., Amisah, S., Fialor, S.C. & Skov, P.V. (2015) Local agro-industrial 418 by-products with potential use in Ghanaian aquaculture: a review. Aquac. Int., 23, 419 403-425. 420 Odesanya, B.O., Ajayi, S.O., Agbaogun, B.K.O. & Okuneye, B. (2011) Comparative
- Ogunji, J.O., Kloas, W., Wirth, M., Neumann, N. & Pietsch, C. (2008a) Effect of housefly maggot meal (magmeal) diets on the performance, concentration of plasma glucose, cortisol and blood characteristics of *Oreochromis niloticus* fingerlings. J. Anim. Physiol. Anim. Nutr. (Berl), 92, 511–518.

evaluation of nutritive value of maggots. Int. J. Sci. Eng. Res., 2, 1–5.

- Ogunji, J.O., Kloas, W., Wirth, M., Schulz, C. & Rennert, B. (2008b) Housefly Maggot
- Meal (Magmeal) as a Protein Source for *Oreochromis niloticus* (Linn.). Asian
- 428 Fish. Sci. 21, 319–331.
- 429 Ogunji, J., Toor, R.U.A.S., Schulz, C. & Kloas, W. (2008c) Growth performance,
- nutrient utilization of Nile tilapia *Oreochromis niloticus* fed housefly maggot meal
- 431 (magmeal) diets. Turkish J. Fish. Aquat. Sci., 147, 141–147.
- 432 Persson, J.A. (2008) Handbook for Kjeldahl Digestion, 4th ed. FOSS, DK-3400,
- Hilleroed, Denmark.
- Randall, J.E. (1967) Food Habits of Reef Fishes of the West Indies. Stud. Trop.
- 435 Oceanogr., 5, 665–847.
- 436 Rurangwa, E., Agyakwah, S.K., Boon, H. & Bolman, B.C. (2015). Development of
- 437 Aquaculture in Ghana Analysis of the fish value chain and potential business cases.
- Ruxton, C.H.S., Reed, S.C., Simpson, M.J.A. & Millington, K.J. (2004) The health
- benefits of omega-3 polyunsaturated fatty acids: a review of the evidence. J. Hum.
- 440 Nutr. Diet., 17, 449–459.
- Sánchez-Muros, M.J., de Haro, C., Sanz, A., Trenzado, C.E., Villareces, S. & Barroso,
- F.G. (2015). Nutritional evaluation of *Tenebrio molitor* meal as fishmeal substitute
- for tilapia (*Oreochromis niloticus*) diet. Aquac. Nutr. 22: 943–955.
- Shiau, S.Y. (2002) Tilapia, *Oreochromis* spp. In: Nutrient requirements and feeding of
- finfish for aquaculture (Webster, C.D. & Lim, C.E. eds), pp. 273–292. CABI
- 446 Publishing, Wallingford, UK.
- Sing, K.-W., Kamarudin, M.S., Wilson, J.-J. & Sofian-Azirun, M. (2014) Evaluation of
- Blowfly (*Chrysomya megacephala*) Maggot Meal as an Effective, Sustainable

449 Replacement for Fishmeal in the Diet of Farmed Juvenile Red Tilapia 450 (*Oreochromis* sp.). Pak. Vet., J. 8318, 85–92. 451 Steffens, W. (1989) Principles of fish nutrition (Ellis Horwood Series in Aquaculture 452 and Fisheries Support, Series ed.). Ellis Horwood Ltd, Chichester, UK 453 St-Hilaire, S., Cranfill, K., McGuire, M.A., Mosley, E.E., Tomberlin, J.K., Newton, L., 454 Sealey, W., Sheppard, C. & Irving, S. (2007a) Fish offal recycling by the black 455 soldier fly produces a foodstuff high in omega-3 fatty acids. J. World Aquac. Soc., 456 38, 309–313. 457 St-Hilaire, S., Sheppard, C., Tomberlin, J.K., Irving, S., Newton, L., McGuire, M.A., 458 Mosley, E.E., Hardy, R.W., Sealey, W. (2007b) Fly prepupae as a feedstuff for 459 rainbow trout, Oncorhynchus mykiss. J. World Aquac. Soc., 38, 59-67. 460 Tacon, A.G.J. (1988). The nutrition and feeding of farmed fish and shrimp - a training 461 manual. 3. Feeding methods, FAO Field Document, Project GCP/RLA/075/ITA 462 "Support to the Regional Aquaculture Activities for Latin America and the 463 Caribbean", Field Document No. 7/E, Brasilia, Brazil, 208 pp. 464 Tacon, A.G.J. & Metian, M. (2008) Global overview on the use of fish meal and fish oil 465 in industrially compounded aquafeeds: Trends and future prospects. Aquaculture, 466 285, 146–158. 467 Tocher, D.R. & Harvie, D.G. (1988) Fatty acid compositions of the major 468 phosphoglycerides from fish neural tissues; (n-3) and (n-6) polyunsaturated fatty 469 acids in rainbow trout (Salmo gairdneri) and cod (Gadus morhua) brains and 470 retinas. Fish Physiol. Biochem., 5, 229–39. 471 Turchini, G.M., Torstensen, B.E. & Ng, W.-K. (2009) Fish oil replacement in finfish

nutrition. Rev. Aquac., 1, 10–57.
van Huis, A., Itterbeeck, J. Van, Klunder, H., Mertens, E., Halloran, A., Muir, G. &
Vantomme, P. (2013) Edible insects: Future prospects for food and feed security.
FAO For. Pap., 171, 1–201.
Veldkamp, T., Duinkerken, G. van, van Huis, A., Lakemond, C.M.M., Ottevanger, E.,
Bosch, G. & van Boekel, M.A.J.S. (2012) Insects as a sustainable feed ingredient
in pig and poultry diets - a feasibility study, Wageningen UR Livestock Research.

Table 1 Ingredient composition (g kg⁻¹) of the control (PG40) and the 3 test diets (MM30,
 MM50 and MM80) and proximate, amino acid, and fatty acid compositions (g kg⁻¹ of

 $\,$ 483 $\,$ meal) of the Black Soldier Fly (BSF) larvae meal and the diets. Values are presented 'as

484 is', based on duplicate analyses.

480

Tables

	DCE	Experimental diets				
	BSF meal	PG40	MM30	MM50	MM80	
Ingredient composition (g kg ⁻¹)						
Fish meal	-	100.0	80.0	50.0	30.0	
Soybean meal	-	200.0	180.0	160.0	130.0	
BSF meal	-	-	30.0	50.0	80.0	
Poultry byproduct meal	-	50.0	80.0	100.0	130.0	
Fish oil	-	20.0	-	-	-	
Corn meal	-	304.0	304.0	304.0	304.0	
Wheat bran	-	130.0	130.0	140.0	130.0	
Poultry blood meal	-	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	
Feather meal	-	90.0	90.0	90.0	90.0	
Vitamin premix	-	3.0	3.0	3.0	3.0	
Anti-mold	-	1.5	1.5	1.5	1.5	
Klinofeed ®	-	1.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	
Methionine	-	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	
Proximate composition (g kg-1)					
Dry matter	950.3	949.4	957.5	952.5	958.3	
Crude protein	416.4	372.8	378.4	371.7	376.7	
Crude lipid	232.4	94.8	78.3	77.6	93.4	
Crude fibre	76.6	30.5	33.1	35.0	34.4	
Ash	116.5	62.9	67.6	68.1	66.8	
Nitrogen-Free Extract	108.4	388.4	400.1	400.1	387	
Gross Energy (MJ/kg)	21.7	19.6	19.2	19.4	19.7	
Essential amino acids (g kg ⁻¹)						
Arginine	20	13.6	13.7	13.1	13.3	
Histidine	11.8	22.5	23.7	23.4	24.1	
Lysine	27	21.8	21.8	21.5	21.8	
Methionine	7.5	11.2	11.7	11.4	11.5	
Phenylalanine	17.5	16.2	15.7	16.3	16.6	
Leucine	29	6.6	5.8	5.1	5.9	
Iso-Leucine	18.4	21.7	21.8	22.4	22.2	
Valine	26.3	19.3	19.6	19.6	19	
Threonine	17.2	34.1	34.3	34.4	34.4	

Fatty acid composition (g kg ⁻¹)						
14:00	10.2	1	1	1.3	1.6	
16:00	33.3	14.4	9.7	10.3	10.7	
18:00	4.7	3.6	3.2	3.5	3.6	
20:00	0.1	0.3	0.2	0.2	0.2	
Total saturated ¹	49.2	19.7	14.4	15.6	16.5	
16:1n-7	6	1.4	1.2	1.3	1.4	
18:1n-9	26.7	24.1	16.9	17.1	16.9	
18:1n-7	5.5	1.5	1.3	1.3	1.4	
22:1n-11	0.3	0.7	0.4	0.3	0.3	
Total monounsaturated ²	40.8	29.2	20.9	20.9	20.9	
18:2n-6	18.6	15.1	12.9	13.3	12.5	
20:2n-6	0.3	0.3	0.2	0.2	0.1	
20:4n-6	0.2	0.2	0.2	0.1	0.1	
Total n-6 ³	19.2	15.8	13.4	13.7	12.9	
18:3n-3	1.7	1.7	1.3	1.2	1.1	
18:4n-3	1.9	0.2	0.2	0.1	0.1	
20:5n-3 (EPA)	0.9	0.8	0.5	0.4	0.4	
22:6n-3 (DHA)	0.1	1.8	1.2	0.8	0.7	
Total n-3 ⁴	4.6	5.1	3.5	2.7	2.5	
Total Polyunsaturated ⁵	23.8	21.1	17.1	16.6	15.5	
Total fatty acids	113.9	70	52.5	53.1	52.9	
n-3/n-6	0.2	0.3	0.3	0.2	0.2	

 $^{1} Includes \ 15:0; \ 22:0 \ and \ 24:0 \ ; \ ^{2} Includes \ 16:1n-9; \ 20:1n-11; \ 20:1n-7; \ 22:1n-9 \ and \ 24:1n-9 \ ; \\ ^{3} Includes \ 18:3n-6; \ 20:3n-6 \ and \ 22:4n-6 \ ; \\ ^{4} Includes \ 20:3n-3; \ 20:4n-3 \ and \ 22:5n-3 \ ; \\ ^{5} Includes \ 16:2 \ and \ 16:3$

Table 2 Growth performance and feed utilisation indices determined for nursing tilapia fingerlings fed control and experimental diets for 32 days

	Dietary treatments				
	PG40	MM30	MM50	MM80	
Initial live weight (g fish ⁻¹)	5.5±0.2	5.1±0.2	6.1±0.7	6.1±0.3	
Final live weight (g fish ⁻¹)	16.0±0.8	16.9±1.8	17.0±1.1	16.5±0.9	
Live weight gain (g fish ⁻¹)	10.4±0.9	11.8±1.9	10.9±1.5	10.4±0.6	
SGR (% day ⁻¹)	3.3±0.2	3.7±0.4	3.2±0.5	3.1±0.1	
Total feed distributed (kg cage ⁻¹)	25.9±0.9	25.7±0.4	26.2±0.2	26.4±0.6	
FCR	2.2±0.1	2.1±0.3	2.0±0.2	2.1±0.1	
PER	1.2±0.1	1.2±0.2	1.3±0.1	1.2±0.0	
Feeding rate (% biomass day ⁻¹)	4.4±0.1	4.3±0.4	4.0±0.1	4.1±0.1	
Survival rate (%)	86.1±0.3 ^b	81.7±1.9°	89.5±2.2 ^{ab}	90.1±0.5 ^a	

Means± SD (n=3) bearing different superscripts within each row are significantly different (P<0.05)

Table 3 Proximate composition (g kg^{-1} of fish, wet weight basis) and fatty acid composition (g kg^{-1} of fish) of Nile tilapia fingerlings whole body at the start (Initial; mean \pm SD; n=4) and on termination of the 32-day experimental period

	Initial	Dietary treatment				
	imuai	PG40	MM30	MM50	MM80	
Proximate composition (g kg ⁻¹)						
Dry matter	238.1±3.4	286.0±5.1	278.5±2.5	282.0±2.5	285.2±1.1	
Crude protein	148.8±1.5	153.6±3.0	152.7±1.3	152.9±0.9	154.3±0.5	
Crude lipid	37.0±1.4	107.8±6.1	96.1±1.1	99.9±4.4	102.2±6.1	
Ash	48.8±0.9	33.1±1.7	34.5±0.8	33.9±2.3	35.7±0.7	
Crude fibre	0.7±0.2	0.8±0.1	0.8±0.1	0.8±0.1	0.8±0.1	
Fatty acid compositio	n (g kg ⁻¹ fish)					
14:0	0.50±0.03	1.57±0.09°	1.70±0.13°	2.32±0.21 ^b	2.91±0.25 ^a	
16:0	4.99±0.20	15.92±0.93ab	14.57±0.57 ^b	16.65±1.99ab	18.01±1.03 ^a	
18:0	1.83±0.07	4.80±0.33	4.68±0.11	4.96±0.52	5.21±0.36	
20:0	0.08 ± 0.00	0.18 ± 0.00	0.17±0.00	0.18±0.03	0.19±0.01	
Total saturated ¹	7.56±0.30	22.68±1.35 ^{ab}	21.34±0.84 ^b	24.35±2.78ab	26.57±1.64 ^a	
16:1n-7	0.93±0.05	2.71 ± 0.16^{b}	2.58±0.12 ^b	2.94±0.37 ^{ab}	3.32±0.12 ^a	
18:1n-9	7.04±0.33	25.42±1.83	22.11±0.80	24.72±2.94	25.70±1.38	
18:1n-7	0.84 ± 0.04	2.04 ± 0.13^{ab}	1.96±0.06 ^b	2.28±0.32ab	2.52±0.20 ^a	
22:1n-11	0.08 ± 0.00	0.36 ± 0.02^{a}	0.18 ± 0.02^{b}	0.20 ± 0.02^{b}	0.18±0.01 ^b	
Total monounsat. ²	9.72±0.46	32.98±2.28	28.92±0.97	32.55±3.89	34.26±1.80	
18:2n-6	2.54±0.19	8.16±0.52	7.61±0.20	8.21±1.05	9.08±0.52	
20:2n-6	0.22±0.01	0.61±0.05	0.58±0.01	0.63±0.07	0.67±0.03	
20:4n-6	0.35±0.02	0.60 ± 0.05^{b}	0.60 ± 0.04^{b}	0.66 ± 0.08^{ab}	0.76 ± 0.05^{a}	

Total n-6 ³	3.69±0.27	10.91±0.77	10.24±0.36	11.10±1.44	12.33±0.72
18:3n-3	0.21±0.02	0.74 ± 0.05	0.62 ± 0.03	0.62 ± 0.09	0.66 ± 0.04
20:4n-3	0.03 ± 0.00	0.11 ± 0.01^{a}	0.07 ± 0.00^{b}	0.07 ± 0.01^{b}	0.07 ± 0.00^{b}
20:5n-3 (EPA)	0.07 ± 0.00	0.13 ± 0.02^{a}	0.08 ± 0.01^{b}	0.08 ± 0.01^{b}	0.09 ± 0.01^{b}
22:5n-3	0.16±0.01	0.47 ± 0.04^{a}	0.32 ± 0.03^{b}	0.29 ± 0.04^{b}	0.32 ± 0.02^{b}
22:6n-3 (DHA)	0.89 ± 0.03	1.85±0.19 ^a	1.38±0.12 ^b	1.16±0.17 ^b	1.24±0.05 ^b
Total n-3 ⁴	1.43±0.06	3.55±0.32 ^a	2.66 ± 0.18^{b}	2.38±0.35 ^b	2.56±0.12b
Total polyunsat. ⁵	5.30±0.34	14.77±1.09	13.19±0.53	13.79±1.82	15.21±0.82
Total fatty acids	22.58±1.08	70.42±4.71	63.46±2.17	70.68±8.42	76.04±4.22

Mean± SD (n=3) bearing different superscripts within each row are significantly different (P<0.05); comparisons

were made between dietary treatments and excluded the initial values. ¹Includes 15:0; 22:0 and 24:0

²Includes 16:1n-9; 17:1; 20:1n-11; 20:1n-9; 20:1n-7; 22:1n-9 and 24:1n-9 ³Includes 18:3n-6; 20:3n-6; 22:4n-6 and 22:5n-6 ⁴Includes 18:4n-3and 20:3n-3

495 496 497 498 499 500 501

502

⁵Includes 16:2; 16:3 and 16:4