

AN EXPLORATION OF GENDER STEREOTYPES IN THE WORK  
OF JAMES HOGG

Barbara Leonardi

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of  
Doctor of Philosophy

English Studies  
University of Stirling

September 2013

### **Abstract**

A self-educated shepherd, Scottish writer James Hogg (1770-1835) spoke from a position outside the dominant discourse, depicting issues of his age related to gender, class, and ethnicity by giving voice to people from the margins and, thus (either consciously or unconsciously), revealing gender politics and Britain's imperial aims. Hogg's contemporary critics received his work rather negatively, viewing his subjects such as prostitution, out-of-wedlock-pregnancy, infanticide, and the violence of war as violating the principles of literary politeness. Hogg's obstinacy in addressing these issues, however, supports the thesis that his aim was far more significant than challenging the expectations of his contemporary readers.

This project shows that pragmatics can be applied productively to literature because its eclecticism offers the possibility of developing a detailed discussion about three aspects of literary communication—the author, the reader and the text—without prioritising any of them. Literature is an instance of language in use (the field of pragmatics) where an author creates the texts and a reader recreates the author's message through the text. Analysis of Hogg's flouting of Grice's maxims for communication strategies and of his defying the principles of politeness enables a theoretically supported discussion about Hogg's possible intentions, as well as about how his intentions were perceived by the literary establishment of his time; while both relevance theory and Bakhtin's socio-linguistics enriched by a historically contextualised politeness shed new light on the negative reception of Hogg's texts.

## Contents

<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</b>	<b>IV</b>
<b>PREVIOUSLY PUBLISHED WORK</b>	<b>IV</b>
<b>DECLARATION</b>	<b>V</b>
<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>1</b>
The cooperative principle of communication	13
Relevance theory	19
Politeness, social deixis, and heteroglossia	21
The pragmatics of literature	35
Reading as a pragmatic act	42
When voices clash	44
Summary of the chapters	46
<b>CHAPTER ONE</b>	<b>51</b>
<b>BOURGEOIS MARRIAGE AND THE FEMALE BODY</b>	<b>51</b>
James Hogg, <i>The Three Perils</i> , and the ideology of bourgeois marriage	51
The Three Perils of Man and the witches' carnivalesque weddings	57
Gatty's grotesque body and Rickleton's buffoon figure	64
War, jealousy, and the violation of Sally Niven's maternal body	81
<b>CHAPTER TWO</b>	<b>96</b>
<b>THE MASCULINITIES OF SCOTTISH NATIONAL IDENTITY</b>	<b>96</b>
Highlanders and Lowlanders: Mystified and materialistic Scottishness	96
The 'overarching' British sentimental masculinity	111
Basil Lee: A carnivalesque 'Highlander' in Quebec	122

<b>We'll finish the Corsican callan',   Wi' stanes an' bullets an' a!</b>	<b>131</b>
<b>The carnivorous Wat o' the Cleuch</b>	<b>137</b>
<b>Hunger and cannibalism in Hogg's Perils of Man</b>	<b>146</b>
<b>CHAPTER THREE</b>	<b>162</b>
<b>QUESTIONING THE PATRIARCHAL VALUE OF WOMEN'S CHASTITY</b>	<b>162</b>
<b>The Scottish Kirk in the early nineteenth century</b>	<b>162</b>
<b>Public repentance and infanticide</b>	<b>169</b>
<b>A clash of discourses: Infanticide in the ballad and the novel</b>	<b>173</b>
<b>Ila Moore: A queen at heart</b>	<b>178</b>
<b>The Profligate Princes and the economic value of women's chastity</b>	<b>193</b>
<b>The magic realism of 'Cousin Mattie'</b>	<b>205</b>
<b>'Maria's Tale': A boisterous face threatening act</b>	<b>217</b>
<b>Bell Calvert and the 'allusions to women of ill fame'</b>	<b>222</b>
<b>CHAPTER FOUR</b>	<b>231</b>
<b>JAMES HOGG'S PROTO-POSTMODERN HEROINES</b>	<b>231</b>
<b>The Brownie's magic power: A shield for the Scottish nation</b>	<b>235</b>
<b>Tibby Hyslop's respectable spinsterhood</b>	<b>247</b>
<b>Queen Hynde and the critical debate with the 'Maid of Dunedin'</b>	<b>257</b>
<b>CONCLUSION</b>	<b>270</b>
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	<b>282</b>

### **Acknowledgements**

I record with gratitude the support I received by the University of Stirling, the Arts and Humanities Research Council, and the PALA Roger Fowler Funding. They all have provided valuable grants without which this project could not have been possible. It is also a pleasure to record my indebtedness to a number of people who have provided supportive feedback: in particular, Dr Suzanne Gilbert, my supervisor; Prof Siobhan Chapman and Prof Roger Sell for their guidance on the theoretical framework that I have used for this project; Prof Ian Duncan for his enthusiastic and supportive feedback on the conference paper that I delivered at the 2011 BARS conference in Glasgow, which is part of chapter two; Dr Robin MacLachlan for sharing his research findings on Hogg and the theatre; and the Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library for permission to cite a Hogg manuscript in their care. I feel especially grateful to Prof Anders Pettersson for providing his fundamental advice on pragmatics at a crucial moment of my journey. I am also indebted to a number of friends and colleagues who proofread parts of this thesis to check my English: in particular, Dr Matt Foley; Mrs Liz Speake; Mrs Carole Pitson; Mrs Heather Smith; and Prof Angela Smith. Above all, I thank my parents, Pierluigi and Tina Leonardi, for accepting my life choices and my being so far away to carry out this research project. I dedicate this thesis to Sheona Low, whom I will miss dearly.

### **Previously Published Work**

Some parts of this thesis are based on previously published work by the present writer. The first part of chapter one is based on ‘James Hogg, the *Three Perils*, and the Pragmatics of Bourgeois Marriage’, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 22 (2012),

19-38. A section of chapter two is based on 'James Hogg, 'Basil Lee', and the Pragmatics of Highland Masculinity', *NAWA: Journal of Language and Communication*, 6.1 (June 2012), 84-101; an earlier version can be retrieved at <<http://www.pala.ac.uk/resources/proceedings/2011/leonardi2011.pdf>> [last access 24 September 2013]. The section on Bell Calvert in chapter three is based on the last part of 'The Pragmatics of Literary Interaction in James Hogg's *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *Papers from the Lancaster University Postgraduate Conference in Linguistics & Language Teaching 2010*, 5 (2011), 92-108 <<http://www.ling.lancs.ac.uk/pgconference/v05.htm>> [last access 24 September 2013]. The section on 'Cousin Mattie' in chapter three is based on 'The Pragmatics of Dreams in James Hogg's 'Cousin Mattie'', <<http://www.pala.ac.uk/resources/proceedings/2012/leonardi2012.pdf>> [last access 24 September 2013].

### **Declaration**

I declare that this thesis is my own work and that all critical and other sources (literary and electronic) have been specifically and properly acknowledged, as when they occur in the body of my text.

Signed:

Date:

## Introduction

A self-educated shepherd, Scottish writer James Hogg (1770-1835) challenged the emerging discourses of empire in early nineteenth-century Britain. Presenting controversial figures such as prostitutes, outspoken servants, and anti-heroic-picaresque characters as protagonists, Hogg emphasised stereotypes of gender and language, with the result that he showed the social contradictions at the heart of empire formation. This aspect distinguished him from contemporary authors such as Walter Scott who, in his historical novels, promoted more positive images of the empire. Hogg's methods provoked charges of 'indelicacy' on the part of the Edinburgh literary élite who perceived him as a subversive voice; for this reason, his writing was widely censored and most of his works badly reviewed.

In the early nineteenth century, Edinburgh was a centre of sophisticated culture, reflecting the legacy of the Scottish Enlightenment and the influence of eighteenth-century empiricists such as Francis Hutcheson, David Hume, and Adam Smith. These intellectuals had established 'absolute standards of taste' which mirrored 'elitist' attitudes towards autodidacts and would greatly influence the subsequent early nineteenth-century Scottish *literati*'s opinion of Hogg who—being a 'peasant poet'—would be regarded only 'on their own terms'.<sup>1</sup> Hogg's writing was accepted when in the form of more rural genres such as ballads and songs, as this was in line with the Romantic figures of the 'bard' and the 'rustic peasant-poet'. Hogg's image as the Ettrick Shepherd, however, would later become a problem for his literary career, as it would struggle against 'a historiography which at once valorized the poet as voice of a primordial stage of society close to nature and

---

<sup>1</sup> Valentina Bold, *James Hogg: A Bard of Nature's Making* (Oxford: Peter Lang, 2007), p. 19.

depreciated him as an uncouth relic doomed to extinction by the logic of economic and cultural improvement'.<sup>2</sup> The same Edinburgh *literati* would have problems with Hogg's attempts at dealing with more urban and sophisticated literary genres, such as the national tale, the historical novel, the drama, and the epic because Hogg's 'indelicacies' disturbed the imperial ideology which these works were meant to convey. In the early nineteenth century, the Scottish ruling class developed the notion of North Britain: 'a new name to match a new post-Union Scottish identity'. Lairds, aristocrats, lawyers, intellectuals, and politicians were willing to enjoy the fruits of the imperial economy. Yet, in order to do so, they had to mould their 'cultural and linguistic norms' to those of 'polite England', as this cultural cleansing would smooth the path of their career in the colonial space.<sup>3</sup>

In 1815, after Waterloo and the end of the Napoleonic Wars, the British Empire was of colossal dimensions and it offered prodigious opportunities to Scotland. In 1707 the Glaswegian merchants involved in the tobacco trade had been quite reluctant to join the political union with England for fear of losing their commercial power in competition with the English traders. At the beginning of the nineteenth century, however, the economic advantages of the Union were unquestionable. The tobacco lords had direct access to the colonial trade and their ships 'were granted the protection of the Royal Navy'.<sup>4</sup> The capital gained through the tobacco trade in North America and sugar in the Caribbean was then invested in Scotland. T. M. Devine observes that, although part of the merchants' fortune went into personal luxuries such as mansions, land, and precious furnishing, a great

---

<sup>2</sup> Ian Duncan, *Scott's Shadow: The Novel in Romantic Edinburgh* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2007), p. 149.

<sup>3</sup> Douglas S. Mack, *Scottish Fiction and the British Empire* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2006), p. 53.

<sup>4</sup> T. M. Devine, *Scotland's Empire 1600-1815* (London: Penguin Books, 2004 [2003]), p. 74.



amount of capital was also invested in the manufacturing industry to supply the colonists with goods. The transatlantic market thus boosted the industrialisation of Glasgow and its hinterland (Devine 2004[2003]: 330-31).

The colonial project also offered career opportunities to the younger sons of the laird class. There had been an increase in population during the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries; this meant that the younger sons of the Scottish aristocracy had greater chances of survival than in the past. The system of primogeniture, however, did not allow them to inherit their father's land; yet, they still had to achieve 'gainful employment [...] which would not only provide income but an acceptably genteel position in society' (Devine 2004[2003]: 66). Robert Gordon of Cluny, one of these lairds, was particularly grateful for the chance that the imperial project had bestowed on his younger son, as he 'had not estate whereby to make him a Scotch laird.'<sup>5</sup>

These aspirations developed an incredible system of Scottish patronage in the Empire, which had its roots in the structure of the Scottish gentry. One of the most representative figures of imperial patronage during the eighteenth century was Henry Dundas who from 1779, 'as sole Keeper of the Signet', had become 'the decisive influence over appointment to government posts in Scotland and systematically used his position to build up a complex network of clients, voters and local interests who depended on him for favours, places, promotions and pensions' (Devine 2004[2003]: 249, 236). Such opportunism incited great antipathy in England where political caricatures gave birth to the image of the greedy Scot in the collective imagination

---

<sup>5</sup> Ned C. Landsman, 'A Scots Community: Settlement Patterns and Family Networks in the New World Environment', in *Scotland and its First American Colony, 1683-1765*, written by Ned C. Landsman (Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1985), pp. 131-62 (p. 107).

(Mack 2006: 53). The British Union with England was thus pivotal to the modern development of Scotland, as ‘virtually every other sphere of Scottish life, from economy to emigration, from rural transformation to political development, was fashioned in large part by engagement with empire’ (Devine 2004[2003]: 360).

In the early nineteenth century, the Scoto-British discourse was spread through the national tale and the historical novel, two novelistic genres which articulated the grand narrative of national progress. Katie Trumpener claims that the national tale originated in the Jacobin novel of the 1790s, later evolving into a new novelistic experiment undertaken by Irish writers Maria Edgeworth in *Belinda* (1801) and *Leonora* (1806), as well as by Sydney Owenson in *The Wild Irish Girl* (1806).<sup>6</sup> According to Ina Ferris, the fortunate cross-national marriage between the main characters became an allegory of the political reconciliation between the British nations.<sup>7</sup> It promoted, however, a distorted image of empire which, in line with Michel Foucault’s notion of discourse, blocked and invalidated other knowledge<sup>8</sup> as, for example, the negative consequences of the imperial enterprise on the lower classes. Ferris argues that in the national tale, ‘novelistic representation remains tied to a mimetic model [...] that rules out the possibilities of taking seriously any fiction that makes more active the pragmatic and performative notion of representation [...] as a presentation of something different’ (Ferris 2002: 47). Concerning the long narrative *The Three Perils of Man* (1822), Caroline McCracken-Flesher observes that

---

<sup>6</sup> Katie Trumpener, *Bardic Nationalism: The Romantic Novel and the British Empire* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997), pp. 124-32.

<sup>7</sup> Ina Ferris (2002), *The Romantic National Tale and the Question of Ireland*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), p. 48.

<sup>8</sup> Michel Foucault, *The History of Sexuality: An Introduction*, vol. 1, trans. by Robert Hurley (New York: Vintage Books, 1990), p. 18.

‘Hogg writes within and plays against the genre of the national tale [...] a game [...] essential to a nation seeking to live beyond the binarisms of British or class identities’.<sup>9</sup> This thesis will contend that the marriage trope is an overarching thread in Hogg’s *œuvre* and that Hogg rearticulated this plot convention not only in his own revisitation of the novel, but also in the short story, the narrative poem, the epic, and the drama, in order to question the progressive assumptions of the British Union, and to voice a more varied and less artificial reality of Scotland at the time of imperial expansion.

Hogg was concerned with the moral implications of developments in Scotland, as they reflected the imperial economic interests of the bourgeoisie at the expense of the poor classes. He hence sought to make his readership more responsive to the abuse embedded in related economic developments, as Douglas Mack (2006: 57-65) notices in his reading of Hogg’s short story ‘Tibby Hyslop’s Dream’ (1829 [1827]), where the focus is on the exploitation of the Scottish Lowland peasantry by selfish masters (see chapter four). Hogg was aware of how the discourse of North Britain tended to obscure social problems both in the country and the city, in order to promote a healthy image of empire.

In the urban context of early nineteenth-century Edinburgh, one of these problems was prostitution. The industrial revolution had caused a rapid movement of population from the country to the city. This demographic shift, however, had also contributed to the degradation of Edinburgh’s urban life and to an increase in the number of destitute women who resorted to prostitution as a means of survival, and

---

<sup>9</sup> Caroline McCracken-Flesher, “‘Perfectly Ludicrous’: The Game of National Meaning in *The Three Perils of Man*”, in *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author*, ed. by Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009), pp. 175-84 (footnote 7 on p. 176).

whose hardships were described in detail by the surgeon William Tait.<sup>10</sup> He claimed that scarce employment, inadequate remuneration for needlework in a market that was ‘completely overstocked’ and early widowhood, which left young women burdened with large families and ‘without the means of subsistence’, were among the main causes (Tait 1840: 107, 111). Hogg empathised with those women who had resorted to prostitution, and he wanted to make the public more conscious of this social issue, highlighting its negative consequences ‘on the prostitutes themselves, their clients, and society at large’, as David Groves observes in his analysis of *The Three Perils of Woman* (1823) (see chapter one).<sup>11</sup>

Two other major social concerns which Hogg portrays in some of his works are illegitimate pregnancy and infanticide. In the early nineteenth century, this reality clashed with Adam Smith’s idea that society’s treatment of children is one of the signs of Western civilisation. In his *Theory of Moral Sentiments* (1759) Smith claims, ‘Can there be greater barbarity [...] than to hurt an infant? [...] Yet] we find at this day that this practice prevails among all savage nations.’<sup>12</sup> At the time of Hogg’s writing, Smith’s notion was exploited by British ideology to support the imperial economic expansion under the cover of civil improvement. However, chapter three will show that infanticide was a reality still existent in Scotland, when birth control was not an option.

---

<sup>10</sup> William Tait, *Magdalenism: An Enquiry into the Extent, Causes, and Consequences of Prostitution in Edinburgh*, 1st edn (Edinburgh: P. Rickard, South Bridge, 1840) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 25 August 2012]; William Tait, *Magdalenism: An Enquiry into the Extent, Causes, and Consequences of Prostitution in Edinburgh*, 2nd edn (Edinburgh, Glasgow, and London, 1842) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 25 August 2012]. The pages indicated refer to the first edition. When substantial changes are present, the pages of the second edition will be provided.

<sup>11</sup> David Groves, ‘James Hogg’s *Confessions* and *Three Perils of Woman* and the Edinburgh Prostitution Scandal of 1823’, *The Wordsworth Circle*, 18:3 (1987), 127-31 (p. 131).

<sup>12</sup> Adam Smith, *The Theory of Moral Sentiments*, ed. by D. D. Raphael and A. L. Macfie, Glasgow Edition of the Works and Correspondence of Adam Smith (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1976 [1759]), pp. 209-10.

Hogg was also concerned with the waste of human life derived from nearly two decades of war with France for imperial expansion. T. M. Devine sustains that ‘empire and militarism were linked together like Siamese twins’, as the colonial dominion ‘had to be achieved on many battlefields across the world and by the unrelenting application of massive naval force on the high seas’ (2004[2003]: 291). Chapter two will show Hogg’s awareness of the fact that the myth of the Highland warrior played an important role in British imperial militarism and that the Napoleonic Wars expanded the British Empire at a high cost of human capital.

A few critics have discussed Hogg’s treatment of gender; for example, James Barcus has explored the figure of the proto-postmodern father in Hogg’s narrative poem *Mador of the Moor* (1816) (see chapter three); Douglas Mack has provided a thorough analysis of Hogg’s representation of Mary Queen of Scots in *The Queen’s Wake* (1813); and Mack and Suzanne Gilbert have treated gender issues in the introduction to *Queen Hynde* (1824) (see chapter four). Of particular interest is the back-and-forth discussion between David Groves and Barbara Bloedé about *Three Perils of Woman* and the Edinburgh prostitution scandal of 1823 (see chapter one), where they discuss the origins of Gatty’s disease. However, the representation of gender in the work of James Hogg is an area that only recently has been identified as requiring investigation. A more focused research into Hogg’s handling of gender is still needed, as Carme Fonte and Silvia Mergenthal strongly advocated in their gender-related papers at the conference ‘From Ettrick to Empire: New Directions in James Hogg Studies’ held at Stirling in August 2007. Mergenthal has recently published an essay on ‘Hogg, Gender, and Sexuality’, where she argues that ‘[o]ne of the reasons [...] why Hogg’s men and women do not become “round characters”

is that they are situated at the interfaces of conflicting constructions of, respectively, masculinity and femininity'.<sup>13</sup> The aim of this thesis is to highlight the astute use that Hogg made of such gender constructions in order to convey his own personal critique of specific Scottish social issues during the expansion of the British Empire. Despite Hogg's preoccupations with gender and language, no substantial study of this aspect of his work has been produced. By focusing on Hogg's masterly management of early nineteenth-century stereotypes of masculinity and femininity, this thesis will thus fill a significant gap.

The gender themes mentioned above will be discussed in more detail in the chapters devoted to the trope of marriage (chapter one); Highland, Lowland, and sentimental masculinities (chapter two); women's chastity and its relation to the issues of out-of-wedlock pregnancy, infanticide, and prostitution (chapter three); and the discursive significance of the bourgeois lady, to whom Hogg counterpoises the peasant woman (Hogg's proto-postmodern heroine), whom he eventually offers as a more authentic alternative to the heroine depicted in contemporary progressive narratives (chapter four). The thesis will consider these gender topics in their dynamics with class (upper, middle, and peasant) and ethnicity (Highland, Lowland, Scottish, English, and British). Although each of the four chapters addresses a specific gender topic, they all may overlap in a single work—a fact which further highlights Hogg's complexity and the critical value of his works. For example, through the buffoon figure of Rickleton in *The Three Perils of Woman* (1823) Hogg depicts stereotypes of masculinity, bourgeois notions of marriage and prostitution, and the negative consequences of women's seduction (see chapters one and two).

---

<sup>13</sup> Silvia Mergenthal, 'Hogg, Gender, and Sexuality', in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Ian Duncan and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012), pp. 82-89 (p. 88).

The following part of this introduction will primarily focus on the theoretical framework arguing that Bakhtin's notions of *heteroglossia* and recent developments in linguistic pragmatics (a field concerned with the principles that govern the actual use of language) can shed new light onto Hogg's treatment of gender. The initiators of this branch of linguistics were John L. Austin and John R. Searle, two philosophers of language who in the 1950s and 1960s, respectively, conceived speech-act theory by focusing on the notion that when uttering words, a speaker also performs acts. The thesis, however, will draw on subsequent developments in pragmatics, specifically politeness theory, the cooperative principle of communication, and relevance theory, taking into account the limits of applying these principles—devised for the analysis of oral language—to literary communication.

Some scholars have unwittingly suggested how productive a pragmaticist line of investigation might be for the analysis of voices in Hogg's texts. Crawford Gribben, for instance, has observed that the rhetorical force of *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (1824) is conveyed through the power of allusion. Michael Kearns has argued that in the *Confessions*, the shift from Scots into English in Samuel Scrape's embedded tale of Lucky Shaw conveys an additional meaning, namely, the inability of the inhabitants of Auchtermuchty to recognise the devil in disguise and hence 'their unwillingness to perceive' [...] "the ruinous tendency of the tenets so sublimely inculcated" in 'literary English'. Ian Campbell has observed that though in the *Confessions* voices from the margins convey high moral value in broad Scots, hence counteracting the 'link between English and

Good', the prostitute Bell Calvert speaks Standard English.<sup>14</sup> Hogg's use of languages was sophisticated and cannot be explained by a mere binary opposition between English as representative of Good and Scots of Evil. Bell Calvert's Standard English, in fact, hints at her high-class origin and, hence, at the threat of prostitution into which all women from any social background might fall (see chapter three); while in *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*, Katharine Laidlaw (a female character from the peasant class) voices her values in beautiful English, thus competing for the role of heroine with the female middle-class protagonists of contemporary fiction (see chapter four). These phenomena show that Hogg made a subtler use of languages in his texts than other contemporary authors. Walter Scott allowed voices from the margins to speak broad Scots often for comic reasons; while Hogg foregrounded marginal voices to question contemporary discursive assumptions.

Twentieth-century scholars agree on the fact that Hogg's negative reception in the 1820s was influenced by extra-literary reasons which had nothing to do with the ability of Hogg as a writer. Drawing on linguistic pragmatics and on Bakhtin dialogics, this project provides a new critical perspective on a wide range of Hogg's works to explore the, often negative, reception of his writing during his lifetime. This critical lens reveals how Hogg's bold linguistic techniques and performance (as shown in his treatment of gender and specific social issues) challenged the accepted

---

<sup>14</sup> Crawford Gribben, 'James Hogg, Scottish Calvinism and Literary Theory', *Scottish Studies Review*, 5·2 (Autumn 2004), 9-26; Michael S. Kearns, 'Intuition and Narration in James Hogg's *Confessions*', *Studies in Scottish Literature*, 13 (1978), 81-91 (p. 83); Ian Campbell, 'Afterword', in *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*, written by James Hogg, ed. by P. D. Garside (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002 [2000]), pp. 177-92 (p. 184).



literary conventions of his day by highlighting Hogg's communicative skills in voicing different members of the Scottish society within the accepted norms of the National Tale. The way in which the project investigates the reader response to Hogg's texts during the early nineteenth century thus contributes significantly to a wider understanding of Hogg's place within the Romantic period.

Though considering the still valuable notion of feminist critics, such as Judith Butler's and Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick's, that gender is performed through language, the argument of the thesis will not be supported by these theories because they are based on J. L. Austin's notion of language performativity which represents an early stage in pragmatics. Austin devised three aspects of the speech act: 'locution', the act of saying something; 'illocution', the act carried out in the act of saying something; and 'perlocution', the effects of these acts on the hearers. For example, in performing the 'locutionary act' 'Could you please open the window?', the speaker also performs the 'illocutionary act' of making a request, which will have a 'perlocutionary effect' on the hearer. The notion of performativity has played an important role in anti-essentialist gender studies such as Butler's and Sedgwick's, as both scholars share the assumption that gender identity is culturally constructed, and that it does not exist outside the acts one performs through language.<sup>15</sup> Yet, in order to show that the perception of gender is a conceptual construction, these critics have over-used Austin's flexible notion of language performativity, denying any agency to the users of language. Furthermore, speech-act theory has been devised for the analysis of utterances in oral communication; hence, it 'lacks concepts adequate for

---

<sup>15</sup> Judith Butler, *Excitable Speech: A Politics of the Performative* (New York: Routledge, 1997); Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick and Andrew Parker (eds), *Performativity and Performance* (New York: Routledge 1995); Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick, *Touching Feeling: Affect, Pedagogy, Performativity* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2003).

dealing with the distinctive character of literary language', an aspect that may have limited the real potential of literary pragmatics and contributed to its discrediting.<sup>16</sup>

Dividing the development of speech-act theory into two waves, Joseph A. Porter observes that although modern critics are very knowledgeable of both Austin's notion of language performativity and Searle's theory of speech acts, they seem to be rather unaware of further developments in the field of pragmatics.<sup>17</sup> Indeed, Butler and Sedgwick do not draw on phenomena investigated by further developments into the field such as P. H. Grice's cooperative principle, Penelope Brown and Stephen Levinson's politeness theory, and Dan Sperber and Deirdre Wilson's relevance theory, which may provide greater precision to criticism in the humanities.<sup>18</sup>

Pragmatics is an eclectic linguistic field which can shed new light on the reasons why Hogg's works were received so negatively by early nineteenth-century reviewers. It offers the possibility of developing a theoretically- and critically-based discussion about *how* and *why* Hogg failed to satisfy the expectations of early nineteenth-century critics. Hogg's contemporary reviewers were rather surprised by Hogg's talent, and belittled it with comments about what they viewed as his violation of the principles of nineteenth-century literary politeness. Yet, Hogg's 'indelicacy' in

---

<sup>16</sup> See Anders Pettersson, *A Theory of Literary Discourse* (Lund: Lund University Press, 1990), pp. 19, 22.

<sup>17</sup> A. Joseph Porter, 'Pragmatics for Criticism: Two Generations of Speech Act Theory', *Poetics*, 15 (1986), 243-57, (p. 245).

<sup>18</sup> Herbert Paul Grice, 'Logic and Conversation', in *Studies in the Way of Words*, written by H. P. Grice (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1989), pp. 22-40; Penelope Brown and Stephen Levinson, *Politeness: Some Universals in Language Usage* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987); Dan Sperber and Deirdre Wilson, *Relevance: Communication and Cognition* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1986).

addressing prostitution, out-of-wedlock pregnancy, and infanticide interrogated important cultural assumptions inherent in the formation of the bourgeoisie, the class at the heart of the British Empire. Contemporary reviewers were then quick to dismiss Hogg's works by considering them as not relevant to their representation of the world. Relevance theory will expose *how* prejudiced these reviewers' reception of Hogg's works was and *why*, on the contrary, the same texts have encountered a far more positive response in the twentieth century.

The following section of this introduction will explain in more detail the cooperative principle of communication as devised by Grice (1989), highlighting how a discussion about Hogg's creative process can be supported by this approach. There will then be a critical overview of relevance theory, Bakhtin dialogics, politeness theory, and social deixis as applied to the primary texts explored in this thesis. The aim is to expose the tension between Hogg's individuality and the social forces that shaped the bourgeoisie at the time of imperial expansion.

### ***The cooperative principle of communication***

Grice (1989) argues that in order to understand meaning in conversation, a hearer needs to ask what a speaker intends to convey by his or her specific linguistic choices rather than what a chain of words literally means, because the sender usually communicates more than what is actually said. Starting from this assumption, Grice has formulated the cooperative principle of communication: 'Make your conversational contribution such as is required, at the stage at which it occurs, by the accepted purpose or direction of the talk exchange in which you are engaged' (1989: 26).

Grice bases the cooperative principle upon four ‘maxims’, arguing that conversational behaviour is constrained by rational expectations of ‘quantity’ (make your contribution sufficient); of ‘quality’ (make your contribution true); of ‘relation’ (be relevant to the topic under discussion); and of ‘manner’ (avoid ambiguity, obscurity of expression, and be orderly). Grice’s maxims are not so much important for the set of regulative principles he proposes as for how a speaker can intentionally ‘flout’ them in order to generate an indirect meaning, which Grice calls a ‘conversational implicature’. This is conveyed by what could have been said but was ultimately suppressed, relying on shared knowledge with the hearer to convey an implied message. Grice’s assumption is that the speaker always observes the cooperative principle because, though the maxims may be flouted ‘at the level of what is said’, they are always respected at ‘the level of what is implicated’ (Grice 1989: 33).

Though Grice never conceived of his cooperative principle beyond the verbal exchange, nor ever extended ‘his discussion to social context’, his insight on how an implicature can be conveyed by flouting the maxims of conversation could still be put to more potentially creative use for discourse analysis of that which is beyond the utterance.<sup>19</sup> Regarding literary communication, Roger D. Sell observes that as speakers might flout a maxim ‘in order to make a conversational implicature’, so also an author might exploit the same strategy when shaping his work for ‘real readers’. The latter, however, go on assuming that there must be ‘some element of implicature [...] and tolerantly interpret the difficulties away’.<sup>20</sup> Grice’s notion of implicature

---

<sup>19</sup> Kenneth Lindblom, ‘Cooperating with Grice: A Cross-disciplinary Metaperspective on Uses of Grice’s Cooperative Principle’, *Journal of Pragmatics*, 33 (2001), 1601-23 (pp. 1620, 1602).

<sup>20</sup> Roger D. Sell, *Literature as Communication: The Foundations of Mediating Criticism* (Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 2000), pp. 52, 58, 59.

may clarify ‘how authors and readers go about “co-creating” the literary work’,<sup>21</sup> as authors may intentionally omit some information or provide their text with misleading sentences in order to develop the plot.

Sell claims that Grice’s cooperative principle could be very productive for ‘a historical yet non-historicist literary pragmatics’ since an author, too, might flout a maxim ‘for some special and striking effect’ (Sell 2000: 52). Though readers may be patient with a writer flouting the maxim of quality, ‘when it comes to flouting the maxims of quantity, relevance and manner, readers [...] may well dislike being steamrollered by authors they experience as impolite’ (Sell 2000: 59). Yet, in Hogg’s case also flouting the maxim of quality (being true) was perceived as impolite by his contemporary readers because Hogg’s ghosts and visions disappointed their post-Enlightenment expectations, according to which the use of the supernatural in the literary discourse had to be rationalised.

Concerning the analysis of literary texts, Mary Louise Pratt considers Grice’s maxims of conversation as ‘very general appropriateness conditions that participants in a speech exchange normally assume to be in force’.<sup>22</sup> She points out that though

speech acts have been discussed in terms of single-sentence utterances [...] appropriateness conditions for explaining, thanking, or persuading [...] must [...] be seen as applying to explanations, thankings, or persuadings that are many sentences long. (1977: 85)

Pratt observes that very few linguists and philosophers of language have addressed this aspect. This is why she argues for the existence of ‘multisentence utterances’ which, having a ‘single point of purpose’, make the application of Grice’s maxims

---

<sup>21</sup> Jacob L. Mey, ‘Literary Pragmatics’, in *Concise Encyclopedia of Pragmatics*, ed. by Jacob L. Mey, 2nd edn (Oxford: Elsevier, 2009a [2006]), pp. 549-55 (p. 550).

<sup>22</sup> Mary Louise Pratt, *Toward a Speech Act Theory of Literary Discourse* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1977), p. 130.

possible at the level of discourse beyond the utterance and, regarding literary texts, for stretches longer than the sentence.

Though Grice considered the maxim of relevance ‘extremely complex and in need of clarification’, according to Pratt ‘[a]n assertion [...] will still be pointless if it has no real or supposed relation to the interests of the hearer’ (1977: 132, 134; see Grice 1989: 30); for this reason, she argues that a wide range of ‘representative speech acts’, namely those utterances asserting a state of affairs in the world, and literary works in particular, ‘belong to the subclass of utterances whose relevance is tellability and whose point is to display experience’ (1977: 152). Pratt observes that

[i]n making an assertion whose relevance is tellability, a speaker is not only reporting but also verbally *displaying* a state of affairs, inviting his addressee(s) to join him in contemplating it, evaluating it, and responding to it. [...] What he is after is an *interpretation* of the problematic event, an assignment of meaning and value supported by the consensus of himself and the hearers. (1977: 136)

Similarly, Sell distinguishes between primary and secondary tellability, where the former ‘seeks to get listeners or readers hooked’ and the latter is ‘the ultimate “point” or “moral” of a story, something which is much more open to interpretation’, thereby arguing that, in so doing, an author invites the readers ‘to compare notes about something’.<sup>23</sup> When flouting Grice’s maxims of communication in *Mador of the Moor* and ‘Cousin Mattie’ (see chapter three), Hogg was inviting his readership to ‘contemplate, evaluate, and respond’ to the issue of out-of-wedlock pregnancy and infanticide in early nineteenth-century Scotland, an aspect which, however, questioned the picture of the motherly heroine in contemporary bourgeois fiction, thus raising negative criticism.

---

<sup>23</sup> Roger D. Sell, *Communicational Criticism: Studies in Literature as Dialogue* (Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 2011), pp. 210, 26.

Grice's set of maxims may still be productive for the literary critic, though more research needs to be carried out into how to implement them for an analysis beyond the sentence. On this point, new research could be developed starting from Pratt's insight on tellability and drawing from what A. Pettersson and Tatyana Karpenko have argued in their subsequent research.<sup>24</sup>

Drawing on Searle's theory of speech acts, according to which utterances should introduce 'a representation of (possible) realities, where the introduction of the representation has a certain kind of point', A. Pettersson claims that 'literary language, too, can be regarded as the introduction of possible realities provided with a point' relevant to the reader. He adds two new concepts to Searle's theory of speech acts in order to make possible the analysis of *how* literary communication functions in textual stretches longer than the sentence: '*the point of a whole discourse* and *the type of point specifically associated with whole literary discourses*' (2012: 165-66, emphases original).

In discussing the applicability of Grice's maxims to the analysis of literary texts, Karpenko argues that 'the apparent contradictions [...] can be resolved if the starting point of analysis is the purpose of literary communication', and she draws on Geoffrey N. Leech's 'goal-oriented approach' to language activity. In his goal-oriented model of discourse, Leech argues for 'long-term goals (persisting through a whole discourse or section of discourse) and short-term goals (which may, for example, be confined to a single sentence or utterance)'.<sup>25</sup> Chapter three will show

---

<sup>24</sup> Tatyana Karpenko, 'Pragmatic Aspects of Literary Communication', PALA Occasional Papers, 3 (1993), 1-20 <<http://www.pala.ac.uk/resources/op/Paper03.pdf>> [accessed 13 October 2012]; Anders Pettersson, 'Literary Practice', in *The Concept of Literary Application: Reader's Analogies from Text to Life*, written by Anders Pettersson (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), pp. 163-85.

<sup>25</sup> Geoffrey N. Leech, 'Pragmatics, Discourse Analysis, Stylistics and "the Celebrated Letter"', in *Prose Studies*, 6·2 (1983), 142-57 (pp. 145-50), quoted by Karpenko (1993) on p. 5.

that Hogg's long-term goal to reveal the reality of illegitimate motherhood to his early nineteenth-century readership is the principle guiding the flouting of Grice's maxims in *Mador of the Moor* and 'Cousin Mattie' for sections longer than the sentence.

Literary texts—as well as a real conversation—may be analysed within a Gricean framework, as their fictional status does not affect their communicative quality since, as Sell claims, their 'specific or episodic *non-truth* can implicate general or moral *truth*' (2000: 253). Literature is not written 'with a view to communicating true statements', and the reader's literary experience may be seen as an 'indirect thinking about reality', which may 'prove cognitively or emotionally rewarding'.<sup>26</sup> This was Hogg's main purpose when using the supernatural in his works. Contemporary reviewers critiqued Hogg's conflation of the natural and supernatural, viewing his lack of education as the cause of such inconsistency. Yet, revealingly, twentieth-century studies of Hogg's creative process have shown that 'his ghosts, brownies, visions and dreams always carry a symbolic and thematic significance, whatever their real status in the real world'.<sup>27</sup> In *Mador of the Moor*, Hogg's depiction of the fairies kidnapping illegitimate children was a veiled critique of the Scottish Kirk's stigmatisation of children born out of wedlock; while, more generally, Hogg's use of the supernatural reflected his unwillingness to comply with contemporary appropriations of tradition because they tended to diminish the value of oral culture, an important aspect of Scottish identity.

---

<sup>26</sup> Anders Pettersson, *Verbal Art: A Philosophy of Literature and Literary Experience* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2000), pp. 120, 36, 310.

<sup>27</sup> David Groves, *James Hogg: The Growth of a Writer* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1988) p. 93.



### ***Relevance theory***

Reducing Grice's four maxims of communication to the principle of relevance, Dan Sperber and Deirdre Wilson (1986) have argued that hearers interpret speakers' new information only when relevant to improving their personal representation of the world, which they define 'cognitive environment', and only when such interpretation requires the minimum processing effort. However, it must be argued that Grice's notion of relevance is slightly different from Sperber and Wilson's, as Grice's maxim with the same name refers to the topic under discussion, while Sperber and Wilson's notion of relevance regards the hearers' interest in increasing their knowledge.

Sperber and Wilson describe their theory as 'ostensive-inferential communication' in that the hearers' inferential process is triggered by the speakers' manifest intention to communicate their implicature. According to them, an act of ostensive communication automatically communicates a *presumption of relevance*', while '[t]he addressees of an act of ostensive communication are the individuals whose cognitive environment the communicator is trying to modify (1986: 156, 158, emphasis original).

Most importantly for the thesis of this dissertation, Sperber and Wilson conceive of context as psychologically activated by the hearer at the very moment of utterance interpretation, rather than as already existing and shared by all the participants of the interaction. In this way, they counteract the 'unitary context assumption', namely the assumption that all participants involved in a conversation share the same context. Two interlocutors can have a similar system of values, share the same situational context of interaction, and hold mutual assumptions about the

use of language; yet, their respective representation of the world will never be identical.

Drawing on relevance theory, Sell claims that in the specific case of literary communication, the unitary context assumption is ‘unhistorical and dehumanizing’ as it implies that ‘any given text can only be taken in just some single way: either according to the putative intention of its author, or according to the understanding of the current commentator’ (2000: 133). According to Sell, any act of reading is characterised by an inferential process which goes beyond the author’s control and which can never be predicted, as it is determined by the tension between the reader’s cultural background and his or her own personal beliefs. When reading Hogg’s works, the early nineteenth-century bourgeois readership experienced different ‘cognitive environments’ clashing against each other, which they could have found rather difficult to negotiate, hence resulting in a negative response to Hogg’s texts.<sup>28</sup>

According to Christie (2000), relevance theory is particularly valuable for gender studies. Since women’s speech in some contexts of occurrence tends to be viewed as less significant than men’s, relevance about information delivered by a female speaker may be limited by patriarchal prejudices. Hearers tend to generate inferences only when they view new information to be relevant to expanding their personal knowledge. An area still remaining to be explored is whether the speaker’s social status, gender, ethnicity, age or education impact on the hearer’s assumptions about how relevant that information will be. Sally McConnell-Ginet argues that the

---

<sup>28</sup> Since space precludes further discussion of relevance theory, for its application to the analysis of literary texts see Adrian Pilkington, ‘Poetic Effects: A Relevance Theory Perspective’, in *Literary Pragmatics*, ed. by Roger D. Sell (London: Routledge, 1991), pp. 44-61; Adrian Pilkington, *Poetic Effects: A Relevance Theory Perspective* (Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 2000); see also the special issue on relevance theory, rhetoric, and style, in *Language and Literature*, ed. by Adrian Pilkington, 5:3 (1996).

authority of certain meanings can be attributed on the basis of gender power in relation to context and social status.<sup>29</sup> A critical discussion of Hogg's works based on these insights of relevance theory can thus clarify theoretically the reasons *why* Hogg's works are more relevant to the cognitive environment of post-modern and post-feminist readers rather than to the bourgeois readership of early nineteenth-century Edinburgh. The latter were rather prejudiced in their reaction to Hogg's texts, failing to see (or probably pretending not to) the cultural assumptions that he was interrogating. Contemporary reviewers preferred to dismiss the critical value of Hogg's works by claiming his background and lack of formal education as the principal causes of his boldness when addressing female gender issues and when not providing a rational explanation for the use of his ghosts and visions. On the other hand, in his reading of *Mador of the Moor*, twentieth-century critic James Barcus has especially appreciated Hogg's portrayal of Ila Moore's forgiving father who accepts his daughter's illegitimate pregnancy (see chapter three). As will be shown later, Hogg 'proto-postmodern' father and husband reappear in *The Profligate Princes* with Sir March pardoning his erring and forsaken Elenor (see chapter three), and in *Perils of Woman* with Rickleton accepting his wife's pregnancy by a former lover (see chapter one and two). Significantly, both works were badly reviewed by Hogg's contemporary commentators.

### ***Politeness, social deixis, and heteroglossia***

Starting from Grice's cooperative principle, Penelope Brown and Stephen Levinson (1987) have developed politeness theory with the aim of clarifying Grice's model of

---

<sup>29</sup> Sally McConnell-Ginet, 'The Sexual (Re)Production of Meaning: A Discourse-Based Theory', in *The Feminist Critique of Language*, ed. by Deborah Cameron, 2nd edn (London: Routledge, 1998), pp. 198-210 (p. 207).

conversation. They wondered why speakers do not just say what they mean, flouting instead Grice's maxims and exploiting conversational implicatures (Christie 2000: 152). Observing the phenomenon of deference, so powerfully internalised in the culture of Far-Eastern societies, Brown and Levinson have thus developed a set of politeness principles, arguing that all languages (to a greater or lesser extent) recognise a need for saving 'face' in social interaction. They claim that any dialogic exchange between individuals entails a potential 'threat' to their face. For this reason, speakers exploit a set of strategies meant to express solidarity and to minimise such threats both to themselves and their hearers. Assuming a Model Person endowed with rationality and face, Brown and Levinson have thus come to distinguish between 'negative face' (hearers' need for not feeling limited in whatever they want to do) and 'positive face' (hearers' need for social approval). 'Face threatening acts' against positive face criticise, ridicule, or show irreverence towards the hearer; while requests and orders may threaten the hearer's negative face.<sup>30</sup>

Christie observes that the problem with Brown and Levinson's theory is the abstraction of a Model Person who is assumed to share the same rationality and face with all other human beings, irrespective of their class, gender, and culture (2000: 157). Similarly, Sara Mills in her subsequent study on the relation between gender and politeness observes that individuals have to negotiate continuously not only with the gender stereotypes that circulate within their particular social groups, but also

---

<sup>30</sup> There are two further strategies in politeness: going 'bald', at the furthest end of positive politeness, when the speaker is not concerned about offending because he or she either is in a more powerful position than the hearer or there is such urgency, as in the case of fire, that face threats are not considered; and going 'off record', the furthest point of negative politeness, when the speaker drops a hint rather than making a direct request, hence leaving the hearer free to choose whether to help or not (Brown and Levinson 1987: 94-100, 211-27).

‘with other variables like race, class, age, sexual orientation, contextual elements, and so on’ which influence both their production and interpretation of politeness.<sup>31</sup>

Despite linguists’ negative reactions to the supposed universality of politeness principles, Sell claims that Brown and Levinson’s notion of face threatening acts, and their distinction between positive and negative face, may open up very productive lines of investigation for literary criticism.<sup>32</sup> Regarding the politeness of literary communication, Sell distinguishes between ‘selectional’ and ‘presentational’ politeness, arguing that while the former deals with the author’s choice of topics which a potential community of readers may perceive as breaking social taboos, presentational politeness evaluates whether the author is observing Grice’s maxims and thus being cooperative with the reader (1991b: 221-22). Similarly to Christie (2000) and Mills (2003), Sell (2000) argues that literary criticism that discusses selectional politeness must be ‘culture specific and historical’ because the perception of what is considered to break social taboos changes not only across time and space, but also within the same community of people (Sell 2000: 225-26). A cultural contextualisation of politeness principles will thus be highly productive for the criticism of Hogg’s works and explain theoretically the reason for both the negative reviews of his contemporary critics and the more positive reception by twentieth-century scholars.

Hogg’s indelicacy in addressing topics such as infanticide, out-of-wedlock pregnancy, and prostitution interrogated the discursive logic of bourgeois identity. As argued by Michel Foucault, late eighteenth-century bourgeois discourse cloaked

---

<sup>31</sup> Sara Mills, *Gender and Politeness* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), p. 1.

<sup>32</sup> Roger D. Sell, ‘The Politeness of Literary Texts’, in *Literary Pragmatics*, ed. by Sell (1991b), pp. 208-24 (pp. 212-15).

sexuality in silence, reducing it to the reproductive function within familial boundaries: extra-marital relations were not permitted in bourgeois logic, and speaking freely about sex was considered indelicate (1990: 1-18). Anne McClintock observes that the bourgeois trope of the family was fundamental to the construction of British national identity. The subordination of either wife to husband or of children to adults provided a language to articulate other external relations in familial terms, so that the infantilisation of colonials, women, and members of the lower classes resulted in the perception of differences in class, gender, and ethnicity as natural and legitimate.<sup>33</sup> Mrinalini Sinha points out that in the late-eighteenth century, bourgeois decorum—sustained by sexual restraint and marriage—emerged alongside cultural constructions of national difference. By the nineteenth century, the interrelation between ‘nationalism’ and ‘bourgeois respectability’ reached its highest degree in the metropolitan centre and its principles were spread across all classes. Bourgeois norms also differentiated ‘pure’ from ‘fallen’ women: the former in their subordinate roles of mothers, wives, and daughters acted as symbolic signifiers of national discourse, while the stigmatisation of prostitutes as fallen women further contributed to the construction of middle-class identity.<sup>34</sup>

As Kathleen Wilson observes, the role of British middle-class women in nation-making and empire-formation was of paramount importance, as they represented the moral authority of the imperial project.<sup>35</sup> The vogue for sensibility,

---

<sup>33</sup> Anne McClintock, *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Conquest* (New York: Routledge, 1995), pp. 43-45.

<sup>34</sup> Mrinalini Sinha, ‘Nations in an Imperial Crucible’, in *Gender and Empire*, ed. by Philippa Levine (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004), pp. 181-202 (p. 188).

<sup>35</sup> Kathleen Wilson, ‘Empire, Gender, and Modernity in the Eighteenth Century’, in *Gender and Empire*, ed. by Levine, pp. 14-45 (pp. 20-21).

whose values of compassion and benevolence were cultivated and internalised in the domestic sphere, defined bourgeois women's notions of womanhood and motherhood. Thus domesticity was constructed as a patriotic ideal, one which shaped the dichotomy between the private and public sphere. Wilson claims that the 'natural history of man' contributed to the establishment of sensibility in that, by exploiting Adam Smith's notion of teleological progress from 'savage' to commercial society, and David Hume's idea of the female condition as a mark of civilisation, nineteenth-century British discourse assumed the purity of middle-class white women (in contrast to female 'sexual excesses' in the colonies) as an indicator of superior civilisation. This provided a powerful tool for legitimising the imperial project (Wilson 2004: 20-21). The British discourse of gender difference and the dichotomy between public and domestic space were thus reinforced by a policy of sexual control through the institution of marriage.

The novel was the medium through which the bourgeoisie promoted the image of the motherly heroine. Foregrounding the figure of the prostitute in some of his texts, Hogg exposed the ideology inherent in the marriage plot and in the cult of domesticity, which shaped the distinction between the public and private sphere. The latter was the golden cage of the bourgeois lady, symbol of the British nation—a conceptualisation that became well established later in the mid-Victorian period, when the British Empire reached its highest expansion, but which certainly started to be shaped by Romantic authors. The prostitute was conceptualised as the 'other', stigmatised as the fallen woman at the margins of the public sphere—an image which shaped the identity of the male bourgeoisie whose members, on the contrary, dominated the high ranks of the public space (see chapter one). Douglas Mack argues

that Hogg's lack of inhibition in dealing with these matters provoked great aversion among the Edinburgh literati who, for this reason, censored his texts.<sup>36</sup>

Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson point out that the Scottish readership in the early nineteenth century was 'complex and varied', including 'an emergent working-class intelligentsia [...and] new spaces for labouring-class readers'; while contemporary 'Scottish periodicals' established notions of 'gentility and taste' thus 'mark[ing] the boundaries of suitability'. As a consequence, 'working-class writers, particularly those who threatened to disturb moral and stylistic standards, were being carefully monitored by the literati'.<sup>37</sup> Contemporary critics tended to dismiss Hogg's works by assuming his social origin as the cause of his audacity. Yet, Hogg's persistent use of such topics and refusal to yield to contemporary notions of decorum show that he was interrogating far more disturbing issues, not simply breaking social taboos.

Sell assumes that nineteenth-century fiction largely mirrors the 'interweaving of politeness with class and power' (Sell 1991: 210). The works by Hogg that violate nineteenth-century principles of literary politeness show this dynamic well. Alker and Nelson observe that Hogg's

interests were expansive and included subjects of national and global significance. The eighteenth century was an age of systemization, taxonomies and typologies, in which categories of individual, national, imperial, and historical identity were emerging. Hogg felt compelled to interrogate many of these categories from his unique perspective. (2009: 11-12)

---

<sup>36</sup> Douglas S. Mack, 'Are We Still Underestimating Hogg?', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 1 (1990a), 1-5 (p. 5).

<sup>37</sup> Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson, 'Introduction', in *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author*, ed. by Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009), pp. 1-20 (pp. 6, 5, 8, 9).



Mack, too, claims that Hogg played a ‘significant role’ in questioning ‘the Imperial élite’s power to narrate and to block other narratives from forming and emerging’.<sup>38</sup> And indeed, Hogg’s works not only question ‘issues of class and literary taste but also [...] matters of nationalism and empire’ (Alker and Nelson 2009: 12). However, a self-educated shepherd who refused to conform could not be considered a serious writer, and Hogg’s boldness was thus condemned as being inappropriate for a bourgeois lady. Yet, in ‘Basil Lee’ (1820), beyond being just indelicate, Hogg challenged the imperial dichotomy between bourgeois heroine and fallen woman by presenting a prostitute endowed with higher moral values than the eponymous protagonist. For contemporary critics, however, it was easier to ignore what Hogg was questioning by arguing that his grappling with prostitution offended ‘the best regulated modesty’ (see chapter two).<sup>39</sup>

By applying pragmatics and conversation analysis to the dialogues of Jane Austen’s characters, Massimiliano Morini argues that the author avoided any kind of confrontation with the ideology of her time by appearing to simultaneously endorse and critique the *status quo*. Morini observes that in Austen’s novels, ‘[t]he narrator’s position in his/her ideological and linguistic world is at one and the same time acquiescent and subversive, parasitic and critical’<sup>40</sup>—a fact which certainly contributed to the positive reception of Austen by contemporary critics.<sup>41</sup> Austen’s

---

<sup>38</sup> See Douglas S. Mack, *Scottish Fiction and the British Empire* (2006), p. 2, quoted by Alker and Nelson (2009: 12).

<sup>39</sup> Anon., ‘[Review of] *Winter Evening Tales*’, *Monthly Review*, n.s., 93, November 1820, pp. 263-67 (p. 264) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 2 May 2012].

<sup>40</sup> Massimiliano Morini, *Jane Austen’s Narrative Techniques: A Stylistic and Pragmatic Analysis* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2009), p. 76.

<sup>41</sup> According to John Lockhart, the reviews of Jane Austen’s *Emma* in *The Quarterly Review*, 14 (1815), p. 188, and of *Persuasion* and *Northanger Abbey* in the same journal, 24 (1821), pp. 352-76, were wrongly attributed to Walter Scott; the real author seems to have been Richard Whately, later Archbishop of Dublin. Lockhart argues that Scott’s review of Jane Austen’s *Emma* and *Northanger Abbey* appeared in *The Quarterly*, 27 (1822). See William Reitzel, ‘Sir Walter Scott’s Review of Jane

elusive technique represents the exact contrary of the narrative strategies employed by Hogg in his works, where such negotiation is completely disregarded. Austen was highly skilled at mastering what LuMing Robert Mao views as the ‘two competing forces shap[ing] our interactional behaviour: the ideal social identity and the ideal social autonomy’.<sup>42</sup> Similarly to Christie (2000), Mills (2003), and Sell (2000), Mao suggests that face and polite behaviour are shaped by a tension between a centripetal force towards adherence to the social norm and a centrifugal force towards the individual’s freedom, though ‘these two interactional ideals remain “unattainable,” in the sense that individual speakers are constantly in the process of pursuing one ideal or the other’ (1994: 472).

Re-adapting Mao’s insight on face in conversation to literary communication—where authors and readers do not share the same time, space and perhaps even culture—this thesis will show that, in some of his works, Hogg exhibits a strong wish to express his own personal criticism of the negative impact caused by the imperial project on the lower social strata of both rural and urban Scotland, as well as a desire to be accepted by the Edinburgh literary élite. His nonconformity, however, was far too disturbing for the dominant discourse. In considering the publishing rules in early nineteenth-century Edinburgh, Alker and Nelson observe that ‘Hogg’s *ability* to conform to the genteel expectations of the marketplace was not in question. It is his *desire* to do so that is at issue’ (2009: 10). Indeed, only in *Queen Hynde* Hogg manages to achieve a balance between his ideal of self-expression and his adaptation to bourgeois values, thanks to the ironic tone with

---

Austen’s *Emma*, *PMLA*, 43:2 (June 1928), 487-93 (p. 488). Yet, no criticism of Jane Austen appears in the *Quarterly* volume mentioned by Lockhart.

<sup>42</sup> LuMing Robert Mao, ‘Beyond Politeness Theory: ‘Face’ Revisited and Renewed’, *Journal of Pragmatics*, 21 (1994), 451-86 (p. 451).

which he addresses the young Edinburgh ladies, the implied readers of this poem. Here Hogg exploits what Jonathan Culpeper defines as ‘mock impoliteness’, that is, ‘impoliteness that remains in the surface, since it is understood that it is not intended to cause offence’.<sup>43</sup> Thanks to such negotiation Hogg was then able to claim his intellectual freedom and, in so doing, to earn positive criticism on this point, even though *Queen Hynde* was not a literary success and other critics dismissed it (see chapter four).

Brown and Levinson developed politeness theory with a conversation between two individuals in mind, while only very recently research in this field has started to consider the dynamics of politeness principles within ‘communities of practice’, that is, small groups such as white women of the middle-class (Mills 2003). In this thesis, politeness theory is being applied at the level of social discourse (the Edinburgh bourgeoisie of early nineteenth century) and in written communication rather than oral—though in his letters and literary sphere, Hogg engaged in both written and oral communication with Walter Scott’s circle, which can be viewed as a small community of practice on its own.

Mills also observes that, in order to develop a different framework of analysis, more research should be carried out with regards to ‘the difference between impoliteness at a social level and at the level of the individual’, because ‘judgements about impoliteness at a social level tend to be ideological’.<sup>44</sup> For example, the British perception of Arabs ‘as too direct when they are speaking English’ is the result of ‘an evaluation not of the language but of the people and the cultural values that a

---

<sup>43</sup> Jonathan Culpeper, ‘Towards an Anatomy of Impoliteness’, *Journal of Pragmatics*, 25 (1996), 349-67 (p. 352).

<sup>44</sup> Sara Mills points out that perceptions of impoliteness must ‘be seen as radically different to politeness and not just its polar opposite’; see Sara Mills, ‘Impoliteness in a Cultural Context’, *Journal of Pragmatics*, 41 (2009), 1047-60 (note 2, p. 1048).

particular group is assumed to hold' (2009: 1049, 1052, 1054). Here the negative criticism of Hogg's texts at the time of first publication comes to mind. In contemporary reception, Hogg's social origin was held explicitly responsible for his lack of delicacy, while his literary skills were rarely mentioned or, rather, considered as the traits of a talented but irredeemable writer. Alker and Nelson, for instance, observe that Hogg's 'tactics' in his 1821 'Memoir' prefacing *The Mountain Bard* 'involve persuading the public that he is a remarkable rural genius more in touch with middle-class taste than some of the critics', while the intense negative reaction to this 'Memoir' in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* (August 1821) dismisses Hogg's literary talent by 'portray[ing] the Ettrick Shepherd as a bestial, polluted creature defined by his labouring body'—traits which were exploited 'to justify his rejection by publishers and to undercut his appeal to sentiment and satire'.<sup>45</sup> A culturally contextualised politeness hence foregrounds theoretically the tension between Hogg's working-class background and the early nineteenth-century literary establishment.

Mills contends that

[w]hen interacting with others, utterances which are judged to be impolite are an indication, not just of face threat, but [...] of [...] the relative status, and more importantly, the perception of status difference, of the participants in relation to one another. (2009: 1049)

This is certainly the dynamic that occurred in judgements of Hogg's writing by contemporary reviewers such as John Wilson and John Gibson Lockhart, prominent figures in the Scottish literary élite (and supposedly Hogg's friends), who scathingly ridiculed Hogg both overtly in the *Noctes Ambrosianae* and anonymously in the

---

<sup>45</sup> Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson, 'James Hogg as Working-Class Autobiographer: Tactical Manoeuvres in a 'Memoir of the Author's Life'', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 17 (2006), 63-80 (pp. 69-70).

negative reviews of his published works. Gillian Hughes observes that though the series of the *Noctes* in *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* 'was undoubtedly good publicity for his [Hogg's] work throughout the British empire, [...] it probably had a negative effect on the nature of his fame.' When Hogg visited London in 1832 to find a publisher for his collection of tales, 'those whose mental picture of Hogg was drawn from the Shepherd of the *Noctes Ambrosianae* were surprised to find him "so smooth, well-looking, and gentlemanly"''.<sup>46</sup>

'Social deixis', too, is an effective linguistic tool pointing to relations of social power between participants in both written and oral communication. It includes those forms of address showing deference such as 'Sir' or 'formulaic expressions the function of which is almost entirely a matter of registering some level of politeness or impoliteness'.<sup>47</sup> In Hogg's short story 'Maria's Tale' (see chapter three), the eponymous protagonist addresses with a mock-deferent 'Sir' all the potential upper-middle-class seducers who put at risk not only the chastity of young female servants but also their employment, at a time when a respectful code of behaviour was important among the lower classes too. A good reputation was in fact an essential trait for a servant to obtain a reference from a previous master or mistress when seeking for a new position.

Politeness theory and social deixis also relate to Bakhtin's insights on literary dialogism. As Trevor Pateman argues,

Bakhtin's concerns with the socially-situated utterance and with the structuring of linguistic form and meaning by context [...] relate much more obviously to the contemporary literature of pragmatics [...]. Brown and Levinson's 1978 paper on

---

<sup>46</sup> Gillian Hughes, *James Hogg: A Life* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), pp. 185-86, 249. Famous is John Wilson's caustic review of Hogg's *The Three Perils of Woman*, *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, 14 (1823), pp. 427-37; see chapter one.

<sup>47</sup> For a discussion of 'social deixis' in literary texts see Roger D. Sell, *Mediating Criticism: Literary Education Humanized* (Amsterdam: Benjamins, 2001), pp. 151-52 (p. 152).

politeness phenomena [...] ought also to be attended to by anyone concerned to develop a specifically Bakhtinian pragmatics.<sup>48</sup>

Indeed, Bakhtin's notions of *heteroglossia* and carnival should be viewed as a literary pragmatics in an embryonic form. While politeness principles show how participants maintain or break power, social distance, and status by respecting or threatening face, characters in a literary work can signal the same social dimension through their closeness to, or distance from, what is assumed to be the official language in the world outwith the text. Mey argues that literary pragmatics goes beyond Bakhtin's theories. *Heteroglossia*, in fact, refers to the passive existence of voices distant from the official language in the novel; a literary pragmaticist approach reveals the management of those voices by the author and their active recreation by the reader through a pragmatic act of reading (Mey 2000: 159-60, see later in this introduction).

According to Bakhtin—and similarly to Mao's argument about the tension between the individual's want of freedom and wish to be socially accepted—the language in the novel reflects the struggle between a centripetal and unifying tendency towards a standard norm (the verbal-ideological centre) and a decentralising, centrifugal force towards other varieties and more marginal voices which he calls *heteroglossia*.<sup>49</sup> Each character in the novel represents a social dimension, for his or her dialogues are always ideologically marked.<sup>50</sup> In *Rabelais and his World* (1984 [1965]) Bakhtin further discusses the social dimension and

---

<sup>48</sup> Trevor Pateman, 'Pragmatics in Semiotics: Bakhtin/Volosinov', 2013 <<http://www.selectedworks.co.uk./index.html>> [accessed 15 January 2013] (para. 2 and 7 of 25) previously published in *Journal of Literary Semantics*, 18.3 (1989), 203-16.

<sup>49</sup> Mikhail M. Bakhtin, 'From the Prehistory of Novelistic Discourse', in *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays by M. M. Bakhtin*, ed. by Michael Holquist, trans. by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981), pp. 41-83 (p. 67).

<sup>50</sup> Mikhail M. Bakhtin, 'Discourse in the Novel', in *The Dialogic Imagination*, ed. by Holquist, pp. 259-422 (p. 334).

subversive potential of medieval carnivals when, for a day, social roles can be turned upside down in the public sphere and people are free to play someone else's role before their return to the *status quo*.<sup>51</sup>

Hogg makes use of carnivalesque characters, such as Richard Rickleton in *Perils of Woman* and the eponymous protagonist in 'Basil Lee', where both characters do not merely play the role of comic relief. With Rickleton, Hogg gives voice to a segment of society silenced by the dominant discourse, questioning patriarchal notions of masculinity (see chapter two) and the discursive logic of the trope of marriage (see chapter one); while through Basil Lee, Hogg interrogates the militaristic discourse of Highland masculinity exploited in the wars for imperial expansion (see chapter two). Literary pragmatics, however, enriches Bakhtin's theories with a more dynamic analysis. Indeed, Bakhtin's carnival may explain *why* Basil Lee's temporary masquerade as a flag subverts the mystique of Highland masculinity; it does not clarify, however, *how* Hogg's opposing of this character's lack of moral values to a Highland prostitute, who on the contrary is a lady at heart, threatened bourgeois assumptions about literary politeness. The final happy marriage between this soldier and a prostitute subverts the ideology of the national tale, where the wedding between its upper-middle-class protagonists was meant to unite the British nations in the imperial project from whose financial gain, however, people of the lower classes were excluded.

The 'chronotope' is another important Bakhtinian notion which expresses the idea that a literary genre determines the structure of the plot through its temporal and

---

<sup>51</sup> Mikhail M. Bakhtin, *Rabelais and his World*, trans. by Hélène Iswolsky (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984 [1965]).

spatial settings.<sup>52</sup> For example, the picaresque novel presupposes a protagonist who undertakes a journey on a metaphorical road that will cause a succession of encounters that build up the narrative plot. In Hogg's *Perils of Woman*, Bakhtin's insight clarifies the significance of Gatty Bell's confinement in an asylum for three years (see chapter one). Here Bakhtin's notions of chronotope and carnival operate simultaneously, as Gatty's grotesque transformation into an automaton—and the necessity of hiding her body in an asylum for three years, away from the public gaze—voices her family's sense of shame for having caused Cherry's death—the 'indelicate' cousin who threatened the marriage between Gatty and M'Ion and, hence, the political reconciliation between the Highlands and the Lowlands.

The Bakhtinian notion of 'superaddressee' also connects Bakhtin's sociological analysis of literary voices and politeness theory. The superaddressee is a literary phenomenon that appears when a character talks to him or herself in order to predict the negative consequences of a personal choice. In these critically evaluative moments, the character impersonates a social institution, such as the church or the family, addressing the inner self with a 'you' voice.<sup>53</sup> Bakhtin's insight relates to what Mao discusses in the above-mentioned article about the construction of face as a never-ending struggle simultaneously between the individual's desire to act upon his or her wishes and the necessity of social recognition. Hogg exploits this literary phenomenon in *Perils of Woman*, when questioning the supposedly moral values of

---

<sup>52</sup> Mikhail M. Bakhtin, 'Forms of Time and of the Chronotope in the Novel', in *The Dialogic Imagination*, ed. by Holquist, pp. 84-258 (pp. 84-85).

<sup>53</sup> See Mikhail M. Bakhtin, 'The Problem of the Text in Linguistics, Philology and the Human Sciences', in *Mikhail M. Bakhtin: Speech Genres and Other Late Essays*, written by Mikhail M. Bakhtin, ed. by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist, trans. by Vern W. McGee (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2004 [1986]), pp. 103-31 (p. 126-27). For a discussion of Bakhtin's 'superaddressee' as a phenomenon reflecting the power and dominance of a text see Jacob L. Mey, *When Voices Clash* (2000), pp. 283-88 (pp. 286, 285).



contemporary bourgeois assumptions about proper feminine behaviour. Gatty's presumptuous choice not to yield to her romantic desire for M'Ion, and to restrain herself according to a bourgeois logic of feminine purity based on Christian values, determines the seduction of her cousin Cherry on the part of M'Ion, and Cherry's later death (see chapter one). In *The Profligate Princes*, exploiting the same literary phenomenon Hogg shows instead how Annabel Drummond avoids rape thanks to her more authentic Christian beliefs, which enable her to resist one of the princes who wants to seduce her.

### ***The pragmatics of literature***

This section will describe how the pragmatics of literature works, negotiating the difference between written and oral communication. Another major concern about using pragmatics for literary analysis is that the act of writing and the reading experience are non-simultaneous processes and, as a result, an author cannot enjoy immediate feedback from the reader as in a real conversation (Sell 2000: 20). This asymmetrical situation makes it hard to provide empirical evidence of how a reader may perceive the linguistic features of a text. Yet, Ernest W.B. Hess-Lüttich (1991) argues that although literary dialogics is different from everyday communication, the author and the reader follow the same principles of a real interaction, and literary texts risk the same ruptures and breakdowns involved in a conversation.<sup>54</sup> For example, Sell quotes Richard Watts (1989) as being 'perhaps the first scholar to point out that readers, despite the superficial asymmetry of the situation, can refuse to grant the writer a turn. They can leave a book unread' (Sell 2000: 80).

---

<sup>54</sup> Ernest W.B. Hess-Lüttich, 'How Does the Writer of a Dramatic Text Interact with his Audience? On the Pragmatics of Literary Communication', in *Literary Pragmatics*, ed. by Sell, pp. 225-41, (p. 226).

Significantly, addressing his bad reviewers James Hogg claimed: ‘Sit down to your book as you would to conversation [...] and read to be pleased [...] if he [the author] should fail in those particular points which are suited to your fancy, it is an easy matter to take leave of him’.<sup>55</sup>

The literary-pragmaticist critic has to play the role of mediator by providing the relevant cultural background to Hogg’s writing and reading practices in the Romantic period, against which the twenty-first-century reader has to enjoy and interpret Hogg’s works. There are different ‘distances’ that need to be considered when applying pragmatics to the analysis of a literary work: firstly, the historical distance between reader and author when discussing writers of previous periods; then, even if an author and a reader share the same historical position, the critic has to bridge a number of cultural and social gaps, as a work can be read by groups of different class, gender, ethnicity, age, religion, and education (Sell 2000: 253-54, 257-58). Hogg’s writing, for instance, mirrors the cultural assumptions that shaped the bourgeoisie in early nineteenth-century Britain; the oral tradition of Borders Scotland; the religious tenets of the Calvinist Kirk; and contemporary constructions of empire: all these discourses affected the life of the inhabitants of the Scottish margins, whose anxieties Hogg voiced in his works. These cultural aspects need to be integrated into a pragmaticist analysis so as to allow the twenty-first-century reader to achieve a more precise feeling of how a reader contemporary to Hogg might have experienced his texts.

---

<sup>55</sup> James Hogg, ‘Reviewers’, in *A Series of Lay Sermons on Good Principles and Good Breeding*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1997 [1834]), pp. 99-107 (p. 104).

In the early nineteenth century the readers of Hogg's works were varied, spanning from the aristocracy and the bourgeoisie up to an aspirational working class, who encountered his texts not only in the form of volumes but also in periodicals, annuals, and gift-books. Hogg first poems had appeared in eighteenth-century magazines, where he had started to make his way as a writer: 'The mistakes of a Night' was first printed in the *Scots Magazine* (October 1794). Yet, for these pieces Hogg received no compensation and the system of unpaid publications 'would not [...] allow [him] to move from unpaid amateur to professional periodical contributor'.<sup>56</sup> This aspect led Hogg to start his own periodical, *The Spy* (1810-1811), where for a year and on a weekly basis he published essays, short stories, and poems, on the model of more prestigious essay-periodicals such as Addison's *Spectator* and Henry Mackenzie's *Mirror and Lounger*.

Hogg started this new adventure anonymously, as an observer of 'contemporary social life', supported by the publication of 'established Edinburgh professionals such as the Writer to the Signet Robert Sym of George Square, but also schoolteachers, printers and a number of women' (Hughes 2012: 33). This is the publishing context where a number of Hogg's first works appeared in their embryonic form: for example, his 'Story of the Berwick-shire Farmer', which he would expand later in the collection *Winter Evening Tales* (1820) as 'The Renowned Adventures of Basil Lee' (see chapter two), the topic of which (illegitimate pregnancy) 'offended readerly expectations of *The Spy* as an essay-periodical and

---

<sup>56</sup> Gillian Hughes, 'Magazine, Annuals, and the Press', in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Duncan and Mack, pp. 31-36 (p. 32).

led to the withdrawal of a significant number of subscribers' (Hughes 2012: 33), and to the end of Hogg's magazine.

Among early nineteenth-century periodicals, the most important site of publication for Hogg was *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*. William Blackwood changed the rules of publication as he started to pay his contributors. After his marriage in 1820, Hogg thus 'became dependant for cash in hand on the regular monthly payments earned by work, which was now specially written for, and tailored to, the concerns of the magazine' (Hughes 2012: 34). Thomas C. Richardson estimates that between 1817 and 1835 Hogg 'contributed more than one hundred works to *Blackwood's*', showcasing 'the diversity of his talent and his achievement as a writer', as here Hogg published 'a variety of songs and lyric poetry, narrative and dramatic poetry, sketches of rural and farming life, review essays, ballad, short stories, and even "screed" on politics'.<sup>57</sup>

Hogg contributed significantly to the success of *Blackwood's*, writing part of the 'Translation from an Ancient Chaldee Manuscript', a satirical story of the rivalry between William Blackwood and Archibald Constable, publisher of the *Edinburgh Review* and the *Scots Magazine*. Most importantly, here Hogg started the series of fictional conversations, the *Noctes Ambrosianae*, where he played an important role both as a writer and character engaging in 'dialogues about politics and culture between the magazine supposed editor Christopher North and his cronies at a well-known Edinburgh tavern' (Hughes 2012: 34). As mentioned before, the portrayal of Hogg as the uncouth and unsophisticated Ettrick Shepherd in the *Noctes*, however,

---

<sup>57</sup> Thomas C. Richardson, 'Introduction', in *Contributions to Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, vol. 1, 1817-1828, written by James Hogg, ed. by Thomas C. Richardson (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), pp. xiii-lxxx (p. xiii).

was both good publicity for his works and denigrating for his image as a serious writer, and it certainly contributed to the perception of Hogg's failed sense of literary decorum among contemporary reviewers.

Another important aspect to consider for the pragmatics of literature is that while reading today is 'a solitary activity',

[i]n the romantic period the selection of the books, the reading, and the subsequent discussion, were often collectively decided through book clubs, [...] every reading family was, to an extent, a reading society subject to pressures from its members. In many houses, the ladies and gentlemen spent time sitting in the parlour sewing, reading, or listening to a book being read aloud. [...] Nor was reading aloud confined to the better-off.<sup>58</sup>

The Romantic habit of reading as a collective experience must have had an enormous impact upon the reception of Hogg's texts since those readers in more powerful positions influenced and conditioned the perception of Hogg's supposed lack of delicacy in his works. This collective reading habit possibly also shaped Hogg's own constructions of implied readership when writing his texts.

From an authorial perspective, Hogg's socio-historical circumstances certainly influenced his choice of cultural tropes, character construction, and plot development—though he then 'co-adapted' his own individuality to such conventions. By highlighting the communicative features of Hogg's texts, a pragmaticist analysis will thus develop a cultural mediation, shedding new light on Hogg's literary talent and hence establishing his significant position among the Romantic writers. Though recent criticism has already highlighted Hogg's subversion of the dominant discourse, no scholar has ever clarified how this happens

---

<sup>58</sup> William St Clair, 'Reading, Reception, Dissemination', in *The Reading Nation in the Romantic Period*, written by William St Clair (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), pp. 394-412 (pp. 394-95).

at a textual level through Hogg's strategic use of early nineteenth-century constructions of gender stereotypes.

Avoiding the interactional fallacy of previous developments in literary pragmatics,<sup>59</sup> namely, the assumption that the reader and the author are involved in a 'conversation' for the duration of the fictional text (see Mey 2000; Sell 2000), this thesis will view literary communication in Bakhtinian terms, that is, as a shared experience of the literary text between the consciousness of both author and reader (Bakhtin 2004 [1986]: 106). This is an important nuance because it does not constrain literary communication to the same temporal and spatial coordinates as the interaction between real speakers does. Mey's insight that the societies surrounding both the author at the time of text production and the reader at the time of text consumption condition the author's creation and the reader's recreation of the text is still an important assumption (2000: 233-46); as is Sell's notion that both the author's and the reader's literary experience are not completely determined by their surrounding society (2000). Thus two authors belonging to the same period are perceived as unique, and any reading of the same text is a distinct experience.

Focusing on text production and consumption, the literary pragmatics conceived by Mey takes into account literary aspects such as text, context, reference, deixis, anaphora, time-shift, point of view, voice, world's perspective, author, reader, power, hegemony, and social constraints. All these phenomena are integrated in the pragmaticist analysis of a literary text in order to clarify how authors, as text producers, use language to establish cooperation with their readership, the consumers

---

<sup>59</sup> See Bo Pettersson, 'Three Fallacies in Interpreting Literature', in *Humane Readings: Essays on Literary Mediation and Communication in Honour of Roger D. Sell*, ed. by Jason Finch and others (Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 2009), pp. 145-56 (pp. 147-51).

of texts. However, the effects of a text on the reader cannot be explained through linguistic rules alone, because an author also exploits social and cultural factors to seduce the readership—factors which, eventually, determine the use of certain linguistic tools (Mey 2000: 8-12). This is an important insight that highlights Hogg's strategic use of contemporary gender stereotypes in his works.

As Mey claims, a text is always the product of a social discourse. The links that tie authors and readers to their extra-literary contexts are responsible for their literary activities, as they have to obey certain social conditions which govern the production and consumption of the text. This means that the reader's involvement with the text depends on his or her attitude towards the narrative. A reader's external position includes all previously read texts, knowledge of the literary genre in question, awareness of the author's role in text production, and current social ideologies (Mey 2000: 262-68). All these aspects influenced enormously the negative reception of Hogg's works by early nineteenth-century British reviewers who were not captivated by his outrageous use of certain female social issues, his fusion between supernatural folklore and reality, and his characters speaking broad Scots. On the other hand, Suzanne Gilbert observes that outside Edinburgh, Hogg's reputation seems to have been less affected by his caricature as portrayed in *The Noctes*: in nineteenth-century America, 'Hogg was popular [...] because his personal narrative appealed to Enlightenment ideals of "improvement" and self-help, and because the democratic and humanitarian impulses of his work paralleled those current in American political discourse.'<sup>60</sup>

---

<sup>60</sup> Suzanne Gilbert, 'Hogg's Reception and Reputation', in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Duncan and Mack, pp. 37-45 (p. 44).

### ***Reading as a pragmatic act***

Mey elaborates on the notion of ‘pragmatic act’ starting from the assumption that ‘there is power in words’ (2000: 308), which modern philosophers of language have defined as the speech act’s illocutionary force in a context of use. He argues that ‘[t]he theory of *pragmatic acts* takes this thinking one step further’, assuming context as

*the most important element of our dealing with language, and through language, with the world [...] ‘pragmatic acts’ (as distinguished from ‘speech acts’) [...] do not depend on the actual words being used as on the circumstances that lead up to, and accompany, those words. The actual words are not even necessary, as seen in the pragmatic act of advertising for a particular brand of beer. A picture of a Carlsberg beer truck making its way up a road in the Grand Tetons is as much an advertisement for that beer as an explicit invitation to buy. (2000: 308-309, emphasis original)*

Regarding the application of pragmatic acts to the reading experience, Mey argues that readers are able to enjoy the text if they ‘accept their share of the text work [...] The readers’ ability to do this, however, depends to a greater extent on an author’s ability’ to set up the scenario against which to understand the textual gaps (2000: 310). In Mey’s words,

the reader’s act of understanding is not dependent on what is found in the text in so many actual words, but in the total context in which those words are found—and are found to make sense, through an active, pragmatic cooperation between author and reader. (2000: 312)

In other words, a scene where the characters act and play their roles ‘is both the condition for, and the result of, a successful reader-author relation [...since] the success of a literary text depends upon readers accepting and voluntarily entering the “scene” created by the author’.<sup>61</sup>

---

<sup>61</sup> Jacob L. Mey, ‘Pragmatics of Reading’, in *Concise Encyclopedia of Pragmatics*, ed. by Mey (2009c [2006]), pp. 775-79 (p. 776).



Mey's notion of reading as a pragmatic act clarifies how a reader fills in the narrative gaps conceived by Wolfgang Iser. According to Iser, narrative gaps drive the interpretative process by stimulating the readers to fill in with their own imagination the blank spaces left by the author, where such blanks are not merely concerned with the omission of events:

[I]t is only through inevitable omissions that a story gains its dynamism. Thus whenever the flow is interrupted and we are led off in unexpected directions, the opportunity is given to us to bring into play our own faculty for establishing connections—for *filling in the gaps left by the text itself*. These gaps have a different effect on the process of *anticipation* and *retrospection* [...] for they may be filled in different ways. For this reason, one text is potentially capable of several different realizations, and no reading can ever exhaust the full potential, for *each individual reader will fill in the gaps in his own way*, thereby excluding the various other possibilities[.]<sup>62</sup>

The difference between Mey and Iser lies in the fact that while the latter discusses textual gaps as if they were passive elements without an originator to be reactivated in various ways by the reader, Mey brings the author back into such negotiation, putting more emphasis on the phenomenon of literary communication. Considering the author's possible intentions limits the process of semiosis on the part of the reader, who has to keep in mind the motivations behind the author's own act of writing.<sup>63</sup>

---

<sup>62</sup> Wolfgang Iser, 'The Reading Process: A Phenomenological Approach', in *The Implied Reader: Patterns of Communication in Prose Fiction from Bunyan to Beckett*, written by Wolfgang Iser (Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press, 1974), pp. 274-94 (p. 280), emphases mine.

<sup>63</sup> The reception theories developed in the last thirty years of the twentieth century are 'predominantly either text centred, or reader centred'; Hans Robert Jauss, for instance, claims that

all texts carry with them implicit assumptions about how they should be read; readers have protocols for reading, including cultural, aesthetic and ideological assumptions, the 'horizon of expectations', that they bring to the act of reading itself. While Wolfgang Iser, Stanley Fish, and Mikhail Bakhtin [...] argue for the construction of meaning taking place in the engagement between reader and text[.]

See Shafquat Towheed, William R. Owens, Rosalind Crone and Katie Halsey, 'General Introduction', in *The History of Reading: A Reader* (London: Routledge, 2011), pp. 1-8 (p. 3). I argue instead for a plurality of meanings arising from the author's supposedly reconstructed intentions, the meaning as conveyed by the language of the text, and the meaning originating from the reader's experience. Neither of these meanings is given priority nor considered to be exclusive.

According to Mey, attributing a voice to a piece of narrative necessitates the cooperation between author and reader, while a correct interpretation of whose voice is being heard is brought about through the exercise of reading as a pragmatic act. The pragmaticist concepts of text production and consumption presuppose the idea that a text is a shared property between author and reader and that ‘voicing is the dialectic process of [...] voice organizing and voice recognizing’ (Mey 2000: 144). In this way, the author’s hegemony in the creation of a text is not univocal because the management of textual voices is due to a co-creative process between author and reader, a cooperation which, when interrupted, may cause a clash of voices (Mey 2000: 132-44).

### ***When voices clash***

Taking into account Bakhtin’s theories on *heteroglossia*, Mey holds that voices are characterised by their own language, and that the author has to manage their consequent ‘messiness’ (or *heteroglossia*). Each voice represents a segment of the world in the narrative. However, in order to be believable, voices are also defined according to a real, extra-literary world. This means that a literary text always mirrors the social conditions of an extra-literary reality according to which its characters are brought to life. As a consequence, authorial hegemony is not absolute, as the author must respect the social constraints of the real world in order to create believable characters.

According to Mey, current discussions of voice are ‘too narrowly linguistic-based’, in that they consider voice as a phenomenon within the narration (Mey 2000: 157). On the contrary, from a pragmaticist perspective one of the most interesting

aspects of voice is its anchoring in the social, historical, and economic conditions of its owner, which are mirrored in the character's use of language. If 'vocality' is the way a voice is managed in a text, then 'multivocality' represents the refraction of characters' social background in their own language. While Bakhtin's *heteroglossia* refers to the passive existence of different voices in a literary text, Mey's notion of multivocality is concerned with the author's active management of those voices as well as their clash, namely, when voices leave their place and take up another part. A voice cannot be assigned indiscriminately to any character because a character voice is always filled with specific conditions which govern its language use (Mey 2000: 153-60).

Mey distinguishes three sub-categories of voice clashing: 'trashing' occurs when the voice heard is not appropriate to the character; 'mashing' arises when characters speak 'out of turn' and the reader is not able to determine the owner of the voice any longer; the third sub-category is 'crashing', which takes place when the author oversteps the boundaries of the narration and 'crashes the gate' of the scene taking part in the action—a phenomenon which occurs in Hogg's *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (1824), for instance, where Hogg himself appears as the Ettrick Shepherd, and refuses to join the Editor and his friends in their inspection of the Justified Sinner's corpse. Yet, Mey views voice clashing only in negative terms, as he considers this phenomenon as the result of an author's failed negotiation with the reader: according to Mey, when voices clash the author has involuntarily committed an oversight and thus failed to seduce the reader (2009c [2006]: 775). On the contrary, this thesis will show that in some of his works Hogg

uses voice clashing strategically for his critical purposes (see chapters three and four).

Regarding voice trashing, a character's credibility depends on the voice that he or she is supposed to embody. For example, a child is not expected to speak about highly speculative topics but to describe events in immediate sensory terms. When characters speak in ways inconsistent with their role, then their voice starts 'trashing'. In Hogg's case, this phenomenon is responsible for having caused the negative criticism on the part of both nineteenth- and twentieth-century critics when, in *The Brownie of Bodsbeck* (1818), he has a peasant girl (Katharine Laidlaw) speak beautiful English (see chapter four). Though, in effect, in this case Hogg failed to seduce both readerships, it must be argued that, in so doing, he had a long-term goal in mind, as his purpose was that of presenting his heroine as a more valuable model of femininity than the heroines of contemporary progressive novels.

Hogg exploits the same phenomenon of voice trashing in *The Confessions*, where the prostitute Bell Calvert, a character from the margins, speaks beautiful English, thereby implying that all women—no matter their social background—conceivably run the risk of having to resort to prostitution if not careful to whom they give their heart (see chapter three). Hogg thus deconstructs any binary opposition in the female social scale, portraying a more fluid reality of women in early nineteenth-century Edinburgh.

### ***Summary of the chapters***

Chapter one, 'Bourgeois Marriage and the Female Body', explores how Hogg articulates his own version of the marriage trope in *The Three Perils of Man* (1822) and *The Three Perils of Woman* (1823). In the early nineteenth-century novel, this

narrative metaphor was replete with political implications: significantly, it runs in various literary genres of Hogg *œuvre*, as will be shown in the following chapters. In both *Perils* books, Hogg questions the discursive assumptions of the cross-national wedding of the upper- and middle-class protagonists—a metaphorical representation of the union of the British Isles. Hogg exposes the negative effects of this marriage of convenience on the female characters' bodies, which he poses as symbols of the Scottish nation whose social grievances cannot be overcome without difficulty in the British union with England.

In 'Peril First' of *Perils of Woman*, the grotesque transformation of Gatty's body into an automaton represents the psychological grievances of bourgeois women and the latter's resistance to patriarchal expectations of delicacy. Here I draw on Suzanne Rosenthal Shumway's Bakhtinian reading of Sandra Gilbert and Suzanne Gubar's *The Mad Woman in the Attic* (2000). In their reading of Charlotte Brontë's *Jane Eyre*, Gilbert and Gubar view Bertha Rochester's madness, and her consequent reclusion, as subverting the moral assumptions of the primary narrative, by 'function[ing] as [an] asocial surrogate for [a] docile sel[f]'.<sup>64</sup> Similarly to Shumway's re-visitation of this imagery of female enclosure and insanity, I view the lunatic asylum (where Gatty's family hides her from social gaze for three years) as a Bakhtinian chronotope, where Hogg empowers Gatty to communicate her act of resistance to the trope of marriage.

---

<sup>64</sup> Suzanne Rosenthal Shumway, 'The Chronotope of the Asylum: *Jane Eyre*, Feminism, and Bakhtinian Theory', in *A Dialogue of Voices: Feminist Literary Theory and Bakhtin*, ed. by Karen Ann Hohne and Helen Wussow (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1994), pp. 152-70; Sandra M. Gilbert and Susan Gubar, 'Preface to the First Edition', in *The Madwoman in the Attic: The Woman Writer and the Nineteenth-Century Literary Imagination*, 2nd edn (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000 [1979]), pp. xi-xiv (p. xi).

Chapter two, 'The Masculinities of Scottish National Identities', addresses the different types of masculinities that characterised constructions of Scottish national identity in the early nineteenth century. The myth of the indestructible and loyal Highlander served a double purpose, as it shaped the militaristic power of the British Empire and the identity of the Scottish nation. The prowess of the enduring Highlander, however, threatened the masculinity of the Scottish Lowlanders, who suffered a double invasion: the economic and political control on the part of England on the one hand, and the cultural supremacy of Highlandism on the other.<sup>65</sup> Middle-class Lowlanders endured a further cultural stigmatisation exploited by the English to keep at bay the economic power of Scotland in the conquest of the colonies: the stereotype of the rapacious Lowlander, based on the assumption that Lowland Scots had bribed the parliament to influence the approval of the 1707 Union with England, in order to take advantage of the economic potential offered by the exploitation of the colonies (Martin 2009: 112). In some of his works, Hogg shows that this cultural assumption, however, was rather unfair to the lower classes of Scotland, as they did not prosper in the political union with England.

The charisma of the Highlander apparently did not affect English manliness, as the latter was founded on contemporary discourses of sympathy and sensibility which helped to shape a more sophisticated sense of masculine vigour, tamed by self-control. Adam Smith's imagining of society as shaped by sensibility and restraint was then exploited by contemporary Scottish writers in representations of the British union between Scotland and England, in order to mask its economic logic

---

<sup>65</sup> Maureen M. Martin, *The Mighty Scot: Nation, Gender, and the Nineteenth-Century Mystique of Scottish Masculinity* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2009), p. 13.

behind discursive assumptions of shared sympathy.<sup>66</sup> Chapter two will show how Hogg interrogates these various conceptualisations of masculinity in some of his works.

Chapter three, 'Questioning the Patriarchal Value of Women's Chastity', addresses how in the early nineteenth century the Scottish Kirk influenced women's sexuality and how it contained out-of-wedlock pregnancy through the humiliating process of public repentance. The texts analysed expose how Christian values of motherhood and female decorum were then re-appropriated by bourgeois discourse in the contemporary novel to promote the figure of the middle-class lady as the guardian angel of the British nation. Hogg deconstructs the dichotomy between fallen woman and bourgeois lady by presenting new prototypes of female characters with features of both cultural constructions.

Chapter four, 'James Hogg's Proto-Postmodern Heroines', analyses how Hogg questions the polarisation between primary and secondary heroine typical of the nineteenth-century novel characterised by the marriage plot. This chapter draws on the work of Jennifer Camden, according to whom the attraction of the hero to the secondary heroine marks an unstable national unity, which has to be maintained by the demise of this female character.<sup>67</sup> In the short story 'Tibby Hyslop's Dream' and in the novel *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*, Hogg shapes two female protagonists with the traits of both primary and secondary heroine. In both works, Hogg's heroines do not engage in any romance leading to marriage because there are no heroes. Through such failed marriages, Hogg implies that Scotland cannot solve her social grievances

---

<sup>66</sup> Juliet Shields, *Sentimental Literature and Anglo-Scottish Identity, 1745-1820* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), pp. 9, 30.

<sup>67</sup> Jennifer Camden, *Secondary Heroines in Nineteenth-Century British and American Novels* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2010), p. 15.

with a political union of convenience, either internally between Highlands and Lowlands or at a national level between Scotland and England. Chapter four shows how in the mock-epic *Queen Hynde*, Hogg then re-engages with the dialectics between primary and secondary heroine without punishing the latter's mischievous behaviour with death, but advancing instead her social status to that of Queen of Scandinavia through a marriage based on true love.

Douglas Gifford concludes the introduction of his doctoral thesis on 'The Development of the Fiction of James Hogg' by arguing that his project aims to 'gain a telling insight into the culturally destructive snobbery and distortion of literary values which increasingly dominated Edinburgh and Scottish literature throughout the nineteenth century'.<sup>68</sup> The literary-pragmaticist critical lens of this project aims to shed new light on the discursive and ideological reasons behind the 'snobbery' which Hogg's works suffered from the Scottish literary élite, by showing that Hogg's skilful treatment of gender stereotypes challenged accepted literary conventions and gave voice to different realities within the accepted and often artificial norms of the National Tale.

---

<sup>68</sup> Douglas Gifford, 'The Development of the Fiction of James Hogg' (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Glasgow, 1982), p. 5.



## CHAPTER ONE

### Bourgeois Marriage and the Female Body

#### *James Hogg, The Three Perils, and the ideology of bourgeois marriage*

This chapter shows how in *The Three Perils of Man* (1822) and *The Three Perils of Woman* (1823), Hogg questions the ideology of the marriage trope as developed in the national tale and the historical novel, where the cross-national wedding of the protagonists was meant to support an unquestioned stability of the British Union. By showing the effects of marriage on the body of the primary and secondary heroines, Hogg voices other realities which counter the progressive assumptions of both grand narratives, thereby exposing the ideology behind bourgeois marriage and the contradictions at the heart of empire formation.

Ina Ferris (2002) views the national tale as a narrative where Irish, mostly female, authors voiced early nineteenth-century national grievances for an English audience, hence mirroring the tension-rife contest generated by the creation of the United Kingdom. Katie Trumpener argues that Walter Scott's historical novel 'repoliticized (and masculinized)' the national tale of his contemporary Irish female writers by shifting the emphasis from the characters' geographical movement across regions to their process of growth and loss through historical change (1997: 132).<sup>69</sup>

Concerning Hogg's treatment of the national tale in *Perils of Woman*, Antony Hasler observes that Gatty's 'marriage to a Highland gentleman finally seals the heroine's

---

<sup>69</sup> By the same author see also 'National Character, Nationalist Plots: National Tale and Historical Novel in the Age of *Waverley*, 1806-1830', *ELH*, 60 (1993), pp. 685-731. In this article, Trumpener describes the dialectics between the national tale and the historical novel, and how the latter grew out of the former by reshaping its national characters, the marriage plot, and the protagonist's journey to the periphery. See particularly pp. 687-88, 689, 693-94, 697-98, and 703.

moral progress in an allegory of national renewal'.<sup>70</sup> In this chapter I argue that in *Perils of Man* and in 'Peril First' of *Perils of Woman*, though apparently conforming to the conventions of both the national tale and the historical novel by having the protagonists united in a prosperous marriage, Hogg questions the ideology behind this narrative trope in two ways: through the secondary characters in the subplots of both novels, and by temporarily reducing the female protagonist of Peril First in *Perils of Woman* to a body incapable of articulating the costs of her marriage to the hero, namely the death of her less socially privileged cousin Cherry, the secondary heroine. In the last two books of *Perils of Woman*, Hogg then moves the same critique into the main plot, exposing the negative consequences of a marriage of convenience on the corpses of the female protagonist and her daughter, a metaphor for a violated Scotland and its dashed hopes for a thriving future after the Culloden massacre.

In the first book of *Perils of Woman*, Hogg subverts the assumed respectability of contemporary bourgeois marriage and interrogates the supposedly blissful union between Gatty and M'Ion in the central plot through the boisterous figure of Richard Rickleton, a Northumbrian laird who marries a Scottish prostitute. In the same novel, Hogg also sets the wayward but honest Cherry in intra-textual relation with the self-restrained Gatty (as a result of her cultural constraints), in so doing defying the expectations of delicacy in contemporary British discourse and showing through Gatty's grotesque body its negative consequences for bourgeois women. The carnivalesque transformation of this female protagonist, who falls into an apparent state of coma for three years, is the consequence of a malady the cause of

---

<sup>70</sup> Antony Hasler, 'Introduction', in *The Three Perils of Woman*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Antony Hasler and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002), pp. xi-xliii (p. xvii).

which is never clarified by Hogg and which has stimulated a fierce debate among twentieth-century critics, as will be explained later in this chapter. No scholar, however, seems to have focused on the significance of Gatty's physical change, hence missing Hogg's pointed critique of the ideology of the marriage plot, where the female protagonist was supposed to act as a repository of British moral values.

Twentieth-century criticism of *Perils of Woman* has mostly focused on the negative reception of Hogg's novel both at its time of first publication in 1823 and among modern scholars too who, until recently, have regarded it as one of Hogg's minor works, a poor imitation of conventional fiction for women, thus failing to grasp its sophisticated satirical aspects. Antony Hasler claims that in 1823 the novel received the most negative reception of Hogg's entire literary production (2002: xiv), a fact which has influenced its negative reputation until recently. David Groves holds that readers of Hogg's time regarded *Perils of Woman* as a terrible failure for its blasphemous language, its lustful heroines, and its lack of respect for polite social mores. Emma Letley observes that the disturbing prayers of Daniel Bell in his native tongue on the occasion of his daughter's illness resulted in Hogg's novel being accused of blasphemy. When compared with other nineteenth-century authors, Letley holds that Hogg used the Scots language in a very distinctive way as, surprisingly for that age, he brought it into the courtroom and the church—centres of authority from which it had been barred.<sup>71</sup>

Groves claims that a real appreciation of the value of Hogg's novel only began in the 1980s, when scholars such as Nelson C. Smith and Douglas S. Mack

---

<sup>71</sup> David Groves, 'Stepping Back to an Early Age: James Hogg's *Three Perils of Woman* and the *Ion* of Euripides', *Studies in Scottish Literature*, 21 (1986), 176-96 (p. 192); Emma Letley, 'Some Literary Uses of Scots in *The Three Perils of Woman*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 1 (1990), 45-56.

perceived its satirical tone behind the more superficial imitation of conventional fiction for women. Ian Duncan holds that Hogg's management of contemporary literary conventions is so subtle that it requires great effort on the part of a twentieth-century reader to grasp its satirical aspects, as Hogg's novel encourages a critical distance from the dominant literary conventions of its time, even though inhabiting those very narrative modes. Katherine Inglis views the maternal bodies in Hogg's novel, Gatty's in 'Peril First' and Sally's in 'Peril Third', as 'an uncanny form', arguing that 'that which in the ideology of the national tale or the historical novel is the repository of national meaning, agency and continuity, becomes instead an emblem and agent of the disruption of history'.<sup>72</sup> Drawing on Bakhtin's notion of novelistic dialogism and on recent developments in the pragmatics of literary communication, this chapter will argue that the temporary paralysis of Gatty's body conveys Hogg's sharp criticism of the primary heroine as symbolic of national progress in establishment tradition.

Seemingly in line with the narrative requirements of the national tale, *Perils of Man* ends with a series of marriages. The beginning of this long narrative has a chivalric tone. It starts with the English Lady Jane Howard demanding that Sir Philip Musgrave conquer the castle of Roxburgh as a test of his love. The Scottish Princess

---

<sup>72</sup> David Groves, 'Urban Corruption and the Pastoral Ideal in James Hogg's *Three Perils of Woman*', *Studies in Scottish Literature*, 27 (1992), 80-88 (p. 80); Ian Duncan, 'Review of The Stirling/South Carolina Edition of James Hogg, Volume 2, *The Three Perils of Woman*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 5 (1994), 154-57; Katherine Inglis, 'Maternity, Madness and Mechanization: The Ghastly Automaton in James Hogg's *The Three Perils of Woman*', in *Minds, Bodies, Machines: 1770-1930*, ed. by Deirdre Coleman and Hilary Fraser (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), pp. 61-82 (p. 62).

Margaret Stuart requests the same task of her suitors, adding a further demonstration of love: the winner of Roxburgh will have her in marriage but, should he lose, he will also lose all his possessions. The only suitor who accepts these conditions is Lord Douglas. The early chapters of the novel relate the first attempts of the Scots guided by Lord Douglas to dislodge Sir Philip Musgrave and his English garrison from the castle of Roxburgh. Princess Margaret Stuart (who, disguised as a valet in the early part of the novel, was thought to have died in the siege) turns out to be still alive and marries Lord Douglas; while Lady Jane Howard is given in marriage to Charlie Scott as a reward for his loyalty to Sir Ringan and Lord Douglas.

Princess Margaret's sense of restlessness, however, calls into question her marriage with Lord Douglas. Margaret is a very proactive female character when compared to other heroines in contemporary fiction, one who is able to 'to turn [her] position of vulnerability into a position of strength by forcing men to play the chivalric game on [her] behalf',<sup>73</sup> and by demanding men 'risk their life under the pretence of honour'.<sup>74</sup> Margaret also utilises various male disguises in order to cross the border between domestic and public sphere and control the events of the dispute between the English and the Scots in the conquest of the castle of Roxburgh. At the end of the novel, however, that marriage so hoped and fought for 'controls and contains her' (Tulloch 2004: 41), as she is no longer able either to play the chivalric game or engage in her carnivalesque masquerades.

---

<sup>73</sup> Graham Tulloch, 'Writing "by advice": *Ivanhoe* and *The Three Perils of Man*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 15 (2004), 32-52 (p. 41).

<sup>74</sup> Jason Mark Harris, 'National Borders, Contiguous Cultures, and Fantastic Folklore in Hogg's *The Three Perils of Man*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 14 (2003), 38-61 (p. 52).

The series of royal marriages at the end of *Perils of Man* are later parodied through the hyperbolic caricature of the witches' weddings through which, once again, Hogg exposes the damaging effect of bourgeois marriage on the female body. Hogg then presents his own version of the marriage trope, transgressing class boundaries in the union between the English Lady Jane Howard and the poor but honest Scottish warrior Charlie Scott, a character who acts in contrast to Lord Douglas's selfishness. Douglas, mirroring the opportunism of Hogg's contemporary middle-class Lowland Scots, is so absorbed by his own economic interests in the conquest of the castle of Roxburgh held by the English that he does not even recognise Princess Margaret in disguise, putting both her life and honour at risk.

Both *Perils Books* were badly reviewed in the nineteenth century. The thirteen anonymous reviewers of *Perils of Woman* did not appreciate Hogg's use of the Scots language nor his 'indelicacies'. The *Literary Gazette* summarises the general opinion, acknowledging that Hogg is 'a man of a strong but undisciplined imagination', and accusing his text of blasphemy, 'coarseness and gross vulgarity', as well as of being characterised by 'a dialect of unintelligible gibberish'; also criticised were 'the frequent allusions to women of ill-fame, and especially Gatty's letter about them, [which] are in the worst possible taste'. Concerning *Perils of Man*, the twelve anonymous reviewers were against Hogg's use of the supernatural, his parodying of the language of the Scriptures in the voice of the Gospel Friar, and the use of the 'unintelligible' Scots dialect.<sup>75</sup> In this chapter I argue that in *Perils of Woman* Hogg interrogates the concept of 'pure' woman as a discursive national

---

<sup>75</sup> Anon., [Review of] *The Three Perils of Woman*, *Literary Gazette*, 345 (1823), pp. 546-48 (pp. 546, 547) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 3 May 2011]. Both lists of journals can be retrieved from *Literary Reviews in British Periodicals 1821-1826*, compiled by William S. Ward (New York: Garland, 1977), p. 116.

signifier, and that he deconstructs the ideology of bourgeois marriage continuing what he had started in *Perils of Man* with the parody of the witches' marriage, thereby portraying a more socially dynamic representation of the national tale. Hogg's questioning of what had become conventions of the genre, however, contributed to the negative reception of both novels at their time of first publication.

### **The Three Perils of Man and the witches' carnivalesque weddings**

Hogg sets *The Three Perils of Man* in the Scottish Borders at the time of Robert II. A war between England and Scotland dominates the plot, as the English Lady Jane Howard and the Scottish Princess Margaret Stuart instigate a conflict for the occupation of the castle of Roxburgh as a test of their suitors' love. In this parodic chivalric romance, Hogg exposes Princess Margaret's loss of royal status through her marriage with Lord Douglas by playing on her tremendous vanity. In his analysis of Hogg's Border romance, W. G. Shepherd argues that the ubiquitous theme of hunger not only exposes the social abuse of the lower classes, but it also performs a broader metaphorical function, as it conveys Princess Margaret's hunger for status, Charlie Scott's hunger for war, and Michael Scott's for power.<sup>76</sup> The ironic aspect of Princess Margaret's narcissism, the implications of her vanity, and Hogg's related and pointed social critique of bourgeois marriage as a medium for controlling women have gone unexplored by critics. Considering Bakhtin's notion of irony as a literary device to expose social issues,<sup>77</sup> Hogg's comic representation of Princess Margaret's

---

<sup>76</sup> W. G. Shepherd, 'Fat Flesh: The Poetic Theme of *The Three Perils of Man*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 3 (1992), 1-9.

<sup>77</sup> Mikhail M. Bakhtin, 'Epic and Novel: Toward a Methodology for the Study of the Novel', in *The Dialogic Imagination*, ed. by Holquist, pp. 3-40 (pp. 21-27).

pride may be interpreted as a case of repressed anger, one that is motivated by a specific fact: her loss of rank after the marriage with Lord Douglas.

This change in Margaret's reputation may be examined in light of literature's status as a communicative phenomenon where the author conveys meanings either by a conscious use of linguistic features or by exploiting specific cultural stereotypes external to the text, which may generate different reactions depending on the historical position of the reader (Mey 2000: 8-12, 233-46).<sup>78</sup> In *Perils of Man*, Hogg communicates Margaret's loss of royal stature by highlighting a change in her naming:<sup>79</sup> 'Our heroine, the lady Douglas, (lately the princess Margaret of Scotland)'.<sup>80</sup> The same strategic use of references, evocative of the bride's descent down the social ladder, is also discernible in Hogg's figuring of Lady Jane Howard who, after her marriage with Charlie Scott, loses her name—and thus one aspect of her identity—becoming 'Sir Charles' English lady' (p. 518).

Hogg plays ironically with Princess Margaret's jealousy of Lady Jane, and Margaret's vanity clearly dominates the scene. But at a deeper level, her extreme envy implies a more troubling reality. In *Perils of Man*, Princess Margaret is a highly proactive woman who cross-dresses and assumes different male identities in order to have free access to the public sphere dominated by men—but forbidden to women—as well as to manipulate Lord Douglas.<sup>81</sup> In the end, however, as Graham

---

<sup>78</sup> See also Roger D. Sell, 'Introduction', in *Literary Pragmatics*, ed. by Sell (1991a), pp. xi-xxiii (p. xiii).

<sup>79</sup> For a detailed discussion of how a strategic use of references may communicate indirect meanings to the reader, see Jacob L. Mey, *When Voices Clash*, pp. 41-42.

<sup>80</sup> James Hogg, *The Three Perils of Man: War, Women and Witchcraft*, ed. by Douglas Gifford (Edinburgh: Canongate Classics, 1996 [1822]), p. 499. Quotations from Hogg's novel will be from this edition, and page references given within parentheses in the text.

<sup>81</sup> Interestingly, Princess Margaret's and Lady Jane's cross-dressing was received positively by Hogg's contemporary critics. *La Belle Assemblée* viewed Princess Margaret's disguise as 'well conceived, and well supported' and the discovery 'from her disguise [...] also beautifully told' (*La Belle Assemblée*, n.s., 26 October 1822, pp. 429-30 (p. 430)); while the *Monthly Review* claimed that



Tulloch observes, marriage puts an end to her masquerades (2004: 41). In the following dialogue between Mary Kirkmichael and Margaret, Hogg conveys indirectly the Princess's slide down the social scale by highlighting her 'hunger' for social prestige. Margaret's voice opens the extract:

'O Kirkmichael, I am ill! I have suffered many distresses in my time! many, many distresses!'

'Yes, indeed you have, my royal mistress! many, many distresses!'

'[...] Your royal mistress, Mary? I am no royal mistress now! No, I a'nt! Nothing but a plain jog-trot wife of a lord, or earl, or how do you call that beautiful title? While the lady Jane Howard! — Oh Kirkmichael, I cannot tell you the half of what I feel!'

'I know it all. Jealousy! My dear lady, jealousy! [...]'

'[...] The lord of *her* adoption *died* for her, Mary. Think of that. The gallant, faithful, and magnanimous Musgrave *died* for the mistress of his affections. But who died for the poor degraded lady Margaret of Scotland? [...] My lord and husband is all that I could wish in man, only—'

'Only that he is *not dead*. That's all.'

'You had better! *Only* I say that he is not a *prince of the blood royal*, Mary. Think of that.' (pp. 500-503, emphases original)

When assuming that Princess Margaret is jealous of Lady Jane, Lady Kirkmichael exposes the mechanisms of patriarchal ideology. Margaret's real feeling is not only jealousy but also anger at having been deprived of her royal position, as Hogg himself emphasises. The royal wedding in *Perils of Man* functions as a medium to control Princess Margaret, who is transacted as a valuable commodity to increase Lord Douglas's economic interests.

After marriage, Margaret is restrained by that very patriarchal institution. Lord Douglas, however, silences the real reasons for Margaret's uneasiness by

---

'the scene in which the Princess of Scotland and the Lady Jane meet in disguise is one of the best' (*Monthly Review*, 2nd ser., 99 (1822), pp. 439-40 (p. 439)). Perhaps, Princess Margaret's masquerade was well received because its performance is temporary. Eventually, the royal wedding with Lord Douglas puts an end to her cross-dressing games, re-establishing her in the domestic space. The above-mentioned articles can be retrieved from P. D. Garside, J. E. Belanger, and S. A. Ragaz, *British Fiction, 1800–1829: A Database of Production, Circulation & Reception*, designer A. A. Mandal <<http://www.british-fiction.cf.ac.uk>> [accessed 3 May 2011].

making her feel jealous of Lady Jane. ‘I gave my lord a lesson’, reports Margaret to Mary Kirkmichael,

but his reply was not only unsatisfactory but mortifying in the extreme [...] “My dearest love,” said he, “I pray that you will not shew a sense of any inferiority by a jealousy of that unfortunate lady.” Inferiority! I never had such a sentiment as a feeling of inferiority! What absurd notions these men imbibe. (pp. 504-505)

Besides highlighting her lack of humility, a human quality that she cannot fathom, Margaret’s discomfort implies a more poignant reality, namely her loss of rank, property and thereby identity through marriage, which Hogg communicates indirectly to the reader both through a conscious use of references in naming her and by placing emphasis on her immense vanity.

Hogg’s representation of Margaret’s uncomfortable feelings may be explained by looking at the Scottish political order before the 1707 Union with England, when Scotland enforced complex land-owning rights based on feudal tenures, which wives brought to their husbands through the institution of marriage.<sup>82</sup> Hogg exploits this earlier system of marital alliances to question the more contemporary national tale and historical novel, where the marriage between the upper-middle-class protagonists was meant to unite England and Scotland in the imperial project, from which, however, only members from the Scottish higher classes benefited. This aspect is subverted by Hogg who, through the union between the English Lady Jane Howard and the poor, but honourable, Scottish warrior Charlie, transgresses class boundaries, with the aim of contrasting Charlie’s sincerity with Lord Douglas’s opportunism. Possibly mirroring the mindset of the male bourgeoisie of Hogg’s time, Lord Douglas would rather substitute Princess Margaret

---

<sup>82</sup> S. Innes and J. Rendal, ‘Women, Gender, and Politics’, in *Gender in Scottish History since 1700*, ed. by Lynn Abrams and others (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2006), pp. 43-83 (p. 45).

with one of her sisters, when the former feigns death. Disguised as a valet in the early part of the novel, Margaret is thought to have died in the siege but she later turns out to be alive and marries Lord Douglas.

The role of Princess Margaret has also to be read within a wider imperial context: while a medieval Romance, the *Perils of Man* clearly exposes itself to questions about Hogg's view of contemporary monarchical power. This is hinted at by the fact that Margaret has a young boy disguised as a valet die in her place, with the promise of some social advancement, in order to cover her masquerades. Significantly, Hogg decides to omit the description of the royal wedding, an event which 'Isaac the curate' describes minutely in the manuscript that the narrator has found. The latter limits his discussion to the observation that '[t]he streets of the city, and the square of the fortress, that had so lately been dyed with blood, now 'ran red with Rhenish wine'' (p. 491).<sup>83</sup> Instead, Hogg provides a detailed description of the adventures of 'Goliath of Gath' (the friar's mule) during the royal games, conferring on it more literary dignity than on the royal couple. The stubborn mule's ironic behaviour is not a mere moment of comic relief, but it is rather meant to critique class-related pride.<sup>84</sup> The royal marriage, a symbol of upper-class vanity and excess, has been realised only because of the death of many innocents in the skirmishes between the English and Scots, whose violent depiction questions the marriage plot of the national tale, and exposes the harsh reality behind the union of Britain in the

---

<sup>83</sup> Hogg also exploits the same motif of the streets dyed with blood which later 'ran red with Rhenish wine' in a previous ballad, 'Thirlestane', contained in the collection *The Mountain Bard*; for further details see *The Mountain Bard*, ed. by Suzanne Gilbert (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), first published in 1807 (pp. 79, 81).

<sup>84</sup> In a letter to William Stewart Rose (18 March 1823), to whom he dedicated *The Three Perils of Man*, Hogg states that John Gibson Lockhart considered the friar's mule 'the hero of the romance', *The Collected Letters of James Hogg*, ed. by Gillian Hughes, associate editors Douglas S. Mack, Robin MacLachlan and Elaine Petrie, 3 vols (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004-08), vol. 2, pp. 183-85.

imperial scheme. Hogg's explicit portrayal of the battles, however, was not well received by the anonymous reviewer of the *Monthly Censor*, who claimed that 'Mr. Hogg [...] ought to blush for having painted the race from whom his countrymen are sprung, in such black, and hideous colours'.<sup>85</sup> Apparently, the British Union was not ready for Hogg's graphic depiction of warring.

In the final part of *Perils of Man* Hogg provides a hyperbolical caricature of the witches' weddings which, as Silvia Mergenthal argues, 'are, respectively, an uncanny foreshadowing of, and an unkind commentary on, the disillusionment experienced by the knights and the ladies in their marriages' (2012: 85). The witches are poor women who have accepted to work for the wizard Michael Scott with the promise of being rewarded with a marriage of convenience. I add that the witches' carnivalesque unions with the devil in disguise question the ideology of the marriage plot as represented by the royal weddings. This supernatural tale is told by Gibbie Jordan who in Hogg's novel is a bearer of old tradition. After having survived myriad magical transformations, Gibbie is found by the Queen of Scots and her attendants during a visit to Aikwood castle. Gibbie thus provides a description of the witches at the service of Michael Scott who yielded their souls to the devil in exchange for a prosperous marriage:

The marriage ceremony itself, always performed by a demon in the habit of a friar, was a piece of the most horrid blasphemy ever conceived; and every night one of the witches was married to the devil in disguise. Sometimes the bridegroom made his appearance as a gay cavalier, sometimes as a country squire, a foreign merchant, a minstrel, and a moss-trooper [...] and though she seemed always aware of the deceit in a certain degree, from former experiences, yet it was wonderful with what avidity each of the old creatures clung to her enamoured and goodly husband! (p. 523)

---

<sup>85</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *The Three Perils of Man*', *Monthly Censor*, 1 (1822), pp. 467-69 (p. 468).

This extract shows Hogg's not-so-subtle critique of the ideology of progressive history inherent in the marriage narrative. Although setting the novel in the fourteenth century, Hogg links it to contemporary social issues, mirroring the cultural assumptions of bourgeois marriage in his epoch. Time and again, the witches first marry the devil in a grandiose ceremony and soon after die a terrible death. The carnivalesque description of one of the witches' horrible murders, 'writhing to death in the arms of a huge and terrible monster, that squeezed her in its embraces, and hugged her, and caressed her till the spark of wretched life was wholly extinguished' (p. 524); Hogg's focus on their destroyed bodies 'squeezed almost to a jelly, and every bone broken as if it had been smashed on an anvil' (p. 525), 'literally dashed in pieces' (p. 527); and the devil's disguises as a series of historical figures cyclically reiterate the same logic: all exemplify the Bakhtinian function of countering and highlighting the similar social pressure suffered by nineteenth-century bourgeois women in their role of national moral signifiers. Upper- and middle-class women, in Hogg's time, were often manipulated through the discourse of sensibility to yield to unhappy marriages for economic interests from which, however, they were excluded. In *Perils of Man*, Gibbie Jordan describes the witches' marriages as 'true emblem[s] of all worldly grandeur' which eventually turn out to be 'all equally unreal and unsubstantial' (p. 525), as the grotesque destruction of the witches' bodies highlights. Considering that the witches are women of poor origins who have sold their soul to the devil for a marriage of convenience, it can be argued that their grotesque death also mirrors the human costs of the British political union borne by the lower classes in Scotland.

***Gatty's grotesque body and Rickleton's buffoon figure***

In a Bakhtinian reading of nineteenth-century hysterical discourse, Clair Wills holds that both the hysteric and the witch articulate a rebellion against the repression of women at different historical times: the hysteric simply repeats the crisis of the woman who came before her.<sup>86</sup> Likewise, while in *Perils of Man* Hogg exploits the carnivalesque witches' mutilated bodies to articulate his critique of the marriage plot, in *Perils of Woman* (1823) he voices the same critique through Gatty's ghastly physical transformation, which represents in miniature the cyclical return of the restlessness of the repressed women. However, as argued by Wills (2001: 88), while medieval carnival turned things upside down in the collective space and witches were punished publicly, the hysteric's (and hence Gatty's) ability to reverse bourgeois values is contained within the familial arena.

'Peril First' of *Perils of Woman* narrates the love-triangle between Gatty (Agatha) Bell, the daughter of a rich Borders farmer, her poor cousin Cherry Elliot, and M'Ion of Boroland, a Highlander student of medicine in Edinburgh. Gatty falls in love with the young M'Ion; however, she does not reveal her feelings to him because her nurse has warned her against the rashness of youthful love. Meanwhile, Gatty, her brother Joseph, and their cousin Cherry move from the Borders farm of Bellsburnfoot to Edinburgh accompanied by their nurse, in order to improve their education. Daniel Bell, Gatty's father, rents the first flat he comes across, failing to notice that it is located in the red-light district of Edinburgh. Strange as it may sound, M'Ion lives in the same building. After a while, Gatty notices the anomalous inhabitants of the lodging, and writes a letter to her father, asking him to bring her

---

<sup>86</sup> Clair Wills, 'Upsetting the Public: Carnival, Hysteria, and Women's Texts', in *Bakhtin and Cultural Theory*, ed. by David Shepherd and Ken Hirschkop, 2nd edn (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2001), pp. 85-108 (p. 90).

back to the Borders farm. Cherry remains in Edinburgh, and the young M'Ion, feeling rejected by Gatty, turns his attentions to her more cheerful cousin. M'Ion and Cherry become engaged, but when the latter discovers that the former still loves her cousin Gatty, she releases him from his promise. Eventually, M'Ion and Gatty get married. After the wedding, Gatty, Cherry, and M'Ion go to live together in the farm of Gatty's father. Unfortunately, Cherry becomes mysteriously ill and dies. Gatty feels guilty for her cousin's broken heart and death, and falls into a coma for three years, during which time she gives birth to a son. Gatty then recovers from her illness, ending up in the Highlands, where she lives a happy life with her new family in the estate inherited by her husband M'Ion.

Hogg's modern critics have disagreed regarding whether Gatty's disease, which deprives her of any intellect and transforms her body into a 'ghastly automaton' for three years, is due to venereal or psychological causes.<sup>87</sup> The name of the malady that strikes Gatty, Cherry, and M'Ion in *Perils of Woman*, however, is never mentioned by Hogg, and the reader does not know how to interpret it. David Groves identifies the illness as venereal; Barbara Bloedé and Valentina Bold advocate an origin in hysteria; while Douglas S. Mack suggests moral and religious implications, arguing that Gatty is a sacrificial victim because of her family's involvement in Cherry's death. Mack also observes that in order to grasp the rich complexity of *Perils of Woman*, the reader must allow multiple interpretations of Gatty's illness. Along the same lines, Richard D. Jackson suggests that it is more likely that Hogg was 'temperamentally inclined' to leave Gatty's illness 'the subject

---

<sup>87</sup> James Hogg, *The Three Perils of Woman; or Love, Leasing, and Jealousy: A Series of Domestic Scottish Tales*, ed. by Antony Hasler and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002 [1823]), p. 201. Quotations from Hogg's novel will be from this edition, and page references given within parentheses in the text.

of wonder'.<sup>88</sup> Indeed, Hogg himself never clarifies the origins of Gatty's disease, creating great ambiguity, as suggested by the narrative voice:

M'Ion still took it for the nervous shiver of a disturbed sleeper, and maintained his point that she [Gatty] was not dead, but fallen into a deep sleep, or rather a trance. In what state she then was, it will never be in the power of man to decide. The issue turned out so terrible, that the whole matter has always appeared to me [the narrator] as much above human agency as human capacity; if any [among the readers] can comprehend it from a plain narration of the incidents as they succeeded one another, the definition shall be put in their power; but further I take not on me to decide. (pp. 196-97)

I argue that Hogg teased the readers of his time by exploiting consciously and purposefully what has been defined by recent studies as the cooperative principle of communication. Research in conversational strategies (Grice 1989: 22-40), which have been also applied to the dynamics of literary communication (Sell 2000: 51-59, 221-22),<sup>89</sup> shows that a speaker may appear to be uncooperative with the hearer in order to convey an indirect meaning. The non-observance of conversational principles alerts the hearer, who looks for the reason why the speaker did so. Flouting what has been defined by Grice (1989: 27) as the maxim of manner, Hogg created areas of ambiguity in relation to an issue of his time: the spread of venereal diseases in early nineteenth-century Edinburgh due to an increase in prostitution. Blatantly calling attention to such an issue could have caused problems with the reception of Hogg's novel, which was already destabilising marriage as a tool of

---

<sup>88</sup> David Groves, 'James Hogg's *Confessions* and *Three Perils of Woman* and the Edinburgh Prostitution Scandal of 1823', *The Wordsworth Circle*, 18.3 (1987), 127-31; Barbara Bloedé, 'The *Three Perils of Woman* and the Edinburgh Prostitution Scandal of 1823: A Reply to Dr Groves', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 3 (1992), 88-94; Valentina Bold, 'Traditional Narrative Elements in *The Three Perils of Woman*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 3 (1992), 42-56; Douglas S. Mack, 'Gatty's Illness in *The Three Perils of Woman*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 1 (1990b), 133-35; Richard D. Jackson, 'Gatty Bell's Illness in James Hogg's *The Three Perils of Woman*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 14 (2003), 16-29 (p. 26).

<sup>89</sup> See also Jacob L. Mey, *Pragmatics: An Introduction*, 2nd rev. and enlarged edn (Malden, MA: Blackwell, 2001), pp. 68-78.



oppression and containment in the national tale. This may explain why in *Perils of Woman* Hogg leaves to the reader the final task of inferring the origins of the strange illness which affects the love triangle. Previously, Hogg's perceived 'indelicacy' in dealing with prostitution had resulted in harsh reactions from the polite world of the Edinburgh literary circle. Though Hogg's collection *Winter Evening Tales* (1820) had been generally well received, *The Monthly Review* considered 'Basil Lee' to be a troublesome story because its not-so-hidden portrayal of prostitution offended 'the best regulated modesty'.<sup>90</sup> Ian Duncan, writing about Hogg's short-lived periodical *The Spy* (1810-11), observes that 'polite readers, offended by the sexual content of some of the stories, cancelled their subscriptions, and *The Spy* folded at the end of August 1811, exactly a year after his first issue'.<sup>91</sup>

Brown and Levinson's (1987) principles of politeness in communication may help to reveal more theoretically the reasons *why* Hogg felt the need to be ambiguous regarding Gatty's illness. As already mentioned (see introduction), Brown and Levinson distinguish between negative face, that is, the hearer's need to avoid being impeded in whatever he or she wants to do, and positive face, the hearer's need for social approval. Nineteenth-century reviewers of *Winter Evening Tales* (1820) had condemned Hogg's supposed 'indelicacies', viewing them as face threatening acts against the positive face of bourgeois women who, in their role of supporters of British moral values, could perceive the blatant manner with which prostitution was dealt as disrespectful. On such occasion, *The Scotsman* had argued that 'Hogg should read his tales over to his recently-acquired wife and "strike out every paragraph

---

<sup>90</sup> Anon., '[Review of] Winter Evening Tales', *Monthly Review*, n.s., 93, November 1820, pp. 263-67 (p. 264) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 10 February 2013].

<sup>91</sup> Ian Duncan, 'Introduction', in *Winter Evening Tales*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004a), pp. xi-xli (p. xiv).

which, either as to thought or expression, offends her delicacy”.<sup>92</sup> Mrs Mary Gray, one of the female contributors to *The Spy*, begins her paper in no. 32 with a conversation of young ladies who declared that *The Spy* ‘was extremely faulty in style, wanted polish exceedingly, and had some descriptions of courtship that were quite unnatural, and very offensive to a delicate mind’.<sup>93</sup> In his ‘Memoir’, Hogg writes that ‘the literary ladies in particular, agreed, in full divan, that I would never write a sentence which deserved to be read’.<sup>94</sup> In order to avoid defying what Roger D. Sell (2000: 221-26) terms ‘selectional politeness’ in literary texts, namely the author’s choice of topics which may offend a particular readership, Hogg chose to be ambiguous about the consequences of prostitution in *Perils of Woman*. However, though he may have exploited a certain ambiguity at the level of ‘what is said’ about Gatty’s illness, at the level of ‘what is implicated’ Hogg may have suggested a series of disturbing circumstances, which were actually inferred by his contemporary reviewers, thus contributing to the negative reception of his work.

David Groves (1987: 127) argues that in *Perils of Woman* Hogg echoes a tragic episode that happened in Edinburgh in 1823. On the evening of 8<sup>th</sup> February, the South Bridge was the scene of a murder that involved six young men and a group of prostitutes who worked in a brothel run by Mary McKinnon. She was absent when the men arrived but, on leaving, the six men refused to pay and a fight ensued. Upon returning to her brothel at about midnight, Miss McKinnon found all the lights

---

<sup>92</sup> Anon., [Review of] *Winter Evening Tales*, *The Scotsman*, 29 April 1820, pp. 143-44 (p. 143); quoted by Gillian Hughes, in *Altrive Tales*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2005 [1832]), note 50(c), p. 243.

<sup>93</sup> Mary Gray, ‘To the Spy’, *The Spy: A Periodical of Literary Amusement and Instruction*, written by Hogg and others, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2000 [1810-1811]), No 32, Saturday 6 April, pp. 320-27 (p. 320).

<sup>94</sup> James Hogg, ‘Memoir of the Author’s Life’, in *Altrive Tales*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2005 [1832]), pp. 11-52 (p. 25).

extinguished and a brawl taking place between the six men and seven of her prostitutes. In the struggle, a man named William Howat was stabbed and died. Although there was no evidence against her, McKinnon was accused of having killed the man and she was executed on 16<sup>th</sup> April 1823. Mary McKinnon became the main target of several magazine articles of the period, and the *Edinburgh Observer* published her story, highlighting her unfortunate life and her arrival in Edinburgh about eleven years earlier, at a time when she had an illegitimate child and no money.<sup>95</sup> Though McKinnon's unfortunate fate stimulated a great deal of public sympathy, she received very little support from 'the genteel and polite' and, eventually, 'was soon forgotten under a blanket of silent disapproval' (Groves 1987: 128). In *Perils of Woman* Hogg may have echoed Mary McKinnon's sad episode through the character of Katie M'Nab—Rickleton's wife, who had been a prostitute before their marriage—as both women had kept up one primary relationship with a 'fancy man', and had an illegitimate son (Groves 1987: 127-31).

In the same article, Groves observes that Daniel Bell's choice of the wrong apartment for his children, in a building which is also the lodging of a brothel, is the first hint at prostitution in the novel. Gatty's letter to her father, with her comments about 'women of ill-fame', is another allusion which Hogg's contemporary critics considered extremely offensive (Anon. *Literary Gazette* 1823: 547). The same character of M'Ion—the Edinburgh medical-student with a 'shady reputation', who lives in a building with a brothel—suggests a common practice among prostitutes in that period since, as also observed by Dr Tait, young students of law and medicine

---

<sup>95</sup> Groves writes that '[t]he *Edinburgh Observer* published, a fifteen-page *Biographical Account* which told of Mary's lack of education, of the early death of her mother, [and] of her seduction at fifteen' (Groves 1987: 127).

were frequently supported by prostitutes as their ‘fancy men’ (1840: 56). Groves claims that at a time when in literary contexts even the theme of pregnancy was considered indelicate, Hogg pushed the limits of decorum too far by introducing a disturbing issue concerned with women’s contemporary urban life and showing the consequences of prostitution in the venereal disease which affects the love-triangle of Gatty, Cherry, and M’Ion (Groves 1987: 129). However, it must be argued that Hogg never states openly the nature of the malady, implying it more subtly through other allusions and leaving the final interpretation to the reader. Yet, the reviewer of the *Literary Chronicle* felt threatened by Hogg’s indirect hints since he judged *Perils of Woman* a novel ‘for our own right understanding and gratification, and not for that of our family, to whom, we soon found, we must make it a sealed book’.<sup>96</sup> That is to say, this reviewer thought that Hogg should have left bourgeois women—the symbolic signifiers of the British nation—unaware of the disturbing reality of prostitution in their position at the other end of the social spectrum.

No matter the cause of Gatty’s disease, what Hogg focuses on is her monstrous physical transformation. Gatty’s ‘animated corpse’ (p. 200) has an important function since it partly symbolises women’s resistance to bourgeois assumptions of proper feminine behaviour. The following extract from *Perils of Woman* depicts Gatty’s state:

The body sprung up with a power resembling that produced by electricity. It did not rise up like one wakening out of a sleep, but with a jerk so violent that it struck the old man [Gatty’s father] on the cheek, almost stupefying him; and there sat the corpse, dressed as it was in dead-clothes, a most appalling sight as man ever beheld. *The whole frame appeared to be convulsed, and as it were struggling to get free of its bandages.* It continued, moreover, a sort of hobbling motion, as if it moved on springs [...] It was now like the dead countenance of an idiot,—the eyes were large and rolled in their sockets, but it was apparent that they saw nothing, nor threw any

---

<sup>96</sup> Anon., ‘[Review of] *The Three Perils of Woman*’, *Literary Chronicle*, 228, 27 September 1823, pp. 615-16 (p. 615).

reflection inward on an existing mind. *There was also a voice, and a tongue, but between them they uttered no intelligible word, only a few indistinct sounds like the babble of a running brook.* No human heart could stand this; for though the body seemed to have life, it was altogether an unnatural life; or rather, the frame seemed as if agitated by some demon that knew not how to exercise or act upon any one of the human powers or faculties [...] there the creature sat struggling and writhing, using contortions both in body and feature that were truly terrific. No one knew what to do or say; but as they were all together in the same room, so they clung together, and neither sent for divine nor physician, *unwilling that the deplorable condition of the family, and the nakedness of their resources, should be exposed to the blare of the public voice.* (pp. 200-201, emphases mine)

Although Hogg never specifies whether Gatty suffers from a venereal disease or hysteria, her body bears the marks of psychological torment caused by her sense of guilt for Cherry's broken heart and death after Gatty's marriage with M'Ion. Drawing upon the contemporary vogue for studies, led by Luigi Galvani, which explored electricity's ability to re-animate corpses,<sup>97</sup> Hogg suggests the symptoms of Gatty's crisis as a 'staging' of the carnivalesque, making her body a symbol of resistance to the bourgeois discourse endorsed by Gatty's mother, a woman of the middle class and a bearer of British bourgeois values. In *Perils of Woman*, Mrs Bell is the guardian of both the bourgeois sense of decorum and middle-class cultural assumptions, the latter shown by her continuous rebuking of her husband's Scots language (which represents Hogg's desire to preserve Scottish identity). The cleansing of their English of any Scotticisms was one of the political strategies endorsed by the members of the Scottish upper and middle classes in order to feel equal members with England in the imperial enterprise.<sup>98</sup> Mrs Bell also displays an excessive preoccupation with appearance and, for this reason, she polices the conduct

---

<sup>97</sup> Ian Duncan discusses both the influence of galvanism on Hogg's fictional construction of Gatty's body and the latter transformation into a 'maternal body' through the deliverance of a child during her three-year comatose state in the asylum. See 'The upright corpse', in *Scott's Shadow*, written by Duncan, pp. 207-12.

<sup>98</sup> For a detailed discussion of Hogg's strategic use of English and Scots in *Perils of Woman* see Emma Letley, 'Some Literary Uses of Scots in *The Three Perils of Woman*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 1 (1990), 45-56.

of her daughter. However Gatty's 'whole frame appeared to be convulsed, and as it were struggling to get free of its bandages' (p. 200), namely the dead-clothes Mrs Bell has put on her supposed corpse—a metaphorical representation of the bourgeois values that she is attempting to instil in her daughter.

Within the literary space, the critical potential of the Bakhtinian grotesque body lies in openness to the public gaze, which becomes the means for expressing a historical consciousness; however, as argued by Wills (1989: 88), in the specific case of the hysterical woman the disruptive potential of her psychological experience is kept within family boundaries. The bourgeoisie depicted by Hogg in *Perils of Woman* has a subtle relation to carnival because its identity relies on differentiation from Gatty's monstrous body, a symbol of disgust, which must be kept within the familial borders and hidden from the public gaze. The members of Gatty's family are 'unwilling that the[ir] deplorable condition [...], and the nakedness of their resources, should be exposed to the blare of the public voice' (p. 201). This is why 'it was judged proper [...] that she [Gatty] should be conveyed to a private asylum [...] so that the country might never know the real circumstances of the case' (p. 203).

Bakhtin's notion of the chronotope, according to which spatial and temporal coordinates not only provide a setting for the novel but also contribute to the shaping of its plot (1981: 84-85), further reveals the significance of Gatty's body. Hogg's novel appears to be characterised by a series of intersecting chronotopes whose relationship reveals competing ideologies. Analysing *Jane Eyre*—in which female madness plays an important role—Suzanne Rosenthal Shumway argues that the chronotope of the asylum has the function of displaying insanity in the novel, hence

‘subverting and distorting the primary narrative’ (1994: 157). According to Shumway,

Within the chronotope of the asylum centrifugal language gains the upper hand over centripetal language. *Laughs, screams, even silence are valorised in this narrative space, rather than utterances.* In short, in the chronotope of the asylum lies the key to an intense linguistic freedom that exists just beyond sanity [...] The chronotope of the asylum [...] thus becomes an arena in which subversion—and in particular a feminine form of subversion—can be articulated. (Shumway 1994: 157, emphasis mine)

In Hogg’s *Perils of Woman*, two powerful literary expedients bear an important strategic function: Gatty’s carnivalesque transformation is set against the patriarchal discourse of the bourgeoisie and it acts to celebrate the social body of silenced women, while the chronotope of the asylum becomes the only possible space where Gatty can articulate her critical historical consciousness. According to the centripetal logic of dominant discourse, however, such resistance is not utterable; here Gatty is allowed only to scream and to make ‘a few indistinct sounds like the babble of a running brook’ (p. 200). For the pragmatics of literary communication, voices need not be heard in order to be real, and a segment of society can also be represented by an unspoken voice (Mey 2000: 150). Although Gatty has been denied articulate speech, she still represents her vision of the world. According to Mey, a ‘pragmatic act’, as distinguished by a ‘speech act’ (how we do things using words), does not ‘so much depend on the actual words being used’ as ‘on the circumstances that lead up to, and accompany, those words’ since the context of the acting carries more weight than the spoken act itself (2000: 309). In ‘pragmatic acting’ the agent simultaneously exploits and is constrained by the conditions of the social situation, and utilises one’s societal empowerment to achieve the communicative goal rather than exerting power

in the usual dominant sense (Mey 2001: 206-35).<sup>99</sup> Through Gatty's inarticulate speech, Hogg effectively empowers her with the possibilities at her disposal in the fictional context of the lunatic asylum and sets her up in the position of performing a pragmatic act of resistance to the extra-literary bourgeois discourse of his time. Through Gatty's incomprehensible words in a marginal space, Hogg voices an important social critique, subverting the primary narrative and, by extension, the ideology of the national tale.

The origin of Gatty's cultural repression may be traced back to the opening pages of *Perils of Woman*, where the duality of her monologue before the mirror illustrates an example of the Bakhtinian 'superaddressee', the judging entity which hovers above her like a Freudian super-ego. Bakhtin argues that the superaddressee is not a figure physically present in the text but a 'third voice' against whose authority the author shapes the language of the text (Bakhtin 2004 [1986]: 126). Mey observes that this third, usually hidden, party reflects the text's 'power and dominance' (2000: 283), and its presence becomes apparent when a character talks to himself through a 'you' voice while socially evaluating personal matters. In this case, the character imitates the voice of an 'external authority', namely public opinion, the social institutions, the educational system, and all the other judging instances that the superaddressee may represent. In Hogg's *Perils of Woman*, Gatty's double-voiced monologue exposes the bourgeois cultural constraints which, as a judging authority, block her natural attraction towards M'Ion:

---

<sup>99</sup> See also Jacob L. Mey, 'Pragmatic Acts', in *Concise Encyclopaedia of Pragmatics*, (2009b [2006]), pp. 747-53. For the application of Mey's notion of pragmatic acts to literary communication see 'Reading as a Pragmatic Act', in *When Voices Clash*, pp. 308-12.



“What is the matter with you, naughty Agatha, that you cannot pray to your Maker this morning, as you have long been wont to do and that with so much delight?”

“Because I am ashamed of the thoughts and feelings of my heart this morning, and I never was before.”

“And because you are ashamed of your thoughts, do you therefore propose to set up a state of independence of your Creator, and to ask no more guidance or counsel of Him? If you think it sinful and shameful to be in love, cannot you pray that you may never be so?”

“No.—Oh dear me! I cannot pray for that neither.”

“Then cannot you pray that you may love with all your heart, and be beloved again?”

“Oh! No, no, no, no! I would not pray that for the whole world; it is so home a thrust, and comes so near one’s heart, it must be very bad. My dear parents and my pastor have always taught me the leading duty of self-denial; to pray for such things as these would be anything but self-denial. To love with all my heart, and be beloved again! Oh! Goodness, no. I cannot, cannot ask such a thing as that! I am sure, at least fear, it is wrong, very wrong, but—I would not care to try.” (p. 2)

As readers we perceive Gatty’s dual-voiced monologue as a coercive entity that is socially evaluating her feelings for M’Ion. When rebuking her own behaviour, Gatty voices her parents, the Scottish Kirk, and the patriarchal bourgeois system which have the cultural role of containing her nature.

The mirror is a literary device that Hogg exploits to show Gatty’s internal struggle between culture and nature: a doorway into her spiritual world, a device which may potentially reveal the fantasies of Gatty’s mind. This is why she does not look into it until she has recited ‘a short prayer’, worn ‘her clothes’, and ‘put her exuberant locks’—a symbol of her sensuality—‘under some restraint for the day’ (p. 1). John Berger argues that the perspectives of the male surveyor and the female surveyed contained within a single woman represent two constituent elements of her identity: she has to inspect ‘everything she is and everything she does’, because a woman’s appearance to others determines how society treats her.<sup>100</sup> In Hogg’s *Perils of Woman*, the mirror has the function of revealing Gatty’s attraction to M’Ion. After a vivid dream, and forgetful of any bourgeois consideration concerning proper

---

<sup>100</sup> John Berger, *Ways of Seeing* (London: Penguin Books, 1972), p. 46.

feminine behaviour, Gatty gathers her courage and looks at her real self, acknowledging her desires. This sense of freedom is short-lived, however, as soon afterwards Gatty's authoritarian scolding of herself in the superaddressee 'you' voice, representative of her 'dear parents' and 'pastor', again restrains her behaviour. Hogg's strategic use of references conveys a further, indirect sense of authority, as Gatty addresses herself by her more official name, Agatha. Such reference, though, exposes Hogg's parody of bourgeois discourse, as it appears to be rather exaggerated compared to the last sentence of the passage where Gatty admits, ironically for the reader, that although her feelings are 'very wrong'—according to the dominant ideology—she 'would not care to try' (p. 2). Thus Hogg critiques the saccharine, sentimental mode of the national tale which, at first sight, the novel seems to embody, offering a more authentic representation of Gatty's real wishes.

Probably drawing on, and hence intertextually engaging with, contemporary Susan Edmonstone Ferrier's *Marriage* (1818), which he had read and loved, in *Perils of Woman* Hogg identifies a cycle of ignorance which bourgeois women perpetuate through their daughters.<sup>101</sup> Opposing two female characters, Gatty and Cherry, with the difference that the two young girls are cousins rather than twin sisters, Hogg shows how Gatty's mother has passed her own selfishness on to her daughter, while Cherry, probably because she was orphaned and hence culturally less conditioned, appears to be more representative of nature. In the following dialogue, Cherry and

---

<sup>101</sup> In a letter to William Blackwood of 28 June 1824, Hogg writes that 'never was there such a painter as she is [...] if the author of MARRIAGE and THE INHERITANCE be a woman I am in love with her and I authorise you to tell her so'; see *Collected Letters*, ed. by Hughes and others, vol. 2, p. 202.

Gatty argue over whether showing one's real feeling towards a man, in their case the young M'Ion whom they both love, is appropriate for a lady. Cherry, two years younger than Gatty, opens the dialogue:

“[...] I love him so dearly, that I feel just as I could take him all to my heart!”

“Bless me, child, you must not speak out your foolish thoughts in that ridiculous manner. I hope you would not repeat such a sentiment to anybody else. If ever such a shameful thought cross your inexperienced mind again, for Heaven's sake suppress it, and say the very reverse of what you feel!”

“Would I, indeed? Catch me there! A fine lesson, truly! You would first persuade me that I am a child, and then teach that child to be a systematic liar. *No, no, cousin, I will always think as I feel, and express what I think, for I shall never take up a trade that I think shame of*, and if I should love Mr M'Ion ever so well, and die for him too, what has anybody to say? So I will do both if I think proper.”

[...]

“Well, I protest, child, that *no young lady of this country ever expressed herself in such a style*. I am utterly ashamed to hear you.”

“And yet you have had the same feeling a hundred times [...] So you are changing colour, are you?—*Who is the child now?—She that professes one thing, and feels quite the reverse, say I*. Good bye cousin.” (pp. 28-29, emphases mine)

Gatty represents the middle-class ‘pure’ young lady, the symbolic signifier of British national identity, who must be raised in accordance with the bourgeois assumptions of delicacy in order to guarantee the moral values at the heart of imperial discourse. Hogg then sets up Cherry as a symbol of anti-hypocrisy and honesty in opposition to Gatty—though, eventually, Cherry's spontaneity is punished with death. This female pair represents Hogg's ‘co-adaptation’ between his own individuality and the cultural values of his time. Hogg partly resists the bourgeois construction of proper feminine behaviour through Cherry's genuineness and then negotiates this show through her demise. The dialectics between these two female characters illustrates what Jennifer Camden (2010: 15) argues about the role of the primary and the secondary heroine in nineteenth-century novels: Gatty mirrors the ideals of the contemporary Edinburgh bourgeoisie, while Cherry's death signals the cost of the ideological union between

Gatty and M'Ion—while simultaneously making her transgression more acceptable to bourgeois readers.<sup>102</sup>

Similarly to a Bakhtinian polyphonic orchestration, the author hides behind Cherry's voice, giving life to a 'naughty' feminine version of Hogg himself. In his essay to 'Young Women', Hogg claims that

[t]here is an ingenious frankness which I am far from condemning, which consists simply in shewing the mind as it is. It is the purity which has nothing to conceal, *nothing to be ashamed of*, nothing to counterfeit, and nothing to affect [...] Nothing great is expected from her [a young lady], which makes her little sallies the more pleasant; and such a picture of happy cheerfulness cannot fail to be reflected even from the breast of a cynic. It is like music at a feast [...] a sweet fragrance on a passing breeze—a savour for delight, which cheers and amends that heart.<sup>103</sup>

Though written after Hogg's novel, this passage reflects the author's moral values and suggests an intertextual relationship with *Perils of Woman*—which the reader has to recognise and then recreate through a pragmatic act of reading—as it seems a description of Cherry herself, through whose 'frankness' Hogg subverts the ideology of bourgeois delicacy.

In *Perils of Woman*, Rickleton's marriage to a prostitute represents a further act of resistance, which Hogg sets against the marriage plot of both the national tale and the sentimental novel. If the wedding between Gatty and M'Ion in the main plot represents the political reconciliation between the Highlands and the Lowlands, through Rickleton's union in the subplot Hogg presents his own version of the marriage plot highlighting the real values on which it should be based. Rickleton's wife is pregnant by a former lover, but he accepts her son as his own. In so doing, he

<sup>102</sup> An anonymous reviewer, probably John Wilson, received Cherry as a 'warm-hearted creature towards M'Ion' and 'very innocent and piquante', even though viewing 'her prattle' too 'tedious'; see '[Review of] *The Three Perils of Woman*', *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, 14 (1823), pp. 427-37 (p. 434) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 3 May 2011].

<sup>103</sup> James Hogg, 'Young Women', in *A Series of Lay Sermons*, ed. by Hughes, pp. 16-27 (pp. 18-19), emphasis mine.

allows the child to become the heir to his possessions which, according to the system of primogeniture, must go to the first son. Through his forgiveness and acceptance (two important Hogg values)<sup>104</sup> Rickleton emancipates himself from patriarchal masculine stereotypes of revenge, thereby gaining social happiness. Though a secondary character, Rickleton bears out two significant functions for the pragmatics of literary communication. First, as Antony Hasler suggests (2002: xvi-xxiii), Hogg's novel counters the sentimental mode of Wilson's collection of tales *Lights and Shadows of Scottish Life* (1822), published by Blackwood one year before *Perils of Woman* (2002, xvii);<sup>105</sup> and second, I argue, he does so through the collective laughter that Rickleton stimulates. Being alien to any kind of malicious intent, this figure emphasises the base nature of selfish characters, such as Gatty's brother, playing the role of Bakhtinian buffoon, as evidenced in the following passage:

The remarks of the laird of Burlhope during dinner were such as to make the Highlanders stare; for the former, valuing himself only on his riches and bodily strength, not only neglected, but despised, all the little elegant rules of courtesy [...] But by the time the cloth was removed, the bluntness and homeliness of his remarks caused them [the Highlanders] several times to break out into a roar of laughter. Old Daniel rather felt uneasy at this, for he heard that these were laughs of derision; but Dick observing no such symptoms, joined them with his Hoo-hoo-hoo, in its most tremendous semiquaver. (p. 59)

---

<sup>104</sup> David Groves, *James Hogg: The Growth of a Writer* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1988), pp. 89, 136.

<sup>105</sup> In a previous article, Hasler observes that Wilson's stories are characterised by 'several themes' of 'the sentimental mode', where 'a saccharine piety plays a large part'; for example, Wilson depicts contrasted 'young love' which later 'triumphs', as well as 'pleasantly condescending pictures of the pious and frugal life led by the simple poor', or 'small and engaging children' who 'run appalling risks going on errands for ageing relatives'; the twists and turns are then resolved rather easily in a 'linear movement' which 'embodies the workings of Wilson's comforting notion of Providence'; see Antony Hasler, 'The Three Perils of Woman and John Wilson's *Lights and Shadows of Scottish Life*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 1 (1990), 30-45 (p. 31). In a letter to William Blackwood of 14 June 1822, Hogg shows mixed feelings towards Wilson's collection of tales, arguing that they exhibit 'a great deal of very powerful effect purity of sentiment and fine writing but very little of real nature as it exists in the walks of Scottish life' (*Collected Letters*, vol. 2, p. 164).

Despite appearing as a fool, Rickleton undergoes a transformation towards the end of ‘Peril First’, mitigating his exuberant character and conveying one of Hogg’s most important values, the moderation of extremes. Rickleton’s obsession with bodily strength and riches makes him a caricature of masculine stereotypes, which Hogg exaggerates in order to highlight his subsequent evolution. As argued by Roger D. Sell in his reading of Charles Dickens’s *Dombey and Son*, although Bakhtin’s *heteroglossia* is helpful in clarifying the significance of Dickens’s socio-historically fixed caricatures, it cannot explain the implications of more socially dynamic characters.<sup>106</sup> In the specific case of *Perils of Woman*, through Rickleton’s subsequent emancipation from the stereotypes of masculinity, Hogg exhibits, once again, a ‘co-adaptation’ between bourgeois patriarchal values of early nineteenth-century Britain and his resistance to them. Rickleton symbolises a challenge to middle-class morality, the anti-hypocrisy and honesty that was needed to correct the bourgeois conventionality of the national tale, its ‘anti-mimetic model’ as Ferris would call it (2002: 47), thus providing an alternative to the ‘binarisms of British or class identities’, as McCracken-Flesher observes in her analysis of Hogg’s *Perils of Man* (2009: 176). In *Perils of Woman*, Hogg deconstructs the discursive dichotomy between Madonna and whore through the subversive marriage between this disruptive Northumbrian landowner and a Scottish-Lowlander prostitute. In so doing, Hogg reveals a more honest representation of North Britain than the prosperous one portrayed in the allegorical union between Gatty and M’Ion in the main plot, voicing the alternative realities in the Scottish social scale.

---

<sup>106</sup> I am indebted to Roger D. Sell for bringing to my attention the comparison between Dickens and Hogg in relation to literary politeness. For Sell’s literary-pragmaticist reading of Dickens’s *Dombey and Son* see ‘Decorum versus indecorum in *Dombey and Son*’, in *Mediating Criticism: Literary Education Humanized*, written by Roger D. Sell (Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 2001), pp. 165-93 (pp. 181-86).

***War, jealousy, and the violation of Sally Niven's maternal body***

The previous part of this chapter focused on how, in both *Perils* narratives, Hogg interrogates the discursive ideals of the national tale by proposing his own version of the marriage plot through the secondary characters' class-crossing unions, as well as by showing the negative consequences of bourgeois ideology on the female body. This section will focus on how Hogg interrogates the historical novel in the last book of *Perils of Woman* by engaging, once again, with the marriage plot. This time, Hogg shows the negative consequences of raising one's social status when marrying for ambition rather than for more honourable reasons. According to Ian Duncan, in *Perils of Woman* Hogg depicts the development of the Scottish novel from 'domestic national tale' to Walter Scott's historical novel with the aim of questioning those very narrative conventions 'from which he felt more and more alienated' (Duncan 1994: 155). The aim of the following discussion is to show *how* Hogg interrogates the historical novel in 'Peril Third' by providing an analysis of the narrative techniques, literary tropes, and human feelings that he exploits to achieve this purpose.

No critic seems to have engaged with Hogg's use of jealousy in 'Peril Third' as an organising trope for the narrative structure. By signposting a chain of events through this basest of emotions, and by adding touches of humour and suspense when tracing a number of its causes and consequences, Hogg seduces the reader in order to achieve a more important goal. He exposes the negative consequences of war on Sally Niven's body, whose tragic death renders the end of 'Peril First'—in which the union of Gatty and M'Ion reconciles the Highlands and the

Lowlands—rather utopian, a reality ‘far distant from the vision of history as meaningless violence’ (Hasler 1990: 43).<sup>107</sup>

Narratologically, Hogg reverses Walter Scott’s progressive movement of the historical novel, starting with a tale set at his time of writing in the 1820s and, then, going backwards in ‘circles’ (rather than in linear chapters) to 1746, in order to stage retrospectively the disturbing Culloden episode—which Scott sidesteps in *Waverley*—and exposing its negative consequences on Highland society through the eyes of Sally Niven, while cross-dressed as a man. Antony Hasler holds that in Hogg’s vision, history is inexorable and inscrutable as it tends to reiterate itself in circles, rather than showing a progressive civilisation (2002: xxv-xxxi). Indeed, the narratologically circling pattern of Hogg’s book has the metaphorical function of suggesting that, at any time in human history, wars are always motivated by the same basic drives for violence, greed, and power on the part of ‘princes and great men [... who] generally live in luxury in their palaces, far from the battle’s alarm, and are but little sensible of the miseries that accompany the wars that they themselves have raised’, as Hogg himself would later argue in his essay ‘Soldiers’, when reflecting upon the more recent Napoleonic Wars.<sup>108</sup>

Transgressing class boundaries, in *Perils of Woman* Hogg continues the critique of bourgeois marriage started in *Perils of Man*, where the union between the English Lady Jane Howard and the poor, but sincere, Scottish warrior Charlie Scott

---

<sup>107</sup> In ‘Peril First’ of *Perils of Woman*, Hogg hints at the exploitation of the Highlands by Lowlander investors through Daniel Bell, who talks about the possibility of breeding sheep in M’Ion estate once he marries his daughter Gatty, thinking the match between the Highland heir and his daughter better than the one with Rickleton: ‘And our daughter is likely to be a great Highland lady too; [...] and I think it will be a better speculation, after a’, than Mrs Rickleton of Burlhope; for ye see, by way o’ tocher [a bride’s dowry] good, I shall double M’Ion’s yearly income to him’ (p. 127). At the time when the novel was written, the Highland Clearances were an important issue, with the eviction of tenants to make room for sheep breeding, which had started soon after the Culloden massacre in 1746, the time when ‘Peril Third’ is set; see the editorial note [127 (d)] to the text on p. 445.

<sup>108</sup> James Hogg, ‘Soldiers’, in *A Series of Lay Sermons*, ed. by Hughes, pp. 40-47 (p. 40).



reveals the opportunism of Lord Douglas and, by extension, of Hogg's contemporary Scottish upper-middle classes. The latter were the ones who profited economically from the British union with England, and both the national tale and the historical novel promoted this marriage of convenience. In 'Peril First' of *Perils of Woman*, Hogg portrays the wedding between a Scottish prostitute and an English squire in the subplot as more honourable than the union between the protagonists of the main plot. In 'Perils Second' and 'Third', Hogg then depicts Sally Niven (a Lowland servant but a lady at heart) climbing the social scale. She is offered the opportunity to marry a Highland gentleman as a reward for her help in the Stuart cause—even though this rise in social status, with relative adjustment to domesticity and renunciation of sexual freedom, will cause her death.

Likewise, Peter Gow (Sally's sweetheart) climbs the social ladder by marrying a lady of the upper class as a reward for having behaved 'heroically'. He defeated by use of a trick and with the help of only eleven old men, 'the Earl of Loudon's grand expedition to catch Prince Charles' (p. 333) at the castle of Balmillo. Peter and his friends 'placed themselves, by Peter's direction, behind bushes on each side of the road, six being above the road, and six below it, all at considerable distances; [...] and then they were to commence a running fire at considerable intervals' (p. 323), pretending to be two Highland clans surrounding the advancing troops of the Earl of Loudon.

The narrator points out that Lady Ogilvie (one of the Highland Ladies supportive of the Stuart cause), upon knowing Sally's and Peter's heroism, remarks that

[i]t would be the highest imprudence of these two to be united; for that they were both well entitled to change their places in society, from the lowest to the highest. If

they were married, they were in a manner compelled to remain in the same humble sphere which they at present occupied. (p. 356)

‘Peril Third’ then shows the tragic consequences of Peter’s and Sally’s abandonment of their ‘humble sphere’ thanks to their respective ‘highly ranked’ unions.

Hogg catalyses his narrative plot around four fits of jealousy. At the end of ‘Peril Second’, Sally’s ‘leaving’ (her ‘flirtatious lying’) provokes both Peter’s and the minister’s jealousies of each other. For this reason, they abandon Sally to her destiny, leading her to accept a marriage of convenience to Alexander Mackenzie. The second fit of jealousy is Sally’s who, on seeing her husband with a supposed lover, flees, setting in motion a chain of misunderstandings that lead to the final catastrophe of the tale: ‘Who can help regretting that Sally did not speak!’ comments the narrator, ‘What toil, what sorrow, what misery one single word at that decisive moment would have prevented! But JEALOUSY, that fiend of internal descent, [...] prevented her from [...] inquiring [...] into the connexion between her husband and supposed rival’ (p. 380). This ‘rival’ will eventually turn out to be Alexander’s half-sister.

Sally’s escape contributes to a third fit of jealousy: this time, her husband Alexander’s, with the result that he and Peter wound each other. The fourth outburst is that of Peter’s wife who in an act of revenge for her supposed abandonment by her husband for Sally, ‘haunted as she was by the tormenting fiend of jealousy’ (p. 401), reveals Peter’s location to the soldiers of the Duke of Cumberland, who will kill both Peter and Alexander. In line with one of Hogg’s aesthetic principles, according to which what appears to be true is not necessarily so, no cause of these outbursts of jealousy proves to be real; however, once ignited by such a potent feeling, the plot

momentum cannot be arrested any longer, and Hogg arranges his critique of the historical novel around these four cardinal fits.<sup>109</sup>

As a consequence of Peter's abandonment, Sally marries a Highland gentleman who, soon afterwards, is involved in the battle of Culloden. Not knowing what has become of him, Sally—once again—experiences a strong feeling of abandonment, exacerbated by the members of her husband's cold family who, notwithstanding her heroism in the Stuart cause, have never accepted her low origins. Suffering such neglect, Sally transgresses the border of her safe domestic environment cross-dressed as a man, and starts her adventure in the public space in search for her spouse.

Appealing to the bourgeois vogue for touring, Hogg portrays his cross-dressed heroine's journey through the Highlands, juxtaposing picturesque sceneries and the atrocious effects of Culloden, particularly upon women and children, through Sally's focalisation. However, her improbable Highland garb—suggested by noun phrases modified by adjectives that emphasise Sally's femininity, such as 'beautiful Lowland boy' (p. 372), 'fine Lowland stripling' (p. 373) or 'handsome Sassenach' (p. 374)—highlights her continuous risk of having her real gender revealed. This

---

<sup>109</sup> In his Preface to *The Hunting of Badlewe*, Hogg discusses the dynamics of his creative process in the organisation of dramatic action. The same principles seem to motivate the plot construction of 'Peril Third' around the feeling of jealousy. In that preface Hogg claims that

a chain of interesting events connected with and arising out of one another, affords infinitely more scope and chance of success to the poet,—more opportunities to the actor, of displaying his powers in the representation of nature, and more interest and delight, whether to spectators or readers, than can possibly be produced, if the rules are adhered to which criticism and custom have established.

See James Hogg [J.H. Craig of Douglas], 'Preface', in *The Hunting of Badlewe: A Dramatic Tale*, written by James Hogg (London: Colburn, 1814b), pp. v-viii (p. vii). Meiko O'Halloran (2012) also discusses the great influence of the theatre on Hogg's successive fiction, where he adopts 'several provocative storytelling techniques' that he had experimented with in *The Hunting of Badlewe* ('Hogg and the Theatre', in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Duncan and Mack, pp. 105-12 (p. 110)).

poses a great threat to Sally, because the unrestrained English and Highland soldiers might rape her, as after Culloden ‘all the posts [were] occupied by a licentious military’ (p. 361). In such a state of uncertainty, Sally meets Davie Duff, the bizarre sexton of Balmillo, a Bakhtinian fool, whom Hogg endows with the important function of revealing the historical responsibilities for the human suffering derived from the 1746 Culloden battle. The narrative voice hints at the dehumanising effects of this war by providing a melancholic description of the Culloden aftermath, where the grotesque sexton appears:

All was ruin and desolation. Hamlet, castle, and villa, had shared the same fate; *all were lying in heaps of ashes*, and not a soul to be seen save a few military, and stragglers of the lowest of adverse clans scraping up the poor wrecks of the spoil of an extirpated people. Among others, whom should they overtake but daft Davie Duff, *walking merrily along*, with a spade over his shoulder. (p. 362, *emphases mine*)

Davie is a ludicrous figure, totally alien to the real world as the verbal phrase ‘walking merrily along’, placed in a semantic context of suffering, suggests. The image of Davie compulsively burying corpse after corpse, which he finds ‘lhying tier above tier, and rhanke pehind rhanke’ (p. 363),<sup>110</sup> reveals a universe indifferent to human suffering, where death erases all human hierarchies. Then, through the narrative voice, Hogg shows the atrocious effects of the battle on the ‘half roasted’ bodies of women and children (p. 365), while later he conveys his criticism behind Davie’s *heteroglot* Gaelic voice:

---

<sup>110</sup> In presenting the Highland-English of native Gaelic speakers, Hogg follows a well-established literary convention: the de-voicing of the voiced consonant [b] to [p] (as in *peing* for *being* and *pe* for *be*); *ta* for *the*; *she* for *I*, and sometimes also for *you*, *he*, *it*. Other features include the substitution of *c* for *g*, and *t* for *d*, so that *God* becomes *Cod*. From Note 62(d) on p. 443 of *Perils of Woman*, ed. by Hasler and Mack.

His Mhachesty te Tuke of Chumperlhand pe a fery cood shentleman, but, Cot tamn! he should nhot have persecuted te poor prhetty mhaiteans, and wives, and lhittle pabies to teath. Fat (what) ill could they doo to himsel or his mhaister? And ten te plack crow, and all te vhire creedy bhaist, would fall on te lhittle dhear innocent crheatures, and would tak out teir eyes, and te tongues out of teir mhouths. And ten tey would pe dhigging into teir hearts, and thaking out all teir bowels; and, O Lort, would pe mhaking a vherey pad chob of it. (p. 394)

The genuine comments of this ‘fool’ figure, however, in the context of Hogg’s novel threatened the positive face of the *British Magazine*’s reviewer who, perhaps feeling the status of his social class challenged, reacted fiercely to Hogg’s unrestrained critique, accusing him of being a violent Jacobite and of spreading ‘absurd falsehoods about the sanguinary cruelty of English soldiers, whom Mr. Hogg pretends to have butchered women and children for sport’. Apparently, Hogg had gone too far in questioning how his contemporary establishment manipulated official history. The *British Critic*, though acknowledging Hogg’s talent, judged the tales of ‘Leasing’ and ‘Jealousy’ as ‘clumsy attempts to interweave a tissue of imaginary adventures on an historical groundwork [...] with little regard to manners, language, facts or character’. The reviewer of *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine*, supposedly John Wilson, regarded Hogg as skilled at writing ballads, but found him ridiculous when attempting more prestigious genres, as ‘in one page, we listen to the song of the nightingale, and in another, to the grunt of the boar’.<sup>111</sup> All reviewers appear to have ignored, either consciously or not, Hogg’s critique of the historical novel, attributing what they deemed his failed literary attempt to his low social background.

---

<sup>111</sup> Anon., ‘[Review of] *The Three Perils of Woman*’, *The British Magazine*, 1 (1823), pp. 364-74 (p. 374); Anon., ‘[Review of] *The Three Perils of Woman*’, *British Critic*, n.s., 20 (1823), pp. 357-61 (p. 361); Anon. [John Wilson], ‘[Review of] *The Three Peril of Woman*’, *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine*, 14 (1823), pp. 427-37 (p. 427).

The second catalyst in Hogg's narratological pattern, Sally's jealousy at the sight of her husband and his supposed lover, leads our cross-dressed heroine to experience what David Groves describes as 'a descent into a world of confusion which engulfs physical, spiritual, and psychological aspects of human life'.<sup>112</sup> Hogg exploits this motif, luring his contemporary readers with a scene that is 'a mixture of the serene, the beautiful, the sublime, and the tremendous, as the wilds of Caledonia cannot equal' (p. 370). The narrator describes Sally descending

into the bottom of the ravine, on a path made by the feet of the goat and the wild-deer; it was a gully, fifty fathom deep; all the rocks on both sides were stripped with marble, and the silver current was pouring amongst its solid bed, which for all the world, had the appearance of the hide of the zebra. (p. 371)

Surrounded by this scene, Sally lives her psychological torment and sense of abandonment at its extreme; but after going through 'exhilarating emotions' (p. 370), she ascends stronger than ever. Sally then 'strip[s] off her hose and brogs' (p. 372), symbols of a Highland masculinity, abandons her old greedy and self-interested Highland guide, and changes the direction of her journey towards her Southern home, still cross-dressed though now as a 'beautiful Lowland boy' and 'little caring about the consequences' (p. 372).

Sally's improbable cross-dressing is not a new motif in Hogg's writing. In *Perils of Man*, without informing the reader of their real gender, the narrator describes Princess Margaret's and Lady Jane's masquerades in a similarly unconvincing way. Silvia Mergenthal observes *how* in Hogg's romance none of the cross-dressers can really pass as men because they consistently show signs of

---

<sup>112</sup> David Groves, *James Hogg: The Growth of a Writer* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1988), p. 19.

femininity (2012: 88). But *why* does Hogg engage in such a failed gender performance? In *Perils of Man*, the narrator depicts Lady Jane with ‘a sweet, delicate voice’ (p. 27), ‘blushing deeper than it behoved a knight to do’ (p. 32), and Princess Margaret with ‘dark raven hair that parted on a brow of snow, a black liquid eye, and round lips, purer than the cherry about to fall from the tree with ripeness’ (p. 31). Indeed, Hogg appears to have flouted Grice’s maxim of quantity by insisting on a dense use of lexical items and metaphors related, ironically, to feminine stereotypes of the sentimental novel, so leaving little doubt as to the real gender of both characters. However, since the narrator insists upon the comic aspects of the two ladies’ disguise, Lord Douglas’s failure to recognise Margaret strikes the reader as a significant implicature, that is, an indirect meaning suggestive of Lord Douglas’s neglect, self-interest, and opportunism for the constant risk at which the Princess is exposed in having her real gender potentially revealed.

Similarly, in *Perils of Woman* the narrator describes Sally as a ‘fine Lowland stripling’ (p. 373), whose ‘loud and piercing shriek’ (p. 374) highlights her real gender. Once again, Peter Gow fails to identify his sweet-heart, as ‘he took a light, examined the features, recognized an acquaintance with the face, but could give no account when or where he had seen it’ (p. 374). In this case, Peter himself voices the implicature of Hogg’s flouting the maxim of quantity. At Sally asking him the whereabouts of his wife, he replies that

she is well enough, and safe enough, for anything that I know; but Culloden men have had so much ado to escape from the cruelty of our beastly and insatiate foes, that really *we have been compelled to let the wives shift for themselves*. (p. 375, emphasis mine)

When Peter asks Sally the whereabouts of her husband, she replies by echoing ironically his previous words, claiming that she feels as ‘an outcast creature, abandoned to the world and to my fate. You warriors have enough to do in taking care of yourselves; *you are obliged to leave your wives to shift for themselves, you know*’ (p. 375, emphasis mine). In this way, Hogg conveys his implicit criticism of the war of Culloden highlighting its horrendous consequences upon women, whose husbands—absorbed as they are by the discursive rhetoric of violence—have become oblivious to their fate at home. Earlier in the narrative, Hogg anticipates the effects that such neglect will have upon his heroine through a prophetic dream, where a soldier runs his sword through Sally’s body before an irate but impotent Peter.

Sally’s husband, Alexander Mackenzie, provides the third outburst of jealousy, after a series of misleading hints lead him into believing that Sally and Peter are still lovers. Alexander attacks Peter but the latter reacts, with the consequence that both men injure each other and have to remain in a hut until their wounds heal. This is the site where Hogg shows how war deforms human nature through two secondary characters: Dr Frazer and, once again, David Duff, who play respectively the Bakhtinian roles of rogue and fool (see Bakhtin 1981: 158-67). These secondary figures bear the metaphorical function of revealing the ideology behind the rhetoric of war. Dr Frazer, the rogue, still maintains a contact with the real world, while David Duff, the fool, is totally alien to it and blind to the other characters’ wicked intentions.

The remote hut in the Highlands is the site where both Dr Frazer and Davie Duff take care of the two wounded men and Sally—the latter showing the first signs of a deranged mind. The narrative voice introduces Dr Frazer as ‘a country surgeon



[...] who accounted the life of a man of no more value than the life of a salmon' (p. 390) and who, in the particular context of the Culloden aftermath, has grown

accustomed to so many scenes of misery, despair, and extermination, that his better feelings were all withered, and a certain distortion had taken place in the bias of his mind. He perceived Davie to be a rude copy of something within himself, and he hankered after him as one deformed object lingers round another, either from sensation or disgust, or a diabolical pleasure in seeing some creatures more loathsome than itself. There the two strayed together, the one relating what deaths, pinings, and ravings, he had seen during the summer; and the other, what miserable corpses he had found and interred in the wastes. (p. 393)

Lost in their personal distortions, both characters highlight their respective idiosyncrasies, and together expose the dramatic effects of the war of Culloden on their nature. Neither of them has completely gone astray, however, as both later show signs of humanity.

Davie is able to survive thanks to his ability to bury corpses, for which the Duke of Cumberland rewards him. From previous episodes in the novel, the reader knows that Davie has a particular fondness for saving money, not so much because of greediness but out of a desire to keep his financial independence. Yet, Culloden has affected his pure nature too, since 'burying ha[s] grown into a passion with Davie' (p. 391), and he has acquired the gruesome habit of cutting ears from the corpses as evidence of their burial to the Duke. However, though on the surface Davie's macabre fondness for burying corpses appears to be motivated by a financial logic, his main drive is the horror he feels at seeing the crows digging into the hearts of dead women and children, and 'mhaking a vherey pad chob of it' (p. 394).

When Dr Frazer cuts off Davie's earlobes as a punishment for the latter's way of earning his living, the doctor's shallowness is fully revealed in his callous act, as he has violated the ears of a living man, not a corpse's. When compared with the doctor's, Davie's nature appears more honourable, as this Bakhtinian fool engages in

the same violent act to prevent the corpses from being devastated by the crows. After such a tremendous injury,

Davie went away cursing, to the burn in the corrie, where he washed his mutilated ears and bound them up; and taking the severed parts, he rolled them carefully up with the rest, deeming the trick played to him, upon the whole, not a very bad speculation. (p.395)

Dr Frazer, however, is not that heartless either, as he shows signs of sympathy behind his callousness. At Sally's expressing her loneliness and sense of abandonment: 'Where can I go? [...] I have neither home nor friend to which I can go—nothing beyond the walls of this hut', the narrative voice warns that 'Dr Frazer cursed her for a whining jade, but, at the same time, *the tears were running over his sallow cheeks*' (p. 397, emphasis mine). The same doctor is later taken by 'a cloud of the deepest melancholy' when, seeing that Sally, Peter, and Alexander are recovering from their respective psychological and physical wounds, he still suspects that a worse injury is hanging over them, namely treachery by Peter's wife's 'fiend of jealousy'. Again, when Dr Frazer takes leave of them, the narrator admits that 'though cursing them for fools and idiots, *the words growled through showers of tears*' (p. 400, emphasis mine). Hogg changes a Bakhtinian rogue into his complete opposite, a Mackenzian 'man of feeling', thereby emphasising that Dr Frazer's previous villainy was a mask to cover the negative consequence of the state of war on his emotions.

The fourth and final plot-shaping fit of jealousy is on the part of Peter's wife. This lady 'of some rank', believing that her husband has eloped with his former lover, is 'haunted [...] by the tormenting fiend of jealousy' (p. 401), and thus reveals the location of her husband to the soldiers of the Duke of Cumberland. At this turn of

events, Hogg stages the distorting effects of the rhetoric of war on the men involved in the battle of Culloden, mesmerised as they are by violence and revenge.

The narrator depicts the English soldiers as having grown ‘accustomed for three months bygone to regard the lives of Highlanders merely as those of noxious animals’ (p. 402), with no respect for military law, and killing their prisoners ‘with the most perfect *sang froid*’ (p. 402) on any small occasion. Hogg’s narrator then describes, in great detail, the trivial reason for which they murder Peter and Alexander in the hut. One of the subordinate soldiers opposes the English sergeant’s cruel proposal to kill both men. Perceiving such resistance as an outrage to his rank, the sergeant kills Peter Gow, so as to reaffirm his authority. Here, Hogg’s criticism in his essay ‘Soldiers’ comes to mind. There he compares the beginning of wars to an argument he witnessed between two boys, who ‘eyed each other with rather *jealous* and indignant looks, and with defiance on each brow’ (p. 42, emphasis mine), thus struggling with all their might in a quarrel without knowing ‘the why or wherefore’ (p. 41) everything had begun. Hogg observes that the micro-reality of the episode with the two boys mirrors the dynamics of history: ‘the rulers of kingdoms have often kindled up the flames of war, they scarcely knew why or wherefore; so that upon a retrospective view, historians and politicians have been quite at a loss how to account for it’ (p. 41). The feeling of jealousy, ‘that fiend evil’ which propels the narrative plot of the last ‘Peril’, is a metaphor mirroring the same driving force of war that ‘originate[s] in the evil and malevolent passions of our nature, which seem to form a primitive part of our constitution, and which neither the reasonings of the philosopher, nor the injunctions of religion have been able to eradicate’ since, as

Hogg concludes, '[t]he very existence of war [...] implies the absence of law' (p. 44).

Though the *British Magazine* reviewer criticised Hogg for describing the English soldiers as butchers killing 'women and children for sport' (1823: 374), it should be noted that Hogg describes the same 'evil' behaviour on the part of the Highlanders. When Dr Frazer and the M'Phersons return to the hut to move Sally, Alexander, and Peter to a safer place, seeing that the two men have been murdered, they hasten in search of the killers and, having vindicated their deaths, paradoxically and significantly forget to go back to the hut to bury the corpses and save Sally, who is still alive.

Only Davie, the grotesque sexton, comes to the hut 'carrying his spade over his shoulder, and bringing also some cordials and refreshment for his old friends', since though '[h]e had been inured to scenes of carnage; and, indeed, they were become so familiar to him, that he delighted in them', yet, the narrator continues, 'natural affection, though blunted in him, was not obliterated' (p. 405). Though a ludicrous scene ensues, as Davie assumes Sally to be dead and starts searching for the hidden money in her bosom before burying her supposed corpse, Davie's logic is not as horrible as the tremendous effects of the Culloden war which Hogg soon shows.

In the previous stages of his tale, the narrator alludes to Sally's pregnancy and shows her delirious despair at her sense of loneliness and abandonment. She talks 'about an ideal orphan babe, the total destitution of which seemed to haunt her wandering imagination' (p. 398), while later she starts 'speaking to a croft flower, as if it were a deserted babe' (p. 401). Once again, Hogg shows the negative effect of a

tragic historical event upon the female body. Though Davie saves and brings Sally to the hut of an old lady, after a while she flees. Some time afterwards, one of the M'Pherson brothers (the ones who had not come back to the hut where they had abandoned Sally) finds her accidentally. The boy sees her 'rocking and singing over the body of a dead female infant', but when he comes back with his brothers, both mother and child lie 'stretched together in the arms of death, pale as the snow that surrounded them, and rigid as the grave-turf on which they had made their dying bed' (p. 407). Here Hogg ends his tale, having depicted the catastrophic effects of a war violating a maternal body, a cyclically inexorable history which repeats itself, at Culloden as in the more recent Napoleonic Wars.

In both *Perils* novels, Hogg presents his heroines as national symbols that do not resolve Scotland's grievances in the marriage plot. Hogg shows them in a circling trajectory that he begins in *Perils of Man* with Princess Margaret's marital discomfort mirrored on the witches' carnivalesque caricature, carries on in *Perils of Woman* with the depiction of Gatty's grotesque body, and then concludes with Sally's and her daughter's tragic death, and no progeny for the future of Scotland. Apparently, a political marriage of convenience with England is not the solution for healing Scotland's collective issues, and all social spheres, from royalty to peasantry, are destined to perish if the imperial enterprise favours only the interests of the male bourgeoisie.

## CHAPTER TWO

### The Masculinities of Scottish National Identity

#### *Highlanders and Lowlanders: Mystified and materialistic Scottishness*

Maureen Martin in her book *The Mighty Scot* discusses the significance of Highland masculinity for the British Empire, arguing that although in the eighteenth century the Scottish Enlightenment had played an important role in the cultural achievements of the sophisticated Lowlands, by the nineteenth century Scotland had come to be identified with a wild hyper-masculinity located in the Highlands (2009: 2). Lowland Scots might thus have felt their masculinity rather threatened, as they had to bear on the one hand England's political supremacy and, on the other, the cultural invasion of the Highland myth, all aspects that affected the construction of a stable Scottish national identity (Martin 2009: 13).

Lowland Scots were further affected by another negative stereotype, the money-oriented Lowlander, a cultural construction common both in England and Scotland. Martin observes that in Scotland, '[t]he disappearing Highland culture was nostalgically mourned as a victim of the money nexus—including by many who supported "improvement"' (2009: 110). The English, on the other hand, felt threatened by the Scots' economic potential in the British Empire, and the 'penny-pincher' caricature, 'popular in English newspapers [...] deflate[d] both the intimidating masculinity of the untamed Scottish warrior figure and the commercial success of the ambitious Scottish entrepreneur with whom Englishmen had found themselves in competition since the Union' (Martin 2009: 110). This chapter will expose that this cultural stereotype, however, mirrored only a part of the Scottish

social spectrum, namely the ‘avaricious nature of the Glasgow of the Imperial “sugar and tobacco-trade”’ (Mack 2006: 155), and ‘the lucrative renting of Highland estates throughout the century, first to sheep farmers and then to English sportsmen’ (Martin 2009: 110) by the Highland landlords. The lower classes of both the Highlands and the Lowlands did not enjoy the financial gains from the empire, and had either to emigrate or to enrol in the army for the Napoleonic Wars, as Hogg highlights in some of the texts discussed in this chapter.

The mystique of the Highland soldier, which in the discourse of imperial expansion played the role of invigorating Britain, did not affect English masculinity because England was a solid economic and political force (Martin 2009: 84). At the beginning of the nineteenth century, English manliness began to be rather characterised by the discourse of sensibility: once considered an exclusively ‘feminine virtue’ that distinguished bourgeois women and made them suitable mothers and wives, besides ‘justifying’ their ‘confinement to the safety of the domestic sphere’, sensibility came to be assimilated into an idealised ‘benevolent patriarchy’ supposedly exercised by men of the middle and upper classes (Shields 2010: 9).<sup>113</sup> It shaped a more tamed and less violent sense of manhood than the one

---

<sup>113</sup> Mike Goode observes that

historical epistemology underwent a shift over the course of the long nineteenth century from being a *feeling* of history to being an *idea* of history and that [...] this epistemological shift was enacted [...] through a complex political and philosophical struggle over the nature and social importance of feeling, especially over the relation of feeling and manliness.

See Mike Goode, *Sentimental Masculinity and the Rise of History, 1790-1890* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), p. 3. Glenn Hendler explores the logic of sympathy in the nineteenth-century American novel, arguing that authors like Mark Twain and Henry James show that this feeling was not strictly private and individual, but rather a public one that shaped contemporary social institutions and political movements; see Glenn Hendler, *Public Sentiments: Structures of Feeling in Nineteenth-Century American Literature* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 2001).

symbolised by the rugged Highlander and it moulded, too, emerging discourses inherent in the formation of the British Empire.

The notions of sympathy and sensibility were informed by eighteenth-century Scottish Enlightenment's philosophers such as David Hume who, in his *Treatise on Human Nature* (1739), argues for a sympathy determined by closeness and similarity that would enable the exchange of emotions among human beings. Hume contends that

[n]o quality of human nature is more remarkable, both in itself and in its consequences, than the propensity we have to sympathize with others, and to receive by communication their inclinations and sentiments, however different from, or even contrary to our own. This is not only conspicuous in children, who implicitly embrace every opinion propos'd to them; but also in men of the greatest judgement and understanding, who find it very difficult to follow their own reason or inclination, in opposition to that of their friends and daily companions.<sup>114</sup>

However, Shields observes that Hume's notion of sympathy as a trait developed by 'like-minded individuals raises the question of whether sympathy that transcends cultural, political, or national boundaries is possible' (2010: 10). Adam Smith, in his *Theory of Moral Sentiments* (1759), answered this point by arguing instead for a learnt sympathy which 'requires both the self-control necessary to regulate or moderate emotion and the sensibility necessary to imaginatively change places with others' (Shields 2010: 11). Smith claims that sensibility and self-control work together in the formation of manhood, as the former restrains the roughness of martial features while the latter deters the emotional overindulgence that would 'destroy the masculine firmness of character'. Self-control thus converts sensibility into a less passive quality 'founded on humanity' (Smith 1976[1759]: 204). This notion served the purpose of representing the idea of British nationhood as a

---

<sup>114</sup> David Hume, *A Treatise on Human Nature*, ed. by L. A. Selby-Bigge (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1965), p. 316.



community bound by shared sympathies rather than economic and political interests at a time when the late nineteenth- and twentieth-century ‘paradigm of nation-state’ was still distant (Shield 2010: 9).

This chapter will explore how Hogg engages with these different stereotypes of masculinity in some of his works. Specifically, the discussion addresses how Hogg deconstructs the myth of the Highland soldier in the novella ‘Basil Lee’ and the song ‘Donald Macdonald’; how he interrogates sentimental masculinity through the character of Rickleton in *Perils of Woman*; Hogg’s questioning of the middle-class-based notion of the avaricious Lowland Scots in ‘Wat o’ the Cleuch’, a parody of Walter Scott’s poetic style; and, finally, Hogg’s reflections on the negative consequences of the Napoleonic Wars in *Perils of Man*, as here assumptions based on ethnic and gender stereotypes foment the violence of both the English and the Scottish soldiers in a war that they fight for the sole advantage of their lords.

Walter Scott—a committed supporter of the union between Scotland and England—played an important role in developing the notion of romantic Highland Scotland. In his works, he recreated the Jacobite risings as heroic romances in a mythical past, while glossing over the military attacks by the Highland clans, whose courage and unconditional loyalty to the chief he re-channelled into the service of the British Union (Martin 2009: 20, 82).<sup>115</sup> In *Waverley* (1814), for instance, Scott re-articulates a safer depiction of a turbulent moment in Scottish history by exploiting the marriage trope, as his novel encompasses simultaneously the 1746 Jacobite defeat in the battle of Culloden and the assimilation of Scotland into an England-dominated Britain through the cross-national wedding of the two main characters. In

---

<sup>115</sup> See also Kenneth McNeil, *Scotland, Britain, Empire: Writing the Highlands, 1760-1860* (Columbus: The Ohio State University Press, 2007), pp. 21, 106.

Scott's novel, *Edward Waverley*, after a first fascination for the beautiful and passionate Flora Mac-Ivor—symbol of the romantic Highland past, who turns out to be a Jacobite supporter of the 1745 appraisal—later marries the quieter Rose Bradwardine, emblem of a modern and rational post-Union Scotland. Thanks to this marriage, the Bradwardines regain the estate they had lost during the turmoil, as Colonel Talbot, one of the characters, explains to Rose's father,

Mr Bradwardine, your family estate is your own once more in full property, and at your absolute disposal, but only burdened with the sum advanced to re-purchase it, [...w]hich sum being advanced by Mr Edward Waverley, chiefly from the price of his father's property which I bought from him, is secured to his lady your daughter and her family by this marriage.<sup>116</sup>

Kenneth McNeil (2007) observes that in *Rob Roy* (1817) Scott re-articulated a more sophisticated representation of Highlanders as less restricted and isolated by their land and cultural stereotypes, highlighting instead their 'participation in a globalising economy that necessitates a constant movement within and across regional boundaries', and hence representing the relation between Highlanders and Lowlanders in more fluid terms (McNeil 2007: 53). In *Rob Roy* Scott portrays this relation as follows,

Hordes of wild, shaggy, dwarfish cattle and ponies, conducted by Highlanders, as wild, as shaggy, and sometimes as dwarfish, as the animals they had in charge, often traversed the streets of Glasgow. Strangers gazed with surprise on the antique and fantastic dress, and listened to the unknown and dissonant sounds of their language, while the mountaineer, armed even while engaged in this peaceful occupation with musket and pistol, sword, dagger, and target, stared with astonishment on the articles of luxury of which they knew not the use, and with an avidity which seemed somewhat alarming on the articles which they knew and valued.<sup>117</sup>

---

<sup>116</sup> Walter Scott, *Waverley*, ed. by P. D. Garside (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007 [1814]), pp. 358-59.

<sup>117</sup> Walter Scott, *Rob Roy*, ed. by Ian Duncan, Oxford World's Classics (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008 [1817]), p. 237.

Ian Duncan points out that in *Rob Roy* Scott distances himself from previous teleological representations of history, where the Highland myth is relegated to the past, depicting ‘the historical simultaneity of different worlds [...in which] savagery and commerce sustain rather than cancel one another, constituting the uncertain, cryptic field of the present’ (2007: 110). It must be argued, however, that although Scott undoubtedly rearticulated a more fluid relation between Highlanders and Lowlanders as Scots who, by sharing a less threatening Highland imagery for the union, kept a distinctive national identity from the English with whom they now were equal partners in the British imperial project, Scott’s rethinking of this relationship was rather classist, as he did not expose the negative effects of the imperial enterprise on the margins of both Scottish regions.

In addition, the Highland regiments employed for imperial expansion during the Napoleonic Wars, which Scott supported, were constituted largely by young soldiers whose lives were wasted as a consequence of the arbitrary power to which they were subjected. This chapter will show that Hogg highlights explicitly this aspect in *The Pilgrims of the Sun* (1815) and ‘The Field of Waterloo’ (1822), the first published and the second composed in the same year of Napoleon’s defeat at Waterloo, where he reflects on the negative consequences of the recent wars upon human lives. The chapter will also show that Hogg conveys the same critique of the Napoleonic Wars more implicitly some years later in *The Three Perils of Man* (1822), where the hunger for meat—along with the carnivalesque transformation of Sir Ringan’s warriors into bulls to ‘feed’ the enemy—is a ubiquitous trope meant to expose the destructiveness of tyrannical power.

The long relationship between Hogg and Scott is both complex and pivotal to Hogg as person and writer, and an exhaustive review of it is beyond the scope of this chapter. Ian Duncan, however, provides a perceptive description of this thirty-year long friendship, arguing that

[s]cholars[hip] engaged in the modern revaluation of Hogg [...] mystifies Scott's influence by reading it in sheerly negative terms. Zealous to reclaim Hogg as original genius, it takes too little account of the social and dialogical construction of such genius, Scott's as well as Hogg's; it yields instead the Romantic myth of Hogg as victim of a literary system that remained external to him, and overlooks Hogg's vigorous agency in entering that system, taking part in it, and using its terms. Literary influence, rather, is the social and psychological medium in which Hogg wrote himself into being. Enthralled as he remained by Scott's seemingly irresistible example and authority, Hogg worked out his literary identity (a literary identity that was never solely his) in a complex, strenuous dialectic of emulation and resistance, in which—in the last analysis—the act of resistance cannot be separated from the act of emulation. (2007: 153)

Before starting the actual analysis of Hogg's works, the following section will thus provide a review of how both authors engaged with contemporary stereotypes of masculinity in the early nineteenth century.

As argued by Murray G. H. Pittock, although Scott exploits the Highland myth and the romance of Scottish Jacobitism's resistance to the union, he also presents them as 'a lost cause [...] based on emotion not fact'. Certainly 'Scott's Jacobite lords [...] are potent [...] figures', but their violence is 'childish' and has 'no place in the peaceable interchange of civilized society' offered by the British Union. To the 'childish' Scottish patriotism Scott hence opposes a more 'adult' British patriotism, represented by the main character's achievement of common sense.<sup>118</sup> In so doing, however, Scott also 'emptied Jacobite ideology of its political force' (McNeil 2007: 7). This is the politically threatening content that, conversely, Hogg kept in his *Jacobite Relics of Scotland*, a collection of songs commissioned by

---

<sup>118</sup> Murray G. H. Pittock, *The Invention of Scotland: The Stuart Myth and Scottish Identity, 1638 to the Present* (London: Routledge, 1991), pp. 84-85.

the Highland society of London<sup>119</sup> to celebrate ‘Scottish heroism in the context of the Napoleonic Wars’, which appeared in two series between 1819 and 1821.<sup>120</sup> Pittock points out that, particularly in the *Second Series*, Hogg failed to observe the contemporary post-Ossianic taste for ‘heroism and sensibility’ which de-historicised the radicalism of Jacobite songs, therefore mirroring a too heavy ‘Scottish politics of resistance from the eighteenth century’ (2002: xviii, xiii). Hogg appears to have produced ‘spurious’ versions of ‘songs dealing with the melancholy aftermath of Culloden’, probably to allude implicitly to the contemporary Highland Clearances, but also failing in this way to produce the ‘sanitized’ ‘image of Scotland’ demanded of him by the Highland society of London.<sup>121</sup> In a letter to William Blackwood of 7 October 1820, Hogg laments the negative reception of his *Relics* by the *Edinburgh Review*, in which ‘Lesley’s March to Longmaston Moor’ was condemned as

---

<sup>119</sup> Kenneth McNeil (2007) writes that

[i]n May 1778, a group of twenty-five expatriate Scots met at the Spring-Garden Coffee-House where they agreed to form the Highland Society of London. Their principal aims were the restoration of the Highland dress [which had been banned after the second Jacobite uprising in 1746]; the preservation and cultivation of Highland music, literature, and language; the establishment of institutions devoted to aid Highlanders such as Gaelic schools, churches, and asylums for Highland children orphaned upon the death of their soldier fathers; honoring the achievements of Highland regiments; and, lastly, the promotion of agricultural improvement in the Highlands. [...] The Highland Society was a key force in disseminating, institutionalizing, and popularizing ideas about the Highlands in the Romantic era. (pp. 1-2)

In the same book, McNeil adds that in subsequent years, the Highland society of London also welcomed members from foreign countries, a fact that highlighted not so much a corruption as an evolution of the society’s ‘original criteria [...] given [...] its awareness of the difficulties in delimiting the “Highlands”’ (p. 19).

<sup>120</sup> Murray G. H. Pittock, ‘Introduction’, in *The Jacobite Relics of Scotland (First Series)*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Murray G. H. Pittock (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002 [1819]), pp. xi-xxxviii (p. xiii).

<sup>121</sup> Murray G. H. Pittock, ‘Introduction’, in *The Jacobite Relics of Scotland (Second Series)*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Murray G. H. Pittock (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2003a [1821]) pp. xi-xix (pp. xiii, xvii). Sadly, Hogg was never paid by the Highland Society of London for his *Jacobite Relics*, though he had been promised a contribution of £ 50 by Colonel Stewart of Garth (1772-1829) via George Thomson. Pittock claims that Stewart, trying ‘to cover his own faults’, sent a letter to Hogg attacking him ‘in terms which would hardly have been used to a man closer to his social status’, and in which he claimed that Hogg had failed to show ‘Scottish songs as “equal to if not superior to any other country”’ (Pittock 2003a: xvii); see also Hogg’s letters to Thomson of 14 December 1821 and 14 February 1822, *Collected Letters*, ed. by Hughes and others, vol. 2, pp. 133, 142.

coarse.<sup>122</sup> Hogg writes that '[t]he principle is absurd for a collector of relics must take them as they are and one would have left out Lesly's [*sic*] March ought to have been damned the taste is not mine but the taste of the age' (*Collected Letters*, vol. 2, p. 47).

McNeil (2007) remarks that Scott's re-appropriation of the Highland myth achieved its apotheosis during King George IV's visit to Edinburgh in August 1822, when Scott played the 'pageant master' promoting the "'Celtification" of Scotland' through a 'gaudy overuse of "tartanry"' (McNeil 2007: 52). For Douglas S. Mack the King's visit represents a significant moment in the history of Scotland, a return of the King to his ancient origins, as George IV descended from 'a daughter of James VI, one of the Stuart Kings of Scots'.<sup>123</sup> Exploiting the cultural trope of 'kinship ties' in 'Highland social identity' (McNeil 2007: 71), and having the Hanoverian king wear the Stuarts' tartan, Scott presented George IV as a modern, updated version of the absolute monarchy of the past and as 'the legitimate heir of the Stuarts and of Scotland's hero-king, Robert I (the Bruce)', whose memory was still alive among the Scots for having 'secured the country's pre-Union independence' in the 1314 battle of Bannockburn (Mack 2008: xxxiv-xxxv). In this way, Scott re-established Scotland's position within the British Union not just as an equal partner with England but as a fundamental one, from which the King was descended. By asserting people's loyalty to the Hanoverian king, Scott also reaffirmed the status quo, kept at

---

<sup>122</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *The Jacobite Relics of Scotland (First Series)*, *Edinburgh Review*, 34, August 1820, pp. 148-60 (p. 155); 'Song III. Lesley's March to Scotland', in *The Jacobite Relics of Scotland (First Series)*, ed. by Pittock, pp. 5-7, see editorial note on Hogg's *Collected Letters*, vol. 2, p. 48.

<sup>123</sup> Douglas S. Mack, 'Introduction', in *The Bush aboon Traquair and The Royal Jubilee*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), pp. xi-lv (pp. xxx, xxxiii).

bay any revolutionary threat from France, and ‘weaken[ed] support for radical political change [...] establish[ing], instead, an understanding of Scottish identity based on loyalty to George IV as King of Scots, and as a monarch of the united kingdom of Britain’ (Mack 2008: xxxiv).

Scott’s tartan pageantry was also influenced by Adam Ferguson’s notion of ‘soldiering as the instrument to rebind society’ and to ‘masculinize’ ‘the relative effeminacy’ ‘of the modern commercial state’ (McNeil 2007: 71-72). Indeed, in discussing the dynamics between manhood and commerce, J.G.A. Pocock observes that the efficient, money-making man was perceived as ‘feminized, even an effeminate being’ in the eighteenth century, but as a ‘masculine conquering hero’ in the nineteenth.<sup>124</sup> Yet, Martin contends that

modern masculinity could not be created out of whole cloth; to feel authentic, it had to incorporate older measures of masculinity too. Few men living in commercial Britain had direct access to warrior skills or experience, yet the traditional martial values of hardihood, fearlessness, and fighting ardour lingered and demanded integration into the new manhood. [...] The construction of Scotland as a source of rugged primal masculinity helped respond to this demand [...] to an English civilization that sometimes seemed too civilized, the desire to internalize Scottish wildness was an attempt to ensure that, beneath the manly self-control, that crucial volcanic core of masculinity still burned (2009: 6).

In Scott’s royal spectacle, the Highland militaristic discourse posed Scotland as an indispensable partner for the virilisation of the more feminised commercial England, the centre of the British Empire.

Some critics, however, have argued that Scott’s pageantry did not represent the entire spectrum of the Highlands’ reality, but obscured a fundamental historical issue: the Highland Clearances, at which Hogg had hinted in his *Jacobite Relics* and

---

<sup>124</sup> See J.G.A. Pocock, *Virtue, Commerce, and History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), p. 114; quoted by Martin (2009) on p. 6.

which, during the King's visit, were at one of their highest peaks. Juliet Shields observes that Highland landlords, who once had been chieftains of their own clans, now favoured 'economic interest over affective bonds' and 'export[ed], like so many surplus goods, Highlanders and their virtues', to repopulate their estates with sheep (Shields 2010: 123). McNeil argues that the 'continuous emigration and clearances throughout the era of "external colonialism" points to the simultaneous process of empire at work both inside and outside the nation' (McNeil 2007: 12). Duncan indicates that Christian Isobel Johnstone's *Clan-Albin* (1815), a novel published soon after Scott's *Waverley* (1814), depicts self-interested landlords 'clearing their estate for sheep' and 'forc[ing] their tenants to choose between Canadian emigration and service in the French wars' (2007: 99). Hogg, too, in some of his works hints at the paradoxical synchronicity between the myth of the Highlander and the Clearances after Culloden, the negative effects of which he depicts in 'Peril Third' of *Perils of Woman* (see chapter one).

Yet, Hogg grew aware of the effects of Culloden rather late in his life. In his early thirties, by undertaking a series of journeys to the Highlands, he acquainted himself with 'the economic problems facing Highland landlords'; nevertheless, as H. B. de Groot observes, 'at this stage in his life' Hogg still 'idealised the Highland chiefs'.<sup>125</sup> Hogg had in mind to start his own farm in Harris,<sup>126</sup> and 'was committed to a major expansion of sheep-farming in the Highlands, while at the same time advocating the granting of secure tenancies to those already on the land' (de Groot 2010: xxxiv). In 'An Essay on Sheep-Farming and Population', Hogg writes that

---

<sup>125</sup> H. B. de Groot, 'Introduction', in *Highland Journeys*, written by James Hogg, ed. by H. B. de Groot (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2010), pp. xi-lxvii (p. xxxiii).

<sup>126</sup> See Janette Currie, "'Betwixt the Devil and the Deep Sea": Hogg's Harris Venture', in *Highland Journeys*, written by Hogg, ed. by de Groot, pp. 231-42.



sheep are the most eligible stock for the greatest part of the Highlands; for the proprietor and farmer, they certainly are so. In a political point of view, however, the scheme must certainly be prosecuted with leisure, caution, and tenderness; nor must we drive the people from their poor, but native huts and glens, until some other source of industry is opened to them, which, by persevering in, they may become more useful members of the commonwealth.<sup>127</sup>

However, as de Groot points out, '[t]he two [views] were simply not compatible' (2010: xxxiv). Later in his life, Hogg realised this incongruity and voiced his criticism of the Highland Clearances in *Perils of Woman*, *The Forest Minstrel* (1810), the two series of *Jacobite Relics*, and the *Songs by the Ettrick Shepherd* (1831). H. B. de Groot writes that by this time, Hogg had begun 'to see the essential connections between the terrorising of the Highlanders from 1746 on, the growth of sheep-farming and the Clearances, and the development of tourism' (2010: lv). Even earlier, Hogg had already shown some internal contradictions, as in his *Highland Journeys* he writes that while he was

traversing the scenes, where the patient sufferings of the one party, and the cruelties of the other were so affectingly displayed, I could not help being a bit of a Jacobite in my heart, and blessing myself that in those days I did not exist, or I had certainly been hanged. (2010: 81)

The King's visit to Edinburgh in 1822 offered Hogg the occasion to pronounce his own view on the Scottish Clearances, while Scott saw the same event as 'an opportunity to heal the old wounds of the Jacobite/Hanoverian conflict by presenting George IV as the legitimate heir of the Stuarts [...and] ignoring some important and painful realities' (Mack 2008: xl), particularly the Clearances. In his own contribution to the king's visit, *The Royal Jubilee* (1822), Hogg did not ignore these social issues. Although playing with the same cultural tropes that Scott was

---

<sup>127</sup> James Hogg, 'An Essay on Sheep-Farming and Population', in *Highland Journeys*, written by Hogg, ed. by de Groot, pp. 195-223 (p. 215).

exploiting in his pageantry, probably hoping to earn a royal pension to alleviate his financial straits, Hogg concludes his masque in a rather unconventional way. He replaces the ‘authoritative figure’ which, at the end, should ‘restore harmony and order’ with a conclusion where ‘*all the spirits*’ ‘[e]xeunt, in different directions’, thereby suggesting that the return of the king was not a ‘sufficient’ action to restore ‘harmony’ in Scotland (Mack 2008: xliii). Scott exploited the tartan pageantry to convey a martial and masculine essence of Scottish national identity, so as to pose Scotland as a vital associate with England in the British partnership; this ideological construct, however, obscured the tragic reality of the Highlanders.

Hogg, representing a non-elitist cultural perspective, parodied the masculine stereotype of the Highland soldier in his writing, revealing instead the exploitation of young working-class men who died in the name of the British Empire. The section of this chapter devoted to ‘Basil Lee’ reveals how Hogg deconstructs the Highland regiments’ supposed traits of courage and unconditional loyalty to the British Union, by featuring the title character’s inclination to desert the war in Quebec, thereby exposing both the national ideology inherent in Highlandism and the inhumanity of the imperial wars.

McNeil provides a perceptive analysis of the dynamics at work in the cultural construction of Highlandism at the time of Hogg’s writing, which he views as ‘a set of anthropological assumptions’, whereby the isolated and harsh nature of the land itself

produces a “natural warrior” who from childhood develops a propensity for warfare [...] geographical determinism [...] which reinforces an imperialist epistemology that assumes the universal condition of other “primitive” mountain people and spaces set apart from normative, civil “lowland” peoples and space. [...] Highlandism is crucial to the rise in popularity of the figure of the Highland soldier-hero in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. Without Highlandism, it is

safe to say, there would have been no Highland soldier-hero and, quite possibly, no regiments in the British army uniquely designed as “Highland.” [...] Most crucial to Scott’s attraction to highlandism, is the powerful code of absolute loyalty, which is fomented by the difficult conditions of mountain life and the patriarchal ties that bind family to family and isolate the clans within their narrow glens. [...] For Scott, it is this code of loyalty [...] that separates the Highland fighting man from his English counterpart, making him an ideal “natural soldier.” [...] The Scottish Highlander soldier-hero, as it moves to a colonial setting, is transformed [...] as an essentialized category of race that works to affirm the innate superior qualities of British colonizers [...] a powerful spectacle of British prowess in action, while simultaneously registering as exotic. (McNeil 2007: 86, 92-93, 120-21)

McNeil concludes his discussion by stating that Highlandism’s essentialism—the soldier-hero’s martial qualities that are linked to his land of origin—represents the limit of such cultural construction since, as a result, the Highlander cannot be upheld as a model to be imitated nor is he suitable for anything else. The Highland regiments, however, were not always populated exclusively by soldiers from the Scottish Highlands, though this was the general impression. This is an aspect that Hogg highlights in ‘Basil Lee’, the eponymous protagonist of which is a good-for-nothing Lowlander employed in the Scottish regiments.

The incorporation of Highland masculinity into the construction of British national discourse had a double ideological purpose as, besides uniting Scotland and England in the imperial enterprise, Highlandism answered a Scottish national need to keep a distinctive character without compromising the union with England. As argued by T. M. Devine and Peter Womack, when Lowland Scotland became economically similar to England, it turned to the Highlands to mark its difference.<sup>128</sup>

Walter Scott’s 1822 pageantry showed that the myth of the Highland warrior also played the role of enhancing the masculinity of England, then more interested in

---

<sup>128</sup> T. M. Devine, ‘Highlandism and Scottish Identity’, in *The Scottish Nation 1700-2000*, written by T. M. Devine (London: Penguin Books, 2006a [1999]), pp. 231-45 (pp. 233-36, 244); Peter Womack, *Improvement and Romance: Constructing the Myth of the Highlands* (Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1989), p. 145.

trade-related affairs than in male-honour-based questions of national identity. Martin argues that ‘a heart of Highland masculinity animate[d] Scotland’s [...] history and culture [...] an undying heart that, because Scotland [wa]s part of Britain, c[ould] beat for Britain as a whole’ (2009: 38). During the Napoleonic Wars—the period when the Hogg texts that will be discussed in this chapter were mostly written or published—the reputation of the kilted Highland regiments, depicted as the direct descendants of the clans, conferred great prestige on the British army. The charm of Highland masculinity, however, obscured the historico-cultural achievements of the Lowlands, where Scottish political and economic life was traditionally centred.

By exploiting the cultural stereotypes of class, gender and ethnicity of his time, Hogg parodied both notions of Highland and Lowland Scottish masculinities, demystifying the heroism of the Highland soldier in his famous song ‘Donald Macdonald’, and questioning the stereotype of the greedy Lowland Scots in ‘Wat o’ the Cleuch’. Hogg exposed a different reality, revealing that the peasantry of the Scottish Lowlands not only did not benefit from any material advantage from the colonial enterprise, but that they also suffered the negative consequences of a deteriorated relationship between master and servant. In the *Quarterly Journal of Agriculture* (1831-32), Hogg claims that

ever since the ruinous prices made every farmer for the time a fine gentleman, how the relative situations of master and servant are changed! Before that time every farmer was first up in the morning, conversed with all his servants familiarly, and consulted what was best to be done for the day. Now, the foreman, or chief shepherd, waits on his master, and, receiving his instructions, goes forth and gives the orders as his own, generally in a peremptory and offensive manner. The menial of course feels that he is no more a member of a community, but a slave; a servant of servants, a mere tool of labour in the hand of a man whom he knows or deems inferior to himself, and the joy of his spirit is mildewed. He is a moping, sullen, melancholy man, flitting from one master to another in hopes to find heart’s ease

and contentment, —but he finds it not; and now all the best and most independent of that valuable class of our community are leaving the country.<sup>129</sup>

Here Hogg provides a very different image from the stereotype of the avid Scot as represented in the English collective imagination. Though from one perspective Hogg seems to be arguing for a benevolent feudalism and hence may be criticised as backward-looking, he maintains that the new imperial economy had enriched the Scottish landlords, who were now ‘expect[ing] feudal obedience without assuming feudal responsibility’, as Katie Trumpener (1993: 694) observes in her analysis of the Irish condition in Maria Edgeworth’s *Ormond* (1818). David Groves (1988) holds that

[p]olitically the Shepherd was a moderate and traditionalist, equally opposed to radical innovation, on one side, and to the new ‘*aristocracy* of farming’ on the other. Both the Whig and Tory policies of the day, he maintained, were destroying community spirit by making ‘the distance between master and servant wider and wider’. (p. 140, emphasis original)

For this reason, a section of this chapter will be devoted to the carnivalesque figure of ‘Wat o’ the Cleuch’ in *The Poetic Mirror* (1816), the Borderer moss-trooper that Hogg depicts in his parody of Scott’s poetry, and whose voracious hunger for meat is meant to signify the harsh conditions of the peasantry in the Scottish Lowlands at the time of imperial expansion.

### ***The ‘overarching’ British sentimental masculinity***

Ian Duncan observes that Hogg in *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (1824) parodies Smith’s conceptualisation of sympathy, conflating it

---

<sup>129</sup> James Hogg, ‘On the Changes in the Habits, Amusements and Condition of the Scottish Peasantry’, in *A Shepherd’s Delight: A James Hogg Anthology*, ed. by Judy Steel (Edinburgh: Canongate, 1985), pp. 40-51 (pp. 44-45). Hogg’s essay was published for the first time in the *Quarterly Journal of Agriculture*, vol. 3 (February 1831- September 1832).

with Enlightenment notions of physiognomy—the search for a correspondence between ‘facial forms’ and ‘immortal soul’—through the chameleon nature of Gil-Martin, the protagonist’s *alter-ego* who can change his features by entering into someone else’s feelings (2007: 267). Hogg exploits the same conflation of the body’s and the soul’s traits when representing the unruly figure of Rickleton in *Perils of Woman*. The relation between the emphasised physicality and the psychological evolution of this disruptive character, whose wedding with a prostitute is considered in chapter one as a tool to expose the ideology of the marriage plot, is also posed by Hogg as a double critique of both sentimental and Highland masculinities. Viewing the processes of writing and reading as ruled by communicative strategies influenced by contemporary cultural assumptions, this section will hence explore how in *Perils of Woman* Hogg demystifies the masculinity of the Highland soldier-hero through the carnivalesque duel between Rickleton and ‘captain’ M’Turk. It will then show how Hogg also interrogates the supposed ‘honesty’ of contemporary British conventions of sentimental masculinity in his treatment of Rickleton, whose character evolves from an extremely stubborn, hyper-energised masculine type into a more balanced man, capable of genuinely sympathising and ‘feeling *with*’ his wife. Significantly, Rickleton accepts the paternity of her son by another man: a fact that will gain him the respect of Simey Dodd, his worst enemy.

David Groves views Rickleton’s subplot in *Perils of Woman* as involving a descent into chaos and confusion since, after the discovery that his wife’s pregnancy is due to a former lover, Richard endures ‘the amorphous uncertainty at the centre of human relationships’, a cathartic cleansing which allows his subsequent forgiveness and acceptance of the child as his own, and the abandonment of male revenge

thereby gaining ‘social happiness’.<sup>130</sup> No twentieth-century critic, however, appears to have explored the dialectics between this quarrelsome character and the cultural assumptions of both sentimental and Highland masculinities at the time of Hogg’s writing.

Rickleton, introduced by the narrative voice, enters the scene as follows:

That very evening, who should arrive with the Pringleton coach, but our good friend Daniel Bell [Gatty’s father], and with him his nephew-in-law, that is, his wife’s brother’s son, Richard Rickleton, Esq. of Burlhope, and farmer of seventeen thousand acres of land, on two sides of the Border. He was a real clod-pole—a moss-jumper—a man of bones, thews, and sinews, with no more mind or ingenuity than an owl; men nicknamed him *the heather-blooter*, from his odd way of laughing, for that laugh could have been heard for five miles around, on a calm evening, by the Border fells,—and, for brevity’s sake, it was often contracted into *the blooter*. But, with all these oddities, Richard Rickleton was as rich as Croesus; at least he was richer, by his own account, than Simon Dodd of Ramshope, and that seemed to be the ultimatum of his ambition. (p. 56, emphases original)

In this passage, Rickleton is firstly introduced through his social status, ‘Esquire’ and ‘farmer’ of an extended land. He is then described through a series of noun phrases that on the one hand enhance his physical strength, as he is depicted as ‘a real clod-pole’, ‘a moss-jumper’, and ‘a man of bones, thews, and sinews’ (p. 56); but on the other hand they also portray him as endowed with very little common sense and ‘with no more mind or ingenuity than an owl’ (p. 56).<sup>131</sup> Rickleton’s personality running to extremes is then alluded to by his nickname ‘*the heather-blooter*’ (p. 56), ‘a common snipe’ with ‘a low, rasping call’ which epitomises Rickleton’s extravagant way of laughing.<sup>132</sup> Finally, Simon Dodd of Ramshope appears on the scene—Rickleton’s competitor in physical strength and material possessions and,

<sup>130</sup> David Groves, ‘Myth and Structure in James Hogg’s *The Three Perils of Woman*’, *The Wordsworth Circle*, 13·4 (1982), 203–10 (p. 206).

<sup>131</sup> Though conventionally an owl is an animal thought to be wise, the Oxford English Dictionary reports an example by M. E. Braddon of this bird as being stupid: ‘I must go and get my siesta, or I shall be as stupid as an owl all the evening’ (*Mt. Royal* 1882, I. viii., p. 243), <[WWW.OED.com](http://WWW.OED.com)> [accessed 27 April 2013].

<sup>132</sup> See *Perils of Woman*, written by Hogg, ed. by Hasler and Mack, editorial endnote, p. 442.

apparently, the most potent signifier of his masculine identity. In a single paragraph, Hogg manages a masterly introduction of a secondary character who will defy contemporary constructions of bourgeois marriage (see chapter one), and who will deconstruct Highland and sentimental masculinities, as will be shown in the following section.

Rickleton's figure encompasses a farcical, parodical depiction of manly traits that highlight even more his subsequent evolution into a more sensible gentleman in whom '[s]ensibility and self-control work dialectically', and where '[s]ensibility moderates the potentially offensive harshness of martial virtues', as Shields observes concerning eighteenth-century constructions of British manhood (2010: 30). Through Rickleton, however, Hogg presents a more honest model of sentimental masculinity than the one encouraged by contemporary assumptions of sympathy informing the relation between Scotland and England—a hypocritical mask that hid the more materialistic rationale of the British Union.

Invoking the epistolary novel, Hogg shows Rickleton's emotional evolution into 'a man of feeling' through a series of letters to his cousin Joseph Bell, a student of law. Bell is dealing with the divorce between this Northumbrian Esquire and his wife because, according to the patriarchal system of primogeniture, all of Rickleton's possessions should go to Katie's son, an aspect that the former is not yet capable of accepting. The epistolary mode also serves Hogg's purpose of showing the tension between Rickleton's *heteroglot* voice and other uses of voices other than Standard English in contemporary fiction, where they were usually exploited for comical reasons. Hogg, conversely, through Rickleton's hilarious speech, implies that there may be an important message behind his distinct voice. Though Rickleton's idiolect



is ‘translated’ in his letters for an English audience because, as he states, ‘[i]f I had not the master of the academy to write for me, and put my feelings on paper, I never could’ (p. 233), he does not appear to be happy with such translations. When dictating the conversation with his wife in the letter to his cousin, Rickleton critiques his speech ‘adaptations’ and exclaims, ‘I shall give you our conversation in our own words; [...] spelling and all. [...W]rite it and spell it as that one delivers it to you’, yells Rickleton at the master, ‘and be cworsed to thee for a dwomonie, although thou calls thyself measter of the academy!’ (p. 228). Rickleton’s Northumbrian speech, interspersed with a few Scots terms, represents a fluid social dimension at the borders between the Scottish and the English worlds. For this reason, his character is less fixed in the sentimental ‘man of feeling’, and he may thus evolve into an honest, sentimental masculine type. The *heteroglot* passages of his direct speeches signal the crucial moments of this change.

On meeting his wife with her new-born in her arms, Rickleton—in a voice translated by the master’s pen—writes,

*How fain would I have clasped them both to my bosom and wept too!—But honour,—stern and magnificent honour interposed, and I was obliged, against my inclination, to assume a deportment of proud offence. ‘How’s this, my dear?’ says I. ‘It’s to be hoped that same baby is not yours?’*

*“She kept rocking the child as formerly, and weeping over it still more bitterly; but she neither lifted her eyes nor moved her tongue in answer to my question. My heart was like to melt; so I saw there was a necessity for rousing myself into a rage in order to preserve any little scrap of honour and dignity that remained to me. Accordingly, I turned to the doctor; and, tramping my foot violently on the floor, I said, ‘There’s for it now, sir! There’s for it! That comes all of your d—d prescriptions!’ (pp. 233-34, emphases mine)*

The prescriptions Rickleton refers to are the nutritional ‘regimen’ his wife had hinted at in a previous letter, as prescribed by the doctor for her supposed ‘illness’ (namely her pregnancy), which Rickleton had misunderstood for a ‘regiment’ of soldiers. This

humorous misunderstanding, though apparently playing with Rickleton's poor education, hints at more serious social issues, specifically prostitution and its abuse by the supposedly 'honourable' Highland soldier-heroes, as will be discussed later regarding Hogg's deconstruction of Highland masculinity through Rickleton's voice. Rickleton's internal struggle shows the tension between his wish to re-establish the law of the father by 'rousing' himself 'into a rage'—so as to preserve his culturally-acquired notion of patriarchal 'honour and dignity'—and his capacity to feel humanly with a 'heart [that] was like to melt'. Through Rickleton's hilarious behaviour, Hogg reveals that gender-, class-, and ethnic-conditioned assumptions of masculinity are a burden for both women's and men's personal and social happiness.

The tragic situation of Rickleton's wife also mirrors Hogg's critique of the Scottish Kirk, whose system of patriarchal values would not allow baptising a child born out of wedlock (see chapter three). On Rickleton asking his wife to renounce her son and to come back with him, she replies,

Poor little innocent! He is an outcast, both of God and man; for, owing to his father's circumstances, as a married man, I cannot get him introduced into Christian church. No reverend divine will, out of pity or commiseration, pronounce a blessing on his unhallowed head, bestowing on him the holy ordinance of baptism. (p. 253)

Rickleton's subsequent sincere act of forgiveness towards his wife and the acceptance of her child represent the honourable manly values which Hogg advocates in *Perils of Woman*. His actions eventually gain Rickleton the admiration and respect of Simon Dodd of Ramshope, his old fierce enemy and male signifier, who admits, 'You have done a deed of generosity, of which I was incapable, and which proves you, with all your obstreperous oddities, to be possessed of a more gentle, forgiving, and benevolent heart, than almost any other of your sex' (p. 257).

Simey Dodd will offer himself as the guarantor of Rickleton's honour by supporting the child's baptism—one of the most important religious celebrations for the Kirk and utmost symbol of social acceptance.

Through Rickleton, Hogg also reveals the anthropological assumptions that shaped the essentialist rationale of Highlandism, according to which the Scottish Highlands produced natural warriors whose loyalty to their clan chiefs was later transferred to the British king. This ideology, however, did not always correspond to reality, and though among the clans of previous times there must certainly have been honourable Highlanders who would have given their life for their chief (as Walter Scott depicts in *Waverley*, where Evan Dhu undergoes a trial and the death penalty for his chieftain Fergus Mac-Ivor), the reality of the Highland regiments during the imperial wars was rather different. In the above-mentioned anecdote of the 'regiments', Rickleton claims that the Highland soldiers were mostly 'a horde of rude, vulgar, and beastly dogs' (p. 231)—the same 'dogs of havoc and war' which Hogg, however, some years later in his essay 'Soldiers' would view as the poor victims of subjective power (Hogg 1997 [1834]: 40-47).

Rickleton engages in carnivalesque duels with M'Ion, M'Turk, and Callum Gun, for their having made fun of his nick names: 'heather-blooter', referring to his boisterous way of laughing; and 'wolf-dog', an epithet deriving from an unfortunate liaison with a married lady. Yet, despite their hilarity, such contests are not mere moments of comic relief. They occupy different lengths of discourse time, with a major narrative space of seven pages dedicated to the comical preparations for the fight between Rickleton and M'Turk, including the narrator's and characters' comments on questions related to the valour of the Highland hero, the difference

between Lowland manliness based on individuality and Highland sense of collectiveness, considerations about human fear, and a seeming re-appropriation of the real value of Highland masculinity as represented by Callum Gun. The duel between the latter and Rickleton, however, occupies only a short paragraph, ending with both men wounded and with an equal achievement of honour on the part of both competitors. Hogg appears to interrogate the ideological assumptions of Highlandism in the duel to which he dedicates the longest narrative space—the one between Rickleton and M'Turk—through which Hogg conveys this critique to the readers of his time.

Hogg interrogates the ideology of the Highland warrior through M'Turk's behaviour, as the latter tries to envisage a stratagem to avoid the duel with Rickleton, to the point of omitting to bring him the sword, in addition to his own, as had been previously arranged. Following is the core of the duel between Rickleton and M'Turk, where the latter opens up the dialogue in his *heteroglot* Highland speech:

“Dhear, sir, te mhatteer is peyond te law, and peyond all shenteel pehaviours,” said the Ensign, bowing in manifestly dismay.

“Draw out your sword,” bellowed Richard, in his most tremendous voice, and heaved his cudgel, as if about to fell an ox. The ireful sound actually made Peter M'Turk spring a yard from the ground, with a sort of backward leap, and when he alighted, it so chanced that his back was toward Richard, and his eye at the same moment catching a glance of one of the impending quivers of the jagged hazel branch, he was seized with *an involuntary and natural feeling of self-preservation*; and as the most obvious way of attaining this, he fell a running with no ordinary degree of speed. (p. 96, emphasis mine)

Through the buffoon figure of Rickleton, who replaces his omitted sword with a hazel cudgel, Hogg prompts the possibility of a carnivalesque combat which could turn upside down the ‘inverted sort of courage’ (p. 96) of ‘captain’ M'Turk, a supposedly Highland soldier-hero, thereby revealing his despicable nature. Hogg, however, does not condemn M'Turk for his not-so-honourable behaviour, but he

rather tries to justify it as ‘an involuntary and natural feeling of self-preservation’ (p. 96), exposing the harsh reality of wars behind the ideology of the Highlander’s manly prowess—a reality which, at Hogg’s time of writing, had taken the lives of many innocent young men in the Napoleonic Wars. In order to do so, Hogg provides a series of considerations about human fear through the narrative voice, setting the example of one of the most famous military men involved in the defeat of Napoleon, ‘Arthur Wellesley [who], in one of the first battles ever he stood in India, fled in a night attack, and left his regiment to be cut up’ (p. 96) but who, subsequently, learnt to combat with honour and to distinguish himself as a true hero.<sup>133</sup> ‘Let no man, therefore’, the narrator claims, ‘flout at Peter M’Turk; for as the old proverb runs, “He may come to a pouchfu’ peas before he dies, for all that’s come and gone”’ (p. 97).

Hogg then voices human fear itself through Rickleton’s character who, despite the fact that he has just exhibited the utmost performance of brave masculinity by wishing to engage in an unfair duel with M’Turk, admits that he has his own fears too, like every man:

“You seem to have no sense of danger, nor to know what fear is,” said Joseph.

“Doos I not?” answered he—“I know both of them full well. It is absolute nonsense to talk of any man being void of fear. Joe, wast thou ever in a boggly [ghost-haunted] place in the dark thy lane?—if thou hast, thou knows what fear is.” (p. 102)

Hogg’s criticism, though, is even more complex, as while interrogating the ideology of Highlandism exploited in the Napoleonic Wars through the figure of ‘captain’ M’Turk, he also reveals the classist prejudices on the part of the Lowland middle

---

<sup>133</sup> Arthur Wellesley (1769-1852), who ‘after service in India and elsewhere, was created first Duke of Wellington in 1814 after his successful campaigns in the Peninsular War. His greatest triumph came with the defeat of Napoleon at Waterloo in 1815’; see *Perils of Woman*, written by Hogg, ed. by Hasler and Mack, editorial note on pp. 444-45.

class through the dialogue between Rickleton and his cousin Joseph. The latter explains the reason why M'Turk is called 'captain', as '[t]he Highlanders are very liberal of their titles [...and e]very commissioned officer, every master of a trading vessel, or even a coal sloop, is captain' (p. 98). Cousin Joe, then, though speaking 'only from hearsay' (p. 99), provides a mirror of the Highland clan system and a panoramic view of the entourage of profiting '*gentlemen*' around the Highland chieftains, not all of them as honourable as portrayed in the collective imagination:

[S]uch of them as are gentlemen of good families, are the completest gentlemen in the British dominions; polished, benevolent, and high spirited. But then, there is not one of these who has not a sort of satellites, or better kind of gillies, that count kin with their superiors, are sometimes out of courtesy admitted to their tables, and on that ground, *though living in half beggary and starvation*, they set up for gentlemen. *These beings would lick the dust from the feet of their superiors; would follow and support them through danger, and to death; but left to act for themselves, they are nothing, and no real Highland gentleman considers himself accountable for the behaviour of such men.* The cadets of a Highland chief, or the immediate circle of his friends, are generally all gentlemen; but there is not one of these who has not likewise his circle of dependent gentlemen, which last have theirs again, in endless ramifications; so that no one knows where the genteel system ends. None of these latter have any individual character to support; they have only a family one, or the character of a chief, who generally now cares not a farthing about them. *There lies the great difference between these people and our Borderers. With us, every man, from the peer to the meanest peasant, has an individual character of his own to support; and with all their bluntness of manner and address, for honesty, integrity, and loyal principles, shew me the race that will go before them.*"

"Ay, shew me the man that will *stand* before us, cousin Joe," cried Richard; "for, rabbit it! We have seen those that can *go* before us already, and that by fair dint of running." (p. 99, emphases mine)

M'Turk is an exponent of those 'unworthy' 'sort of satellites', continues Joseph Bell, who gravitate towards more honourable Highlanders such as Callum Gun, 'a man of education'. Joseph claims that their difference in social provenance is signalled by their respective Highland and Standard English, which 'always stamps the character with the sterling mark' (p. 99). It should be remembered, however, that Hogg has such comments delivered by a Scottish Lowlander of the middle class—and student of law. In his volume dedicated to the question of prostitution in nineteenth-century

Edinburgh, Dr Tait provides a detailed picture of these debauched students, who were often the fancy men of prostitutes (see introduction and chapter one). Joseph's education has not turned him into an honourable and sympathetic gentleman, as he enjoys Rickleton's 'unpolished' manners for the shallow reason of having some fun; while, despite his poor official education, Rickleton is the one who behaves with true honour. In addition, Joseph is blind to the fact that a Highlander of the lower class like M'Turk would 'lick the dust from the feet of [his] superiors' because he may have been reduced to 'half beggary and starvation' by those 'real Highland gentlem[e]n' who, at the time of Hogg's writing, were forcing their tenants to emigrate to Canada or to enrol in the Highland regiments, so as to make room for the more financially convenient grazing of sheep—a new market that Lowlanders of the middle class like Joseph Bell and his father Daniel would exploit at the expense of people like M'Turk. Though Callum Gun is portrayed as having an apparently more honourable behaviour, as he does engage in a duel with Rickleton, Hogg de-emphasises such combat with a very short passage, effectively suggesting a critique of the economic issues inherent in the class that Callum Gun represents.

Joseph seems to recuperate the value of Lowland masculinity by speculating about the difference between the Highlanders' collective blind loyalty to their chief and the Lowlanders' more individualistic sense of pride and honour. Nevertheless, Hogg goes beyond such a deterministic sense of manliness by posing Rickleton's sincere, sympathetic manly behaviour as not influenced by any materialistic reason masked behind ethnic, gender, and class ideological assumptions. In addition, Hogg deconstructs the conflation of the Enlightenment vogue for physiognomy and Adam Smith's conceptualisation of sympathy, since Rickleton, despite being 'a real clod-

pole—a moss-jumper—a man of bones, thews, and sinews’ (p. 56), turns out to be one of the most humane types among the characters that Hogg ever conceived.

***Basil Lee: A carnivalesque ‘Highlander’ in Quebec***

‘Basil Lee’ is a short novella that was published in 1820 in Hogg’s collection *Winter Evening Tales*. Integrating Bakhtin’s (1981) carnivalesque dialogism with a more socially dynamic literary pragmatics (Sell 1991b, 2000; Mey 2000), this section will analyse the relationship between the negative response to Hogg’s novella at its time of first publication and the subversiveness of its subject. Hogg’s presentation of a prostitute as a lady at heart who ‘redeems’ through marriage a soldier of a Highland regiment, and who also prevents him from deserting the imperial war in Quebec, defied bourgeois principles of literary politeness; while their subsequent happy marriage functioned to critique the apparent assumptions of respectability of contemporary bourgeois marriage and the political significance of the marriage plot in the progressive accounts of historical and national narratives.

‘Basil Lee’ is the substantially revised version of the ‘Story of the Berwickshire Farmer’ that had first appeared in two issues of Hogg’s magazine *The Spy* in 1811. At that time, Hogg’s description of the housekeeper’s out-of-wedlock pregnancy in the story was criticised very harshly by contemporary readers, and a large number of them removed themselves from the subscription list of the journal for this very reason.<sup>134</sup> In a letter to Walter Scott of 28 September 1810 Hogg writes, ‘I have got a dreadful letter from Mr Ballantyne every word of it I fear too too just; it

---

<sup>134</sup> Gillian Hughes, ‘Introduction’, in *The Spy: A Periodical of Literary Amusement and Instruction*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2000a [1810-1811]), pp. xvii-xlix (p. xxvi).



seems that by one or two unlucky expressions in Number 4 I have given my work that looked so well, a wound which it will be difficult to heal' (*Collected Letters*, vol. 1, p. 107).

Nonetheless, Hogg kept this episode in the 1820 version for *Winter Evening Tales*, expanded 'massively' the passage related to Basil's combat in Quebec, which in *The Spy* was only 'two paragraphs long', and then added the Clifford Mackay plot.<sup>135</sup> A decade of historical events after its first appearance probably contributed to Hogg's own reflections on the aftermath of the Napoleonic Wars, and he hence exploited this tale as a platform from which to articulate his own critique. For this reason, the focus of the present analysis will be on the interface between Hogg as the author, the text, and the bourgeois readers of his time. The relation between Hogg's strategic use of specific linguistic features, contemporary cultural tropes and literary motifs, and the socio-historical influence on Hogg's writing and reception of 'Basil Lee' will show that the negative reception of Hogg's story is rooted in its perceived challenge to the stability of the early nineteenth-century British militarist discourse and to the ideology of Highland masculinity. Though twentieth-century critics have long acknowledged that Hogg was a subversive figure, studies have lacked detailed analysis of Hogg's strategic use of the principles that govern literary communication in his works. A more nuanced textual analysis of 'Basil Lee' will highlight how Hogg conveys his critique of both the imperial wars and the marriage trope by defying early nineteenth-century assumptions of literary politeness and gender.

'Basil Lee' is a novella narrated in the first-person by a Scottish Lowlander who lives in the Borders countryside of 1770s Scotland, where he works as a

---

<sup>135</sup> Ian Duncan, editorial note, in *Winter Evening Tales*, written by Hogg, ed. by Duncan, p. 548.

ploughman, shepherd, grocer, and farmer, but with such an ‘instability of mind’ that he cannot keep any of these jobs. The life of a shepherd turns out to be harsh, not idyllic as depicted in contemporary pastoral poetry; while a farmer, Basil neglects his crops and indulges in a profligate life, getting his housekeeper pregnant. Hence, in Basil’s words,

as the war was then raging in America, I determined on going there in person, to assist some of the people in killing *their neighbours*. I did not care much which of the parties, provided I got to a place where I should never see nor hear more of *my drunken neighbours*, profligate servants, lame horses, blighted crops, and unfathomable housekeeper.<sup>136</sup>

As a last opportunity after so many failures, in 1777 this Lowlander enters the Highland regiments to defend the British colonies from the revolutionary war in America. Through the ironic ‘parallelism’ between the noun phrases ‘their neighbours’ and ‘my drunken neighbours’, Hogg illustrates that Basil is willing to struggle against any neighbours—it does not matter of which party—as long as he gets rid of his own. Basil’s picaresque, anti-heroic nature represents Hogg’s first deconstruction of the mystique of Highland masculinity. It not only challenges the erroneous belief that the troops of the British army were mostly people from the Highlands (Devine 2006a: 240-41), but it also contends that these soldiers lacked those qualities of courage, loyalty, and honour which characterised the myth of the Highland soldier-hero.

---

<sup>136</sup> James Hogg, ‘The Renowned Adventures of Basil Lee’, in *Winter Evening Tales*, written by Hogg, ed. by Duncan (2004c), pp. 3-79 (p. 17), emphases mine. Quotations from Hogg’s tale will be from this edition, and page references given within parentheses in the text.

The second deconstruction operates through the carnivalesque depiction of Basil's combat in Quebec where he becomes a hero of the American Wars for saving, very much unwittingly, the British flag, as depicted in the following passage:

[A]t that time *I did not know in the least what I was doing*. [...] As we went up the hill I heard an old grim sergeant, who was near to me, saying, "*It is utter madness! We are all sold to a man.*" The murmur ran along, "We are sold—we are sold;—to a certainty we are sold." [...] But] they went the faster, and *the old burly ill-natured sergeant, though assured that he was sold to destruction* [...] *hurried on fastest of any* [...] *I did not see what was going on*, till the Yankee horse in a moment came and attacked us in flank. [...] *I did not know in the least what I was doing*; and chancing to have a hold of my flagstaff with both my hands, I struck at him with my colours, which, flapping round the horse's head, blindfolded *him*; and at the same moment the cavalier struck at me, but by good luck hit the flag-staff, which he cut in two not a foot from my hand. I ran for it, and left my colours about his horse's head or feet, I did not stay to examine which; but, owing to the pikes and bayonets of our men, I could only fly a very short way. When the old crusty sergeant saw the colours down and abandoned, he dashed forward with a terrible oath, and seized them, but was himself cut down that moment. *The dragoon's horse* that left the ranks, and came upon me, had been shot. I deemed that he had come in *desperate valour* to seize my standard, whereas his horse was running with him in the agonies of death and *knew not where he was going*. (pp. 31-32, emphases mine)

The 'foregrounded' linguistic feature in this passage is the sentence 'I did not know in the least what I was doing', which is repeated twice through Basil's voice. Later, Hogg reiterates a similar sentence when depicting the horse as personified through the masculine pronoun 'he' and which, likewise, 'knew not where he was going'. This aspect suggests the negative consequences of arbitrary power that the horse shares with the dragoon, Basil Lee, and 'the ill-natured sergeant'—all described as pawns in someone else's hands. The horse's personification also blurs the boundaries between the latter and the dragoon's identity, as both are depicted as a unique body sharing the same destiny of death. Paradoxically, while the sergeant's blind courage leads him to his death, Basil's cowardice—or his human drive to survive—saves his life.

Although the war depicted in the novella is the British campaign to expel the Americans from Canada in 1777, at Hogg's time of writing the Napoleonic Wars were still affecting the destiny of Europe. Hogg's text hence reflects the critical scrutiny to which the wars were being subjected at this time, and the above passage may be viewed as being in intertextual relation with Hogg's own essay 'Soldiers', where he comments on the imperial motives behind the Napoleonic Wars.<sup>137</sup> As argued by both Nils Erik Enkvist and Jacob L. Mey, intertextuality is a pragmaticist phenomenon since it requires an active reader to infer, and hence recreate, the intertextual relations between the alluded texts.<sup>138</sup> In 'Soldiers', Hogg argues that

princes and great men [...] generally live in luxury in their palaces, far from the battle's alarm, and are but little sensible of the miseries that accompany the wars that they themselves have raised [...] which] lead to no aim or end besides the taking of life [...] while t]he thirst of military fame is never quenched. Every victory is a new starting place from which *to unleash the dogs of havoc and war*. (pp. 40-47, emphasis mine)

Hogg's allusion to the words uttered by Antony in Shakespeare's *Julius Caesar* come to mind here:

And Caesar's spirit, ranging from revenge,  
With Ate by his side come hot from hell,  
Shall in these confines, with a monarch's voice,  
*Cry havoc and let slip the dogs of war*,  
That this foul deed shall smell above the earth  
With carrion men, groaning for burial.<sup>139</sup>

---

<sup>137</sup> James Hogg, *A Series of Lay Sermons*, ed. by Hughes, pp. 40-47. Also reflecting cultural interest in writing about Napoleon at the time is Walter Scott's *Life of Napoleon*, which he published in nine volumes in his twenty-eight-volume collection of *Sir Walter Scott's Prose Works* (Edinburgh: Robert Cadell; London: Whittaker, 1834-1836), vols 8-16.

<sup>138</sup> Nils Erik Enkvist, 'On the Interpretability of Texts in General and of Literary Texts in Particular', in *Literary Pragmatics*, ed. by Sell, pp. 1-25 (p. 22); Jacob L. Mey, *When Voices Clash* (2000), pp. 251, 371-72.

<sup>139</sup> William Shakespeare, *Julius Caesar*, ed. by David Daniell, The Arden Shakespeare, 3rd series (London: Routledge, 2007 [1599]), Act 3, Scene 1, ll. 270-75, pp. 250-51; see notes by the editor on p. 251.

Shakespeare had always been a source of profound inspiration to Hogg, and Meiko O'Halloran claims that '[t]he density of Shakespearean allusions in Hogg's first serious play, *The Hunting of Badlewe*, suggests that he had read most of Shakespeare's plays by the time he began composing it in the spring of 1813' (2012: 106). In Shakespeare's *Julius Caesar*, 'Cry havoc' indicates 'slaughter and pillage without mercy', while 'dogs of war' are a metaphorical portrayal of soldiers who, likewise, fight for the belligerent king in the Prologue to Shakespeare's *Henry V*:

Then should the warlike Harry, like himself,  
Assume the port of Mars, and at his heels,  
Leashed in like hounds, should famine, sword and  
fire  
Crouch for employment.<sup>140</sup>

Hogg exploits the same metaphor in his essay 'Soldiers' when depicting monarchical power—a trope which appears consistently in Hogg's *œuvre* and which bears a particular significance in 'Basil Lee' as well. In Hogg's novella the thirst for destruction, nourished by the ideology of Highland masculinity, is what motivates the old sergeant to risk his life. Although aware of the fact that 'it is utter madness' and that they 'are all sold to a man', the sergeant hurries on faster than anyone only to find his death.

Soon after, Basil Lee is infected by the same contagious thirst for destruction when, having stabbed the Yankee and unwittingly saved the flag without 'the most distant idea of valour or heroism', he is incited by an old English officer who claims:

“Well done, young Scot [...] you have behaved like a hero!” [...] but *I was quite delirious, and knew not what I was about*, [...while t]he old man's words raised *my madness* to the highest pitch. I swore dreadfully at the Yankees—threw down my colours, and began to strip off my coat, the first thing that a country-man of

---

<sup>140</sup> William Shakespeare, *King Henry V*, ed. by T. W. Craik, The Arden Shakespeare, 2nd series (London: Thomson Learning, 2002 [1599]), Prologue, ll. 5-8, pp. 31-32.

Scotland always does when he is going to fight with any of his neighbours. “No, no,” said the old lieutenant, “you must not quit your colours after fighting so hardly for them; you must not throw them away because they have lost the pole. Here,” continued he, and giving them a hasty roll up, he fixed them in my shoulder behind, between my coat and shirt, where they stuck like a large furled umbrella; and having then both my hands at liberty, I seized the long bloody halbert once more, and *with my eyes gleaming madness* and rage, and, as I was told, with my teeth clenched, and *grinning like a mad dog*, I rushed on in the front of the line to the combat. (p. 33, emphases mine)

The first two lines of this passage foreground through parallelism the sentence claiming that Basil, once again, is not aware of what he is doing, with the variant that now he is even ‘quite delirious’. The dramatic irony lies in the voice of the old lieutenant, who argues that Basil must not quit the flag after having fought for it so hard. At this point in the story, in fact, the reader knows that the old sergeant is the one who died to save the flag, while Basil ran away. Anne McClintock argues that nationalism is constructed through the visible use of national fetishes such as ‘flags, uniforms and military displays’ (McClintock 1995: 374). Hence, when the unworthy Basil Lee, with the flag flapping on his shoulders, takes hold of the dead sergeant’s halberd, he becomes a living, carnivalesque image of the flag itself, inverting the mystique of the Highland soldier. A good-for-nothing Lowlander fuming with instinctual rage and behaving as if he were ‘going to fight with any of his neighbours’ (p. 33) becomes the very symbol of the British nation, ‘grinning like a mad dog’, that is, one of those ‘dogs of havoc and war’ unleashed by ‘princes and great men’ whose ‘thirst of military fame is never quenched’, as Hogg himself, alluding to Shakespeare, argues in ‘Soldiers’ (1997 [1834]: 40, 47).

Hogg also critiques the supposed honour of the British army through the voice of Clifford Mackay, a prostitute from the Highlands who will marry and ‘redeem’ the not-so-honourable Basil Lee. She claims, ‘I never yet knew an officer in the British army [...] who would not seduce his friend’s mistress, or even his wife or

sister, if he found it convenient' (p. 26). Though a prostitute from the margins, Hogg presents Clifford as an honourable character, who prevents Basil from deserting the British army. Douglas Gifford observes that in contemporary fiction such as John Wilson's *The Trial of Margaret Lindsay* (1823), the prostitute was characterised as 'a symbol of irretrievable social and moral ruin'; Hogg, on the contrary, presents Clifford as a symbol of redemption and the story of 'Basil Lee' as an emblem of 'anti-hypocrisy and honesty', which was needed 'to correct the worldly conventionality of the nineteenth-century novel'.<sup>141</sup> Basil's voice then defies the false assumptions about morality and delicacy of contemporary British discourse in an exophoric address to the reader at the end of the story:

Never yet was there a *young* female seduced from the paths of virtue, who did not grievously repent, and who would not gladly have returned, had an opportunity offered [...] I have known many who were timeously snatched from error; before their *minds* were corrupted, which is not the work of a day; and who turned out characters more exemplary for virtue, and every good quality, than in all likelihood they would have been, had not such misfortune befallen them. (pp. 73-74, emphases in the original)

Interestingly for a literary-pragmaticist analysis concerned with the tension between Hogg, his cultural circumstances, and the readers of his time, Ian Duncan notices that though Hogg removed Clifford's considerations about the British army in the 1821 edition of *Winter Evening Tales*, he kept 'the Clifford Mackay plot', even though it had provoked a negative response from contemporary critics.<sup>142</sup> While Hogg's collection in 1820 had been received very enthusiastically, the *Monthly Review* had judged 'Basil Lee' the worst story because its grappling with prostitution and illegitimate pregnancy offended 'the best regulated modesty'; whereas *Blackwood's*

<sup>141</sup> Douglas Gifford, *James Hogg* (Edinburgh: The Ramsay Head Press, 1976), p. 98.

<sup>142</sup> Ian Duncan, 'Note on the Text', in *Winter Evening Tales*, written by Hogg, ed. by Duncan (2004b), pp. 527-34 (p. 533).

*Edinburgh Magazine* had argued that ‘not a few passages [...] would require an intrepid person to read aloud to boys and virgins’.<sup>143</sup> Duncan observes that ‘it seems that Hogg took care to present the story as a challenge to middle-class morality, not a lapse from it; and to the very end he refused to alter it’ (Duncan 2004b: 534). As Duncan points out, Edinburgh was not ready.

Hogg’s failure to observe the principle of what Sell defines as selectional politeness by addressing prostitution so openly was probably perceived as a face threatening act against the positive face (namely the social status and prestige) of an Edinburgh bourgeoisie whose male members, though prone to see prostitutes outside marriage, preferred to keep their daughters, wives, and sisters in the dark. Regarding ‘Basil Lee’, the *British Critic* claimed that ‘prostitutes and blackguard gentlemen belong to a department of human nature, which is not at all necessary that our wives and daughters should study [...] There are cases in which it is better to be ignorant of vice, than even to detest it’.<sup>144</sup> Apparently, Hogg failed to strike the balance between bourgeois values and their subversion, as instead of placing Clifford in the background he presented her as a lady at heart. According to the logic of relevance theory, Hogg’s bestowing of dignity upon a prostitute from the Highlands, who rehabilitates a Lowlander through marriage, suggests a strong implicature. Namely, the ‘Clifford Mackay plot’ may have been perceived as a communicative act intentionally employed by Hogg to critique the hypocrisy of the bourgeoisie of his time, as the union between Basil and Clifford seemingly worked to subvert both the

---

<sup>143</sup> Anon., ‘[Review of] *Winter Evening Tales*’, *Monthly Review*, n.s., 93, November 1820, pp. 263-67 (p. 264) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 2 May 2012]; Anon., ‘[Review of] *Winter Evening Tales*’, *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine*, 7 (1820), pp. 148-54 (p. 154) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 2 May 2012].

<sup>144</sup> Anon., ‘[Review of] *Winter Evening Tales*’, *British Critic*, n.s., 13, June 1820, pp. 622-31 (p. 623) <http://books.google.com> [accessed 30 September 2011]; also cited by Ian Duncan, ‘Introduction’, in *Winter Evening Tales*, written by Hogg, ed. by Duncan (2004a), p. xxxiv.



culturally constructed valour of the Highland soldier and the marriage trope in teleological narratives. Hogg then counterpoises an alternative sense of honour personified by Clifford, a Highland prostitute who marries Basil Lee, thereby articulating a more socially dynamic version of the National Tale which includes the voices of the margins. In so doing, however, Hogg defied contemporary essentialist stereotypes based on class, gender, and ethnicity that shaped emerging discourses of empire.

***We'll finish the Corsican callan', | Wi' stanes an' bullets an' a!***

As argued by Suzanne Gilbert and Peter D. Garside, Hogg's song 'Donald Macdonald' enjoyed numerous publications during his lifetime, becoming what nowadays would be considered a successful hit. It first appeared as a song sheet published by John Hamilton in c.1803; then, in Hogg's collection of legendary ballads and songs *The Mountain Bard* (1807); in *The Forest Minstrel* (1810); in *Songs by the Ettrick Shepherd* (1831), as well as in multiple issues of song sheets published again by Hamilton.<sup>145</sup>

The positive response to Hogg's song was no doubt excited by its theme, as it met the expectations of its early nineteenth-century British audience. At a time when Britain felt threatened by Napoleon's military campaigns, a song celebrating the indestructible Highland soldier must certainly have conveyed a great sense of safety to British society. According to Garside,

---

<sup>145</sup> Suzanne Gilbert, editorial notes to 'Donald Macdonald', in *The Mountain Bard*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Suzanne Gilbert (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007 [1807]), pp. 454-55; Peter D. Garside, 'The Origins and History of James Hogg's 'Donald Macdonald'', *Scottish Studies Review*, 7.2 (Autumn 2006), 24-39.

[w]hat effectively Hogg has achieved in his own ‘Donald Macdonald’ is to recycle the figure of the self-assertive amorous Highland Donald of the ballad (‘I tell ye I am Donald Macdonald/I’ll ever be proud of my name’) with a comparatively new archetype, at once *emblematic* and *individual*, that of the indestructible French-resisting common Highland infantryman. (2006: 33, emphases mine)

As Gilbert observes, a comparative analysis of the 1807 and 1803 variants of the song shows the validity of Garside’s argument. The geographical setting, in fact, is changed from the more localised: ‘My name is Donald Macdonald | I live in Loch-ber sae grand’ in the 1803 version to ‘I live in the Highlands sae grand’ in *The Mountain Bard* (1807), hence suggesting that ‘[t]he singer of this song [...] is to be seen as a typical and representative Highlander’ (2007: 454), that is to say ‘at once *emblematic* and *individual*’ (Garside 2006: 33, emphases mine).

The spelling of some Scots terms in the Hamilton edition has also been anglicised in *The Mountain Bard* as, for instance, the Scottish generic subject pronoun ‘she’ which changes into the more affectionate ‘laddie’ in the third line of the first refrain, possibly to reach a wider audience, as shown in the following passage:

*Brogs an’ brochen an’ a’,  
Brochen an’ brogs an’ a’,  
An’ isna the laddie well aff  
Wha has brogs an’ brochen an’ a’.*<sup>146</sup>

Gilbert points out that according to his ‘Memoirs’ in *Altrive Tales*, Hogg composed the song ‘Donald Macdonald’ ‘on the threatened invasion by Bonaparte’ (2007: 454), either in 1800 or 1803. Also the *Literary Panorama* in 1807 considered ‘Donald

---

<sup>146</sup> ‘Donald Macdonald’, in *The Mountain Bard*, written by Hogg, ed. by Gilbert, pp. 108-09, (ll. 9-12, p. 108), emphases mine. Quotations from Hogg’s song will be from this edition, and page references given within parentheses in the text.

Macdonald' as 'a loyal song, which derives an additional interest from the present circumstances of public affairs, to which loyalty is altogether *a propos*'.<sup>147</sup>

However, neither current nor nineteenth-century criticism appears to have engaged in any degree with 'Donald Macdonald' as a parody of the Highland soldier. Bakhtin's notion of parody as two languages crossing each other's point of view illuminates this approach. Bakhtin views this literary technique as extremely subtle and, sometimes, hard to detect because only the parodied language is clearly uttered while the parodying voice unnoticeably creates and perceives (1981: 41-83). In 'Donald Macdonald' Hogg seems to be imitating the contemporary Romantic trend of Highland lyric songs without exaggerating their stylistic features, hence making it hard to view the song as a parody. However, a careful analysis of the song's lexical content does suggest a burlesque of the myth of the Highland soldier. The following is the series of refrains in Hogg's song:

*Brogs an' brochen an' a',  
Brochen an' brogs an' a',  
An' isna the laddie well aff  
Wha has brogs an' brochen an' a'. (ll. 9-12)*

[...]

*Guns an' pistols an' a',  
Pistols an' guns an' a';  
He'll quickly see Donald Macdonald  
Wi' guns an' pistols an' a'. (ll. 21-24)*

[...]

*Swords an' buckler an' a',  
Buckler and sword an' a';  
For George we'll encounter the devil,  
Wi' sword an' buckler an' a'. (ll. 33-36)*

---

<sup>147</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *The Mountain Bard*', *Literary Panorama*, 2, August 1807, pp. 957-60 (p. 959).

[...]

*Knees an' elbows an' a',  
Elbows an' knees an' a';  
Depend upon Donald Macdonald,  
His knees an' elbows an' a'. (ll. 45-48)*

[...]

*Stanes an' bullets an' a',  
Bullets an' stanes an' a';  
We'll finish the Corsican callan',  
Wi' stanes an' bullets an' a'. (ll. 57-60)*

[...]

*Brogs an' brochen an' a',  
Brochen an' brogs an' a',  
An' up wi' the bonny blue bonnet,  
The kilt an' the feather, an a'. (ll. 69-72)  
(pp. 108-09, all emphases mine)*

The refrains of Hogg's song show, once again, what by stylistics has been defined as 'parallelism', namely the four-line refrains at the end of each verse have the same syntactic structure, although a different lexical content. In each refrain, Hogg shows a conscious and purposeful replication of lexical items related ironically to the stereotype of the Highland soldier. By repeating them symmetrically in the first two lines, '*Brogs an' brochen an' a', | Brochen an' brogs an' a'*', and then reiterating them in the last line, '*An' isna the laddie well aff | Wha has brogs an' brochen an'a'*', Hogg elicits a sympathetic laughter in the reader or listener. Similarly to the collective voice of a Greek chorus which comments on the dramatic action, each refrain of Hogg's song foregrounds through parallelism the cultural stereotypes of the Highland soldier with a humorous undertone, reaching a comic effect and hence demystifying the heroism of the Highland warrior.

Going beyond a formalist stylistic analysis, which only accounts for the linguistic features of a text, a historical contextualisation of 'Donald Macdonald' exposes the social critique that Hogg implied through his linguistic choices. Though

at first glance, the trope of the Highland soldier appears deterministically in line with the historical context of the Napoleonic Wars, Hogg was playing humorously and strategically with it to convey a tragic reality. In relation to Hogg's *Poetic Mirror*, Dieter A. Berger argues that 'one can speak of a complete interaction between poets, critics, and parodists [...as t]he interpretation of a parody [...] cannot be preoccupied with the text alone, but must pay attention to cultural, biographical, social, and even political factors'.<sup>148</sup> 'Donald Macdonald' can hence be viewed as a subtle parody through which Hogg exposes the exploitation of young soldiers in the imperial wars at his time of writing (and singing); and Hogg conveys it to the readers (and listeners) of his time by hiding himself behind a narrative voice stereotypically representative of any Highland soldier.

The third stanza portrays the 1745 Jacobite rising, when Prince Charles Edward Stuart, 'the exiled heir of the deposed Stuart kings', came to Britain from France to regain his throne with the support of the Highland clans which, for this reason, suffered a ferocious reprisal after their defeat at Culloden in 1746. As mentioned before in this chapter, later in the eighteenth century the Highland regiments started to play a significant 'role in the British army, in the service of the Hanoverian monarchs who had replaced the deposed Stuarts' (Gilbert 2007: 455). The stanza is as follows,

What though we befriendit young Charlie?  
 To tell it I dinna think shame;  
 Poor lad! He came to us barely,  
 An' reckoned our mountains his hame:  
 'Tis true that our reason forbade us,  
 But tenderness carried the day;

---

<sup>148</sup> Dieter A. Berger, 'James Hogg as a Parodist in Verse: *The Poetic Mirror*', *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference (Edinburgh 1985)*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Aberdeen, 1988), pp. 79-96 (p. 43).

Had Geordie come friendless amang us,  
 Wi' him we had a' gane away.—  
*Swords an' buckler an' a',*  
*Buckler and sword an' a';*  
*For George we'll encounter the devil,*  
*Wi' sword an' buckler an' a'. (ll. 25-36)*

As noted by Suzanne Gilbert, in this stanza 'Hogg registers this remarkable change' of loyalty from the Stuarts to the Hanovers (2007: 455). However, Hogg also parodies the militaristic discourse inherent in the stereotype of the Highland soldier, and this is particularly evident in the interaction between the first eight lines of the stanza and its final refrain, where the narrative voice claims that '[f]or George we'll encounter the devil' (l. 35). If, on the one hand, here Hogg appears to be rechanneling the Highlanders' militaristic quality of unconditional loyalty to the clan chief into the service of the British king against Napoleon, on the other he is also implicitly exposing the ideology of the supposedly blind loyalty of the Highland soldiers who like 'mad dogs' might be willing to encounter even the devil in person for King George III. Hogg's voice seems to be hiding behind this line, as its content alludes to his own essay 'Soldiers' where some years later he would criticise the Napoleonic Wars. As already shown in the previous discussion about 'Basil Lee', in that essay Hogg critiques the subjective authority to which men are exposed in the battles induced by the personal gain of '[p]rinces and great men' (1997 [1834]: 40-47). The members of these privileged strata of society would never experience in first person the hardship which a war entailed, risking instead the life of their young subjects, that is, of those supposedly brave Highland soldiers who, in the collective imagination of early nineteenth-century Britain, and in Hogg's parodic reshaping of it, were viewed as heroes 'up wi' the bonny blue bonnet, | The kilt an' the feather, an a'. Through such parody, however, Hogg exposed the 'mystified – purely ideological

– commitment to history and folklore’<sup>149</sup> of early-nineteenth-century British discourse, which represented ‘an essential ingredient in a more concerted building-up of Empire’, as argued by Garside (2006: 34).

### *The carnivorous Wat o’ the Cleuch*

‘Wat o’ the Cleuch’ is a three-canto parody of Sir Walter Scott’s literary style contained in Hogg’s collection *The Poetic Mirror*, published for the first time in 1816. Hogg discusses the genesis of *The Poetic Mirror* in his ‘Memoir of the Author’s Life’ where he recounts that, being in financial straits, in 1814 he thought of improving his situation by publishing a repository of poems written by the most famous British Romantic figures of his time. Southey, Wordsworth, Wilson, and Byron, among others, gave their ‘good-humoured promise’ to contribute a piece; while Scott refused, thus occasioning a temporary rupture of his friendship with Hogg. According to Hogg, this rejection ruined the project, as he had counted on Scott’s literary support. Looking disappointingly over the pieces he had received, Hogg commented,

I fancied that I could write a better poem than any that had been sent to me, and this so completely in the style of each poet, that it should not be known but for his own production. It was this conceit that suggested to me the idea of “The Poetic Mirror.” (2005: 40)

Indeed, some of Hogg’s contemporary critics, unaware of the real author’s identity (as the collection was published anonymously), viewed the poems of *The Poetic Mirror* as serious imitations rather than caricatures. *The Quarterly Review* argued

---

<sup>149</sup> Ian Duncan, with Leith Davis and Janet Sorensen, ‘Introduction’, in *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism*, ed. by Ian Duncan, with Leith Davis and Janet Sorensen (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), pp. 1-19 (p. 1).

that the works ‘do not remind us of any individual passages’, while in relation to ‘Wat of the Cleuch’, it claimed that it could be ‘the real though imperfect offspring of the prolific and sometimes hasty pen of Mr. Scott himself’. The *Eclectic Review* considered the intention of the author rather equivocal, and observed that it was not clear whether the poems were ‘a serious attempt to catch the manner and spirit of the individual writers, so as to exhibit their intellectual likeness, or that of a broad caricature parody of their more obvious peculiarities’. Yet, the same critic considered ‘Wat o’ the Cleuch’ ‘[a] very fair parody of Mr. Scott’s border-epics’.<sup>150</sup>

Twentieth-century criticism is likewise divided between those scholars who view all poems of Hogg’s *Poetic Mirror* as full parodies and those who consider only some of them as such. Dieter A. Berger, for instance, argues that the collection contains imitations ‘notably of Byron and Scott, as well as comic distortions and satirical exaggerations of Southey, Coleridge, and Wordsworth’, regarding the ‘serious imitations’ as pastiche and only the ‘comic distortions’ as parody ‘in the narrow sense’ (1988: 45). Antony J. Hasler, on the contrary, considers the ‘parodic status’ of ‘Wat o’ the Cleuch’ ‘apparent at the very outset [...even though] it has been singled out critically as being too close to its original to be a parody’.<sup>151</sup> Hasler takes as evidence the very beginning of the poem, which shows a ‘condensation’ of Scott’s stylistic features,

Wat o’ the Cleuch came down through the dale,  
In helmet and hauberk of glistening mail;  
Full proudly he came on his berry-black steed,  
Caparison’d, belted for warrior deed.  
O bold was the bearing, and brisk the career,

<sup>150</sup> Anon., ‘[Review of] *The Poetic Mirror*’, *Quarterly Review*, 15, July 1816, pp. 468-75 (pp. 469, 476); Anon., ‘[Review of] *The Poetic Mirror*’, *Eclectic Review*, 2nd ser., 6, November 1816, pp. 507-11 (pp. 507, 510).

<sup>151</sup> Antony J. Hasler, ‘Ingenious Lies: *The Poetic Mirror* in Context’, in *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference*, ed. by Hughes, pp. 9-96 (p. 83).



And broad was the cuirass and long was the spear,  
 And tall was the plume that waved over the brow  
 Of that dark reckless borderer, Wat o' the Cleuch.<sup>152</sup>

Hogg could not resist making fun of Scott, though sympathetically, and he did so with a series of heroic couplets in anapaestic tetrameters for comic effect, thus achieving his own little revenge for Scott's refusal to contribute a poem to the collection. Hasler observes that

the "galloping" anapaests from "Bonnie Dundee" (in *The Doom of Devorgoil*) [...] the interpolated song "The Cavalier" in *Rokeby*, [...] the inversions [...] which begin at "bold was the bearing;" the piling up of adjectives ("dark reckless borderer") [...] are exaggerated and concentrated together [...] "laying bare the devices" of Scott's own verse. (1988: 84)

Indeed, the beginning of 'Wat o' the Cleuch' closely resembles the anapaestic rhythm of Lady Heron's song 'Lochinvar' in Scott's narrative poem *Marmion*,

O, young Lochinvar is come out of the west,  
 Through all the wide Border his steed was the best;  
 And save his good broad-sword he weapons had none,  
 He rode all unarmed, and he rode all alone.  
 So faithful in love, and so dauntless in war,  
 There never was knight like the young Lochinvar.<sup>153</sup>

Considering, again, Bakhtin's notion of parody as a double-voiced discourse where only the parodied language is heard, Paul Grice's (1989) cooperative principle of communication, as well as Hogg's well-known strong sense of humour, it may be argued that 'Wat o' the Cleuch' was meant to be a parody of Scott's style. Its value, however, should not be viewed per se but rather envisioned in the cultural and

<sup>152</sup> 'Wat o' the Cleuch', in *The Poetic Mirror* (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, and Brown; Edinburgh: John Ballantyne, 1816), pp. 55-129 (p. 74) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 6 December 2012]. Quotations from Hogg's poem will be from this edition, and page references given within parentheses in the text.

<sup>153</sup> Walter Scott, *Marmion: A Tale of Flodden Field*, 9th edn (Edinburgh: Archibald Constable, 1815 [1808]), p. 258 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 29 April 2014].

historical context of Hogg's time of writing because, through Scott's parody, Hogg also deconstructs the stereotype of the greedy Lowlander through a less idealised version of Lochinvar, implying that this cultural stereotype did not represent the actual condition of all social strata in early nineteenth-century Scotland.

Recent developments in historicist formalism have tried to overcome 'both the programmatic and the effective exclusion of either form or history that has characterized most formalisms and historicisms'.<sup>154</sup> Yet, historical formalism is still too historically deterministic and offers little space to both the author's and the reader's agency in creating and co-creating the text. A literary-pragmaticist critical lens reveals that Hogg's active flouting of one of Grice's (1989) sub-maxims of manner (being ambiguous)—by leaving the parodic status of his works uncertain—was an active creative strategy meant to convey a precise point to the reviewers of his time concerning his ability as a writer. The ambiguous mode of the poems in the *Poetic Mirror* has generated a double interpretation both in nineteenth- and twentieth-century criticism. Blurring the boundaries between genuine simulations and full parodies, Hogg asserted his own poetic skills, hence implying that he indeed 'could write a better poem than any that had been sent to [him]' (2005: 40). As such, Hogg was able to answer to the patronising and condescending attitude that he had suffered by the literary élite until then. Yet, to be fair, Hogg also included a self-parody, 'The Gude Greye Kat', with its exaggerated pseudo-medieval Scots reminiscent of 'Kilmeny' and the 'Witch of Fife' in *The Queen's Wake* (1813).

As mentioned above, a parody must be considered in relation to the socio-historical circumstances in which it originated (see Berger 1988: 43), and which the

---

<sup>154</sup> Stephen Cohen, 'Introduction', in *Shakespeare and Historical Formalism*, ed. by Stephen Cohen (Aldershot: Ashgate), pp. 1-27 (p. 3).

author may have wished to critique. With ‘Wat of the Cleuch’ Hogg interrogates the stereotype of the materialistic Lowland Scot, exposing the fact that such a label did not represent the entire social spectrum of the Scottish Lowlanders in the early nineteenth century. As Hogg comments in the article mentioned above, the peasantry was being affected rather negatively by the affluence derived from the imperial project.

‘Wat of the Cleuch’ narrates the vicissitudes of the eponymous Scottish Borderer moss-trooper<sup>155</sup> who, disguised as a monk, wants to regain the Castle of Roxburgh from the English garrison—a location that Hogg will also employ some years later in his long narrative *Perils of Man* (1822), and likewise as the site of a contest between the English and the Scots. In the poem, Wat agrees to yield quite reluctantly his sword in order to play a more credible role of pious monk and enter so disguised into the castle; his masquerade, however, stimulates great laughter among the real monks, who are helping him in the enterprise:

Such rude unhypocritic mien,  
No churchman’s eye had ever seen

[...]

No living man the scene could stand,  
Each eye was shaded with the hand[.] (p. 74)

Wat’s boorish and impulsive temperament seems to be even harder to disguise than his appearance. At the Castle of Roxburgh he can scarcely contain himself when Walsinghame, the English minstrel who is unaware of our monk’s true identity, performs a hilarious song to deride Wat, who ‘[s]toop’d onward with such dire intent

---

<sup>155</sup> A moss-trooper was a ‘member of any of the marauding gangs which, in the mid 17th cent., carried out raids across the “mosses” of the Scottish Border’; see Oxford English Dictionary online <[WWW.OED.com](http://WWW.OED.com)> [accessed 23 April 2013]. They were particularly involved in cattle-raiding.

| As if each nerve were strain'd and bent' (p. 110). Eventually, Wat's page gives the sword back to his master; the latter gladly releases himself from his disguise, kills Walsinghame, and expels the English garrison from the castle.

Samantha Webb views Wat's sword as a symbol of 'competence and authority' which he loses when disguised as a monk.<sup>156</sup> It may be added that through Wat's regaining of his sword Hogg also performs a re-appropriation of masculine identity by the Scottish Borderers, which had been damaged by the myth of the Highland soldier. Maureen Martin, for instance, observes that in *Kidnapped* (1886) and *The Master of Ballantrae* (1889), Robert Louis Stevenson represents 'the dilemma of Scottish identity as a dilemma of Lowland masculinity' (2009: 13). According to Martin, Lowland Scots suffered from a double feminisation in 'their relation to England' and 'their "coverture" under the Highlands' (2009: 13). If on the one hand, the cultural absorption of the Highland myth into British ideology did not threaten English masculinity thanks to England's 'secure supremacy within the union', on the other hand, 'Lowland manhood [did] not enjoy any comparable position of objective might from which it [could] safely use the Highland myth to meet its ideological needs' (Martin 2009: 84). In 'Wat o' the Cleuch', Hogg hence re-assumes such 'objective might' through the passionate eponymous protagonist, whose identity cannot be easily contained within his carnivalesque travesty:

"Hurra!" cried Wat, and onward flew  
Like fire-brand that outwings the view,  
And at Sir Guy he made a blow  
That fairly cleft that Knight in two;  
Then Walsinghame he turn'd upon,  
And pinn'd him through the shoulder-bone

---

<sup>156</sup> Samantha Webb, 'In-Appropriating the Literary: James Hogg's *Poetic Mirror* Parodies of Scott and Wordsworth', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 13 (2002), 16-35 (p. 27).

Against the pavement, and the while,  
 Half said, half sung, with grizly smile,  
 "Out, songster, with thy chorus true,  
 What think ye now of Wat o' the Cleuch?"  
 "Ah! ruffian, ah!—for shame! for shame!"  
 Were the last words of Walsinghame. (p. 112)

The series of heroic couplets are now, more conventionally, in iambic pentameters, as Hogg is conveying a serious message. Wat's disguise fails to turn his identity upside down, while the securing of his sword re-establishes both his male and national identity: a fictional event through which Hogg implies that Lowland Scottishness could not be absorbed into a dominating Englishness so easily, even if under the pretence of an overarching Britishness.

Both Wat's failed masquerade and his strong reaction to the English minstrel represent Hogg's deconstruction of the English ideology inherent in the stereotype of the money-obsessed Lowlander. A close analysis of the lexical level of 'Walsinghame's Song' shows that Wat's robberies in the Borders are motivated by a voracious, carnivorous hunger, a fact that raises a sympathetic laughter in the reader:

O heard ye never of Wat o' the Cleuch?  
 The lad that has worrying tikes enow,  
*Whose meat is the moss, and whose drink is the dew,*  
 And that's the cheer of Wat o' the Cleuch.  
 Wat o' the Cleuch! Wat o' the Cleuch!  
 Woe's my heart for Wat o' the Cleuch!

*Wat o' the Cleuch sat down to dine*  
*With two pint stoups of good red wine;*  
*But when he look'd they both were dry;*  
*O poverty parts good company!*  
 Wat o' the Cleuch! Wat o' the Cleuch!  
 O for a drink to Wat o' the Cleuch!

*Wat o' the Cleuch came down the Tine*  
*To woo a maid both gallant and fine;*  
*But as he came o'er by Dick o' the Side*  
*He smell'd the mutton and left the bride.*  
 Wat o' the Cleuch! Wat o' the Cleuch!

What think ye now of Wat O' the Cleuch?

*Wat o' the Cleuch came here to steal,  
He wanted milk, and he wanted veal;  
But ere he wan o'er the Beetleston brow  
He hough'd the calf and eated the cow!  
Wat o' the Cleuch! Wat o' the Cleuch!  
Well done, doughty Wat o' the Cleuch!*

[...]

*Wat o' the Cleuch kneel'd down to pray,  
He wist not what to do or to say;  
But he pray'd for beef, and he pray'd for bree,  
A two-hand spoon and a haggies to pree.  
Wat o' the Cleuch! Wat o' the Cleuch!  
That's the cheer for Wat o' the Cleuch!*

[...]

*But of all the wights in poor Scotland,  
That ever drew bow or Border brand,  
That ever drove English bullock or ewe,  
There never was thief like Wat o' the Cleuch.  
Wat o' the Cleuch! Wat o' the Cleuch!  
Down for ever with Wat o' the Cleuch!*  
(pp. 105-108, all emphases mine)

Once again, Hogg makes use of the anapaestic rhythm to enhance the comic effect of Wat's craving for meat: 'O heard ye never of Wat o' the Cleuch? | [...] Whose meat is the moss, and whose drink is the dew'. Behind the depiction of Wat's comical hunger, however, Hogg also communicates an important social critique. 'Walsinghame's Song' is in intertextual relation with Hogg's short story 'Marion's Jock', a tale that Hogg will later embed in *Perils of Man*, where Jock's uncontrollable hunger for meat symbolises the fierce exploitation of servants by their master. Ian Duncan—viewing all extreme human drives as tropes of an original urge, the need to fill one's mouth—regards Jock's voracious hunger as the result of a series of privations and his crimes as motivated by extreme poverty, since Jock kills a lamb

out of hunger and murders the lamb's vengeful owner to save his life. According to Duncan, through this story Hogg represents a great contest between nature (appetite) and law (property), as well as the paradox of a legal system which, instead of protecting human rights, defends the possessions of self-interested masters. This is why the reader sympathises with Jock, notwithstanding his insatiable hunger.<sup>157</sup> The craving for meat is a trope with which Hogg engages consistently in his *œuvre* when wishing to highlight the exploitation of the poor classes. Similarly to 'Marion's Jock', Wat o' the Cleuch's raids across the Scottish Borders are determined not by self-interested ends but, rather, by his human drive to survive in a poor world which has exacerbated his craving for meat, a symbol of wealth and prosperity.

Webb considers 'Wat of the Cleuch' 'a celebration of spontaneous physicality and moral ambiguity that is found in popular tradition' (2002: 25). Yet, Wat also functions as an honest representative of the margins, who indeed reacts with 'spontaneous physicality' to a mere instinct for survival, the extreme poverty that motivates his robberies. In comparison, the exploitation of the colonies by the Scottish Lowlanders of the higher classes was motivated more by greed. Though the poem is set more than a hundred years before the nineteenth century, it mirrors Hogg's socio-historical circumstances. At Hogg's time of writing, the Lowlanders of the the higher classes were, in fact, the ones who prospered in the imperial economy and who, perhaps for this reason in 1707, the time around which 'Wat o' the Cleuch' is set, had bribed the parliament to pass the articles of the Union with England. One of the prime reasons for the move to unification had been the collapse of the Darien

---

<sup>157</sup> Ian Duncan, 'Scott, Hogg, Orality and the Limits of Culture, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 8 (1997), 56-74.

Scheme, Scotland's failed attempt to found a colony on the Isthmus of Panama in the late 1690s. Poor planning, tropical diseases, lack of profitable achievement determined by the Spanish and English fear of Scotland's economic potential caused the failure of this enterprise, which ruined a great number of Scottish investors (Devine 2004 [2003]: 44-48, 250). Martin observes that the subsequent 'commercial successes of Scotland, as junior partner in the imperial economy [...] contributed to the long-existing notion that, in 1707, Scots had "sold" their own nation' (2009: 110). The Scots' economic competition with the English in the imperial enterprise stimulated the satirical representation of the rapacious Lowlander in the English popular culture. This caricature, however, did not represent the tragic reality of the Borders' peasantry, whom Hogg voiced through the carnivorous 'Wat o' the Cleuch'.

### ***Hunger and cannibalism in Hogg's Perils of Man***

One of the themes most discussed in twentieth-century criticism of Hogg's *Perils of Man* is the ubiquitous hunger with which the characters are constantly faced and which, according to W. G. Shepherd, functions as an overarching, unifying trope of Hogg's novel.<sup>158</sup> The chivalric contest between the Scots and the English for the conquest of the castle of Roxburgh in the name of love provides Hogg with a plot through which he is able to expose the negative effects of war on the lives of those who are subject to the power of a few self-regarding men. Sir Douglas engages in the conquest of Roxburgh castle—held by the English garrison—to gain Princess Margaret and upgrade his social status, while the Borderer Sir Ringan sends a delegation to Aikwood castle, abode of the potent wizard Michael Scott, seeking his

---

<sup>158</sup> W. G. Shepherd, 'Fat Flesh: The Poetic Theme of *The Three Perils of Man*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 3 (1992), 1-9.



advice about whether it is more convenient to help the Scottish Sir Douglas or the English Lord Musgrave in the conquest of Roxburgh. As shown in chapter one, the only lord who behaves ‘honourably’ in line with the chivalric code is Lord Musgrave, who kills himself rather than yielding Roxburgh to the Scots; while Sir Douglas and Sir Ringan mask their respective hunger for self-aggrandisement behind apparently chivalrous conduct.

Before publishing the novel, Hogg had named Sir Ringan ‘Sir Walter Scott of Rankleburn’. Judy King and Graham Tulloch in their recent Stirling/South Carolina edition of *Perils of Man* (2012) have reinserted Hogg’s earlier choice. In my analysis I keep ‘Sir Ringan’, as I refer to Douglas Gifford’s (1996) edition of Hogg’s novel, where he keeps Hogg’s second choice. The name ‘Sir Ringan’ for the Borderer Warden was adopted by Hogg under Walter Scott’s suggestion, who feared that the guardians of the juvenile 5<sup>th</sup> Duke of Buccleuch, whose father had provided Hogg with Yarrow’s farm free of rent for life, could feel offended by Hogg depicting one of his ancestors with such opportunistic traits.<sup>159</sup> King and Tulloch in their introduction to *Perils of Man* argue that

Hogg was claiming the right to define the meaning of the signifier Sir Walter Scott. Hogg clearly associated his fictional Border baron with his real life contemporary, as becomes obvious when he later describes Scott as ‘the very picture of an auld, gruff Border Baron’ [*Perils of Woman*, S/SC edn, 2012: 11] and again as ‘exactly what I concieve an old Border Baron to have been’ [*Anecdotes of Scott*, S/SC edn, 2004: 72]. Moreover the portrait of the fictional Sir Walter Scott, a hard-headed chief only concerned for the advancement of his clan, is very different from the way Scott would have seen himself, as a modern inheritor of the values of disinterested medieval chivalry. Hogg was loudly asserting the right to tell Scott’s story and to define Scott’s significance in ways that were quite different from those Scott would have chosen. By 1819 Hogg’s relationship with Scott had returned to a cordial one

---

<sup>159</sup> See Hogg’s letter to Walter Scott of 10 December 1821 (*Collected Letters*, vol. 2, ed. by Hughes and others, pp. 129-30) and the editorial note on p. 130.

after a rough patch in 1814 and 1815. However Hogg's relatively aggressive assertion of his rights may owe something to the aftermath of their earlier quarrel.<sup>160</sup>

As we have seen in the section of this chapter dedicated to 'Wat o' the Cleuch', Hogg argued with Scott when the latter did not provide his contribution for *The Poetic Mirror*; Hogg's use of Walter Scott's name for the Borderer Warden may have been his little revenge.

In *Perils of Man*, the castle of Roxburgh proves to be the site where the English suffer real hunger 'staring them in the face' (p. 443) and posing the threat of cannibalism for the reason that all provisions are being blocked by Sir Ringan's men. A similar trial is also faced by the delegation sent by Sir Ringan to the castle of Aikwood, as one of its members—the friar—has blown up with gunpowder the seneschal who held the keys of the castle, with the result that they all are left to perish from hunger as well. As the members have only two alternatives to survive, either to throw themselves from the walls of the castle or to remain and feed upon each other, the wizard Michael Scott proposes a tale-telling contest: the best storyteller will win the maid Delany, offered to the wizard by Sir Ringan as a reward for his prophecy, while the worst teller will become food for the others. One of the embedded tales is 'Marion's Jock', mentioned earlier in this chapter.

Shepherd claims that the threat of cannibalism menacing the characters in both Aikwood and Roxburgh castles suggests a vivid 'vision of creatures devouring each other' (1992: 3), thereby alluding to fighting and war; while Ian Duncan views it as a metaphor for disintegration—a place where domination of instinct and appetite converge (Duncan 1997: 56-74). Jason Marc Harris claims that the passages in

---

<sup>160</sup> See Judy King and Graham Tulloch, 'Introduction', in *The Three Perils of Man or War, Women, and Witchcraft: A Border Romance*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Judy King and Graham Tulloch (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2012), pp. xi-lxiii (pp. xv-xvi).

Hogg's novel dealing with food convey a social critique, and he sets the example of Sandy the fisherman who, finding meat in the river flowing upstream in the direction of Roxburgh castle, discovers the English garrison's trick for receiving provisions. Sandy starts stealing their food and, eventually, is discovered by the English and punished with death. Harris views this episode as representative of food as both a vital and lethal source of sustenance: meat in the water mirrors a world that has been turned upside-down and where the balance between life and death has been broken by the Border conflict. Harris also points out that witchcraft is a metaphor for the diabolic acquisition of power through opportunistic alliances, like the one between Sir Ringan and Michael Scott. However, Harris continues, in Hogg's novel war is even more dangerous than witchcraft since the Border conflict causes more deaths than does the compact between the devil and the wizard. When Michael Scott transforms Sir Ringan's warriors into oxen (who, so disguised, will later conquer the castle of Roxburgh), Hogg exposes the interests of selfish lords, suggesting that men 'are all potentially oxen to be slaughtered when ruled by feudalism'.<sup>161</sup>

Twentieth-century critics concerned with the trope of hunger in *Perils of Man* have mostly discussed Hogg's deconstruction of the chivalric code as represented, for instance, in Walter Scott's *Ivanhoe* (1819) (King and Tulloch 2012: xvii-xx); no scholar, however, appears to have engaged to any degree with Hogg's exploitation of this trope to prompt reflection on the devastations caused by the more recent Napoleonic Wars. Alker and Nelson have discussed the figure of the soldier in various Hogg texts (among them *Perils of Man*), arguing that while contemporary writers such as Wordsworth in *The Prelude* (1805) or Charlotte Smith in *Old Manor*

---

<sup>161</sup> Jason Mark Harris, 'National Borders, Contiguous Cultures, and Fantastic Folklore in Hogg's *The Three Perils of Man*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 14 (2003), 38-61 (p. 52).

*House* (1793) ‘mitigate’ ‘Britain’s complicity’ in the ‘brutality of war’, Hogg highlights instead how

[t]he nation permits—even encourages—him [the soldier] to use whatever means are necessary to secure the borders, and is therefore complicit in his acts and implicated in the violence that follows from them. [...] Hogg’s inclusion of martial violence in the British or Scottish consciousness is an important corrective for Scottish Enlightenment narratives of progress. By embracing painful elements of national history, Hogg opens up a space to consider precisely what a nation asks of its soldiers [...] when it sends them to war.<sup>162</sup>

Considering that Hogg viewed history as a cyclical phenomenon, rather than a progressive one, where wars are ‘originated in the evil and malevolent passions of our nature’ (1997 [1834]: 44) and then reiterated by the same logic through times, I propose that the never-satisfied hunger suffered by the Scots and the English in both castles of *Perils of Man* is a metaphor for ‘the thirst of military fame’ that ‘is never quenched’ (Hogg 1997 [1834]: 47). Through this literary expedient, Hogg conveys his critique of ‘the campaign of Buonaparte, and the slaughter of so many millions among the most civilised nations on the face of the earth’, as he claims in his essay ‘Soldiers’ (1997 [1834]: 41). Here Hogg observes that his generation may have been enjoying ‘a wider range of [...] intellectual improvement than our fathers did; yet we are no less destructive in fields of battle than they were, but have rather improved in our modes of general destruction’ (p. 46). The following analysis will show how in *Perils of Man* Hogg conveys this critique through the trope of hunger.

---

<sup>162</sup> Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson, “‘Ghastly in the Moonlight’: Wordsworth, Hogg and the Anguish of War”, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 15 (2004), 76-89, (pp. 77, 83, 86). In their article Alker and Nelson claim that Hogg ‘is fixated on the horror of warfare’ in the following texts: *Queen Hynde* (1824); *Tales of the Wars of Montrose* (1835); *The Three Perils of Woman* (1823); *The Three Perils of Man* (1822); ‘The Renowned Adventures of Basil Lee’ from *Winter Evening Tales* (1820); ‘The Adventures of Captain John Lochy’ from *Altrive Tales* (1832); and ‘a series of occasional poems’, among which ‘The Field of Waterloo’ in the second volume of his *Poetical Works* (1822).

The two banquets at the castle of Aikwood between the members of Sir Ringan's delegation and the wizard Michael Scott offer some of the most hilarious passages of Hogg's novel, thanks to a comical mixture of enchantment and hunger in what has been defined by Duncan as magic realism in its embryo (Duncan 2007: 194). In the first banquet,

*[t]he dishes of meat were [...] of good quality, and well mixed with fat and lean; yet none of them knew exactly what they were, neither would the sullen steward deign to give them the least information on that head. There was even one large shapeless piece, of a savour and consistence so peculiar that no one of them could tell whether it was flesh or fish. Still they continued their perseverance, devouring one dish after another, without any abatement of appetite on the one side or any exhilaration [sic] of spirits on the other, the steward always bringing in a supply with the most perfect equanimity. At length our yeomen began to look at one another. Their hands had waxed weary with cutting, and their jaws would scarcely any more perform their office. (p. 202, emphasis mine)*

In a parallel scene which shows a similar situation, Sir Ringan's men engage once again in a feast with the wizard (joined this time by the devil in person disguised as an abbot). But, as in the previous banquet, our yeomen's voracious hunger is never satisfied:

*There was great variety on the table of every kind of food, yet there was no one of our yeomen knew of what the greater part of the dishes consisted. [...] The feast went on, and the wine flowed; but, as on former occasion, the men ate without being satisfied. (p. 389, emphasis mine)*

The two parallel scenes, characterised by similar phrases allusive of Sir Ringan's warriors' ignorance of the origin of their food, occur at two crucial moments in the novel, signalling both the beginning and the end of the peril of witchcraft. The warriors' disinterest in questioning the source—as long as they can satisfy their voracious hunger—symbolises the blindness suffered by soldiers. This is a consequence of the ideological assumptions (in this case ethnic difference between the English and the Scots) behind which more powerful people, like Sir Ringan, hide

their selfish interests. Sir Ringan is the epitome of self-regarding lords who behave like those ‘princes and great men, who are the means of stirring up wars and commotions among their fellow-men’ and who are ‘generally [...] little sensible of the miseries that accompany the wars that they themselves have raised’ (Hogg 1997 [1834]: 40). Some years before the writing of Hogg’s novel, those ‘princes and great men’ had been responsible for the wasted lives of young soldiers in the Napoleonic Wars, whose negative consequences were still affecting the stability of Europe at the time when Hogg published *Perils of Man* (1822) and his essay ‘Soldiers’ (1834).

Indeed, Sir Ringan is responsible for the hunger suffered in both castles since his warriors are blocking the provisions sent by the English to Roxburgh, while the members of his delegation are held at the top of Aikwood castle. Sir Ringan’s ‘philosophy’ is revealed when the wizard Michael Scott provides his enigmatic interpretation of the prophecy of the old man whom Sir Ringan encounters at the beginning of the novel and who advises him to ‘[a]ct always in concert with the Douglasses, while they act in concert with the king your master [...] It is thus and thus alone, that you must rise and the Douglas fall’ (p. 9). Since in the old man’s vision the prophecy was in Michael Scott’s book of fate, Sir Ringan sends a delegation to Aikwood for a prediction; but rather than providing a clear interpretation, Michael Scott transforms Sir Ringan’s warriors into bulls which are then returned to human shape thanks to an antidote provided by the wizard himself. This carnivalesque transformation suggests Sir Ringan the ‘Trojan horse gambit’ (Shepherd 1992: 3), through which he will conquer Roxburgh disguising his men as cattle to ‘feed’ the English who are perishing there with famine. However, the

conquest of Roxburgh castle—and Sir Ringan's and Lord Douglas's self-aggrandisement—will cause an equal devastation of Scots and English warriors.

The 'editor' narratorial voice informs the reader that upon knowing the words of the mysterious prophecy in the book of fate, Sir Ringan does not seem to be worried about its truth or fulfilment, as his 'philosophy taught him to estimate facts and knowledge as he found them developed among mankind, *without enquiring too nicely into the spirit of their origin*' (p. 458, emphasis mine). Yet, the 'spirit' of such 'origin' is witchcraft, a metaphor for opportunistic alliances and source of the seemingly 'nourishing' food provided by the wizard in the two banquets which leave Sir Ringan's men's voracious hunger 'unquenched'. The hunger for power of self-interested individuals like Sir Ringan is shown to be inversely proportional to a real hunger suffered by those in less powerful positions who, blinded by the ideological assumptions of ethnicity and martial valour, and ignorant of the real purpose of the wars they fight for, are unleashed like 'dogs' ('Soldiers', p. 47) 'yelping and yowling' (*Perils of Man*, p. 340), in order to empower the magnificence of a few potent men ('Soldiers', p. 40). The Border conflict in Hogg's novel will prove to be a great source of destruction for both the English and the Scots, as the Napoleonic Wars had been shortly before Hogg's time of publication in 1822.

Ethnic ideology is at work on both sides (the English and the Scots) of *Perils of Man*'s subaltern warriors. The English in the castle of Roxburgh,

*with famine and pestilence both staring them in the face – [...] bound themselves by a new and fearful oath never to yield the fortress to the Scots while a man of them remained alive. Every new calamity acted but as a new spur to their resolution; and their food being again on the very eve of exhaustion, their whole concern was how to procure a new supply. Not that they valued their own lives or their own sufferings – these had for a good while been only a secondary consideration – but from the excruciating dread that they should die out, and the Scots attain possession of the fortress before Christmas.* (p. 443, emphases mine)

What comes to mind here is ‘the ill-natured sergeant’ in ‘Basil Lee’ discussed earlier in this chapter: the title character saves his life thanks to his cowardice; while the sergeant’s blind courage to defend the British flag causes his premature death. Similarly, in the above passage of *Perils of Man* Hogg describes the dynamics of a militaristic ideology of self-sacrifice nourished by ethnic assumptions which, by feeding the soldiers’ blind instinct of violence, also increases the power of a few privileged men. However, while the former are reduced to starvation and death—emphasised by Hogg’s personifications of ‘famine and pestilence both staring them in the face’ (p. 443)—the latter increase their personal gain.

‘[T]here will be mony o’ us throw away our lives to little purpose’ (p. 420), claims Will Laidlaw o’ Craik, one of Sir Ringan’s warriors, when reflecting upon the worth of disguising themselves as oxen to conquer the castle of Roxburgh. This subaltern, *heteroglot* voice anticipates the negative consequences of such disguise on both the English and the Scots, whose slaughter Hogg depicts through a vivid image:

The battle was then renewed by the light of the moon with greater fury than ever; they fought like baited bears, with *recklessness of life* and the *silence of death*. [...] When the day light arose, the English fought within a semicircular wall of mangled carcasses; for, grievous to relate, they were not corpses; yet *they were piled in a heap higher than a man’s height, which was moving with agonized life from top to bottom, and from the one end to the other*; for the men having all fallen by sword wounds, few of them were quite dead. (p. 454, emphases mine)

This image of a heap pulsing with dying men, ‘from top to bottom, and from the one end to the other’ (p. 454), evokes an impressively dramatic picture in the reader’s mind. In addition, it recalls another visual representation of wars’ destructiveness which Hogg quotes at the end of his essay ‘Soldiers’: ‘Let me conclude this rambling discourse by a quotation’, Hogg claims, ‘which I have always deemed powerful’:



The dreadful harass of the war is o'er,  
 And Slaughter, that, from yesternorn till even,  
 With giant steps passed striding o'er the field,  
 Besmeared and horrid with the blood of nations;  
 Now weary sits *among the mangled heaps*,  
 And slumber o'er her prey.<sup>163</sup>

Hogg implies that wars are vain and useless, as their negative consequences affect both winners and losers. Although the carnivalesque disguise of Sir Ringan's men as oxen puts an end to the skirmishes with the English, it also reveals that the warriors of both sides are mere tools in their lords' hands, and that they all end up in a mixed heap of carcasses, where 'recklessness of life' in the name of martial valour and ethnic difference is nullified by the 'silence of death'.

After their victory at Roxburgh, the Scots find themselves in a labyrinthine castle. Despite their strength and though 'armed' 'at all points to execute his [Sir Ringan's] commands' (p. 451), they are unable to work out the building's structure, as '[t]here were so many turnings and windings; so many doors and wickets; so many ascents and descents – that an army may have gained possession of the one end and yet have been kept out of the other for years' (p. 451). The symbolism for the cultural clash experienced by the Scottish colonisers at Hogg's time of publication is strong here: the imperial wars may have expanded the geographical extension of the British Empire, but conquering the soul and respect of the colonised must have been a different matter. In *Perils of Man* Hogg offers the vision of an inverted form of internal colonisation where the Scots play the colonisers over the English but whose core, likewise, is an unconquerable 'citadel' 'with gates and bars of its own'. Murray Pittock has recently devised the concept of 'fratriotism' to describe the relation

---

<sup>163</sup> Nicholas Rowe, *Tamerlane, a Tragedy*, II.1.1-6. See note on p. 131 of Hogg's *Lay Sermons*, ed. by Hughes; Hogg cites it on p. 47.

between Britain and the Empire during the Romantic period. He contends that fratritism is

a mindset which arises from conflicting loyalties generated by inclusion in a state which one does not fully identify, which takes two forms: the preservation of one's submerged national identity in the public realm in foreign countries, and the adoption of colonized nations and cultures as a means of expressing reservations concerning the nature and development of empire, of seeing oneself in the other. Fratritism was both the performance of nationality for export, and also its displacement into a reading of the other as the unachievable self: cultural alterity as a response to political defeat.<sup>164</sup>

Considering the cultural colonisation experienced by Scotland on the part of England at the time of Hogg's writing, the above passage from *Perils of Man* portrays a reversed notion of Pittock's fratritism. On the one hand, the imagery of the impregnable fortress exposes the cultural clash experienced by the Scottish ruling class in the exploitation of other countries behind an ideological mask of ethnic difference to conquer a colonial space which they did not fully understand. But on the other hand, Hogg's passage also describes the loss of national identity that the same Scottish ruling class must have experienced in their alliance with England. M. T. Devine contends that in the eighteenth century, the 'new wealth' derived from the imperial trade enriched the Scottish nobility, rendering its members 'a better catch in the British marriage market'; however, though

[m]arriage into the English élite promised more career opportunity and political influence for future generations [...] the Scottish patricians became anglicised. They were "strangers in their own lands, so much did they succumb to English politics, English manners, English culture and English spouses". (2004 [2003]: 350-51)

---

<sup>164</sup> See Murray Pittock, *Scottish and Irish Romanticism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), pp. 28-29.

Although Scotland's economic advantages brought by the political union with England were undeniable, Hogg's unconquerable castle describes the cultural cost that such union had involved.

When publishing *Perils of Man*, Hogg was also involved in the collection of his *Poetical Works* (1822), which he published in four volumes—the second of which has been recently edited by the Stirling and South Carolina Research Edition as *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems* (2008). Here Hogg conveys very explicit considerations about the shocking consequences of the Napoleonic Wars, specifically in *The Pilgrims of the Sun* (1815) and 'The Field of Waterloo' (1822). Considering their contemporaneous publication with *Perils of Man*, and the intertextual relations between the three works—supported by recurrent phrases and motifs representative of the soldiers' exploitation through the ideology of martial honour—I propose that *Perils of Man*'s enchanted world of 'chivalrous cannibalism' communicates the same reflections, though in a more implicit way.

*The Pilgrims of the Sun*, published for the first time 'by William Blackwood in Edinburgh in December 1814 and by John Murray in London in January 1815', was written soon after *Mador of the Moor* 'probably between mid-February and late July 1814', and was inspired by the success of Kilmeny's journey to the 'land of thought' in *The Queen's Wake* (1813).<sup>165</sup> Similarly, *The Pilgrims of the Sun* relates Mary Lee's dreamy 'long trance', through whose 'erratic pilgrimage'<sup>166</sup> in the worlds

---

<sup>165</sup> *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, in *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, written by James Hogg, ed. by the late Jill Rubenstein and completed by Gillian Hughes with Meiko O'Halloran (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), pp. 3-50; see the editorial note on p. 179. Quotations from Hogg's poem will be from this edition, and page references given within parentheses in the text.

<sup>166</sup> See Hogg's own 'Notes to *The Pilgrims of the Sun*', in *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, written by Hogg, ed. by Rubenstein and others (2008b), pp. 148-52 (p. 148); they first appeared in his *Poetical Works* in 1822.

around the sun, Hogg provides a pointed critique of his society.<sup>167</sup> As observed by Fiona Wilson, the visionary worlds that Mary Lee experiences are ‘possible versions’ of Hogg’s contemporary reality, where Mars, the planet devoted to war in the collective imagination, is the field of ‘eternal war, [...] much as Europe must have appeared after its recent battles’.<sup>168</sup> The following is the apocalyptic vision of the martial world that Mary Lee beholds in her enchanted dream:

Now oped a scene, before but dimly seen,  
*A world of pride, of havock, and of spleen;*  
 A world of scathed soil, and sultry air,  
 For industry and culture were not there;  
 The hamlets smoked in ashes on the plain,  
*The bones of men were bleaching in the rain,*  
*And, piled in thousands, on the trenched heath,*  
*Stood warriors bent on vengeance and on death.*  
 (ll. 239-46, p. 31, emphases mine)

While the second line recalls Hogg’s own critique of wars in ‘Soldiers’, as well as intertextually alluding to the Shakespearean trope of havoc and war, the last two lines recall language from Hogg’s same essay where, after a destructive battle, a personified ‘Slaughter [...] | Besmeared and horrid with the blood of nations; | Now weary sits *among the mangled heaps*’ (p. 47, emphasis mine). This quotation likewise suggests the pulsing image ‘of mangled carcasses’, ‘piled in a heap higher than a man’s height’ and ‘moving with agonized life from top to bottom, and from the one end to the other’, which Hogg describes in *Perils of Man* (p. 454). Here Hogg exposes the ruinous consequences of the transformation of Sir Ringan’s men into oxen through a vivid picture evocative of the cannibalistic act of ‘creatures

---

<sup>167</sup> Meiko O’Halloran, ‘“Circling the Pales of Heaven”: Hogg and Otherworld Journeys from Dante to Byron’, in *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, written by Hogg, ed. by Rubenstein and others, pp. lxxvii-ci.

<sup>168</sup> Fiona Wilson, ‘Hogg as Poet’, in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Duncan and Mack, pp. 96-104 (p. 101).

devouring each other' which, as Shepherd observes (1992: 3), is a metaphor for fighting and war and through which, I add, Hogg conveys the same criticism of the Napoleonic Wars as in *The Pilgrims of the Sun*.

Hogg wrote 'The Field of Waterloo' quite soon after the defeat of Napoleon on 18 June 1815 in the famous battle which concluded a twenty-year period of European wars with France—an event that 'sparked an explosion of celebrations in Scotland in which Hogg participated in various ways'.<sup>169</sup> Jill Rubenstein observes that Hogg must have been aware of 'the heavy losses sustained by Scottish regiments in the battle' (2008a: 213). Indeed, in a letter to Walter Scott of 16 November 1815 Hogg writes:

[S]ince ever I saw you and heard your enthusiastic sentiments about the great events of late taken place in the world and of our honour and glory as a nation lately won I have been busily engaged with a poem on Waterloo as a small tribute to our heros [sic] which I think not unbecomes every British Bard. (*Collected Letters*, vol. 1, p. 256)

Hogg's poem mirrors the effects of European macro-history's events upon a Borderer soldier from Yarrow who, before dying, engages in a dialogue with a Russian and a Prussian soldier, through which Hogg 'deconstructs military glory and undermines the widely-accepted ethic of sacrifice'.<sup>170</sup> Rubenstein claims that Hogg's failure to publish this poem in the aftermath of Waterloo was probably motivated by

---

<sup>169</sup> 'The Field of Waterloo', in *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, written by Hogg, ed. by Rubenstein and others (2008a), pp. 123-41; quotations from Hogg's poem will be from this edition, and page references given within parentheses in the text; see Jill Rubenstein, 'Editorial Notes to 'The Field of Waterloo'', in *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, written by Hogg, ed. by Rubenstein and others (2008a), pp. 212-21 (pp. 212-13); see also Gillian Hughes, 'James Hogg, and Edinburgh's Triumph over Napoleon', in *Scottish Studies Review*, 4.1 (Spring 2003), 98-111, where she argues that the celebrations held in Edinburgh after the defeat of Napoleon in 1815 prepared the ground for Scott's pageantry during the 1822 King's visit.

<sup>170</sup> Jill Rubenstein, 'Introduction', in *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, written by Hogg, ed. by Rubenstein and others (2008b), pp. xliv-lxxvi (p. xliv).

his questioning of the martial values so much endorsed by other contemporary poems (2008b: xlv).

Hogg's Borderer describes his experience of Waterloo as follows:

I saw it. But to me it seems  
 A train of long-past hideous dreams,  
 Of things half known, and half forgot,  
 I know not whether seen or not.  
 E'er since I bore the onset's shock,  
 And was involved in fire and smoke,  
*I've had no knowledge what hath been,  
 Nor thought, nor mind—a mere machine.*  
 I only viewed it as my meed,  
 To stand or fall, as heaven decreed;  
*For honour's cause to do my best,*  
 And to the Almighty leave the rest.  
*Blessed be his hand that swayed the fight  
 For mankind's and for freedom's right!*  
 (ll. 150-63, p. 127, emphases mine)

The words of the dying soldier convey a sense of loss and abandonment in a battlefield which, according to historical sources, 'took place on a wet uneven ground amidst confusion, deafening noise, and dense smoke' (Rubenstein 2008a: 216). This description is realistically conveyed by the Borderer soldier whose words recall the same state of confusion experienced by Basil Lee, the 'dragoon's horse', and the 'Yankee' who combat 'in desperate valour', with little awareness of the causes and consequences of the military campaign in which they engage ('Basil Lee', p. 31).

Rubenstein points out that at the time of the Napoleonic Wars, 'the chivalric model remained the accepted literary [...] paradigm for war', emptied of 'the brutal details of individual suffering' so as to convey the ideology of self-sacrifice (2008b: xlviii). Contrary to this contemporary vogue, in *The Pilgrims of the Sun* and 'The Field of Waterloo' Hogg dismisses the military institution 'as devoid of purpose and merely self-serving' (Rubenstein 2008b: xlv). In 'The Field of Waterloo' a soldier is

‘a mere machine’ (l. 157), while in *The Pilgrims of the Sun* ‘an abject fool! | A king’s, a tyrant’s, or a stateman’s tool!’ (ll. 323-24, p. 33). A parallel can thus be drawn with the Scots and the English chivalrous warriors in *Perils of Man*, who are destined to die for the consequences of arbitrary power. This is the direct result of a ‘blindfold levity’, nurtured by the ideology of self-sacrifice, which ‘directs’ a soldier’s military action, thereby rendering him a ‘licensed murderer that kills for pay!’, as Hogg had stated explicitly in *The Pilgrims of the Sun* some years earlier (ll. 327-28, p. 33), when critiquing more blatantly the negative consequences of the Napoleonic Wars. In so doing, however, Hogg was also deconstructing the potent stereotype of the Highland soldier, so pivotal in the militaristic discourse of the British Empire.

## CHAPTER THREE

### Questioning the Patriarchal Value of Women's Chastity

#### *The Scottish Kirk in the early nineteenth century*

Though in more recent centuries less of the population has been influenced by Christian morality and beliefs, religion has always played an important role in Scottish society—and it certainly did at the time of James Hogg. Literary criticism of Hogg's works must hence consider the impact that the religious discourse had upon his writing process, as the tenets of the Scottish Presbyterian Kirk, based upon Calvinism, undoubtedly influenced Hogg's choice of themes, tropes, and linguistic forms.

This chapter will thus investigate *how* and *why* Hogg, in some of his texts, exposed the ways in which the Kirk controlled women's sexuality and marriage in Scotland. In so doing, Hogg also revealed a different reality of women than the one depicted in the grand narrative of the national tale and the historical novel: he questioned the figure of the primary heroine, thus challenging the assumptions that shaped national and imperial ideologies. As shown in chapter one and two, emerging discourses of empire drew on the notions of sympathy and sensibility to articulate the politics of the marriage trope, in order to endorse the British union, as well as on Christian values to promote the image of the motherly heroine as national signifier. This chapter will show how Hogg crosses the boundaries of literary genres to articulate his own version of the marriage trope in the narrative poem, the drama, and the short story, by giving voice to female characters from a wider social scale than



the one usually depicted within the National Tale. To this end, the following discussion will engage in analyses based on the pragmatics of literary communication (Grice's maxims, politeness theory, social deixis, and Bakhtin's dialogics), shedding new light on Hogg's exposure of the economic relation between women's chastity, Christian values, and the British Empire.

The first part of this chapter will supply some historical context about the Scottish Kirk, illegitimate pregnancy, and the issue of infanticide in eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century Scotland so as to prepare the ground for the analysis of Hogg's following works and characters: *Mador of the Moor* (1816), *The Profligate Princes* (1817), 'Cousin Mattie' (1820), 'Maria's Tale', and the prostitute Bell Calvert in *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (1824). Contemporary reviewers condemned these texts, deeming Hogg's social origins and want of conventional studies as responsible for his dealing with such 'indelicate' female issues. Yet, this chapter will argue that that was a pretext to minimise the challenge that Hogg's writing posed to the ideology of the British Empire.

According to the Calvinist doctrines of Scottish Presbyterianism, man is sinful in principle and corrupted 'by the taint of original sin'.<sup>1</sup> Any form of good work is pointless for salvation, because God has already decreed who will be among the damned and the elect. Calvinism views justification as 'the attribution of righteousness by God, [...] by faith alone and [...] not linked to any action on the part of the justified' (Mitchison and Leneman 1998: 5). That is to say, the individual has neither merit nor virtue apart from that attributed by God himself, who has already chosen who will be part of the true church. Since in Hogg's time a

---

<sup>1</sup> Rosalind Mitchison and Leah Leneman, *Sexuality & Social Control: Scotland 1660-1780* (Oxford: Basil Blackwells, 1989), p. 16.

congregation's strict observance of moral discipline was considered as a sign of being part of the true church, its members were kept under the strictest control because the misbehaviour of a single individual could threaten the 'elect' status of the congregation as a whole.<sup>2</sup>

This particular brand of church discipline had been introduced during the 1560s through the Confession of Faith under the aegis of John Knox, the leading figure of the Scottish Protestant Reformation.<sup>3</sup> A congregation that did not punish breaches of rule threatened its 'elect' status and was likely to attract the wrath of God through famine, plagues, wars or rebellions, 'all signs of divine displeasure' (Mitchison and Leneman 1989: 18). Discipline was kept by a system of kirk sessions and 'testificats'. The former were special meetings held on a monthly basis by the minister and the elders of a parish, with the purpose of exerting strict moral supervision upon the members of the community. They dealt with cases of 'fornication, adultery, drunkenness, and Sabbath profanation', as well as with 'assault, theft and wife-beating', referring more serious offences to the local civil authority (Devine 2006b: 84).

The members of a parish were also controlled by a strict system of 'testificats', certificates of good conduct produced by the local minister, without which they could not move easily to another community and start a new life there. Pregnant women could not lose their identity in the anonymity of the city either because, as Leneman's and Mitchison's (1998: 1) later research has demonstrated,

---

<sup>2</sup> T. M. Devine, 'The Parish State', in *The Scottish Nation: 1700-2007*, written by T. M. Devine, (London: Penguin Books, 2006b), pp. 84-102.

<sup>3</sup> Callum G. Brown, 'Religion', in *Gender in Scottish History since 1700*, ed. by Abrams and others, pp. 84-110.

such system was effective not only in rural areas but also in the cities, thanks to an efficient network of parishes on which ministers could count to obtain information about any attempting to leave their communities. These practices highlight the profound influence of the Scottish Kirk on women's sexuality, compared to the English<sup>4</sup>—though there was a double standard, depending on social class. Kirk sessions dealt almost exclusively with sexual misbehaviour until 1860, while the abusive system of public repentance that the elders demanded of their parishioners lasted until 1800, when a line of demarcation between the civil and the religious spheres was drawn.

This strict moral supervision was mostly directed against women, particularly from the lower classes, to prevent pregnancy out of wedlock (Callum G. Brown 2006: 84-110). The social élite, the landowning class, and their servants could easily escape public repentance, and being humiliated before members of a lesser status, by writing a persuasive, contrite letter and donating a token payment to the poor fund (Devine 2006b: 87). Thus, inability to write, as well as inferior economic power, left peasant and servant women—often pregnant by their master or master's sons—more exposed to public shame (Mitchison and Leneman 1989: 75).

The cases of people who appeared before the congregation were mostly of those without property, both men and women. Interestingly, there are very few cases of upper-class women who were cited by the kirk sessions, and 'whether such women were more virtuous, better guarded, or less likely to be found out is a moot point' (Mitchison and Leneman 1989: 155). This is an important aspect to be

---

<sup>4</sup> R. W. Malcolmson, 'Infanticide in the Eighteenth Century', in *Crime in England 1555-1800*, ed. by J. S. Cockburn (London: Methuen, 1977), pp. 187-209 (p. 197).

considered in analyses of both Hogg's *Mador of the Moor* (1816) and *The Profligate Princes* (1817). The chastity of upper-class women represented an important financial value as 'property could be redistributed by their marriages'.<sup>5</sup> Christopher Smout points out that both middle- and upper-class women observed the strictest code of sexual morality before marriage, which was 'a contract by which property was transferred'.<sup>6</sup> To illustrate the significance of premarital chastity for a hereditary system regulated by the system of primogeniture, Smout quotes Dr Johnson who, considering the importance of women's chastity to society, claimed that '[u]pon that all the property in the world depends' (cited in Smout, 1980: 214). Indeed, an uncertain paternity meant that land and estates could be inherited by an illegitimate child, an issue which Hogg hints at through the figure of Rickleton in *Perils of Woman*, as shown in chapters one and two.

In this regard, peasant women enjoyed more freedom since, in their cases, a pregnancy out of wedlock did not threaten land ownership and, as observed by W. Cramond, having gone through public repentance, they would be considered purged from their sin and could even aspire to marry—as long as they were not promiscuous.<sup>7</sup> It must be argued, however, that though lower-class women did not transfer land and estates through marriage, an illegitimate pregnancy could cost them their work. At a social level where marriage was not an opportunity for all, their occupation was the only source of survival, as will be shown later in this chapter

---

<sup>5</sup> Rosalind Mitchison and Leah Leneman, *Girls in Trouble: Sexuality and Social Control in Rural Scotland 1660-1780*, rev. edn of *Sexuality & Social Control: Scotland 1660-1780*, first published by Blackwells in 1989 (Edinburgh: Scottish Cultural Press, 1998), p. 81.

<sup>6</sup> Christopher Smout, 'Aspects of Sexual Behaviour in Nineteenth-Century Scotland', in *Bastardy and its Comparative History: Studies in the History of Illegitimacy and Marital Non-Conformism in Britain, France, Germany, Sweden, North-America, Jamaica, and Japan*, ed. by P. Laslett and others (Harvard: Harvard University Press, 1980), pp. 192-216 (p. 214).

<sup>7</sup> W. Cramond, *Illegitimacy in Banffshire* (Banff, 1888), p. 49, cited in Mitchison and Leneman (1989), p. 236.

through analysis of Hogg's stories 'Cousin Mattie' and 'Maria's Tale'. The patriarchal value of women's chastity was hence important at all levels of the social scale.

Groups exempted from public repentance included the gentry, their servants, soldiers, vagrants who did not belong to any specific parish and, most importantly for the present discussion, those women considered promiscuous and, hence, not deserving of grace.<sup>8</sup> A woman alleged to be a prostitute was forced to leave the village and was sometimes physically disciplined by authority of the town council itself. Mitchison and Leneman report the following historical examples:

In February 1701, Rothesay session referred Anna McTimus, a relapse case, to the sheriff depute, who intended to keep her imprisoned and to have her head shaved in the public mercat (i.e. market) place. In one region, Caithness, the sessions themselves used physical sanctions. In March 1716, Christian Machugh, a trilapse case, was ordered by Wattin kirk session to be put in the 'jougs' (i.e. an iron collar) for half an hour before service, and later was ducked, shaved and exiled. Thurso kirk session also used the 'jougs' for several sabbaths on Jannet McKinla in October 1716 for 'notorious prophaneness'. In December 1701, the action there about Barbara McKean was even more drastic. She was to be 'convoyed from the pit by the executioner with a paper hat on her head to the stool, her head to be shaven by the hand of the hangman'. After that she was to be seen out of the town by the hangman and promised a ducking if she appeared again. Here the session made use of the town's officials for the physical treatment. In Wattin, in October 1704, Jean Guna was called 'a vile person unworthy of entertainment in a Christian society' and handed to the baillie for corporal punishment; and in Thurso, in March 1705 and April 1709, Elspeth Murray and Mary Sinclair were handed over to the magistrate for corporal punishment. What was expected was made explicit in October 1724 over Jannet Barrie: the magistrate was recommended to 'scourge her out of town' as a lewd woman. (Mitchison and Leneman 1989: 52, 223-24)

The Kirk showed a dual standard in its treatment of prostitutes since, though considering them 'beyond redemption', it did not take measures against 'well

---

<sup>8</sup> See T. M. Devine (2006b), 'The Parish State', pp. 84-102, (p. 87); Mitchison and Leneman, *Sexuality & Social Control*, p. 35; Leah Leneman and Rosalind Mitchison, 'Acquiescence in and Defiance of Church Discipline in Early-Modern Scotland', *Records of the Scottish Church History Society*, 25 (1993), 19-39, (p. 24).

organised and institutionalised sexual services for the upper classes'.<sup>9</sup> A young woman alleged to be promiscuous, forced to leave her village, and with no testificat to guarantee her good reputation had no chance of survival but through organised prostitution in the city.

In certain cases, sexual intercourse before marriage was practiced systematically among the peasant classes, in order to test both partners' fertility, for instance in the Lowlands, where 'the work unit was the family, not the single employee' (Smout 1980: 214). The couple would have to go through public repentance, however, for three weeks and were not allowed to baptise their child until they had satisfied this obligation. Although baptism was not considered to be 'necessary for salvation' (Mitchison and Leneman 1989: 33), it bore a strong social significance, as it was a sign of respectability. It also served the function of mitigating superstitious fears since '[u]nbaptized children were regarded as unlucky, and in north-east Scotland and the Borders they were seen as likely to haunt their parents' (Mitchison and Leneman 1989: 118). In *Mador of the Moor*, Hogg exploits this traditional belief to critique the Scottish Kirk's stigmatisation of children born out of wedlock.

Public repentance was not an easy matter. If found guilty, offenders had to pay a fine according to their means, and appear in front of the congregation for a number of Sundays, depending on the sin that they had committed.<sup>10</sup> This might vary: a minimum of three appearances for fornication, six for a relapse, twenty-six for adultery, and a year for incest (Devine 2006b: 88). A woman with child by a

---

<sup>9</sup> Leah Leneman and Rosalind Mitchison, *Sin in the City: Sexuality & Social Control in Urban Scotland 1660-1780* (Edinburgh: Scottish Cultural Press, 1998), p. 30.

<sup>10</sup> J. Stewart Brown, 'Religion and Society to c. 1900', in *The Oxford Handbook of Modern Scottish History*, ed. by T. M. Devine and J. Wormald (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), pp. 78-98 (p. 80).

married man who did not want to reveal his identity would have to go through this terrible humiliation alone and for different months, staying ‘at the pillory—a raised platform or a stool in front of the pulpit, clad in a cloak of sackcloth [...] to be admonished by the minister until he was satisfied of [her] penitence’, as Henry Grey Graham vividly depicts.<sup>11</sup> Apparently, these events were a source of great pleasure and spiritual pride for some members of the congregation, who smiled and smirked at their ‘neighbours in disgrace’ (Graham 1906: 322). Hogg himself, like Robert Burns, had to appear ‘with a red face on the Stool of Repentance’, as he fathered two daughters out of wedlock.<sup>12</sup>

### ***Public repentance and infanticide***

As shown by Leneman and Mitchison (1993: 19-39), the system of public repentance was mainly intended to limit extra-marital pregnancies and to control women’s sexuality. Unfortunately, in order to avoid standing before the session and ‘facing the disgrace and terrible ordeals of the Church’ (Graham 1901: 323), between 1700 and 1706 twenty-one unmarried girls committed child-murder and were subsequently hanged in Edinburgh (Graham 1901, note 2, p. 323). The lawyer Hugo Arnot in his *Collection of Criminal Trials in Scotland* (1785) writes that ‘four women, condemned to death for child murder on one day, declared that dread of the pillory was the cause of their crime’.<sup>13</sup> A letter to the *Scots Magazine* lamented public repentance as one of the possible causes of child-murdering in Scotland, arguing that

<sup>11</sup> Henry Grey Graham, ‘Religious and Ecclesiastical Life’, in *The Social Life of Scotland in the Eighteenth Century*, written by Henry Grey Graham (London: Black, 1906), pp. 267-392 (p. 321).

<sup>12</sup> See James Hogg, *Collected Letters*, vol. 1, ed. by Hughes and others, p. 314; Gillian Hughes, *James Hogg: A Life*, pp. 73-80; Gillian Hughes, ‘James Hogg and the ‘Bastard Brood’, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 11 (2000b), 56-68.

<sup>13</sup> Hugo Arnot, *Collection and Abridgement of Celebrated Criminal Trials in Scotland, 1536-1784* (Edinburgh, 1785), p. 350.

‘this inhuman practice does not proceed from any natural brutality in my country-women, but from be[ing] exposed on the repenting-stool, to the derision of their neighbours and acquaintance’.<sup>14</sup> Moreover, a refusal to repent publicly could lead to excommunication which, at a time when social life was primarily organised around religious events, would mean alienation from the community (J. Stewart Brown 2012: 93).

It must be argued, however, that the inexperience of those young women who concealed their pregnancies and who gave birth alone could involuntarily cause the death of their infants; this aspect, when questioned by the kirk session, was often used as a pretext by those women who did kill their children. This is why in 1690 the Scots parliament promulgated the Act Anent (concerning) Child Murder, a statute according to which any woman who concealed a pregnancy, called for no help at birth, and whose child was dead or missing was to be found guilty of child murder and hanged.<sup>15</sup> This Act lasted until 1809, when the death penalty was replaced by banning. Hogg may have hinted at this cruel edict, though never mentioning it, in his short story ‘Cousin Mattie’. Walter Scott, too, centres the plot of *The Heart of Midlothian* (1818) on this law, as will be explained later in this chapter.

Women could not escape easily to another village or to a city; without a testificat produced by the minister of the old parish, attesting their moral character, they could not aspire to a respectable job. There was another method of control through the midwives, who—before being allowed to practice—had to sign a commitment, in which they were obliged to disclose the presence of any woman who

---

<sup>14</sup> Anon. [An Anti-Papist], ‘Letter to the Author of the *Scots Magazine*’, *Scots Magazine*, 19, 9 February 1757, pp. 80-82 (pp. 80-81).

<sup>15</sup> Deborah A. Symonds, *Weep not for Me: Women, Ballads, and Infanticide in Early Modern Scotland* (University Park, Pennsylvania: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 1997), p. 5.



was a stranger and about to give birth. This system was abused by those who could afford to pay for the midwives' silence (Leneman and Mitchison 1993: 25-26). In the short story 'Maria's Tale', where a young servant from the countryside is made pregnant by her master's son, Hogg addresses the issue of out-of-wedlock pregnant women fleeing to the city in search of anonymity. Hogg, who published this tale for the first time in 1811 in his weekly magazine *The Spy*, was fiercely critiqued for its topic; nevertheless, he republished it unchanged in his 1820 collection *Winter Evening Tales*.<sup>16</sup> Hogg was unwilling to accommodate the bourgeois readers' sense of literary decorum and more interested instead in exposing the sexual exploitation of contemporary servant women by their masters.

Fundamental to the rationale that led a woman to commit infanticide were her 'sense of shame and [her] concern for reputation', as Malcolmson has shown (1977: 203). Though Malcolmson's research is related to child-murder in England, the dynamics he identifies may certainly be applied to Scotland as well. In England, infanticide was subject to the 1624 Act, likewise focused not on the actual killing, which was difficult to prove, but on concealment. Though active until 1803, this law was never enforced since in England '[I]nconcealment appears to have been more the norm than the exception', probably because its society was not influenced by the Calvinist strict rules against fornication. In the sixty-one cases analysed in the Old Bailey between 1730 and 1774, at least thirty-five involved servants; while, again, cases of infanticide by women of the higher classes were rare (Malcolmson 1977: 197, 192, 202).

---

<sup>16</sup> A comparison between the tale as it appeared in *The Spy* in 1811 under the title 'Affecting Narrative of a Country Girl—Reflections on the Evils of Seduction' and its later version in the 1820 collection *Winter Evening Tales* shows no changes of substance; see James Hogg, *The Spy*, ed. by Hughes, pp. 223-30; James Hogg, 'Maria's Tale, Written by Herself', in *Winter Evening Tales*, ed. by Duncan, pp. 151-58.

Malcolmson observes that a servant's financial security depended on her reputation, the loss of which could represent a catastrophe from social and economic points of view. Abandonment was not an easier option because servants were not allowed to leave the houses for which they worked of their own accord, and they could not risk the baby's cries (Malcolmson 1977: 205). It is not possible to estimate exactly how many children were killed in England; 'reliable statistics simply cannot be compiled' since the evidence existent is based upon 'reported cases', not 'actual instances' (Malcolmson 1977: 191). This assertion contradicts Leneman and Mitchison's (1989) thesis, according to which in England were committed more infanticides than in Scotland. When arguing against the statements in the Scottish press concerned with this issue,<sup>17</sup> Leneman and Mitchison hold that they were based on simple impressions rather than quantitative material, claiming that there were more cases of infanticide in England than in Scotland, even considering that 'Scotland has a considerable amount of wild hill country not susceptible of search' (1989: 213). Yet, it is impossible to prove by statistical evidence how many cases of child-murder were committed either in Scotland or in England and, hence, where they were more frequent. What can be observed, without any doubt, is that in England women did not have to repent publicly as in Scotland—and this fact may have made the difference.

Another social issue possibly related to Hogg, who married in his early fifties but who had previously fathered two daughters by two different women, is that marriage among the peasant class was restricted to those economically capable of owning a house and supporting a family (Mitchison and Leneman 1989: 1). These

---

<sup>17</sup> See the above-mentioned letter in the *Scots Magazine* of 1757, and also Anon. [A Country Elder], 'Letter to the Author of the *Scots Magazine*', *Scots Magazine*, 19, August 1757, pp. 401-02.

social rules, however, clashed with human sexual behaviour and its consequences, particularly at a time when the options for birth control were limited. Though the Scottish Kirk obliged a father to contribute towards his child-maintenance until the latter was grown enough to work, in certain cases an unwanted child may have represented another mouth to feed and a threat to a servant's working position. On this point, Deborah A. Symonds claims that the 'capitalist transformation of agriculture' had a huge impact upon 'rural women in eighteenth-century Scotland' (1997: 3). She observes that

the pressures created by population growth and emerging capitalist farming meant that an illegitimate birth could become a matter of life and death, threatening their reputations, their positions as servants, and ultimately their place in the village pecking order. (Symonds 1997: 2)

Some women never married and depended upon the generosity of a master for their entire lives. Traditional Scottish ballads of infanticide bluntly mirror the 'hardship of courtship and the difficulties of marriage', as well as the solutions women had at their disposal to tackle an unwished-for pregnancy out of wedlock (Symonds 1997: 3).

### ***A clash of discourses: Infanticide in the ballad and the novel***

Historical sources deal mostly with infanticide by unwed mothers, though E. A. Wrigley and J. D. Chambers 'have speculated on infanticide as a possible form of population control in early modern England' among married couples as well.<sup>18</sup> Child-murder could take the form of 'studied neglect during nursing' (Wrightson

---

<sup>18</sup> E. A. Wrigley, 'Family Limitation in Pre-Industrial England', *Economic History Review*, 2nd ser., 19 (1966), 82-109 (p. 105); J. D. Chambers, *Population, Economy and Society in Pre-Industrial England* (London: Oxford University Press, 1972), p. 78; both cited in Keith Wrightson, 'Infanticide in Earlier Seventeenth-Century England', *Local Population Studies*, 15 (1975), 10-22 (p. 10).

1975: 10), and unwanted children could be ‘abandoned [...] maltreated and frequently killed’, while abortion was generally avoided because it was ‘dangerous and often unsuccessful [...] and commonly required that a pregnant girl reveal her condition to at least one other person’ (Malcolmson 1977: 187-88). Generally strangulation, suffocation, drowning and exposure predominated over more violent methods, the latter usually committed by a mother whose mental state was temporarily disturbed (Wrightson 1975: 15). Therefore, in the seventeenth, eighteenth, and nineteenth centuries, at a time when abortion was not an alternative for dealing with single motherhood, child-murder seems to have been an option both in England and in Scotland. Symonds, for instance, affirms that in Scotland ‘between 1661 and 1821 some 347 women were indicted or investigated for murdering their children at birth, after attempting to hide their pregnancies’ (1997: 2).

Traditional culture engaged with this social issue in the ballads of infanticide as, for instance, in ‘The Cruel Mother’, which portrays very bluntly the variety of solutions to an out-of-wedlock pregnancy.<sup>19</sup> Jean R. Freedman observes that the Scottish ballads in particular depict a violent world ‘of murder and rape and revenge, of war and abduction and broken promises, of thwarted love and malicious cruelty’, which rearticulated and neutralised these conflicts by ‘changing them from reality to representation’.<sup>20</sup> David Atkinson notes that the ballads of infanticide, rather than being prescriptive, represented a healing process for a disturbing social issue, a cathartic cleansing at the disposal of the lower classes.<sup>21</sup>

---

<sup>19</sup> Francis James Child, *The English and Scottish Popular Ballads*, 5 vols (New York: The Folklore Press in Association with Pageant Book Company, 1957), vol. 1, p. 218, 20B.

<sup>20</sup> Jean R. Freedman, ‘With Child: Illegitimate Pregnancy in Scottish Traditional Ballads’, *Folklore Forum*, 24:1 (1991), 3-18 (p. 4).

<sup>21</sup> David Atkinson, ‘History, Symbol, and Meaning in “The Cruel Mother”’, *Folk Music Journal*, 6:3 (1992), 359-80 (p. 376).

Interestingly, there is a strand of these ballads in which the protagonists are upper-class women, for instance, ‘Mary Hamilton’ (Child 173), ‘Lamkin’ (Child 93), and ‘Lady Maisry’ (Child 65). The latter ballad, in particular, reflects the economic value of women’s chastity, as it portrays a struggle to control a woman’s sexual behaviour, whose choice of partner bears important consequences for her family (Freedman 1991: 13). Lady Maisry has rejected a series of Scottish dukes because she is in love with an English lord. Her pregnancy cannot be amended by marriage because such union ‘would simply mean that her dowry [...] would be in the control of the enemy’ (Freedman 1991: 13). The dialogue between Maisry and her brother well illustrates this point:

‘O pardon me, my brother dear,  
An the truth I’ll tell to thee;  
My bairn it is to Lord William,  
An he is betrothed to me.’

‘O coud na ye gotten dukes, or lords,  
Intill your ain country,  
That ye draw up wi an English dog,  
To bring this shame on me?’  
(Child 65A, vol. 2, p. 114)

Maisry’s family will condemn and kill her. Women’s value as a commodity is questioned by Hogg in *The Profligate Princes*, where Elenor—a woman from the upper class—is made pregnant and abandoned by Badenoch, a prince in disguise. Elenor’s father wants to punish his daughter for having threatened the family’s economic security by losing her chastity and by making it evident through her illegitimate pregnancy. Hogg touches the same theme in *Mador of the Moor*, drawing on ‘The Cruel Mother’ in the encounter between the protagonist Ila Moore—an unwed pregnant woman who decides to keep her child—and the Palmer, whose

previous lover Matilda, on the contrary, kills her baby in order to avoid threatening the economic value of her supposed chastity, as she has been promised in marriage to another wealthy man.

Folklore in Hogg's time depicted a very different woman from the delicate and motherly heroine of élite culture—the carrier of British values—as represented in the sentimental novel. The female protagonist of the ballad played an active role, though sometimes she might be victimised, as in 'Eppie Morrie' (Child 223), or depicted as being cruel, as in 'The Mother's Malison' (Child 216) (Freedman 1991: 8). Even so, the ballad heroine showed a freedom and autonomy unconceivable for a bourgeois lady in early-nineteenth century Scotland, which Hogg mirrors in the female protagonist of *Mador of the Moor*. Ila Moore takes actions and goes in search for her child's father, defying both human and supernatural powers, and hence proving to be in command of both her life and body. Hogg's character, like a ballad heroine, behaves counter to the norms of feminine manners as described in contemporary conduct books such as Scottish Dr John Gregory's *A Father's Legacy to His Daughters* (1781), where young women's self-control is urged 'as a means of protecting them from seduction' (cited in Symonds, 1997: 51).

When studying the impact of rural transformation upon peasant women in eighteenth-century Scotland, Symonds found at least fifty cases of women hanged for child-murder, many more trials, and hundreds of investigations. However, though this topic tended to reappear in the ballads, it was contained in more official discourses as '[b]etween 1762 and 1817, doctors, lawyers, jurors, and the writer Walter Scott all scrambled to unravel the dismal story that the court cases presented, by arguing that women did not really kill their children' (Symonds 1997: 8). The

possibility of infanticide is an important plot element in Scott's *The Heart of Midlothian* (1818) and George Eliot's *Adam Bede* (1859); they both, however, set their stories in a period previous to their own time of writing, thus diminishing the impact of their criticism on contemporary cases of child-murdering (Malcolmson 1977: 189). As observed by Symonds, Walter Scott in his novel re-adapted the true story of Isobell Walker (who in 1736 had committed infanticide in the small village of Cluden, near Dumfries) by 'blaming a vagabond' for her child's death (1997: 5, 9). Scott addressed the issues of infanticide and concealed pregnancy through Effie Deans, his own version of Isobell Walker, who would never kill her baby. He was more willing to convey a proper model of motherly woman, capable of deep feelings, not dangerous to the familial nucleus and thus a righteous representative of the Scottish nation.

Though some collectors of ballads published them with all their violence and sexual explicitness, they managed to use this form as a subtle ideological instrument of national symbolism. Scott himself, in his *Minstrelsy of the Scottish Border*, included 'Lady Anne' and 'The Cruel Mother' 'with no apologies for their sordid content', privileging the form 'as a vehicle of national cultural transmission'. This was a strategic exploitation of traditional lore since '[t]he antiquarians publish[ed] the various infanticide ballads [...] by dismissing them as examples of primitive practice and superstition'. In this way, bourgeois readers could still enjoy traditional ballads though maintaining a 'critical [...] historical distance from the violence of the primitive past'.<sup>22</sup> Hogg likewise set *Mador of the Moor* and *The Profligate Princes* in

---

<sup>22</sup> Ann Wierda Rowland, "'The fause nourice sang': Childhood, Child Murder, and the Formalism of the Scottish Ballad Revival", in *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism*, ed. by Davis, Duncan, and Sorensen, pp. 225-44 (pp. 226, 227, 240, 227).

the past, though he shaped their fictional worlds on contemporary religious and political issues—a fact that rendered these works highly controversial.

***Ila Moore: A queen at heart***

Hogg's outstanding imaginative power was fuelled by his traditional background of Scottish Border ballads, songs, and supernatural folk tales, of which his mother was a bearer, and which he re-articulated and exploited for his own critical purposes. In the narrative poem *Mador of the Moor* (1816), Hogg re-appropriates the tradition of ballads of infanticide, focusing on Ila Moore, a forsaken young woman from the 'woodland', the daughter of a tenant, who is seduced, abandoned, and made pregnant by the King of Scotland in disguise, and who has to endure the social stigmatisation of her condition. For this reason, she loses the opportunity to marry her betrothed—Albert of the Glen, her father's landlord—and, hence, the chance of advancing the position of her family on the social scale.

Contemporary English reviewers, though acknowledging Hogg's poetic power, were irritated by what may now be described as Hogg's apparent flouting of Grice's maxims of communication. The *Champion* received his use of the supernatural rather negatively. The *British Lady's Magazine* considered exaggerated and irrelevant to plot construction that '[a] whole band of courtiers [was] murdered for disrespect to fairies'; while the *Antijacobin Review* critiqued the passages in the Scots language, arguing that Hogg lacked 'the knowledge of what is pleasing to an English ear'.<sup>23</sup> However, Hogg's flouting of the maxim of quality by inserting the

---

<sup>23</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *Champion*, 9 June 1816, pp. 181-82 (p. 182); Anon., '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *British Lady's Magazine*, 4, October 1816, pp. 251-55 (p. 253); Anon., '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *Antijacobin Review*, 52, June 1817, pp. 328-35 (p. 329) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012].



supernatural dimension of the fairy plot, the maxim of relevance by the supposedly unnecessary murdering of the courtiers, and the maxim of manner by using obscure expressions in the pseudo-medieval Scots passages, have important implicatures.

Hogg exploited the supernatural motif of the fairies' abduction of illegitimate, unchristened babies to enhance Ila Moore's psychological torment in order to question the social stigmatisation of unmarried mothers and the strict morality of the Scottish Kirk: which would not christen children born out of wedlock if both parents had not gone through public repentance. In the first canto the King and his courtiers go hunting the deer in the forest. One night, the minstrel Gilbert of Sheil recites 'The Harper's Song' in ancient Scots, depicting traditional beliefs in the fairies' abduction of illegitimate children. The courtiers start deriding 'superstition's spell' and uttering 'words [...] unfitting bard to tell' (p. 27).<sup>24</sup> The fairies thus take revenge and

That night was done, by the supreme decree,  
A deed that story scarce may dare to own!  
By what unearthly hand, to all mankind unknown!  
At midnight, strange disturbing sounds awoke  
The drowsy slumberers on the tented heath. (p. 28)

The following morning the six courtiers are found horribly murdered:

With wonder, woe, and death so fully fraught!  
So far beyond the pale of bounded mortal thought!  
[...]  
Knight, page, and hound, lay scatter'd far around,  
Deform'd by many a stain, and deep unseemly wound. (p. 29)

Though the *British Lady's Magazine* (1816) considered the courtiers' murder not relevant to the development of the poem's plot, this violent episode emphasises the

---

<sup>24</sup> James Hogg, *Mador of the Moor*, ed. by James E. Barcus (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2005 [1816]), p. 27. Quotations from Hogg's poem will be from this edition, and page references given within parentheses in the text.

power of the fairies and, consequently, the protagonist's plight at having an unchristened child, thanks to the laws of men.

As argued by Douglas Gifford, Hogg's writing was characterised by a 'directness of expression' which at first attracted some patrons such as Walter Scott, only to embarrass them later for the indelicate issues he addressed.<sup>25</sup> Hogg's depiction of an unmarried, pregnant girl may have threatened the norms of politeness practiced among the Edinburgh literary élite, and contributed to the negative reception of *Mador of the Moor*. Hogg's female protagonist—based on the proactive heroine of Scottish ballads—was destined to clash with the discursive significance of the more submissive heroine of contemporary bourgeois literature. The *Scots Magazine* noted that '[t]he heroine is reduced [...] to too low a state of humiliation; an incident which, though suited to the ballad style, is not in harmony with a more elevated and regular composition'.<sup>26</sup> Conversely, the same strong female character is certainly more in line with the cognitive environment of a twentieth-century post-feminist reader, since it interrogates important issues that have been of paramount importance to women's struggles for gender parity.

According to James Barcus, through *Mador* Hogg enters into dialogue with Scott's *The Lady of the Lake* (1810)—as both poems begin with a deer hunt—in order 'to question the value system Scott espoused' and his 'elitist agenda', proposing instead 'a new social order in which forgiveness is practiced and innate

---

<sup>25</sup> Douglas Gifford, *James Hogg* (Edinburgh: The Ramsay Head Press, 1976), p. 23.

<sup>26</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *Scots Magazine*, 78, June 1816, pp. 448-51 (p. 449) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 14 April 2014].

goodness and nobility are recognized'.<sup>27</sup> Barcus notices that Hogg's *Mador* is likely to receive a more positive reception by a twentieth-century readership for its deconstruction of feminine and masculine stereotypes. He observes that if one considers 'the role that literature has played in reinforcing stereotypes', a text like *Mador* is innovative in depicting firstly a world replete with masculine values such as 'men obsessed with females as objects', 'a reduced and helpless woman; a callous nobleman; an enraged father; and a strong but conniving mother', only to interrogate later those very patriarchal values.<sup>28</sup> Yet, the *Literary Panorama*,<sup>29</sup> the *Antijacobin Review* (June 1817: 330), and the *Critical Review* seem to have inferred only the first layer of Hogg's message, as they judged his depiction of Ila's mother rather negatively, arguing that 'from his general reflections upon women dispersed in various parts of this work, he [Hogg] entertains no high admiration for the sex'.<sup>30</sup> These reviewers concur that Hogg then 'redeems himself in the daughter of this wrangling pair, who is described blooming as the flowers around her, pure as the dews in which they are bathed, and playful as the lamb that sports among them' (*Literary Panorama*, p. 734). These commentators welcomed Ila's description, as it was in line with the delicate heroine of the sentimental mode. They did not capture, however, Hogg's subtle use of the personality of Ila's mother, which has to be seen in intra-textual relation with the character of Ila's father. The latter is the '1990s' male figure which fascinates Barcus (1995; 2005) in his reading of *Mador*: a proto-

---

<sup>27</sup> James E. Barcus, 'Introduction', in *Mador of the Moor*, ed. by Barcus, pp. xi-xlii (pp. xxiv, xxvii, xxxvii).

<sup>28</sup> James E. Barcus, "'When Beauty Gives Command, All Mankind Must Obey!': Gender Roles in Hogg's *Mador of the Moor*", *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 6 (1995), 33-49 (pp. 35-36, 39).

<sup>29</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *Literary Panorama*, n.s., 4, August 1816, pp. 731-40 (p. 738).

<sup>30</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *Critical Review*, 5th ser., 4, August 1816, pp. 130-43 (p. 142) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012].

postmodern father, whom Hogg also revisits in the *The Profligate Princes* with Sir March and in *Perils of Man* with Gatty's father Daniel Bell (see later in this chapter). Such a figure, however, must have been too far ahead of its time when read in the context of early nineteenth-century Britain.

Negative reviews in Hogg's time, prompted by Hogg's flouting of the principles of literary communication and politeness, may have hidden a more disturbing threat, since Hogg failed to satisfy the early nineteenth-century bourgeois readers' expectations of propriety. The marriage between the peasant girl Ila Moore and the king of Scotland who, disguised as wandering minstrel, made her pregnant questioned the artificial comfort within the concept of union and stability by joining two people from extreme poles of the social scale. The national tale and the historical novel conventionally ended with the cross-national marriage of its upper- middle-class protagonists, whose union reinforced the extra-literary political alliance of the British Isles, from which, however, the margins were excluded. The marriage depicted in *Mador*, though achieving the unification of Highland and Lowland ethnicities, nullifies class hierarchies through the marriage between a Highland peasant girl and the King of Scotland. Moreover, a woman who challenges social stigmatisation by deciding to reveal her pregnancy and keep her child—contrary to the Palmer's upper-class lover who killed her baby—further questions the discourses of sensibility and motherhood as conveyed through the bourgeois heroine in the same novelistic genres. Josephine McDonagh observes that in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries,

the inclusion of child murder in a text is a moment of puncturing that deflates the even contours of meaning and narrative, and the chronology on which they depend. The historical memory borne by the figure of child murder therefore complicates the

conventional teleology of historical narrative, and opens the possibility of counter-histories that question the authority of conventional, progressive accounts.<sup>31</sup>

The following section will show that Hogg wished to convey a more complex ‘counter-history’ to the readers of his time and that the latter, being conditioned by the ideology of their historical position, fiercely rejected Hogg’s audaciousness.

The male protagonist of *Mador of the Moor*, the King of Scotland in disguise, is a conflation of two Scottish historical figures: the fourteenth-century King Robert II and the sixteenth-century James V, who lived before the Protestant Reformation. Nevertheless, the poem shows a strong influence of those Calvinist tenets that informed the Presbyterian religious discourse in Hogg’s time. In Hogg’s poem, the young Ila Moore, pregnant and forsaken, has endured public repentance, as shown in the following passage:

Sweet Ila Moore had borne the world’s revile  
With meekness, and with warm repentant tears;  
At church-anathemas she well could smile,  
And silent oft of faithless man she hears.  
But now a kind misjudging parent’s fears  
Opprest her heart—her father too would sigh  
O’er the unrighteous babe, whose early years  
Excluded were from saints’ society!  
Disown’d by God and man, an heathen he might die! (ll. 199-207, p. 56)

Having endured public penance, Ila Moore is a candidate for grace; however, she cannot baptise her child because the father still has to undergo the same process. In ‘Canto Fourth’, drawing upon the popular ballad ‘Tam Lin’ (Child 39)—‘set in the Ettrick valley’, where the protagonist Janet is pregnant out of wedlock—Hogg presents a brave heroine who does not bear passively her fate as an abandoned single mother and, ‘[w]ith robe of green, upfolded to her knee’, goes in search of her

---

<sup>31</sup> Josephine McDonagh, *Child Murder and British Culture, 1720-1900* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), p. 12.

lover.<sup>32</sup> Freedman observes that ‘Tam Lin’ is an ‘inversion ballad’ with a reversed Calvinist world where the protagonist, rather than facing public shame and accepting a life of poverty and marginalisation, is proactive and ‘controls the course of the story [where n]o brothers appear to condemn or to save her [...and] no fathers bar her way’ (1991: 10). Ila Moore, like Janet in ‘Tam Lin’, takes action in order to allow her child’s christening and to protect it from the fairies’ abduction.<sup>33</sup>

Reviewers’ criticism of Hogg’s use of the supernatural was rather sceptical. The *British Lady’s Magazine* claimed that the scene with the ‘fairies visibly and bodily attempting to seize a child [...] astounds our southern apprehensions’ (1816: 253). The *Antijacobin Review*, on the other hand, critiqued Hogg’s use of the Scots language arguing that: ‘we know nothing of [...] the uncouth jargon of the harpers’ and fairies’ songs [...] as there is no Glossary to which we can have recourse’ (1817: 329-30). The apparent lack of relevance in the courtiers’ murdering (mentioned earlier in this chapter), the depiction of a non-rationalised supernatural, and the unintelligible Scots passage of the fairies’ song implicate an important, indirect critique, which Hogg may have intended to convey to the readership of his time. By an apparently irrelevant violent event in the plot, the conflating of supernatural and ‘real’ worlds, and ‘code-switching’ from English into Scots, Hogg emphasised the magic power of the fairies in order to critique the Kirk’s strictness with illegitimate motherhood. The fairies’ supernatural force exhibited in the murder of the courtiers highlights Ila’s forsaken predicament at having an unchristened child. It exposes, too,

---

<sup>32</sup> James E. Barcus observes that this is an ‘echo of the ballad ‘Tam Lin’ (Child 39): ‘Janet has kilted her green kirtle | A little aboon her knee’, see *Mador of the Moor*, ed. by Barcus, editorial note on p. 119.

<sup>33</sup> See Barcus’s above-mentioned editorial note on p. 119, where he suggests the reading of Suzanne Gilbert, ‘Hogg’s “Kilmeny” and the Ballad of the Supernatural Abduction’, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 8 (1997), 42-55.

the flaws of Hogg's contemporary religious practices for not observing the Christian values of acceptance and forgiveness, and for not acknowledging that 'illegitimate children [...] were always primarily children' (Hughes 2000b: 66).

Though recognising Hogg's creative skills, contemporary reviewers preferred to dismiss the poem's value by resorting to his lack of official learning (*British Lady's Magazine* Oct 1816: 252). The *Critical Review* rejected Hogg's use of the Spenserian stanza which, at the time, was considered a very difficult and prestigious form, attempted by few poets, for instance Byron in his *Childe Harold's Pilgrimage* (1812).<sup>34</sup> The *Critical Review* writer argued that 'as a native of Scotland, probably not very well acquainted with our literature, he [Hogg] could not be supposed to possess that wide and perfect knowledge of the language which such a reduplication of sounds requires' (August 1816: 143). Yet Barcus claims that 'Hogg probably realised that his stanzaic pattern would provide him with a golden opportunity to raise the profile of folk culture, and to assert the potential worth of self-educated writers' (2005: xxxii). Hogg himself, in his 'Memoir of the Author's Life', claims that the Spenserian stanza is for *Mador*

the finest verse in the world [...] it rolls off with such majesty and grandeur. What an effect it will have in the description of mountains, cataracts, and storms!

I had also another motive for adopting it. I was fond of the Spenserian measure; but there was something in the best models that always offended my ear. It was owing to this. I thought it so formed, that every verse ought to be a structure of itself, resembling an arch, of which the two meeting rhymes in the middle should represent the key-stone, and on these all the strength and flow of the verse should rest. On beginning this poem, therefore, I had the vanity to believe that I was going to give the world a new specimen of this stanza in its proper harmony. It was under these feelings that my poem of "Mador of the Moor" was begun, and in a very short time completed. (2005 [1832]: 35)

---

<sup>34</sup> James E. Barcus, 'Introduction', in *Mador of the Moor*, ed. by Barcus, pp. xi-xlii (p. xxix); quoting David Hill Radcliffe, Barcus also observes that when such measure came into vogue between 1770 and 1833, a line of self-taught Scottish authors, such as James Beattie (1735-1803), writing Spenserian poems emerged; see David Hill Radcliffe, 'Crossing Borders: The Untutored Genius as Spenserian Poet', *John Clare Society Journal*, 22 (2003), 51-67, (p. 51), cited in Barcus's 'Introduction' to *Mador*, p. xxxi.

However, Hogg's ambitious poetic goal was received negatively: the *Eclectic Review* considered Hogg a fine writer as long as he limited himself to the ballad, but not so good when attempting more prestigious genres; while the *Monthly Review* judged Hogg's writing vulgar, lacking 'invention', and with a certain 'rudeness of versification'.<sup>35</sup>

The *Literary Panorama* published one of the most positive reviews of Hogg's poem, deeming Hogg's versification 'easy and polished', and the story 'told with a rapidity which carries the reader along with it' (August 1816: 731). This anonymous reviewer, contrary to his colleagues, praised particularly 'The Song of the Fairies', of which the following is an extract:

SING AYDEN! AYDEN! LILLELU!	
Bonnye bairne, we sing to you!	(Bonnye bairne = beautiful child)
Up to the Quhyte, and doune the Blak,	(Quhyte = white magic; Blak = black)
No ane leuer, no ane lak,	(leuer = gleam, ray; lak = flow)
No ane shado at our bak;	(shado = shadow; bak = back)
No ane stokyng, no ane schue,	
No ane bendit blever blue,	(blever blue = the Scottish blue-bell)
No ane traissel in the dewe!	(traissel = a track left by footsteps)
Bonnye bairn, we sing to you,	
AYDEN! AYDEN! LILLELU! &c.	
(ll. 324-34, p. 24) <sup>36</sup>	

Regarding this song 'in the mountain dialect of Scotland', the above-mentioned reviewer claimed that

<sup>35</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *Eclectic Review*, 2nd ser., 7, February 1817, pp. 174-79 (p. 175) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012]; Anon., '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *Monthly Review*, 81, December 1816, pp. 438-40 (p. 439) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012].

<sup>36</sup> Hogg wrote the 'Song of the Fairies' in what he called his 'ancient style', 'a combination of ballad phraseology, the rhetoric of late medieval Scottish "makars," such as Robert Henryson, and more modern idiomatic expression'; see Peter D. Garside, 'Introduction', in *A Queer Book*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Peter D. Garside (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1995), pp. xi-xxxvii (p. xxv). This song is contained in 'The Harper's Song' within Canto I, and '[un]like the rest of *Mador of the Moor*, [...] is not in Spenserian stanza'; see James E. Barcus, editorial note, in *Mador of the Moor*, ed. by Barcus, p. 104.



[it] must have been taught our poet by the fairies themselves: except by the Bard of Avon, never before were their characteristic offices and feelings so exquisitely expressed. Unfortunately, its beauties can only be guessed at by the “Southrons”; who will vainly endeavour to find out the meaning of such poetry. (*Literary Panorama* 1816: 731)

Among all contemporary critics, this is perhaps the one who came closest to inferring the critique that Hogg appears to communicate through the fairies’ unintelligible (at least to the English) magic language. The supernatural is meant to be uncanny, eerie, and mysterious; and in ‘The Song of the Fairies’ Hogg’s code-switch to medieval-sounding Scots conveys a sense of awe in relation to popular beliefs, with the narrative purpose of anticipating the plight that Ila will experience later in the story. In *Communicational Criticism*, Roger Sell argues that ‘ambiguity in literature can be wholly constructive [...and] a last stimulus to discussion’ (2011: 37). In Hogg’s poem, the final result of the fairies’ ambiguous language is that the supernatural is perceived as an entity which goes beyond the grasp of human comprehension, whose ‘beauties can only be guessed at’ and not always rationalised, as noticed by the above-mentioned reviewer. Barcus observes that this passage (contained in ‘The Harper’s Song’ of Canto I) was excised in the 1822 edition of Hogg’s *Poetical Works*, with the result that Hogg’s intentions have been greatly misunderstood and the poem ‘seriously weakened’ (2005: 105).

To highlight the protagonist’s emotional uneasiness, Hogg also draws upon contemporary Gothic tropes and phrases related to supernatural popular beliefs. When leaving her village in search of her child’s father and heading to Stirling castle, where she hopes to find him as a court’s minstrel, Ila meets a mysterious Palmer of whom she is wary, as she believes him to be an evil spirit who might kidnap her child. The stormy weather, the ‘darksome’ hut where the Palmer gives her shelter,

the cold hearth, the sound of carnivorous animals with ‘fiend-like eye and fetid breath’ (l. 100, p. 64), the fairies that looked ‘from every crevice of the wall’ (l. 172, p. 66) are all elements from popular beliefs, but also in line with the contemporary Gothic vogue, that highlight Ila’s frightening condition. In an ‘exophoric’<sup>37</sup> address to the reader, the narrator claims,

O ye, who mock religion’s faded sway,  
 And flout the mind that bows to Heaven’s decree,  
 Think of the fortitude of that fair May,  
 Her simple youth, in such a place to be,  
 In such a night, and in such company, —  
 With guest she ween’d not man of woman born,  
 A babe unblest upon her youthful knee!  
 Had she not cause to deem her case forlorn?  
 No! Trusting to her God, she calmly waited morn.  
 (ll. 136-44, p. 65)

This passage shows one of Hogg’s greatest senses of ‘ethics of address’, namely ‘a writer’s way of entering into human relationships’ (Sell 2011: 4, 6) with the readership of his time, as Hogg here attempts to negotiate the clash between popular tradition and Christian beliefs through Ila’s faith in God, which enables her to resist the strength of the fairies. In addition, Hogg also negotiates the clash between supernatural beliefs and post-Enlightenment rationality by arousing the readers’ sympathy towards Ila’s forlorn condition. Hogg achieves this purpose by deploying what Sell defines as ‘co-adaptional duality’, that is, by exploiting the ‘range of stylistic and formal options’ available to him, and reshaping them anew, which ‘experienced readers can come to recognize by its interesting and often pleasurable distinctiveness from everything which has gone before’ (2011: 183). Hogg’s

---

<sup>37</sup> In *Communicational Criticism*, Roger Sell distinguishes between ‘exophoric address’, when the narrative voice addresses directly a historically specific readership, and ‘endophoric address’, when a character addresses someone ‘within the world of the poem’ (2011: 366). I add that an endophoric address, too, is important for the pragmatics of literary communication between author and readers, as it may highlight some important aspects of the extra-literary world that the author wishes to critique.

contemporary critics, however, did not appear (or pretended not) to appreciate Hogg's skills at 'co-adaptation', because the pro-active behaviour of his unmarried female protagonist was interrogating ideological assumptions related to the discourses of sensibility and motherhood exploited by the British discourse to support the imperial enterprise. Namely, Hogg's alternative heroine questioned the political significance of social improvement through sympathy and moral sentiments with which British ideology invested the primary heroine, exposing instead the lucrative reasons of imperial expansion behind such discourses. Hogg conveys this point by comparing the reaction of two women of different social background to illegitimate motherhood, as is explained in the following section.

The encounter between Ila Moore and the Palmer has an important communicative function, as Hogg exploits it to 'compare notes'<sup>38</sup> with the bourgeois readers of his time about an important Scottish oral tradition: the ballads of infanticide. The Palmer is revealed to have fathered a child out of wedlock with a Lady of the upper class who, being promised in marriage to another Lord, killed her child to avoid both public shame and the loss of her chastity's economic value in the marital contract. An analysis of the stanzas where the Palmer delivers his story shows important intertextual relations with 'The Cruel Mother', an oral ballad very popular in nineteenth-century Scotland, of which the following is an extract:

She's taen out her little penknife,  
And twinnd the sweet babe o its life.

She's howket a grave by the light o the moon                      (howket = dug out)  
And there she's buried her sweet babe in.

As she was going to the church

---

<sup>38</sup> Roger D. Sell argues that sometimes '[l]iterary texts draw around themselves communities of addressees who do not experience themselves as receivers of a message, but who respond to what is basically an invitation to compare notes about something' (2011: 26).

She saw a sweet babe in the porch.

‘O sweet babe, and thou were mine,  
I wad cleed thee in the silk so fine.’

‘O mother dear, when I was thine,  
You did na prove to me sae kind.’<sup>39</sup>

Similarly, in *Mador of the Moor* the Palmer leads Matilda to church as ‘chiefest guest’ during her wedding; but as they are proceeding towards the altar, a row of children stop them, and Matilda starts an ‘endophoric’ address to one of them,

“‘Sweet babe,’ she simper’d, with affected mien,  
‘Thou art a lovely boy; if thou wert mine,  
I’d deck thee in the gold and diamonds sheen,  
And daily bathe thee in the rosy wine;

[...]

“‘O lady, of the proud unfeeling soul,  
’Tis not three little months since I was thine;  
And thou did’st deck me in the grave-cloth foul,  
And bathe me in the blood—that blood was mine!  
(ll. 304-15, pp. 69-70)

Although the anonymous reviewer of the *British Lady’s Magazine* felt ‘astounded’ by ‘[the] row of infant ghosts stopping a marriage procession, and one of them making a formal speech, like the head of a deputation’ (1816: 253), Hogg’s allusion to this ballad of infanticide carries an important message. As a group of these ballads depicts a ‘cruel mother’ from the upper class, Hogg’s use of this traditional motif functions to set Lady Matilda, who killed her illegitimate child, in ‘intra-textual’ relation with Ila Moore, a beautiful Highland girl from the peasant class who, on the contrary, chooses to keep her child and to endure public shame, though given the opportunity to advance her family’s social position by marrying her father’s landlord.

---

<sup>39</sup> Anon., ‘The Cruel Mother’ (Child 20B), in *The English and Scottish Popular Ballads*, ed. by Child, vol. 1, p. 220.

Hogg's comparison, however, may have questioned the maternal upper-class heroine depicted in contemporary fiction and, hence, contributed to the negative reception of his work. The Palmer himself claims, 'Fair dame, thy crime is purity to mine!' (l. 339, p. 70), and through this voice Hogg presents Ila Moore as a queen at heart, who—though only the daughter of a country tenant—well deserves to marry the king of Scotland, not for her beauty, but because she has accepted the consequences of her mistake instead of committing a crime.

In this poem, Hogg realises the wedding between a peasant girl and the king of Scotland by drawing on a series of traditional and social conventions. He exploits a folk motif of recognition, the ring that the King gave Ila, and the fact that the Scottish law accepted a form of marriage called *verba de futuro*, 'a promise of marriage in the future, followed by sexual intercourse' (Mitchison and Leneman 1989: 99). If a woman had been seduced with this subterfuge, she 'was entitled to damages for seduction'.<sup>40</sup> Certainly, such a union may have appeared rather extravagant to Hogg's contemporary readers, as in nineteenth-century Britain there was little social mobility, and 'a woman could not expect a man to marry her if she was not [...] his equal in rank' (Leneman 1999: 40). Nevertheless, in his poem Hogg has the Abbot of Dunfermline play a trick upon the King who, informed of the plight of a young girl, utters in front of the courtiers, '[T]he knight that so hath done | [s]hall reparation make, or quit the land' (ll. 174-75, p. 80). Upon knowing that the forlorn girl is his beloved Ila, the King feels morally obliged to marry her, and eventually abdicates, abandons the corrupted court, and lives as happily as ever with

---

<sup>40</sup> Leah Leneman, 'Seduction in Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth-Century Scotland', *The Scottish Historical Review* 78.1, no. 205 (April 1999), 39-59 (p. 39).

her in the Highlands. Though it is highly improbable that such a union could have been realised in the extra-literary world, through this marriage Hogg reveals that class division is a cultural construction, while real nobility lies in people's souls, redefining a more human society and an alternative Scotland, 'beyond the binarisms of British or class identities', as argued by McCracken-Flesher in her article on Hogg's *Perils of Man* (2009: 176).

In Hogg's new version of society, women have a prominent role, as Ila becomes not 'an appendage to a royal husband [but rather] a partner with her husband in a new environment outside the confines and hierarchy of the court' (Barcus 2005: xxxvii). Such a union, however, in addition to gender and social critical allusions, bears important class, ethnic, national, and imperial implications. Although it unites the Lowlands and the Highlands in a peaceful and promising Scotland, as required by the marriage plot, it joins two characters from extreme ends of the social ladder, thereby presenting a new version of this trope with a more socially dynamic depiction of Scottish national identity. At the level of imperial discourse, the marriage between Ila Moore and Mador further interrogates the bourgeois assumption of the virtuous heroine by giving credit to an unmarried mother of the peasant class who, despite the strict morality of the Scottish Kirk and the loss of her chastity's economic value, becomes the Queen of Scotland thanks to her more honourable heart.

### **The Profligate Princes *and the economic value of women's chastity***

Hogg's experimental attempt at writing for the theatre<sup>41</sup> was received rather unenthusiastically by his contemporary critics. Hoping to benefit from the recent success with his anonymous imitations of Romantic poets, in 1817 Hogg advertised his collection of *Dramatic Tales* as 'by the Author of "The Poetic Mirror."' Nevertheless, it received only one notice in the *Monthly Review*, which judged it as 'a poor school-boy's performance, —a coarse and unenlightened *commixture* of Allan Ramsay, Robert Burns, and Walter Scott, into an irregular fairy tale, dramatized and *colloquized* for the occasion'.<sup>42</sup> The present section will address one of Hogg's *Dramatic Tales*, *The Profligate Princes*, the plot of which focuses on a group of noblemen in disguise, wandering through the Scottish glens, with the double purpose of hunting the deer and 'the blooming mountain maids'.<sup>43</sup> Although Hogg's literary friends critiqued his breach of the Aristotelian unities of time, place, and action, Hogg's failure to 'co-adapt' his own individual literary taste to the aesthetic expectations of the readership of his time was not the only reason for inciting negative response. Hogg sets this tragedy at the time of Robert III;<sup>44</sup> yet the economic relation between virtue and seduction questions the moral authority of the

---

<sup>41</sup> In his 'Preface' to *The Hunting of Badlewe* (1813), a previous version of *The Profligate Princes* (1817), Hogg writes that he wished to have his tragedy

brought forward on one of the theatres of the metropolis; but on showing it to a few selected friends, who he knew could not be mistaken, he was persuaded that the innovations upon received custom were too palpable to be tolerated at once; and therefore determined not to *offer* it for representation, but, rather than risk the mortification of a refusal, or the still more painful one which every bad or perverse actor has the power of inflicting, to give it to the Public simply as it is, —*an experiment, and a first essay*. [1814b: viii, emphases original]

<sup>42</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *Dramatic Tales* by the Author of *The Poetic Mirror*', *Monthly Review*, 88, February 1819, pp. 183-85 (p. 183), emphasis original <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 25 June 2012]

<sup>43</sup> James Hogg, *The Profligate Princes*, in *Dramatic Tales*, 2 vols (Edinburgh: James Ballantyne, 1817), vol. 2, p. 4 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 2 August 2011]. Quotations from Hogg's play will be from this edition, and page references given within parentheses in the text.

<sup>44</sup> King Robert III of Scotland (1390-1406). He married Annabella Drummond in 1366/7 and was crowned in 1390.

male bourgeoisie over women's sexuality in the nineteenth century. In *The Profligate Princes*, the threat of rape to which the upper-class female characters are constantly exposed highlights the lucrative value of their purity—a commodity to be exchanged together with the dowry women brought with marriage, both in the fourteenth and in the nineteenth century.

*The Profligate Princes* had been written four years earlier in 1813, under the title of *The Hunting of Badlewe*, of which Hogg had only six copies printed for few 'selected literary friends' (*Collected Letters*, vol. 1, editorial note, p. 141). Their opinion, however, was not very favourable, as William Roscoe considered it 'unsuitable for representation on the stage' (*Collected Letters*, vol. 1, p. 172); while Walter Scott, though he 'had read it with pleasure, [...] pronounced that the plot was divided into too many characters and interests' (Hughes 2007: 120). Despite Hogg's friends' negative reception, Goldie published a few copies of *The Hunting of Badlewe* the following year in London (1814), 'to see how the public relished it'.<sup>45</sup> Hogg printed it under the pseudonym of J. H. Craig of Douglas in order to avoid, as he stated in a letter to Bernard Barton, 'the prejudices that poverty and want of education have to encounter in this important age' (*Collected Letters*, vol. 1, p. 140).

Hogg's tragedy, this time, attracted a more positive notice as in the North American *Analectic Magazine*, apparently a reprint from the *Scottish Review*, the author's style was compared to Shakespeare's:

This is indeed a most extraordinary production, in which the faults and the beauties are almost equally indications of no common-rate talents. The hitherto unknown author has marked out a path for himself with all the boldness at least, if not with all the originality, of Shakespeare. Those infringements of dramatic rules, or, in other words, those transgressions of probability and good taste, into which that master of the art was betrayed by ignorance, allured by indolence, or hurried by the fervours

---

<sup>45</sup> James Hogg, 'Memoirs of the Author's Life', in *Altrive Tales*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2005 [1832]), pp. 11-52, (p. 33).



of an impetuous imagination, the author seems to have adopted from choice; and whilst he flounders, in company with his great master, through all the fragments of broken unities, he certainly comes nearer to him in his most daring and unequalled flights than perhaps *any* modern poet.<sup>46</sup>

In the subsequent version of *The Profligate Princes*, Hogg took into account the suggestions of the *Analectic's* reviewer, removing 'the indelicacy and silliness' of the 'stupid enumeration of the mistresses of Badenoch' (p. 366), and published it anonymously in the volume *Dramatic Tales* (1817). Again, all plays incited little interest among contemporary critics, with the *Monthly Review* judging *The Profligate Princes* as 'undeserving of criticism in its design or execution' (February 1819: 185). Such a poor reception put an end to Hogg's dramatic career and his plays were never performed.

Both Hogg's literary friends and the *Monthly Review* agreed that the departure from the unity of action—besides showing a 'want of plan, character and incidents'—rendered Hogg's tragedy rather difficult for theatrical representation (February 1819: 183). And, indeed, the series of inter-connected subplots requires the reader's strictest attention. The main plot concerns Annabel Drummond, a noble by birth but impoverished young lady, who enjoys being courted by three Stuart princes in disguise as noble men of a lower rank 'hunting in the Scottish Borders': for the occasion they have assumed the names of Sir Ronald, Kilmorack, and Coucy. Only Sir Ronald, King Robert III in disguise, has honourable intentions, while Kilmorack's and Coucy's hidden purpose is to enjoy Annabel's beauty, either by seducing or raping her. When Annabel experiences an ambiguous dream about them,

---

<sup>46</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *The Hunting of Badlewe, A Dramatic Tale* [From the *Scottish Review*], *Analectic Magazine*, May 1815, pp. 353-67 (p. 353), emphasis original.

her father Lord Drummond, who is still attached to old superstitious beliefs, visits the powerful wizard Merlin seeking an interpretation of his daughter's vision.

Badenoch is another profligate prince of the same group, whose intention is to seduce Matilda, Lord Crawford's wife, having tired of his current mistress Elenor, daughter of the Earl of March, who is in his train disguised as a page and pregnant by him. Elenor escapes from Badenoch's entourage and is helped by a shepherd, who meets her father and convinces him to forgive her. Badenoch, however, kills Elenor's father when the latter demands him to marry his daughter. Badenoch is then killed by Lord Crawford, Matilda's husband, in an act of revenge, as he wrongly believes him to be involved in a liaison with his wife.

The plot is rather intricate, and William Roscoe claimed that 'though containing some fine scenes, [it] does not "form a perfect whole."' Although a tragedy may admit of episodes "yet they sho[uld] all contribute to the illustration of the principal object".<sup>47</sup> In his preface to *The Hunting of Badlewe*, Hogg justified his departure from the unity of action by arguing that a chain of connected events affords more opportunities of representing the subtleties of human nature since, 'arising out of one another, [they] afford infinitely more scope and chance of success to the poet,—more opportunities to the actor, of displaying his powers in the representation of nature, and more interest and delight, whether to spectators or readers (1814b: vii).' However, in an unpublished review for the London weekly newspaper *The Champion*, written by himself, Hogg would later acknowledge that '[t]he plot is too long and diffuse [...] bold, erratic, ill conceived, and carelessly executed'.<sup>48</sup> And,

---

<sup>47</sup> Cited in an editorial note to a Hogg letter, *Collected Letters*, ed. by Hughes and others, vol. 1, p. 173.

<sup>48</sup> J. H. Craig Esq<sup>r</sup>. [James Hogg], '[Review of] The Hunting of Badlewe', draft copy for the London weekly newspaper *The Champion*, identified by Gillian Hughes; it survives in the Beinecke Rare

probably, as argued by Meiko O' Halloran in her essay 'Hogg and the Theatre', 'Hogg's use of multiple plots restricts the psychological development of the characters, leaving little room for the audience to enter into their feelings' (2012: 110).

This, however, was not the only reason that motivated the bad reception of Hogg's drama. Shakespeare was not an accurate observer of the Aristotelian unities; however, this aspect did not limit the revival of his plays during the Romantic period. Hogg himself, having drawn rather heavily on Shakespeare for his tragedy—as O' Halloran (2012) has accurately shown—was rather surprised, claiming in a letter to the editor of *The Scotsman* that the complete failure of *The Dramatic Tales* had 'more astonished me than all I have ever witnessed in my short literary experience' (*Collected Letters*, vol. 1, p. 351). I argue that Hogg was exposing more crucial issues and, hence, questioning the contemporary values and assumptions of the Northern British Empire.

In *The Profligate Princes*, Hogg portrays a dying aristocracy, some of them impoverished—like Lord Drummond, retaining only a noble title and incapable of making the transition to the modern world. Self-made men have now the economic power to buy Lord Drummond's title by marrying his daughter; this is why Annabel's chastity needs protection. Hogg also depicts a rich Lord Crawford, who has married the attractive though impoverished Matilda without a dowry. Notwithstanding his prodigious economic power, Crawford's extreme jealousy of his wife exposes his moral weakness, his deep attachment to physical beauty (a

---

Books and Manuscript Library, Yale University: James Hogg Collection GEN MSS 61, Box I, Folder 23; it has never been published. Hogg's Manuscript was sent to the editor of *The Champion*, John Scott, in a letter of 28 February 1816 (James Hogg, *Collected Letters*, ed. by Hughes and others, vol. 1, pp. 268-70) I thank Robin MacLachlan for this information and The Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library for permission to cite the manuscript in their care.

patriarchal value) and his inadequate awareness of the beauty of Matilda's soul. Hogg then presents Elenor, daughter of the Earl of March, who has defied the law of her father eloping with her lover Badenoch, by whom she is later raped and made pregnant. Finally, a shepherd—a subaltern voice—is presented as the only character upholding the morality of the play, endowed with a nobler sense of justice than the revengeful Crawford: he advises Sir March, Elenor's father, to forgive and accept his injured daughter—a 'trodden flower' deserving pity. Not only does Hogg show a shepherd asking a father to forgive an unmarried, pregnant daughter, but he also depicts a 'fallen woman' of the upper class. Hogg's work could not be accepted by the bourgeoisie of his time, as their values were not that different from the ones critiqued in Hogg's tragedy.

Recent studies on oral conversation concerned with the principles of politeness illuminate the pragmatics of literary communication between Hogg and the readership of his time, and reveal why Hogg's tragedy was received unenthusiastically at the time of its first publication.<sup>49</sup> The fictional act of a shepherd requesting a father to forgive his erring daughter was viewed as threatening both the positive and negative face of the bourgeoisie of Hogg's time. Irreverence and negative criticism threaten the hearer's positive face and interrogate the validity of his or her social status; while requests and orders—limiting the addressee's freedom of action—threaten the hearer's negative face. In the specific case of theatrical performance, communication happens at two simultaneous levels: between

---

<sup>49</sup> See Brown and Levinson, *Politeness: Some Universals in Language Usage*; for a discussion of politeness applied to literary texts see Roger D. Sell, *Literature as Communication*, pp. 207-30; and, by the same author, 'The Politeness of Literary Texts', in *Literary Pragmatics*, ed. by Sell (1991b), pp. 208-24.

characters; and between the playwright and the audience by means of the characters' dialogues and action. A request within Hogg's play by a member of the lower class to forgive a pregnant daughter limits Sir March's freedom to re-establish the patriarchal order and to punish Elenor, whom he considers 'the shame of maidhood and nobility' (p. 69). The shepherd's fictional request to Sir March also questions the patriarchal authority in the real world outwith the play. At the level of communication with his readership (and future possible audiences, if the play had been received more enthusiastically), Hogg was probably perceived as questioning the ideological assumptions of the male bourgeoisie of his time as well as their economic interests in the value of women's chastity, thereby exposing the relation between money and marriage. At the level of nineteenth-century discourses of empire, Hogg's questioning of such economic relations threatened the ideology of bourgeois marriage promoted in the *National Tale*, where the unquestioned union between the protagonists alluded to the wealthy alliance between the British nations, though hiding the fact that the flourishing of such union derived from the exploitation of the colonies.

In Hogg's Calvinist Scotland, a woman in Elenor's condition had to face public repentance. Hogg's wish to convey his own class values of forgiveness and acceptance to the bourgeoisie of his time was destined to fail, however. Mitchison and Leneman have shown that very few women of high status repented publicly (1989: 155). Although risking her position as servant through an illegitimate pregnancy, a peasant woman was not responsible for the economic alliances between families and enjoyed far more freedom from the norms of bourgeois delicacy.

A comparison between *The Hunting of Badlewe* and *The Profligate Princes* shows Hogg's awareness of the issues he was interrogating. In the later edition of Hogg's drama, the dialogue between Kilmorack and the old courtier Glen-Garnet is excised of any hints at pregnancy out of wedlock and 'grace of true repentance'—signs of the influence of Calvinism on Hogg's play. Robin MacLachlan's research on the forthcoming Stirling / South Carolina edition of *Dramatic Tales* has shown that the changes of substance in *The Profligate Princes* are 'generally of a kind that suggests that Hogg has been involved', and this is '[i]n part [...] supported by the absence of any comments from Hogg that the cuts and rewriting were done without his knowledge or involvement'.<sup>50</sup> In *The Hunting of Badlewe* Glen-Garnet rebukes Kilmorack quite harshly for his profligate behaviour:

Gar. Hence, scoffer with thy jargon: *Now I guess  
The drift of all this deft dissemblage,—vice!*  
Kil. *Call't not by name so hard; say love, Glen-  
Garnet.*  
Gar. *Heaven bar such love! Poor girls, they little  
ween  
What gins lie hid around them!—From the hall,  
The steading, and the cot, constant they look  
To see the green-coat hunter's stately form;  
Their fair blue eyes, like morning's softest beam,  
And ruddy lips, opening in cherub smile,  
Courting their own destruction!—I do fear  
This wicked hunt will teach too many a maid  
The grace of true repentance; and the art  
To sing the sob-broke lullaby full sweet  
O'er mid-day cradle!—Fie upon it! Now  
That I perceive your drift, I'll home again.*<sup>51</sup>

---

<sup>50</sup> I must thank Robin MacLachlan for his generous help and guidance on this point; MacLachlan's comments come from an email exchange dated 3 May 2012.

<sup>51</sup> James Hogg [J.H. Craig of Douglas Esq.], *The Hunting of Badlewe: A Dramatic Tale* (London: Colburn, 1814a), p. 3, emphases mine.

This long rebuke in the later version of *The Profligate Princes* is softened by omitting two long sections that address directly the issue of pregnancy out of wedlock. The first emphasised part from ‘Now I guess’ to ‘What gins lie hid around them!’ is bowdlerised into the innocuous sentence ‘true it is I like these country maidens’ (*The Profligate Princes*, p. 5); while the second highlighted part from ‘Courting their own destruction!’ to the end is reduced to the innocuous clause ‘[c]ourting in simplest guise the words of love’ (p. 5). These omissions show Hogg’s willingness to negotiate his own individual perspective with the ideological assumptions of the readership of his time, perhaps to achieve a more enthusiastic literary recognition of his newly edited play.

There are plentiful intertextual relations with other Hogg texts, and the most obvious—particularly for the theme of disguised princes—is the one with *Mador of the Moor*. Since both texts were written in the same period, seeing them in dialogue with each other may be illuminating, as also in *Mador* Hogg develops the theme of father forgiving a lost daughter. In *The Profligate Princes*, the Shepherd tells Sir March,

Could you endure to see that innocent  
Vilely betray’d, disgraced, and then thrown out  
Derisive on a cold injurious world?  
Could you bear this, sir? —For my part I cannot;  
No, and I will not bear it. (p. 66)

Sir March will later accept Elenor’s pregnancy, claiming, ‘Thou art my daughter still!’ (p. 70). In *Mador*, also Ila Moore’s father forgives his daughter, using a similar address:

My child is still my own, and shall not tell  
At Heaven’s high bar, that I, her only shield,  
For blame that was not hers, expell’d her to the field. (ll. 97-99, p. 53)

This is also what Daniel Bell will argue some years later in *Perils of Woman* (1823) when, presuming Gatty with child, he claims, ‘What can a father do, but forgie his erring bairn?’ (p. 118). Concerning *Mador of the Moor*, James Barcus observes that Hogg promotes ‘a kind of fatherhood which has not been praised until the last half of the twentieth century’ (1995: 45). Hogg communicates this intention by endorsing Ila’s father’s acceptance of his daughter’s pregnancy, and by having him choose poverty instead of repudiating her. In the same poem, as seen earlier in this chapter, Hogg sets Ila’s case in intra-textual relation with the episode of the Palmer, who fathered a child out of wedlock with a Lady of the upper class who, having been promised in marriage to another Lord, killed her baby to avoid public shame. In *Mador*, Hogg shows what may happen when a daughter is not forgiven for having disappointed her family’s economic alliances—which, perhaps, is what Elenor in *The Profligate Princes* might have done if a shepherd had not provided his advice to her revengeful father.

Yet, in his play Hogg also exhibits a wish to espouse the Christian values exploited by the discourse of bourgeois delicacy—though not for the same economic reasons. He does so by relating Elenor, an erring daughter, to Annabel Drummond, the impoverished aristocratic young maid, who resists Kilmorack’s advances thanks to her Christian values. When asked to elope with him, she replies to Kilmorack,

Hold, my good lord, a while;  
 Let me deliberate calmly on this act:  
 Short conference with my own heart will serve.—  
 Fair candid maid,—can thou, in time to come,  
 Answer, with open truth and stedfast look,  
 To prudence, virtue, parents, and the world,  
 For this?—Not one:—No; not to one of them! (p. 107)



The duality exhibited in Annabel's monologue illustrates an example of Bakhtinian 'super-addressee', the same literary phenomenon discussed in chapter one when in *Perils of Woman* Gatty addresses herself in front of the mirror to evaluate her love for M'Ion. The judging entity that Annabel is interrogating here represents an external authority which, likewise, she has internalised and which she is addressing to assess socially her personal circumstance.<sup>52</sup>

The reasons why here Hogg complies with a bourgeois value of his time are various. Lord Drummond, who defines himself as an 'ancient oak' (p. 39)—a symbol of the dying aristocracy in Hogg's time—shows an economic interest in his daughter's purity, whom he addresses as '[a] slender stem | [...] should that too fall or fade, | [f]arewell to every hope beneath high heaven' (p. 40). Lady Drummond, similarly to Ila Moore's mother in *Mador of the Moor*, is also a scheming woman, interested in the economic value of her daughter, to whom she gives wrong guidance, advising her to yield to Kilmorack's amorous advances. This shows, as Barcus indicates in his reading of *Mador*, that often 'mothers participate in and are party to the [...] seduction of their daughters [by...] teach[ing them] to acquiesce in a subservient role' (1995: 42), hence reinforcing—rather than questioning—patriarchal assumptions. Annabel, on the other hand, proves to have internalised the Christian values of women's delicacy, one of the most important assumptions of early nineteenth-century bourgeois discourse, for more honest reasons. She does not trust her 'inexperienced heart' with lord Kilmorack and, contrary to her mother's advice, chooses the apparently poorer Sir Ronald, who will reveal himself to be King Robert

---

<sup>52</sup> For a discussion of this literary phenomenon see Jacob L. Mey, *When Voices Clash*, pp. 283-86.

III in disguise and will marry Annabel, making her a queen because ‘[f]or love, and not for state, thou wedded’st me; | [t]herefore I love you and value thee more’ (p. 187).

Annabel’s father, Lord Drummond, represents the old Scottish pre-Enlightenment world and its superstitious beliefs. Though a sorcerer himself, he craves for more supernatural expertise and thus resorts to the mighty wizard Merlin, whom he finds in his cave, sleeping over the book of fate. Merlin’s cave symbolises the ancient, traditional, and superstitious world, fuelled by his magic book—a symbol of knowledge and power—which the wizard is not able to control any longer because history has reached a modern phase and the book’s values have become untenable. Lord Drummond steals Merlin’s book with the hope of re-establishing his authority and the old system of values; but, again, he does not have the expertise to manage its power. Lord Drummond will abandon the book, as the old aristocracy with its superstitious values has to give way to the new Enlightenment phase of history. The book will be found by Merlin and Lord Crawford, Matilda’s jealous husband who, likewise, went to Merlin’s cave to know the future of his marriage. Merlin’s prophecy will help Lord Crawford to acknowledge the beauty of Matilda’s soul, but wizard and book will shatter and vanish forever. Hogg hence concludes his tragedy negotiating, in perfect tension, the values of the ancient traditional world, which still have some moral lessons to teach, with the new post-Enlightenment phase of his actual time of writing, of which he gives a glimpse in Annabel’s dream. Here Hogg shows the process of fusion between upper and middle classes, as well as the emerging British Empire as, in her vision, Annabel (who will become a queen of the Stuart line) travels to ‘future ages’, where she sees

Our progeny extended in a line  
 Farther than the eye could reach; and still they grew  
 In grandeur and in glory, till at last  
 Their branchy curving horns hoop'd the wide world.' (p. 38)

It may hence be argued that the *Monthly Review* was rather unfair when viewing *Dramatic Tales*—and *The Profligate Princes* in particular—as ‘a poor school-boy’s performance’, and a ‘coarse and unenlightened [...] irregular fairy tale’ (February 1819: 183). Hogg makes a subtle use of traditional beliefs, as he reconciles supernatural folklore with contemporary post-Enlightenment rational demands by distancing his tragedy in another age. He also depicts a more honest delicacy, questioning the bourgeoisie’s exploitation of this Christian value for economic and political reasons. Hogg finally shows a shepherd upholding the morality of his play, and teaching the values of forgiveness and acceptance to the members of a higher class. Perhaps the reason for the failure of Hogg’s work should be traced to what Valentina Bold (2007: 19) has argued for the peasant poets in Scotland, namely the prejudices with which Hogg was still regarded by the *literati* of his time, behind which—it must be added—they hid the potential of Hogg’s critique of the imperial ideology.

### ***The magic realism of ‘Cousin Mattie’***

The present section discusses the function of dreams, and their implicit meaning, in Hogg’s short story ‘Cousin Mattie’, utilising Grice’s maxims (1989) to address Hogg’s creative process, and a historically contextualised politeness theory (Brown and Levinson 1987; Mao 1994) to explore the negative reception of Hogg’s tale at the time of first publication. In this tale, Sandy (Mattie’s cousin and juvenile

playmate) subsequently becomes her lover, fathering her child and causing indirectly the death of both mother and baby who, seemingly, die in childbirth. The cause of Mattie's death, however, is never revealed clearly; the reader is kept in suspense with regards to the interpretation of Mattie's dreams; and Hogg ends his tale with a double line of asterisks, leaving several questions unanswered.

Hogg employs a contemporary superstitious belief in foretelling dreams and the fairies' magic number of seven as 'function-advancing' elements<sup>53</sup> to construct the plot of his tale. He then flouts what Grice (1989: 22-40) has defined as the 'maxims' of 'quantity' and 'manner' of the cooperative principle of communication through a highly ambiguous ending, as well as the 'maxim of quality' by a strategic use of the supernatural, in order not to threaten the principles of politeness upon which his contemporary reviewers based their norms of delicacy with regards to what could be published. Concerning the literary marketplace of early nineteenth-century Edinburgh, Alker and Nelson claim that Hogg was aware of the publishing rules of literary decorum, although he was not always willing to conform to the artificial norms of 'gentility and taste' (2009: 10, see introduction). The social issues to which Hogg refers in 'Cousin Mattie' were too unsettling for contemporary bourgeois readers, and he must have felt 'monitored' by his contemporary reviewers; this is why in this tale Hogg shows a tension between pleasing himself and his readers.

Though surely originating in a desire to entertain, Hogg's story also functioned as a critique of specific social issues external to the text, towards which

---

<sup>53</sup> See Joanna Gavins, *Text World Theory: An Introduction* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), pp. 53-71.

Hogg wished to draw his readers' attention. Ambiguity about the reasons for Mattie's death rendered Hogg's treatment of infanticide and pregnancy out of wedlock more acceptable to nineteenth-century bourgeois readers, who could interpret the tale's symbolic meanings according to various possibilities and then choose the option that did not threaten their assumptions of politeness. Hogg left his readers to decide for themselves whether Mattie died giving birth or whether she was killed by Sandy out of fear, as the midwife's husband near Mattie's tomb seems to imply: 'What was the corpse like?', he asks, 'Was't a' fair, an' bonny, an' nae blueness nor demmish (damage) to be seen?'.<sup>54</sup>

Hogg's flouting of the maxims of manner and quantity at the end of his tale requires an active participation of the readers in the co-creative process, as they have to use their own imagination to interpret Mattie's dreams in relation to the circumstances of her death. Yet in so doing Hogg also masters what LuMing Robert Mao views as the 'two competing forces shap[ing] our interactional behaviour: the ideal social identity and the ideal social autonomy' (1994: 451, see introduction); that is, Hogg exhibits a centripetal tension towards being accepted by the Edinburgh literary élite, and a centrifugal one towards his desire to express his own personal criticism of branding illegitimate children as socially disgraceful.

A literary pragmaticist critical lens highlights *how* and *why* Hogg's linguistic techniques and treatment of unsettling gender issues in this tale challenged the accepted literary conventions of his day. Making a skilful use of the Scottish Borders supernatural belief in foretelling dreams, Hogg hinted at the harsh reality of peasant women, as portrayed in the Scottish ballads of infanticide, and denounced the control

---

<sup>54</sup> 'Cousin Mattie', in *Winter Evening Tales*, ed. by Duncan (2004a), pp. 433-41, (p. 441); quotations from Hogg's tale will be from this edition, and page references given within parentheses in the text.

of female sexuality by the Scottish Kirk in the early nineteenth century. The comments between the midwife and her husband about the physical condition of Mattie's and her child's corpses suggest the possibility of 'text-worlds' which would have been too disturbing for Hogg's contemporary reviewers. Such allusions, in fact, questioned the delicate image of the motherly heroine and the ideology of the marriage trope in the literary establishment.

Contemporary reviewers, however, seem to have felt disturbed only by Hogg's treatment of tradition. According to some of them (see later), by presenting Cousin Mattie's dreams as fictional tools 'to ponder over' reality, Hogg failed to observe the expectations of post-Enlightenment readers.<sup>55</sup> Suzanne Gilbert observes that 'Hogg's defence of oral culture depends on a view of tradition that had undergone revision as a result of Enlightenment scrutiny; ideas about antiquity, authenticity, and the reliability of direct experience had been challenged and found too unscientific'.<sup>56</sup> In 'Cousin Mattie', drawing on the supernatural without rationalising it, Hogg thus failed his readers' expectations by appearing to flout Grice's two sub-maxims of quality—'don't say what you believe to be false' and 'what you lack adequate evidence for' (1989: 27). Gold's *London Magazine* attacked Hogg's *Winter Evening Tales* 'with decided reprobation' (Anon 1820: 639) for its use of the supernatural without any rational explanation, publishing—paradoxically—the tale of 'Cousin Mattie' in its entirety as an example 'of the

---

<sup>55</sup> For a thorough discussion of post-Enlightenment's expectations of fiction see Ian Duncan, 'The Rise of Fiction', in *Scott's Shadow* (2007), written by Duncan, pp. 116-44. Though literary texts may depict a fictional world, they still have the readers 'reflect on' reality; see Anders Pettersson, *Verbal Art* (2000), p. 46.

<sup>56</sup> Suzanne Gilbert, 'James Hogg and the Authority of Tradition', in *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace*, ed. by Alker and Nelson, pp. 93-109 (p. 101).

principles which the author wishes to convey',<sup>57</sup> and which the readers were advised not to follow. I argue that these reviewers exploited Hogg's failure to observe such a contract in order to provide a motive for their negative reaction, while simultaneously ignoring Hogg's 'implicatures', namely the disturbing realities that, through such a use of the supernatural, he was indirectly asking them to consider.

In her first dream when aged seven, Mattie is offered a rose by a lady, seemingly her dead mother, who warns her never to separate from it or she will die in a fortnight. In the same dream, Sandy craves the rose and Mattie gives it to him. The lady then tells Mattie that Sandy will be her murderer. Seven years later, Mattie dreams about her dead aunt, who warns her to beware of Sandy, as he will cause her death in seven days. Yet, in Hogg's tale, dreams have their own temporal logic and foretell Mattie's death at the age of twenty-one, fourteen years after her first vision.

In Hogg's biography, Gillian Hughes argues that 'Cousin Mattie' may be mirroring a personal 'hidden episode in Hogg's own life': John Wilson, one of Hogg's literary friends and well established in Edinburgh literary circles, claimed that Hogg's 'usual dress' included 'a brooch in his unfrilled shirt, adorned with the hair of a Tenant Lass in Ettrick Forest who died in a certain condition in the 89' (2007: 173).<sup>58</sup> The real cause of Mattie's death, however, is never disclosed by the narrative voice, even though the dialogue between Mattie's midwife and her husband reveals that she was buried with her child.

---

<sup>57</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *Winter Evening Tales*', Gold's *London Magazine*, 1 (1820), pp. 638-44 (p. 633).

<sup>58</sup> See also Norah Parr, *James Hogg At Home: Being the Domestic Life and Letters of the Ettrick Shepherd* (Dollar: Douglas S. Mack, 1980), p. 72.

The purpose of this section is to shed some light on what Hogg may have wished to communicate in ‘Cousin Mattie’, and on how his text was then received by the critics in 1820. Both purposes will be achieved by considering the significance of textual features such as character construction; how information about events in the plot development is withheld or provided for effects of suspense; and why Hogg chose the particular chronotope of early-nineteenth-century Scotland for his tale. Without being deterministic, it will be argued that Hogg’s historical position may have influenced specific textual choices, and that the readers’ standpoint may then have affected the interpretation of and the reaction to such authorial choices at the time of first publication. Mediating Hogg’s cultural background for the potential readers of the twenty-first century, and considering the dynamics between Hogg’s individuality and overarching categories of gender, class, and ethnicity, the following analysis will clarify why Hogg’s tale was cited as a literary example not to follow at the time of first publication (Anon 1820: 639).

With these aims in mind, the literary meanings that can arise from a reading of ‘Cousin Mattie’ will not be considered as fixed, because Hogg’s own act of writing and the multiple readers’ experiences of his tale allow for different interpretations which do not exclude one another: this is an effect that Hogg suggests by leaving the end of his tale open. For the same reason, context will not be assumed as unitary, since the different interpretations on the part of the readers originate from their different background realities.

The following discussion provides a stylistic analysis of some extracts of Hogg’s tale, as well as an evaluation of the ‘critical meaning’<sup>59</sup> deriving from the

---

<sup>59</sup> See Anders Pettersson, ‘Meaning in Literature’, *Neohelicon*, 37 (2010), 433-39 (p. 435).



particular, individual reading experience of the reviewers of Hogg's time. An exploration of character construction exposes how Hogg foregrounded adjectival phrases related to the eighteenth-century discourse of sensibility to emphasise the innocence of both protagonists, in order to soften the disturbing issues he later raises in the text. Awareness of Hogg's historical, cultural, and biographical backgrounds helps to achieve a closer idea of what the readers of his time might have inferred.

The supernatural belief in foretelling dreams not only conveys a strong symbolism, but it also plays an important function in advancing the plot construction of the tale. Penny Fielding argues that Mattie's dreams 'can be seen to dramatise the control of female sexuality by women themselves', as '[b]oth the women who appear in Mattie's dreams warn her against sexual transgression and symbolise it as a form of death'.<sup>60</sup> Yet, such visions also serve a narrative purpose, as they increase the effects of suspense on the reader in relation to the risks of Mattie's later condition, and Hogg constructs a plot which, as argued by Ian Duncan, 'is remarkable for the interruptions that delay fulfilment',<sup>61</sup> in no way reflecting a naïve use of the supernatural, as argued instead by Hogg's contemporary reviewers.

An analysis of the three main characters' construction reveals that, at first glance, Hogg appears to draw upon some of the dominant discourses of his time and to comply with their ideology. For example, the narrator presents Flora (Sandy's elder sister and Mattie's cousin who, in Hogg's tale, plays the role of 'guardian angel') as follows:

---

<sup>60</sup> Penny Fielding, 'Burial Letters: Death and Dreaming in Hogg's 'Cousin Mattie'', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 16 (2006), 5-19 (p. 11).

<sup>61</sup> Ian Duncan, editorial note to 'Cousin Mattie', in *Winter Evening Tales*, written by Hogg, ed. by Duncan, p. 583.

*How I do love a little girl about that age! There is nothing in nature so fascinating, so lovely, so innocent; and at the same time, so full of gayety and playfulness. The tender and delicate affections, to which their natures are moulded, are then beginning unconsciously to form; [...] their hearts are like softened wax, and the impressions then made on them remain forever. Such beings approach nigh to the list where angels stand, and are, in fact, the connecting link that joins us with the inhabitants of a better world. How I do love a well-educated little girl of twelve or thirteen years of age.*

At such an age was Flora Finagle, with a heart moulded to every tender impression, and a memory so retentive, that whatever affected or interested her was engraven there never to be cancelled. (p. 433, emphases mine)

At the level of discourse-world, when referring to Flora's heart as 'softened wax' on which 'the impressions [...] remain forever', Hogg appears to comply with contemporary Romantic re-evaluations of John Locke's developmental theory of childhood from innocence to experience—according to which a child's mind was a *tabula rasa* to be written on, a very popular background knowledge that early nineteenth-century readers would have brought with them when reading the tale. Furthermore, the narrator's sentence referring to Flora as a being 'approach[ing] nigh to the list where *angels* stand [...] the connecting link that joins us with the inhabitants of a better world' (p. 433) is also in line with Romantic ideas of childhood as a unique state of happiness and purity, of spontaneity and illusion from which the adult could learn.<sup>62</sup> Such intertextual relations, however, clashed with the

---

<sup>62</sup> Ann Wierda Rowland writes that

images of infancy and childhood emerge as a pervasive *historical* rhetoric in British Enlightenment and Romantic writing. [...] Using the life span of the individual to describe the larger course of human history, [...] Enlightenment and Romantic writers [...] used new ideas of development to articulate a compelling and new historical paradigm: one that emphasizes origins[.] [...] Wordsworth's phrase, [...] "The Child is Father of the Man" must be seen as an historical as much as a psychological metaphor, one that [...] neatly condenses the theories and images circulating in Enlightenment and Romantic culture. [...] "The Child is Father of the Man" thus articulate the idea of development out of childhood origins as a description of the individual life, as well as an account of human history and human culture that understand "primitive man" as both the "child" and the "father" of modern man.

See 'The Child is Father of the Man', in *Romanticism and Childhood: The Infantilization of British Literary Culture*, written by Ann Wierda Rowland (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), pp. 25-66 (pp. 27-29), emphasis original.

more troubling reality of infanticide and child death alluded to later by Mattie's death: a reality which, in Hogg's time, was well represented in the ballad tradition of popular culture. The latter did not accommodate easily with the ideology of women's sensibility in contemporary establishment tradition, where the delicate heroine symbolised the British nation—a motherly lady absolutely incapable of killing her child (Symonds 1997: 8).

In shaping the narrator of the above passage, Hogg shows a voice that shifts from first-person, as if it were an internal focaliser, to third-person, as if it were an 'external observer' playing the role of ethnographic collector of rural stories among the Scottish Borders, a popular vogue at the time of the tale's writing, as Penny Fielding observes (2006: 7). Hogg then draws upon the Romantic discourse of sensibility in the adjectival phrases that characterise Flora as 'so lovely' and 'so innocent'. The parallelism between the initial and final sentence of the first paragraph depicts a 'voyeuristic' narrator, as Fielding (2006: 8) defines him, who claims: 'How I do love a little girl about that age!', then shifting into a more distant, objective third-person voice in the last part of the extract. This person-deictic shift reinforces the reliability of Flora's depiction, whose 'heart' is described through the Lockean discourse of children's stadial development from innocence to experience, a *tabula rasa* to be written upon, and a cultural paradigm which Hogg exploits to increase the overwhelming effects that Mattie's dream will soon have upon Flora's 'retentive memory' in the tale.

Cousin Mattie, on the other hand, is introduced through her own words when telling her dream to Sandy while overheard by Flora. Though only seven, the narrator

---

describes Mattie as ‘far beyond her years in acuteness’ (p. 437), endowed with articulate speech, and as having been raised in accordance with the principles of bourgeois delicacy:

[h]er mother was an accomplished English lady, though only the daughter of a poor curate, and she had bred her only child with every possible attention. She could read, she could sing, and play some airs on the spinnet; and was altogether a most interesting nymph. (p. 437)

Through such a narrative voice Hogg alludes ironically to the heroine of contemporary sentimental novels, a feature which, as the next section will show, serves a critical purpose.

Though only a year younger than Mattie, Sandy’s language, on the contrary, is still the inarticulate speech of a child. After hearing Mattie’s prophetic dream, where he supposedly will kill her in a fortnight, Sandy recounts his chivalrous fantasies about being a knight who fights against Robin Hood, making the promise that, once adult, he will marry and protect Mattie, and claiming that ‘[w]hen Sandy gows byawman, an’ gets a gyand house, him be vely good till cousin, an’ feed hel wi’ gingebead, an’ yean, an’ tyankil, an’ take hel in him’s bosy yis way’ (p. 434). Through the long passages of Sandy’s unintelligible speech, Hogg flouts the maxims of quantity and manner. The effort required of the reader to understand them implicitly contributes to conveying Sandy’s immaturity and alienation. Hogg then reinforces the child’s estrangement at the level of characters’ dialogues: when trying to report Mattie’s dream to his mother, Sandy ‘made such a blundering story of it, that it proved altogether incoherent, and his mother took no further notice of it’ (p. 435). Through this function-advancing strategy, Hogg anticipates to his readers Sandy’s inability to protect Mattie and behave responsibly later in the tale.

The series of asterisks at the end leaves several unanswered questions. What does happen to Mattie and Sandy? Why do they not marry? Why does Sandy not attend Mattie's funeral? How does Mattie really die? Giving birth? Does she kill both her child and herself? Are both mother and child killed by Sandy? Why does Sandy flee away? Hogg provides no answer.

Though both Mattie and Sandy would have had to undergo public repentance before the congregation for three Sundays, they would have been allowed to marry, since their relation was not considered incestuous. On the other hand, if Sandy did not accept responsibility and fled, leaving Mattie to deal with the matter alone, and if the latter did not mention Sandy's name to the Kirk session, she would have been considered an adulteress, having probably sinned with a married man whom she may be protecting. Mattie would hence have to face the congregation for twenty-six Sundays (Devine 2006b: 88), no easy matter for a young girl. Is this what happens to Cousin Mattie in Hogg's tale? Does she kill herself and her child to avoid public shame? Historically, these episodes did happen, as four cases of child-murder in Edinburgh had been triggered by fear of public repentance;<sup>63</sup> while Symonds mentions the high number of women (347) investigated for infanticide in Scotland between the seventeenth and the nineteenth century (1997: 2). The ambiguous conclusion of Hogg's tale must have recalled this tragic reality.

In Hogg's story, no one has been informed about Mattie's pregnancy, including Flora who, at the time of the sad episode, lives far away raising her own family. At Mattie's funeral, when Flora's husband investigates the causes of her death, Flora's father is vague and provides 'an equivocal answer, [...] to avoid

---

<sup>63</sup> See Hugo Arnot, *Collection of Criminal Trials in Scotland* (1785), p. 350.

entering into any explanation'; while upon 'inquiry[ing] at others, [...] all testified their ignorance of the matter' (p. 440). The 'unaccountable' aspects of this passage and the secrecy about Mattie's condition may also imply an indirect critique of the clash between the legal discourse and the landlords' personal interests in Hogg's time. According to the Scottish Act Anent (concerning) Child Murder (1690-1809), a concealed pregnancy, not calling for a midwife when delivering the child, and the infant's death were crimes that could incur in the death penalty (Symonds 1997: 5). In a peasant society where the economy was based on family unity, with all members contributing to the farm's management, the loss of a single individual, particularly someone like Mattie who, apparently, had become the backbone of such unity since Flora's departure, could signify the loss of reliability to the landlord, who could then give the farm to another family and render Mattie's kin completely destitute (see Christopher Smout 1980: 214). It can thus be argued that the text-world of Hogg's tale portrays the failed performance of a cross-national marriage between two characters of the peasant class: Mattie, who is of English origin, and Sandy, who is Scottish. Hogg voices a less artificial reality than the one depicted in the National Tale, which was well represented in the popular culture of the Scottish ballad tradition.

These are all possible implicatures at which Hogg hints in 'Cousin Mattie' through his open ending: disturbing issues which he never raises directly but rather suggests, leaving the readers of his time to infer for themselves the social problems he implies. When reviewing Hogg's *Winter Evening Tales*, the *British Critic* condemned the 'strings of tales about dreams and apparitions, all of which, [...] are

not worth reading, and were not worth writing'.<sup>64</sup> This anonymous reviewer appears as having blamed Hogg's tales for a shallow reason, and as not having inferred—or, perhaps, pretending not to infer—the unsettling realities that Hogg was actually suggesting through such a use of the supernatural, as in the case of 'Cousin Mattie'.

Though it will never be possible to know Hogg's real intentions, a pragmaticist analysis of 'Cousin Mattie' allows for speculation about a wide range of possible text-worlds that Hogg may have wished to trigger in the mind of the readers of his time. Yet, none of these interpretations should be viewed as the correct answer to the implicatures suggested by the asterisks at the end of Hogg's tale. Instead, each should be considered as possible in its own right, since giving primacy to one would exclude the options offered by the others and violate the norms of literary politeness at the time of writing, thereby diminishing the potential critical value of Hogg's tale.

***'Maria's Tale': A boisterous face threatening act***

'Maria's Tale' made its first appearance in no. 22 of Hogg's periodical *The Spy*, on Saturday 11 January 1811. It tells very bluntly the sad story of a servant's seduction and abandonment by her master's son, a student of medicine in Edinburgh who, during a summer visit to his parental house in the rural area of the same city, seduces her with very little effort, being 'a handsome young man, of easy engaging manners, insinuating in his address, and extremely affable to his inferiors'.<sup>65</sup> Transgressing one of his most peculiar aesthetic rules, according to which an author has 'always to leave something to *the imagination of the reader*' (*The Spy*, p. 28, emphasis

---

<sup>64</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *Winter Evening Tales*', *British Critic*, n.s., 13 (1820), pp. 622-31 (p. 624) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 30 September 2011].

<sup>65</sup> James Hogg, 'Maria's Tale, Written by Herself', in *Winter Evening Tales*, written by Hogg, ed. by Duncan (2004b), pp. 151-58 (p. 152).

original), in this tale Hogg leaves very little to be guessed at by his contemporary audience, nor does he adjust its content to contemporary assumptions of literary decorum in subsequent editions during his life time. Indeed, ‘Maria’s Tale’ reappeared ‘without revision’<sup>66</sup> in the 1820 collection *Winter Evening Tales*, and with no changes of substance in the second edition of the same volume the following year, even though the *British Critic* had included it among those stories ‘containing no matter either of edification or amusement, but a good deal which is quite the contrary of either’ (Anon 1820: 623). This is similar to what Ian Duncan has argued for the ‘Clifford Mackay plot’ in ‘Basil Lee’ (2004b: 533);<sup>67</sup> that is, Hogg seemed more interested in presenting ‘Maria’s Tale’ as a threat against bourgeois readers’ assumptions of politeness, as shown in the following address by the eponymous protagonist:

SIR, —You have manifested your desire of rendering yourself a useful member of society, by ridiculing the foibles, and branding the crimes of your fellow-citizens. Amidst your ingenious and engaging speculations, can you listen to the voice of the wretched? Even in your endeavours to please, you have hitherto appeared anxious to instruct and to reform; to you, therefore, as the friend of virtue and of man, I beg leave to address the following narrative. It contains nothing wonderful, but it is *true*; and may in some degree serve to warn others against the arts by which I was deceived; it is the relation of a perfidy of which myself was the victim. (p. 151, emphasis original)

‘Maria’s Tale’ is written in the autobiographical mode by a first-person narrator, the protagonist herself, who denounces the upper- middle-class masters’ practice of seducing young female servants through a flattering and ‘insinuating’ behaviour, hard to resist by an inexperienced woman of a lower class.

---

<sup>66</sup> Ian Duncan, editorial note to ‘Maria’s Tale, in *Winter Evening Tales*, written by Hogg, ed. by Duncan, p. 564.

<sup>67</sup> See chapter two. The Clifford Mackay plot regards the marriage in ‘Basil Lee’ between the eponymous Lowland protagonist and Clifford, a prostitute from the Highlands. This novella was included in the same collection *Winter Evening Tales*, where ‘Maria’s Tale’ and ‘Cousin Mattie’ appeared.



The ‘Sir’ at the beginning of the tale marks a ‘social deixis’ pointing out the social distance between narrator and implied bourgeois reader and, hence, alerting the readers of any time that the story will raise issues about class relations of the period when the tale is set, which is close to Hogg’s own epoch, as invoked by the social circumstances addressed in the story.

The ‘person deixis’ expressed by the noun phrase ‘you [...] yourself a *useful member of society*’ (emphasis added) situates the topic under discussion in an ironic relation to a male representative of the bourgeoisie, while voicing at the same time ‘the wretched’, Maria, an abused and abandoned servant. Social deixis is an important linguistic device which ‘models relationships within the communicative triangle from the point of view of politeness’ (Sell 2001: 152). In Hogg’s tale, the politeness conveyed by ‘Sir’ is employed to mock deference when established by social status rather than honourable reasons.

Through such a deferential form, Maria addresses all those male exponents of the upper-middle class who, similarly to the master’s son who impregnated her, may ‘decoy’ other young female servants and lead them ‘to folly and ruin’ (p. 156). Through ‘Maria’s Tale’, Hogg wished to draw his readers’ attention towards the reality of rural Scotland and to voice its gender issues through a story which, though containing ‘nothing wonderful, [...] is *true*’ (p. 151, emphasis original). Maria cannot stand ‘[t]he shame of acknowledging that [she] had so long persisted in a falsehood, together with the necessity of giving that satisfaction which the church would demand’ (pp. 154-55). This social circumstance positions the tale’s temporal setting close to Hogg’s time of writing, as he himself had gone through the same ‘shame’ and faced public humiliation for the same reason.

A maid servant like Maria could certainly not afford to provide some financial support for the poor to avoid public repentance, and her out-of-wedlock pregnancy would involve the loss of her reputation and of her position as a servant within her master's family. This was the only financial support of which she could dispose at a time when social mobility was unconceivable, and when she could not expect to be married to someone like the 'Sir' she addresses in the tale. Compelled to disappear from her parish and with no reference, Maria had no likelihood to find a decent job to support herself, thus mirroring one of those pitiful cases which Dr Tait indicates as the major causes of prostitution in nineteenth-century Edinburgh (Tait 1840: 97-98, see chapter one). The eponymous protagonist of 'Maria's Tale' could easily have run into the same risk had her little child survived and her family not forgiven her, as she was 'without a friend, and without a home; without money and unable to work' (p.155), and the only place where she found asylum in Edinburgh was 'a house, which I supposed was the haunt of debauchery and vice; for this appeared to be the only abode to which I was entitled now, and the only one where I was likely to be admitted' (p. 155).

Hogg presents 'Maria's Tale' as a boisterous face threatening act against the positive face of the male bourgeoisie of his time and their false assumptions of politeness, founded on a sense of importance conferred by social status rather than honour. Hogg's tale defies the dichotomy between bourgeois woman and fallen angel. The freely circulating body of the working-class woman represented a threat and an antithesis to the restricted figure of the lady contained within the familial domestic arena, as promoted by bourgeois ideology (Wills 2001: 94). The strong sexual desire for the servant girl on the part of the male bourgeoisie symbolised a

tool to control a threatening figure of the extra-familial space who had to be both seduced (assimilated) and abandoned (expelled).<sup>68</sup> Even more crucially, Clair Wills suggests that in the mind of the male bourgeoisie not only were the prostitute and the servant girl equalled, but there was an even subtler equation between the prostitute and the lady, as both were on the market for their physical and financial gain (2001: 94-95).

The master's son who seduces and abandons Maria, in addition to being a member of the gentry who will never marry her, may also have been one of those university students mentioned by Dr Tait, whom brothel-keepers supported (1840: 56). Maria relates that her family eventually found her, and that they 'conducted [her] to the house of a relation, a few miles from Edinburgh, where ill health' seriously affected her (p. 157)—possibly a venereal disease, which she may have contracted from her master's son and which may also have been responsible for the premature death of her child.

Rather than accommodating the *status quo* by adopting a more elusive strategy, as Massimiliano Morini (2009: 76) argues for Jane Austen's narrative technique (see introduction), in this tale Hogg disregards such a tactic. In shaping it, he chooses instead to adhere to his own 'ideal social autonomy'. In so doing, Hogg distances himself from a centripetal force towards adherence to the social norm (see Mao 1994: 451, 472), thereby challenging early nineteenth-century expectations of literary politeness. No wonder that the *British Critic* viewed Hogg's tale as 'containing no matter [...] of edification or amusement' (1820: 623). Hogg appears to have been more interested in exposing the reality of contemporary servant

---

<sup>68</sup> Jane Gallop (1985) 'Keys to Dora', in *Dora's Case: Freud, Hysteria, Feminism*, ed. by C. Bernheimer and C. Kahane (New York: Columbia University Press), cited by Clair Wills, in 'Upsetting the Public: Carnival, Hysteria, and Women's Texts', p. 94.

women's lives, as he claimed in a letter to his daughter Elizabeth whom he had fathered out of wedlock. What really matters, states Hogg, is '[t]ell[ing] always the downright simple truth although it should appear to be against you it will ultimately turn out to be in your favours [sic]' (*Collected Letters*, vol. 3, p. 167). In 'Maria's Tale', Hogg had a specific critical goal: to raise his readers' attention to a different reality from the one represented in contemporary literary establishment. By challenging the hypocrisy of nineteenth-century assumptions of politeness, however, Hogg's tale also questioned the discursive significance of the domestic angel, the public prostitute, and the female servant in the bourgeois imagination.

***Bell Calvert and the 'allusions to women of ill fame'***

During Hogg's lifetime (1770-1835) Edinburgh was one of the most sophisticated cultural centres of Europe. In *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (1824) Hogg, self-educated and working-class, opposes the city's elitism and insists upon the greater value of marginal voices, among them a prostitute: Bell Calvert. This character questions the reliability of the official discourse in Hogg's time of writing which, in the novel, is represented by the Editor, the narrative voice of the first part of the novel. The prominence conferred on a prostitute from the margins clashed, once again, with the bourgeois ideal of delicate heroine. The figure of Bell Calvert questioned the ideology represented by this female emblem of national progress in both the national tale and historical novel, because it exposed an unsettling socio-historical circumstance of the Northern British Empire: the issue of prostitution in Edinburgh. I argue that this is one of the aspects that contributed to the reviewers' little enthusiasm at the time of its first publication. By contrast, and for

the same reason, Hogg's work is judged by recent postmodern and postcolonial scholars to be one of the most significant Scottish novels of any period.

Hogg's *Confessions* is divided into two main narratives. The first part is narrated by the post-Enlightenment Editor, a contemporary of Hogg, who offers a third-person account of the life of Robert Wringhim, the Justified Sinner, a religious fanatic who lived between 1687 and 1712. The second part is Robert Wringhim's autobiography, interrupted by an embedded supernatural tale; the novel is then concluded by the Editor's account of how he and his friends found Robert's manuscript in a grave in Ettrick Forest more than a hundred years after the narrated events. The plot shows the negative consequences of Robert's religious fanaticism and his adherence to antinomianism, an extreme faction of Calvinism. According to Calvinism, though God has already predestined the Elect, the latter still have to observe the strictest moral behaviour since this confirms their elected state. Antinomianism, conversely, releases the Elect from the obligation of observing the moral law. Robert thus thinks that, in order to destroy God's enemies, he is justified in committing any crime. Such religious zeal, however, will bring him to damnation, either evil or psychotic, depending on how the reader wants to interpret this particular aspect of the novel. Once again, Hogg offers no clear conclusion.

In the *Confessions*, Hogg interrogates the blind reliance on authoritative discourses by using the voices of subaltern classes which question both the Editor's biased rationality and the Justified Sinner's antinomian enthusiasm. Hogg's attitude anticipated postmodern criticism as represented by French philosopher Michel Foucault, who claims that any society is characterised by its particular system of values, spread by national institutions at the expense of other knowledge (1990: 18).

Similarly, in the *Confessions* Hogg sought to expose prostitution amongst other gender issues, one of the hidden problems in nineteenth-century Edinburgh. Though Wringhim's narrative is set more than a hundred years before the 1820s, its fictional events mirror this disturbing issue outwith the text in Hogg's time of writing.

Preoccupied with the negative reception of his previous two novels, *Perils of Man* (1822) and *Perils of Woman* (1823), and possibly also influenced by the success of The Great Unknown's (Walter Scott's) series of Waverley Novels, Hogg published the *Confessions* anonymously in 1824. Despite these precautions, the novel was reviewed negatively. As argued by Gillian Hughes, the unenthusiastic reception of the *Confessions* 'could not have been for the want of Hogg's name', as six out of the ten anonymous reviewers attributed the novel to him, using as evidence his style, 'an incongruous mixture of the strongest powers with the strongest absurdities'.<sup>69</sup> With the only exception of the *Monthly Critical Gazette*, which praised highly Hogg's satire of extremist Calvinism,<sup>70</sup> the main objections 'were made to what are now taken to be the deliberate ambiguities of the novel' (Hughes 1982: 12). Some reviewers criticised Hogg's inconsistent representation of the devil as either real or a product of the Justified Sinner's imagination, arguing that this uncertainty caused great confusion in the reader as to who was responsible for the crimes committed in the novel. One reviewer admitted his 'ignorance of Mr. Hogg's precise drift [...] as regards his incoherent machinery'; while another claimed that 'if

---

<sup>69</sup> Gillian Hughes, 'The Critical Reception of *The Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *Newsletter of the James Hogg Society*, 1 (1982), pp. 11-14 (pp. 11, 12).

<sup>70</sup> Anon. '[Review of] *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *Monthly Critical Gazette*, 1 (1824), pp. 436-38 (p. 437).

an author will introduce supernatural beings, he is at least bound to invent plausible motives for their interference in human concerns'.<sup>71</sup>

The double narrative also raised some concerns as 'the author has managed the tale very clumsily, having made two distinct narratives of the same events' (*Westminster Review*, 1824: 560-61); while a further reviewer argued that 'it is altogether unfair to treat the reader with two versions of such extraordinary trash'.<sup>72</sup> In general, Hogg's 'tremendous power over the human imagination' (Hughes 1982: 13) was acknowledged, though not always in positive terms, and the *Confessions* was viewed as exhibiting 'the characteristic ingenuity and extravagance of the highly-gifted, but eccentric writer'.<sup>73</sup>

If, on the one hand, Hogg's contemporary critics appear as having motivated their negative reception with the inconsistencies arising from the double narrative and the uncertainty of Gil-Martin's nature, no comment whatsoever was made on Bell Calvert opposing the reliability of the Editor's voice in the first part of the novel. Only the *British Critic* remarked on this character, defining her rather mockingly as 'a genuine melodramatic heroine, who with the exception of the minor feminine virtues of chastity and honesty, was endowed with every quality which might entitle her to canonization'.<sup>74</sup> Postmodern scholars have found appealing the fact that in Hogg's *Confessions* no voice is given prime status of reliability, and much responsibility for the construction of textual meaning is left to the reader. Peter

---

<sup>71</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*, *London Literary Gazette*, Saturday 17 July 1824, pp. 449-51 (p. 451); Anon., '[Review of] *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*, *Westminster Review*, 2 (1824), pp. 560-62 (p. 561).

<sup>72</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *New Monthly Magazine*, 12 (1824), p. 506.

<sup>73</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *The Ladies' Monthly Museum*, 20 (1824), p. 106.

<sup>74</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *British Critic*, n.s., 22, July 1824, pp. 68-80 (p. 70).

D. Garside observes that post-colonial critics have been fascinated by the novel's challenge mounted by marginal voices in Scots language against the dominant English culture;<sup>75</sup> while Douglas S. Mack claims that Hogg's message in the novel is that 'well-educated people might sometimes be in error' while people from the margins—such as the prostitute Bell Calvert—might have 'a valuable story to tell' (2006: 57).

Keeping in mind the contentious reception of the *Confessions*, this section will argue that Hogg's lack of inhibition in giving a prominent role to a prostitute may have been one of the unstated reasons for the *Confessions*' negative reception. Concerning Hogg's treatment of prostitution in *Perils of Woman* (1823), Groves claims that, in a period when even the depiction of a pregnant woman affected negatively the principles of literary politeness, Hogg went far beyond the limit (1987: 129). By addressing a tragic reality of women in the city, he thus provoked great aversion among the bourgeoisie of the period. Raising such a disturbing issue and making bourgeois female readers aware of it may have been perceived as too subversive and as complicating progressive accounts of historical and national narratives. Mack holds that in the *Confessions*, through the voice of Bell Calvert, Hogg interrogates the post-Enlightenment Editor's prejudiced social assumptions. Indeed, Bell is a woman who supports herself by 'the most degrading of all means' (*Confessions*, p. 49), and with a very different background from the typical heroine of contemporary bourgeois literature.<sup>76</sup>

---

<sup>75</sup> Peter D. Garside, 'Hogg's *Confessions* and Scotland', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 12 (2001), 118-38 (p. 121).

<sup>76</sup> Douglas S. Mack, 'Revisiting *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 10 (1999), 1-26 (p. 4).



Bell recounts an episode already narrated by the Editor, providing an eye-witness description of the killing of young George, the Justified Sinner's brother. The Editor, on the other hand, assumes that George has been murdered by his friend Drummond, basing his account on the general impression of George's friends who, at the moment of the homicide, were in a brothel: 'Not one of them could swear that it was Drummond who came to the door, and desired to speak with the deceased, but the general impression on the minds of them all, was to that effect' (p. 38). On the contrary, though unable to work out what she saw on the night of the crime, Bell Calvert does know that Drummond cannot be guilty:

I had only lost sight of Drummond [...] for the short space of time we [Bell and a client] took in running up one pair of short stairs; [...] and, *at the same time*, I saw the two men [Robert Wringhim and Gil-Martin] coming down the bank on the opposite side of the loch, [...] both he and they were distinctly in my view, and never within speech of each other, [...] so that it was quite clear he neither could be one of them, nor have any communication with them.<sup>77</sup>

In addition, Bell's tale makes the reader reconsider the Editor's jovial depiction of George's friends, as she describes a group of drunken men who, on the night of the murder, were contracting sexual favours with her, while she was perishing with famine (Mack 1999: 5). Through such episodes, Hogg meant to raise awareness in bourgeois women—who comprised part of his readership—of a disturbing reality.

As shown in the introduction to this thesis, Sinha (2004: 188) and Wilson (2004: 20-21) remark that nineteenth-century bourgeois women represented the moral authority of the imperial project. In the *Confessions*, Bell Calvert foregrounds

---

<sup>77</sup> James Hogg, *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*, ed. by Peter D. Garside (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, (2002 [1824]), p. 51, emphasis original. Quotations from Hogg's novel will be from this edition, and page references given within parentheses in the text.

a marginal reality of contemporary Edinburgh. Bell's voice must have highlighted sexual inequalities in marital relations and brought into prominence the discrepancy between the monogamy demanded of women within marriage and the abuse of prostitution by some men outside of it. By exposing this social issue, however, Hogg also destabilised the progressive ideology inherent in the marriage trope, because Bell Calvert's unfortunate condition revealed the costs suffered by the margins in the name of the Northern British Empire.

In general, Hogg's lack of inhibition in dealing with these matters provoked great aversion among the Edinburgh literati who, for this reason, censored his texts. The *Confessions*, too, may have been critiqued for the same reason, though such reason is never mentioned by contemporary reviewers. In his discussion of politeness in Dickens's *Dombey and Son* (1846-48), Sell points out that the novel's success at its time of publication was due to Dickens's skilfully balanced 'endorsement and subversion of a homogenizing bourgeois decorum' (2001: 165), similarly to what Morini argues for Jane Austen (2009: 76). Dickens's fluctuation between traditional values and their subversion mirrors a 'tension between the social and the individual' which Dickens 'powerfully' co-adapted (Sell 2001: 168-69). A total deconstruction, in fact, may have been 'too intoxicating for a middle-of-the-road Victorian reader' (Sell 2001: 181). This is probably the balance that Hogg was unable to strike in the *Confessions* as, instead of placing Bell Calvert in the background, he made her one of the most prominent characters of the novel.

Hogg's acts of voicing a prostitute and of conferring dignity to her seemingly worked to subvert teleological representations of history; this is perhaps the reason why Hogg's contemporary critics preferred to motivate their negative reception of

the *Confessions* with what they judged as narratorial inconsistencies, avoiding any reference to the subtler critique that Hogg conveyed through Bell Calvert's voice. Tait observes that prostitutes were considered to be consistent liars and, hence, not reliable 'as witnesses before a public court' (1840: 39). This is a point that Hogg challenged in the *Confessions* by presenting Bell Calvert's testimony in an Edinburgh public court as more reliable than the evidence provided by the post-Enlightenment Editor. However, by deconstructing a notion of power based on class and apparent decorum, Hogg destabilised his contemporary social order.

In the *Confessions* the social conventions of bourgeois marriage are also questioned by Rabina and the Laird of Dalcastle who, united in an unhappy relation, find relief in extramarital liaisons. The over-religious Rabina and the old, dissolute George, unable to overcome their difference, start leading separate lives under the same roof. Douglas S. Mack (1999: 3) has suggested that the Editor's narrative highlights the opposition between two families: the Wringhims and the Colwans, formed by Rabina's and George's respective parallel lives. In the context of the nineteenth-century British novel, the blunt portrayal of extra-marital liaisons appears as a subversive act through which, once again, Hogg reveals the ideology of the marriage trope. Mack observes that the young and innocent Rabina finds herself trapped in the bedroom of a drunken, old husband who rapes her repeatedly (Mack 1999: 6). Yet, Rabina's religious zeal (so much criticised by the Editor) is not a mere form of resistance to an unhappy union, but also a parody of the delicate heroine: an extreme case of religious faith which emphasises the debauchery of her husband and the mask of bourgeois respectability outwith the text.

At the other end of the spectrum, Hogg sets the fallen woman, Bell Calvert. Rabina and Bell are two victims of the same bourgeois logic, who resist in opposite ways the social pressure suffered by middle-class women in relation to marriage. As Dr Tate has shown (1840), ‘unprotected’ women from all social strata were threatened by the risk of resorting to prostitution. Hogg suggests Bell Calvert’s high social origins through her beautiful English, thus fusing the bourgeois lady and the prostitute in the same character:

My name is Arabella Calvert [...] Miss, mistress, or widow, as you chuse, for I have been all the three, and that not once nor twice only [...] There have been days, madam [...] when I *was* to be seen, and when there were few to be seen like me. But since that time there have indeed been days on which I was not to be seen. (p. 43, emphasis original)

This ‘voice trash’,<sup>78</sup> by featuring a prostitute whose language clashes with her current social status, questions the dynamics of power, class, and politeness in Hogg’s time. Interestingly, though the women that Tait treated for venereal diseases belonged for the greater part to the lower classes, he also cured three upper-class women who had resorted to prostitution for reduced circumstances, and twelve ladies of the middle class for misplaced love (Tait 1840: 26-27). Through Bell Calvert’s tragic story Hogg wanted to make his female bourgeois readers aware of an unsettling reality. Yet, in so doing, he was also threatening (may be unwittingly) the stability of the bourgeoisie, the Scottish nation, and the Northern British Empire.

---

<sup>78</sup> Jacob L. Mey, *When Voices Clash*, pp. 198-202; see introduction.

## CHAPTER FOUR

### James Hogg's Proto-Postmodern Heroines

Hogg's proactive heroines challenged the teleological assumptions of the historical and national narratives, where female characters incorporating aspects of the sentimental novel acted as national allegories through their symbolic union with the hero. Jennifer Camden claims that in the nineteenth-century British and American novels with a marriage plot, the hero's repressed attraction towards the more rebellious secondary heroine poses a threat to the nation's stability, as his real feelings return like a Freudian 'uncanny' to 'destabilize' and 'complicate' the 'national ideals' embodied by the primary heroine. The hero's hidden feelings for the secondary female character expose 'national anxieties', thus 'pointing to the instability of national identity' (2010: 2, 6, 5).

Camden draws on Benedict Anderson's and Katie Trumpener's models of nationhood to shape a paradigm for the tension between the primary and the secondary heroine.<sup>1</sup> Anderson's view of 'nationhood as an imperial construct' where 'the nation is defined by the majority' as an 'imagined community' which 'excludes the "other" in the interests of group cohesion' supplies Camden with a theory for conceptualising the role of the primary heroine, whose marriage with the hero represents 'the basic unit on which the larger nation is constructed'; Katie Trumpener's idea of nationalism as located on the border provides instead a model for the 'rebel, outcast, or merely forgotten' secondary heroine who 'pulls readers'

---

<sup>1</sup> Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities* (London: Verso, 2006 [1983]); Katie Trumpener, *Bardic Nationalism*; both authors are cited by Camden on p. 3.

attention to the margins' (Camden 2010: 3). Regarding the British novel, Camden offers the examples of Walter Scott's *Waverley* (1814) and *Ivanhoe* (1820) where their respective secondary heroines, Flora and Rebecca, 'complicate the incipient nationalism these novels appear to endorse', as they both 'narrate a sort of last stand against an already-changed world order, and in each novel the secondary heroine registers the cost of that shift' (Camden 2010: 15, 60).

In this chapter I shall argue that in *The Brownie of Bodsbeck* (1818) and 'Tibby Hyslop's Dream' (1829 [1827]), Hogg fuses the tension between the primary and the secondary heroine in a unique character symbolic of the Scottish nation—a new heroine who does not engage in any courtship with the hero—thereby suggesting that Scotland's social grievances cannot find an easy resolution in the political union with England. Though in other works Hogg engages with the conventional dialectics between the primary and the secondary heroine as, for instance, in *Perils of Woman* (see chapter one) where Cherry's death signals the cost of the marriage between Gatty and M'Ion, in *The Brownie of Bodsbeck* and 'Tibby Hyslop's Dream' Hogg gives birth to a new prototype of heroine where the traits of both female characters merge, thereby articulating a heterodox solution to contemporary Scottish national issues.

In both works, the figure of the secondary heroine is absent because her traits are incorporated in the primary one and, most importantly, Hogg's heroines do not engage in any love affair that may convert into marriage to the hero. If the story contains a hero, he is already married, as is Daniel Roy Macpherson in *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*, a Highlander who could potentially realise the marriage trope with the Lowland Katharine Laidlaw. When the story contains anti-heroes whose only

purpose is to take advantage of the female protagonist's body, as in the case of 'Tibby Hyslop's Dream', then the heroine chooses spinsterhood, because '[t]here is neither sin nor shame in being unwedded, but there may be baith in joining yourself to an unbeliever', as Tibby's grandmother warns her granddaughter.<sup>2</sup> Through this voice, Hogg critiques the cultural assumptions of bourgeois marriage—based on the idealised familial microcosm—as an ideological tool for the construction of the British nation's identity. As Anne McClintock (1995: 43-45) argues, the bourgeois trope of the family based on the dependency of wife and children on the father, shaped also British relations between the margins and the centre, articulating perceptions of class, gender, and ethnic disparity as normal and natural (see chapter one). Instead, in 'Tibby's Hyslop's Dream' Hogg voices the reality of the margins, thus providing a more realistic representation of gender and class in the Scottish Borders.

At the time when Hogg wrote this tale, the imperial expansion of Scotland in the colonies had enriched the higher classes, which now were in the position of investing and expanding their power at home. The money earned in the colonies, however, supported an internal process of economic colonisation which affected rather seriously the peasantry and the working class (see Mack 2006: 58-62). In an essay published in the *Quarterly Journal of Agriculture* (1831-32, see chapter two), Hogg exposes the loss of benevolence between master and servants, as the latter were not considered members of the family unit any longer: their masters now owned more than one farm and, sometimes, did not even know their servants. Tibby's endurance of the trials of life and her master's attempts to violate her body portray

---

<sup>2</sup> James Hogg, 'Tibby Hyslop's Dream, and the Sequel', in *The Shepherd Calendar*, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002 [1829]), pp. 142-62 (p. 155). Quotations from Hogg's tale will be from this edition, and page references given within parentheses in the text.

the tragic condition and the exploitation of peasant women in the early nineteenth-century Scottish Borders.

In the character construction of both Katharine and Tibby, Hogg does not adhere to what Camden describes as ‘Western stereotypes of femininity’, namely ‘beauty and dependence’ (2010: 7). In both texts Hogg depicts unconventionally independent female types, characterised by high moral values, providing very little physical description. In *The Brownie of Bodsbeck* Hogg describes Katharine as endowed with ‘the strength of mind, and energy of the bravest of men, blent with all the softness, delicacy, and tenderness of feminity [*sic*]’, a proto-postmodern heroine whom Hogg sets, through her father’s *heteroglot* voice, as a new gender model for the ‘poor shilly-shally milk-an’-water’ ladies of early nineteenth-century Edinburgh.<sup>3</sup> According to a contemporary anonymous reviewer, the female bourgeois readership would ‘feel much disappointed at the perusal; no love scene is to be traced here—Katharine Laidlaw has no lover. The happy winding up of a long and interrupted courtship, is not to be found in the conclusion’.<sup>4</sup> *The Brownie of Bodsbeck* shows no ideological marriage to solve the political issues between the Scottish Highlands and Lowlands. Instead, Hogg engages in a resolution through the friendship between Walter Laidlaw, the heroine’s Lowland father, and Daniel Roy Macpherson, a Highland soldier.

This chapter will conclude with analysis of Hogg’s more conventional engagement in the tension between primary and secondary heroine in his mock-epic *Queen Hynde* (1824). Possibly disappointed by the negative role that the Edinburgh

---

<sup>3</sup> James Hogg, *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1976 [1818]), pp. 164, 163. Quotations from Hogg’s novel will be from this edition, and page references given within parentheses in the text.

<sup>4</sup> Anon., ‘[Review of] *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*’, *Clydesdale Magazine*, 1, May 1818, pp. 24–28 (p. 25) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012].



blue-stockings had played in Robert Miller's refusal to publish *The Pilgrims of the Sun* (1815),<sup>5</sup> in *The Brownie* Hogg initiates a literary dialogue with these ladies through Walter Laidlaw's voice. Such dialogue then achieves its final apotheosis in *Queen Hynde* with the hilarious exophoric address of the narrator to the 'Maid of Dunedin'. In this long poem, Hogg declares his intellectual freedom and poetic independence, subverting contemporary constructions of delicacy as epitomised by the primary heroine, the eponymous Queen Hynde—a textual representation of Hogg's contemporary Edinburgh ladies, the readers of his books—whom he sets in intratextual relation with the Queen's maid of honour—the naughty, rebellious, and insubordinate Wicked Wene, the secondary heroine. Douglas Mack argues that Wene represents the 'fairy' nature of Hogg's poetry and that Hogg hides a serious purpose behind her 'mischief-making' behaviour.<sup>6</sup> I shall add that Wene bears a *double* serious purpose, as she symbolises both the freedom of bourgeois women from the role of Scottish national signifiers and Hogg's independence from nineteenth-century literary conventions.

### ***The Brownie's magic power: A shield for the Scottish nation***

*The Brownie of Bodsbeck* portrays the story of Walter Laidlaw and his daughter Katharine who help the Covenanters to hide from Royalists in the Borders area in 1685, six years after they have been defeated in the Battle of Bothwell Bridge (22

---

<sup>5</sup> Hogg was not completely displeased with Miller's refusal, however, as he was expecting to get his poem published by John Murray's more prestigious London firm. See Gillian Hughes, 'Essay on the Genesis of the Text', in *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, written by Hogg, ed. by Rubenstein and others, pp. xiii-xliii (pp. xviii-xx). See also James Hogg, 'Memoir of the Author's Life', in *Altrive Tales*, written by Hogg, ed. by Hughes, pp. 11-52 (pp. 36-39).

<sup>6</sup> Douglas S. Mack, 'Hogg's Bardic Epic: *Queen Hynde* and Macpherson's *Ossian*', in *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace*, ed. by Alker and Nelson, pp. 139-55 (p. 143).

July 1679).<sup>7</sup> During the Killing Times (1680-1688), the soldiers of Charles II and James VII persecuted the Covenanters for not having adhered to the reintroduction of the episcopacy in Scotland after the Restoration in 1660, maintaining instead their Presbyterian form of government. The Cameronians were a radical section of the Presbyterian Covenanters—a particularly strict, ideologically fundamentalist faction—who followed Richard Cameron (1648-1680), a leader who opposed the Stuart Kings' attempts to control the Scottish Kirk.<sup>8</sup> The movement was mostly concentrated in the South West of Scotland, though a good number of its adherents moved to the Ettrick area during the Killing Times, because its geographical character offered safer places in which to hide. Mack argues that among

the subaltern people of the Western Lowlands, the Killing Times came to be remembered with reverence as a defining moment, as a period of heroic struggle that had secured the civil and religious liberties of the people by paving the way for the deposition of James VII and II in the “Glorious Revolution” of 1688-89. For eighteenth-century Scottish Radicals like the poet Robert Burns, the struggles of the Covenanters provided a deeply encouraging example of ultimately successful popular opposition to an unjust and tyrannical aristocratic regime. [...] Attempts to reconcile the revered principles of the Covenanters and the “Glorious Revolution” with post-Union Imperial reality and with the insights of the Enlightenment preoccupied not only Burns, but also the major Scottish writers of the next generation, the generation of Scott and Hogg. [...] Hogg's *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*, a short novel that seems to have been first planned in the early 1810s as part of a projected series of “rural and traditionary tales” designed to give voice to the insights, the history, and the concerns of the subaltern people of Hogg's native Ettrick Forest. (2006: 120-24)

There were two waves of rebellion on the part of the Covenanters. In 1638, the nobility and the landowners acted as leaders against the king because they did not recognise him as the supreme head of the Reformed Church of Scotland. The second in 1666 was instead a more popular rising not just against ‘the state but their social

---

<sup>7</sup> Douglas S. Mack, ‘Introduction’, in *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1976 [1818]), pp. ix-xix (p. ix).

<sup>8</sup> Michael Lynch, *Scotland: A New History*, reprint of revised edn (London: Pimlico, 2003 [1992]), pp. 294-95.

superiors'.<sup>9</sup> David Stevenson observes that 'a new self-reliance and confidence was emerging among common folk, especially in the west, displayed in a willingness and ability to think for themselves and express their opinions' (1988: 71). Stevenson points out that the Cameronians took inspiration from the 'later rather than the early Covenanters, with the Covenanters as the poor [...] rather than the Covenanters led by the nobility in the arrogance of their days in power in the 1640s, zealously persecuting others' (1988: 72). Indeed, the memory of the later Covenanters influenced various literary works in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries 'surrounding the martyrs with a severe romantic glamour' (Stevenson 1988: 73), because they had voiced not only religious but also civil rights. This was the legacy they left to the following generations of working-class organisations in defence of their political rights: 'the Covenanting past [...] had provided the Scots with a strong tradition of denouncing corrupt and oppressive landlords' (Stevenson 1988: 77).

This section will show how *The Brownie of Bodsbeck* voices such concerns through the two main characters: Katharine and Walter Laidlaw. For the plot construction of this novel, Hogg drew on Robert Wodrow's (1679-1734) *History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland from the Restoration to the Revolution* (1721-1722), an account of the Killing Times sympathetic with the Covenanters which provided him with the general historical background; while for the local episodes, Hogg drew on traditional accounts—supplied among others by his own father—about the Borderers of the Ettrick area who helped the Covenanters (Mack 1976: xi).

---

<sup>9</sup> David Stevenson, *The Covenanters: The National Covenant and Scotland, Saltire Pamphlets*, n.s., 11 (Edinburgh: Lindsay & Co., 1988), pp. 6, 62-63, 62.

Douglas S. Mack (1976) has observed that the two parallel narratives (one concerned with Walter Laidlaw and the other with his daughter Katharine) render the plot of Hogg's novel rather disjointed. Both characters help the Cameronians, unaware of the other doing so. Katharine's plot also provides a fantastic dimension which is eventually rationalised, as for the entire story she is suspected of being in league with the Brownie of Bodsbeck, a supernatural figure of local tradition. Mack points out that the rambling nature of Hogg's novel is exacerbated by the violent murders perpetrated by Claverhouse's Royalist soldiers, episodes which Mack views as not particularly related to the main narrative but spread through the plot in order to expose the brutal treatment of the Covenanters. Even so, Mack holds that *The Brownie* is an important testimony to 'Border life and tradition' of a period not very distant from the author's 'childhood', showing Hogg's 'intimate understanding of the character, beliefs and above all the language of the Border people' (Mack 1976: xviii).

Building on Mack's observations, the following section will focus on the purposeful use that Hogg makes of the Border people's *heteroglot* voices so as to clarify why, in such a melting pot of languages, he decides to represent Katharine's speech in Standard English. Though twentieth-century critics have noticed Hogg's inconsistency in depicting Katharine's voice, they have never gone beyond observing such contradiction at the level of its form, hence failing to infer what Hogg may have implied through this clash of voices. Margaret Elphinstone (1992), for instance, claims that Katharine's 'didactic accents bears no relation to the picture of one whom a "young skempy" would "wile her out o' her bed i' the night-time"', adding that Katharine's language is a serious flaw, as '[t]here is no purpose to be served by

bringing her into the world of the pompous narrator in which the conventional accents of the romantic heroine of the early nineteenth-century novel surely place her'. Likewise, Martina Häcker (1997) views Katharine's Standard English as 'inconsistent with her family background', particularly in a historical novel like Hogg's, where the use of vernacular voices is meant to 'increase the intended impression of authenticity'.<sup>10</sup>

I shall argue that Hogg makes strategic use of what Jacob L. Mey (2000) defines as 'voice trash', a literary phenomenon which describes a clash of voices occurring when characters speak in ways that are inconsistent with their roles.<sup>11</sup> The adherence to a centripetal form of language through Katharine's conventional speech produces an intentional clash of voices that Hogg exploits to set his brave and 'femenine [*sic*]' Borderer heroine on the same level as, and as a better model than, the more delicate and passive heroines of the early nineteenth-century novel. Hogg then enhances Katie's moral strength through comments conveyed by the centrifugal and ironic voice of her father who, upon discovering what she has risked and accomplished in defence of the Cameronians, presents his daughter as a more reliable national model than the Edinburgh young ladies of 1685, a textual representation of the ladies of Hogg's own time. The following is the dialogue between Wat and Katharine at a crucial moment in the novel, when she reveals her role in rescuing the Covenanters, while simultaneously disambiguating the novel's supernatural dimension, as she has been suspected of dealing with witchcraft:

---

<sup>10</sup> Margaret Elphinstone, 'The Brownie of Bodsbeck: History or Fantasy?', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 3 (1992), 31-41 (p. 37); Martina Häcker, 'Literary Dialects and Communication in *The Tale of Old Mortality* and *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 8 (1997), 1-11 (pp. 3, 1).

<sup>11</sup> See Jacob L. Mey, *When Voices Clash*, pp. 198-202; see also my introduction.

“O my dear father,” said she, “you know not what I have suffered for fear of having offended you; for I could not forget that their principles, both civil and religious, were the opposite of yours—that they were on the adverse side to you and my mother, as well as the government of the country.”

“Deil care what side they war on, Kate!” cried Walter, in the same vehement voice; “ye hae taen the side o’ human nature; the suffering and the humble side, an’ the side o’ feeling, my woman, that bodes best in a young unexperienced thing to tak. It is better than to do like yon [those] bits o’ gillflirts [giddy young women] about Edinburgh; poor shilly-shally milk-an’-water things! Gin [if] ye but saw how they cock up their noses at a whig, an’ throw their bits o’ gabs [mouths]; an’ downa bide [are not able to endure] to look at aught [anything], or hear tell o’ aught, that isna i’ the top fashion. Ye hae done very right, my good lassie—*od, I wadna gie ye for the hale o’ them*, an’ they war a’ hung in a strap like ingans [onions].” (*The Brownie*, p. 163, emphasis mine)

The contrast between Wat’s and Katharine’s voices may sound quite incoherent to the readers, as observed by the two above-mentioned twentieth-century critics. However, even a centripetal voice like Katharine’s may become potentially subversive once Hogg’s reason for placing it in the *heteroglot* world of the Scottish Borders is inferred. The belief in the existence of the Brownie creates strong suspense which keeps the supernatural dimension as a possible world until this point of revelation. The hesitation between the marvellous and the uncanny gives life to the fantastic in Todorov’s terms,<sup>12</sup> enhancing the perception of Katharine as a strong female character; while the final disambiguation poses her as a more substantial representation of Scotland’s national values than the ‘shilly-shally milk-an’-water’ Edinburgh coquettes.

The two apparently disjointed narratives also have a specific purpose because Katharine’s solitary endeavours position her as an unconventionally independent female character, like the heroine of the Scottish ballad ‘Tam Lin’, upon whom Hogg bases Ila Moore’s solitary adventure in *Mador of the Moor* when searching for her child’s father (see chapter three). Similarly, the possibility of Katharine’s fairy nature

---

<sup>12</sup> Tzvetan Todorov, *The Fantastic: A Structural Approach to a Literary Genre*, trans. by Richard Howard (Cleveland: Press of Case Western Reserve University, 1973), p. 25.

highlights her character strength, an option that until the end keeps both the readers and her father in suspense. Wat Laidlaw's plot, on the other hand, allows Hogg to develop the friendship between this Lowland tenant and Daniel Roy Macpherson, the Highland soldier who fights for Claverhouse against the Cameronians, but whose deep humanity saves Wat from being accused of being a Cameronian himself.

H. B. de Groot (1995) observes that 'Daniel Roy Macpherson [...] begins as a stock parody of an incomprehensible Highlander and ends up as a man of great humanity and sensitivity [...] to show an alternative way of behaving which makes that of Claverhouse and his cohorts bleaker still'.<sup>13</sup> Martina Häcker argues that '[i]n the dialogues between Walter Laidlaw and Daniel Roy Macpherson Hogg [...] shows how people of different cultural backgrounds can come to an understanding' (1997: 10). Indeed, through this friendship—rather than through the marriage plot—Hogg suggests a possible solution to Scotland's internal inequalities, hence presenting Katharine as a new Scottish national symbol: Scotland as a single woman, who does not need a marriage of convenience to survive, because only the privileged classes of both the Highlands and the Lowlands would be advantaged by such an ideological union. In *The Brownie*, though ironising the Highland notion of blood ties, Hogg epitomises a more genuine coalition between the Scottish regions thanks to the friendship between Wat Laidlaw and Daniel Roy Macpherson, a new prototype of national unity which could solve the ethnic inequalities in Scotland by taking into account the entire social system.

Ross MacKay observes that Walter Scott's master narrative in *The Tale of Old Mortality* (1816), where he likewise engages in the historical account of the

---

<sup>13</sup> H. B. de Groot, 'The Historicity of *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 6 (1995), 1-11 (p. 10).

Killing Times, reflects the teleological progress endorsed by the Scottish Enlightenment. Scott thus shows one of the typical traits of the Scottish novels of the same period which try ‘to contain the revolutionary impulse—both past *and* present’, though failing in this way to ‘recognise the class-based grievances of the rebels and therefore [...] marginalis[ing] so many of them’.<sup>14</sup> In the same article, MacKay argues that, on the other hand, ‘Hogg’s novel conforms to Bakhtin’s dialogic form [...] subvert[ing] the notion of a unifying voice of historical representation’ (p. 72), as it ‘expose[s] a blind ideology which is in the service of class oppression [...] an alternative impression of the past that explores the operations of power on ordinary people’ (pp. 74-75). This may be one of the reasons why *The Brownie* was received so negatively by contemporary reviewers who accused Hogg of plagiarising Walter Scott’s *Old Mortality*. The *Clydesdale Magazine*, for instance, saw *The Brownie* as a poor imitation of Scott’s *Waverley* and *Guy Mannering*, accusing Hogg of being inaccurate with historical information and of having provided a rather biased and exaggerated depiction of Claverhouse’s violence, ‘as Mr. H. has derived his formation principally from the descendant of that persecuted sect’. Though, in a later issue, the same journal admitted that Hogg had written his novella long before Scott’s *Old Mortality* was published and that, for this reason, Hogg ‘was necessitated to write his work anew’. The *British Critic* equally considered *The Brownie* historically inaccurate and a less valuable imitation of Scott’s original adding, rather patronisingly, that Hogg’s name was enough for the work to be judged negatively: ‘Let a copy be ever so exact, yet the very name alone is sufficient to destroy its

---

<sup>14</sup> Ross MacKay, ‘The Scattered Ruins of Evidence: Non-Eventworthy History in *Old Mortality* and *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*’, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 12 (2001), 56-79 (pp. 63-64, emphasis original).



value', thus decreeing *The Brownie* 'an entire failure'; this reviewer acknowledged Hogg's talent as long as he did not engage with historical material, because his descriptions of Claverhouse's cruelties 'instead of exciting horror, as our author intended, excites only our smiles'.<sup>15</sup> Perhaps, the reason why Hogg's novel was considered an inferior imitation of *Old Mortality* is that he did not adhere to the master narrative of Scott's teleological progress, as observed by MacKay (2001), retrieving instead a different reality of Scotland which he voiced in the margins of both class and gender.

Regarding gender, the episode where the Episcopalian Mass John Clerk attempts to rape Katharine can be seen as a symbolic threat to the Scottish nation. Through such an incident, Hogg critiques the absolutist power of those institutions that mind only the political interests of the élite rather than of the entire social spectrum. The role of instructing 'the inhabitants in the *mild* and *benignant* principles of prelacy' (p. 12, emphasis original) mainly to keep an eye 'upon the detested whigs', a faction of the Scottish Covenanters, has been conferred on Clerk. By

---

<sup>15</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*', *Clydesdale Magazine*, 1, May 1818, pp. 24-28 (p. 24) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012]; Anon., '[Review of] *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*', *Clydesdale Magazine*, 1, July 1818, pp. 121-25 (p. 124) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012]; Anon., '[Review of] *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*', *British Critic*, n.s., 10, October 1818, pp. 403-18 (pp. 403, 406, 412) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012]. For the question about whether Hogg wrote *The Brownie* before Scott published *Old Mortality* see Douglas S. Mack, 'Introduction', in *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*, written by Hogg, ed. by Mack, pp. ix-xix (pp. xii-xv). See also James Hogg, *Anecdotes of Scott*, ed. by Jill Rubenstein (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004), pp. 21-22, 50-51; and James Hogg, 'Memoir of the Author's Life', in *Altrive Tales*, written by Hogg, ed. by Hughes, pp. 45-46.

describing Katharine's mother's unquestioning devotion to this Episcopalian priest, Hogg reveals the dynamics of a 'blind ideology' 'on ordinary people', as MacKay observes with regards to the Covenanters (2001: 74-75) since, equally, Maron's Episcopalian 'conscience approved of every thing, or disapproved, merely as he [Clerk] directed', and 'he flattered her for her deep knowledge in true and sound divinity and the Holy Scriptures, *although of both she was grossly ignorant*' (*The Brownie*, p. 14, emphasis mine). Here the third-person narrator presents a complex pattern of oppositions: 'the Ettrick community' may be 'capable of acts of heroic generosity in assisting the fugitive Covenanters, but it is also capable of absurdity, small-mindedness, and lack of perception' (Mack 2006: 134). As a result of her blind religious zeal, Maron allows Clerk to 'exorcise' Katharine from the evil power of the Brownie, leaving her daughter without defence in the 'Old Room' under the priest's 'hellish clutch' (p. 115).

Eventually, Katharine is able to keep the priest's abusive power at bay thanks to the strength of his own superstition. When he is about to violate Katharine's body, the supposedly magic Brownie, who is the leader of the Covenanters in disguise whom she has secretly rescued, appears and saves Katharine by reciting a magic spell, 'Brownie's here, Brownie's there, | Brownie's with thee every where', and then 'lead[ing] her off in triumph' (p. 90). Significantly, the magic power of old tradition saves Katharine from rape.

Yet, Hogg reserves a harsh punishment for the priest, as Maron obliges him to stay in the 'Old Room' one more night to get rid of any residual 'evil' entity. The following night, the leader of the same group of Covenanters—the supposed

Brownie—comes back and decrees, in his biblical voice, the priest's punishment by emasculation:

Thou didst attempt, by brutal force, to pollute the purest and most angelic of the human race—we *rescued her from thy hellish clutch*, for we are her servants, and attend upon her steps. Thou knowest, that still thou art cherishing the hope of succeeding in thy cursed scheme. *Thou art a stain to thy profession*, and a blot upon the cheek of nature, enough to make *thy race and thy nation* stink in the nose of their Creator!—To what thou deservest, thy doom is a lenient one—but it is fixed and irrevocable! (*The Brownie*, p. 115, emphases mine)

The printer James Ballantyne was not pleased at discovering the punishment that Hogg had reserved for Clerk and, as Sharon Ragaz argues, modern readers will probably never know how much of Hogg's actual version Ballantyne excised.<sup>16</sup> In the printed edition, the priest's castration is not overtly stated but rather implied by 'Claverhouse's laughter' at discovering the priest's tragic end, as well as by the 'description of the night-time scene witnessed by Nanny', one of the servants (Ragaz 2002: 97). Ragaz claims that the priest's violent punishment is in line with the Scottish ballad's moral law, and that Hogg had already offered a version of Clerk in *The Mountain Bard* (1807) in the ballad 'Mess John', where a priest seduces 'a young girl [...] with the aid of black magic' and for this reason is punished by 'violent death' (Ragaz 2002: 98-99). Be that as it may, in the literary context of *The Brownie* Hogg presents the priest's punishment as morally right, as his desire to possess Katharine's body may violate the purity of what Hogg has established as the signifier of the Scottish nation, which Clerk's unquestioned power might potentially threaten, exploit, and corrupt. Hogg hence portrays the priest's abusive power as a

---

<sup>16</sup> See Sharon Ragaz, "'Gelding' the Priest in *The Brownie of Bodsbeck: A New Letter*", *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 13 (2002), 95-103 where she states that in a letter to William Blackwood 'dated 3 March 1818 [...] Ballantyne asks Blackwood: "Do you chance to be aware, that one of the incidents in the Brownie of Bodsbeck is the emasculation, the *gelding* of a priest by the said Brownie? In case you are not aware of this most irregular aberration, I take the liberty to point it out"' (p. 98).

‘hellish clutch’, more evil than the magic world of the old Scottish tradition—an important legacy that still defines Scottish identity and that can heal the Scottish nation at critical moments.

At this point of the story, Wat is in Edinburgh under trial, accused of having aided the Covenanters; Katharine has gone to their landlord’s, the Laird of Drumelzier, to see if he can intercede to save her father from death; while the goodwife Maron, left without the priest’s spiritual guidance to shelter her from the evil strength of the Brownie, has abandoned the farm of Chapelhope. In other words, Hogg shows the Laidlaw family—the microcosm that should symbolise national unity and cohesion—completely disintegrating as a consequence of Maron’s blind religious ideology which, instead of fortifying her soul and giving her the strength to overcome such perilous moment, has completely drained her of any energy to protect her family. Hogg’s deep Christian faith made him particularly intolerant of those institutionalised figures such as Clerk who took advantage of the power derived from their religious position.

The narrator informs us that ‘everything about the farm was going fast to confusion when Katharine returned from her mission to the Laird of Drumelzier. Thus it was that she found *her father’s house deserted, its doors locked up, and its hearth cold*’ (p. 117, emphasis mine). Hogg then portrays Katharine as a proactive heroine, a single woman who saves her familial macrocosm from ruin: a new, unorthodox allegory of the Scottish nation. In this light, Katharine’s apparent voice clash with the *heteroglot* world of the Scottish Borders acquires new significance, as it represents Hogg’s wish to establish a more valuable model of the Scottish nation and a more realistic representation of British moral values than the ‘poor shilly-

shally milk-an'-water' ladies of early nineteenth century Edinburgh. The tragic aspect, however, is that Hogg presents a primary heroine who does not marry and hence does not provide an offspring to 'ensure the continuation of the nation' (Camden 2010: 4), a trait that Camden associates with the secondary heroine.

### *Tibby Hyslop's respectable spinsterhood*

In the early nineteenth century, the female peasantry of the Scottish Borders had to come to terms with a far more tragic reality than the one experienced by the bourgeois ladies living in a safe domestic microcosm. In 'Tibby Hislop's Dream', Hogg depicts the hardships of women's rural life, merging magic and realism and 'posing folk beliefs against elite conventions of rationality'.<sup>17</sup> Harris argues that 'works of the literary fantastic use aspects of supernatural folklore [...to] present voices and perspectives of unofficial culture [...] that contradict the mindset of rational, religious, and imperial power' (2008: 34). This is what happens in Hogg's tale as well.

In addition, though on the surface Tibby may appear to function as Bakhtinian fool, as her innocence reveals the opportunism of the anti-heroes who court her—her master Gilbert Forret, who attempts to rape her, and John Jardine, a calculating man famous for having neglected his previous wife, who wishes to make Tibby his new spouse—Hogg invests this female character with a far more important role. Tibby not only exposes the problems that afflicted the women of her peasant class at the time of imperial expansion, but she also stands as a metaphor for rural Lowland Scotland.

---

<sup>17</sup> Jason Marc Harris, *Folklore and the Fantastic in Nineteenth-Century British Fiction* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008), p. 33.

In ‘Tibby Hyslop’s Dream’, Gilbert Forret leases a farm in the Scottish Borders towards the end of the eighteenth century. A married man with a large family of his own, he leers at young, beautiful women whom he hires as dairy maids and then seduces. Forret is a man without fear of God. The Presbyterian elders of his parish have admonished him several times for his debauched behaviour—though not publicly, perhaps because he managed to pay a little token for the poor (see chapter three). As T. M. Devine has noted ‘[i]t became much more common for kirk sessions to demand a monetary fine rather than the public appearance of the sinner before the congregation’ (2006b: 88), particularly when the case involved a prosperous master, like Gilbert Forret, who could support the church financially.

Hogg’s short tale appeared for the first time in *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine* in June 1827 and, shortly after, in the collection *The Shepherd’s Calendar* in 1829. The 1829 tale, however, is a toned-down version excised of any sexual innuendoes thanks to the intervention of James Hogg’s nephew, Robert Hogg, who accommodated it to the dominant nineteenth-century sense of decorum. Douglas S. Mack observes that Robert Hogg was ‘anxious to tone down his uncle’s indelicacy in writing about [Gilbert Forret’s] sexual pursuit of Tibby’, though these ‘extensive revisions remove much of the vigour and vitality of ‘Tibby Hyslop’s Dream’’.<sup>18</sup>

As mentioned above in this chapter, Forret is a usurper of the Scottish land, as his improper cultivation without rotating crops threatens the fertility of the farm he leases. Mack has suggested that ‘[j]ust as he sought to rape Tibby, so he seeks to rape the farmland on which he is tenant’ (Mack 2006: 62). Since Tibby signifies rural

---

<sup>18</sup> Douglas S. Mack, ‘Hogg, Blackwood and *The Shepherd’s Calendar*’, in *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference (Edinburgh 1985)*, ed. by Hughes, pp. 24-31 (pp. 29-30). For a detailed account of the variants in ‘Tibby Hyslop’s Dream’ between the version in *Blackwood’s Edinburgh Magazine* (1827) and *The Shepherd Calendar* (1829) see Douglas S. Mack, ‘Editing James Hogg’ (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Stirling, 1984), pp. 126-40.

Lowland Scotland, then Gibby Forret's threat to rape her does not merely reiterate his abusive behaviour, but rather symbolises an attempt to violate the Scottish land. Hogg lamented the harsh conditions endured by the peasantry in the Scottish Borders after the Napoleonic Wars, claiming that the relationship between master and servants had greatly deteriorated. The new masters might have enjoyed better financial conditions as a result of imperial expansion, but their acquisition of multiple farms had also distanced them from their servants and resulted in a loss of familial communion.<sup>19</sup>

In light of this, the excision of the sexual allusions in 'Tibby Hyslop's Dream' acquires a new significance. The revision of the tales for a collection was important because it would reach a wider female readership than a magazine. In a letter to Hogg of 28 May 1828, Thomas Pringle laments that a poem he received for the annual *Friendship's Offering* was

too strange & droll, & 'high-kilted' for the very 'gentle' publication now under my charge: were it for a Magazine or some such work I should not feel so particular but for these "douce" and delicate publications the annuals I think it rather inappropriate [...] I think it ought to be a rule [...] to admit not a single expression which would call up a blush in the Cheek of the most delicate female if reading aloud to a mixt company.<sup>20</sup>

Indeed, as Thomas C. Richardson observes, the annuals and gift-books were collections of works by contemporary authors which 'normally appeared late in the year to serve the Christmas market and usually were directed towards a female or

---

<sup>19</sup> James Hogg, 'On the Changes in the Habits, Amusements and Condition of the Scottish Peasantry', in *A Shepherd's Delight: A James Hogg Anthology*, ed. by Steel, pp. 40-51 (pp. 43-45); see chapter two.

<sup>20</sup> National Library of Scotland MS 2245, ff. 122-23; quoted in Douglas S. Mack, 'Hogg, Blackwood and The Shepherd's Calendar', in *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference (Edinburgh 1985)*, ed. by Hughes, pp. 24-31 (p. 28).

genteel audience'.<sup>21</sup> However, the removal of the sexual hints from the 1829 edition of 'Tibby Hyslop's Dream' not only excises the tale of anything threatening to raise a blush to the face of young bourgeois ladies, but it also deprives the story of the pointed social critique that Hogg conveys through Forret's simultaneous threats to the Scottish land and Tibby's body. Hogg invested the latter with the cultural role of regional allegory, exposing contemporary issues of gender and class exploitation on the part of 'agricultural innovators' (Mack 2006: 65) like Gilbert Forret at the time of empire's growth. If Forret's attempt to violate Tibby's body is toned down, then the negative effects of Scotland's internal colonisation are also blurred. The sexual abuse by Tibby's master, on the other hand, reveals the harsh conditions of the female peasantry in Lowland Scotland. Hogg thus voices a reality that is not part of the élite, presenting Tibby as a peasant heroine who does not fall thanks to her Christian values and traditional beliefs.

A succession of dreams shapes the plot, prophesying Tibby's future happiness—in her socially respected spinsterhood—and her master's punishment through death. Hogg's hesitation between divine judgment and supernatural divination conveys a great sense of mystery to the tale; while tradition, once again, represents an important cultural value: God conveys his message through dreams so as to relieve the poor from the hardships of life. But, most importantly, Hogg presents Tibby as a 'respectable spinster', and spinsterhood as a positive choice, thus distancing his tale from the more conventional closure with marriage in contemporary fiction.

---

<sup>21</sup> Thomas C. Richardson, 'James Hogg and *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*: Buying and Selling the Ettrick Shepherd', in *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace*, ed. by Alker and Nelson, pp. 185-99 (p. 193).



Forret offers generous wages to Tibby, wishing to enjoy her physically; but his hopes are dashed by the young girl who, though inexperienced with life and innocent in her heart, is endowed with great integrity derived from her strong Christian faith. After having escaped rape by her master who, for this reason, reduces her to destitution, Tibby is called as a witness in court and, unwittingly, provides evidence of her master's exploitation of the land through improper cultivation practices. The fantastic aspect of the tale is achieved through Tibby's dream about her master:

A great number of rooks and hooded crows were making free with his person;—some picking out his eyes, some his tongue, and some tearing out his bowels. But in place of being distressed by their voracity, he appeared much delighted, encouraging them on all that he could[.] [...] In the midst of this horrible feast, down came a majestic raven [...which] opened the breast of his victim [...] and after preying on his vitals for some time, at last picked out his heart, and devoured it[.] (p. 152)

During her testimony in court, Tibby is astounded when she recognises 'her master's counsel and the Dumfries writers and notaries [...] as the birds that she saw, in her dream, devouring her master' (p. 157). Tibby eventually finds her master's corpse after he has committed suicide in a secluded area, 'woefully defaced by these voracious birds of prey' (p. 161).

Magdalene Redekop views Tibby Hyslop as 'Hogg's version of the idiot or the fool who acts as a vessel for an oracular truth', adding that though 'Mr Forret's efforts are foiled, [...] his actions start a chain of events that bring down on him a horrible vengeance for having sought to defile the pure' (1988: 35). Tibby certainly plays the role of Bakhtinian fool in Hogg's tale, as her innocence exposes her master's despicable intentions. However, Bakhtin's static notion of the fool figure does not do justice to Tibby's evolution as a character within Hogg's tale. The

narrative voice describes her as unearthly, claiming that ‘there was something in her manner and deportment different from other people—a *sort of innocent simplicity, bordering on silliness, together with an instability of thought, that, in the eyes of many, approached to abstraction*’ (p. 142, emphasis mine). Yet, Tibby grows aware of the world, since when talking to John Jardine, the local cooper who ‘knew every man, and every man’s affair—every woman, and every woman’s failings’ (p. 153), she admits rather tragically that ‘life’s naething but a fight [...] frae beginning to end’ (p. 153).

Tibby’s character is a mixture of innocence and common sense, derived from her deep knowledge of the Bible. Though ‘in the eyes of many’ her simplicity ‘border[ed] on silliness, [...] then Tibby could repeat the book of the Evangelist Luke by heart, and many favourite chapters both of the Old and New Testaments’ (p. 142). When Forret attempts to rape her, Tibby’s ‘grandmother’s voice’ rescues her from such threat (p. 147), as after an ominous dream old Aunt Douglas sent her sister to Mr Forret’s farm. The narrative voice of the Ettrick Shepherd then informs the readers that

Mr Forret, alias Gledging Gibby, had borne the brunt of incensed kirk-sessions before that time, and also the unlicensed tongues of mothers, roused into vehemence by the degradation of beloved daughters; but never in his life did he bear such a rebuke as he did that day from the tongue of one he had always viewed as a mere simpleton. It was a lesson to him—a warning of the most sublime and terrible description, couched in the pure and emphatic language of Scripture. (pp. 147-48)

Hogg therefore presents Tibby as a character who goes beyond the typical Bakhtinian fool since, in addition to revealing her master’s flaws, she reacts with impressive strength to his attempt at raping her. Tibby’s non-violated body thus becomes a symbol of rural Scotland, whose inhabitants in the early nineteenth century may find relief both in God and tradition: two important values for the

peasant society which do not clash with each other because God may convey his message through dreams. In 'Cousin Mattie', Flora's mother claims that 'the Almighty [...] made nothing in vain, and if dreams had been of no import to man, they would not have been given to him' (*Winter Evening Tales*, p. 437).

In 'Tibby Hyslop's Dream', issues of class, gender, nation, and empire are closely related to each other: Tibby voices the negative consequences of Scotland's internal colonisation on the female peasantry at a time when the upper-middle classes were benefiting economically from global imperial development. Hogg exploits the threat of Tibby's rape as a social metaphor to denounce the abuse of the lower classes, and her innocence to highlight the opportunism of her master:

When he [Tibby's master] would snatch a kiss or two, Tibby did not in the least comprehend the drift of this; but, convinced in her heart that it could mean something *holy, and good, and kind*, she tried not further to reflect on it, for she could not; but she blessed him in her heart, *and was content to remain in her ignorance of human life*. (p. 146, emphases mine)

Through the technique of free indirect discourse, Hogg incorporates Tibby's thoughts within the narrative voice: 'holy, and good, and kind' are words that Tibby herself would pronounce to describe her master. Tibby's innocence, however, at this early stage of the tale exposes the rhetorical dynamics of modern progress in the internal colonisation of Scotland.

Tibby's state of 'abstraction' from worldly matters renders her similar to another of Hogg's female characters: Kilmeny in *The Queen's Wake* (1813). Douglas S. Mack has suggested that 'as the sinless woman who couldna remain, Kilmeny is a marvellous poetic symbol; but by her nature she has only a limited capacity to be a

role model for mortal women'.<sup>22</sup> Similarly, when considering Forret's intentions, Tibby's prophetic aunt exclaims: 'Poor Tibby!—as lang as the heart disna gang wrang, we maun (must) excuse the head, for it'll never aince (once) gang (go) right. *I hope they were baith made for a better warld, for nane o' them were made for this*' (p. 145, emphasis mine). Though endowed with the same purity as Kilmeny, Tibby is 'a role model for mortal women', because she manages to maintain her integrity in the real world. This aspect renders Tibby similar to another of Hogg's female characters: Mary Lee in *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, who comes back from fairy Heaven for 'she must also learn to play her full part in the life of "this world of sorrow and pain"—the world that Kilmeny left behind her' (Mack 1992: 70)—the world where, according to Tibby, 'life's naething but a fight [...] frae beginning to end' (p. 153).

Mack observes that Hogg sets Kilmeny as a prototype of the Blessed Virgin (1992: 68-75). It might be argued that Hogg views Tibby in the same terms, juxtaposing her to the hypocritical conceptualisation of the morally blessed heroine of contemporary bourgeois novel. Yet, while Kilmeny is moved to fairyland since no worldly man deserves to become her husband: 'It wasna her hame, and she couldna remain; | She left this world of sorrow and pain, | And returned to the land of thought again',<sup>23</sup> Hogg leaves Tibby unmarried in the earthly world, defying the conventional closure of the heroine's marriage to the hero.

Through the *heteroglot* voice of Tibby's grandmother, Hogg claims that 'there is neither sin nor shame in being unwedded, but there may be baith in joining yourself to an unbeliever' (p. 155). Considering what Murray G. H. Pittock writes in

---

<sup>22</sup> Douglas S. Mack, 'Hogg and the Blessed Virgin Mary', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 3 (1992), 68-75 (p. 70).

<sup>23</sup> James Hogg, *The Queen's Wake*, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2005 [1813]), p. 296.

relation to ‘the voice of the rural peasantry of Scotland in Hogg’ as ‘the voice of common sense’, particularly ‘when it is represented in direct speech’,<sup>24</sup> it may be argued that through Tibby’s grandmother Hogg suggests a different solution to the idealised marriage of bourgeois fiction, implying that this does not necessarily represent the best choice for the lower classes. Chapter three details how difficult it was for such a couple to achieve the financial security necessary to support a family of their own. Even when such circumstance was achieved, marriage did not necessarily represent a wise choice for women. In ‘Tibby Hyslop’s Dream’, Mr Forret’s wife lives a life of shame and humiliation and, perhaps, of destitution after her husband’s suicide; while, according to Tibby’s grandmother, John Jardine ‘is not the man to lead a Christian life with [...] it is weel kend how sair he neglected his first wife’ (p. 155). Spinsterhood can thus be a far more positive choice than marriage when there are no heroes and Tibby, the symbol of rural Lowland Scotland, is allowed to circulate freely in the North British Empire as a highly respected single woman.

Once again, Hogg presents his own revisitation of the marriage trope, as the tale does not conclude with a union between the primary heroine and the hero. Tibby’s unmarried condition hence signals a threat to Scottish national identity, as Scotland is left without progeny for the future. The absence of Tibby’s offspring, however, depicts a far more realistic picture of Hogg’s rural Scotland. The marriage trope promoted in contemporary progressive novels looked for political reconciliation between England and Scotland, promoting ‘adjustment to English cultural and linguistic norms’, which was certainly embraced by ‘members of the

---

<sup>24</sup> Murray G. H. Pittock, ‘Narrative Strategies in ‘The Brownie of the Black Hags’’, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 14 (2003b), 30-37 (p. 35).

Scottish élite', who could benefit from the wealth derived from imperial expansion; but 'the poor and dispossessed of subaltern Scotland', of whom Tibby is a representative, had 'very little direct access to the material rewards of Empire' (Mack 2006: 6-7). As Mack argues, 'Tibby Hyslop's Dream' raises

searching questions about the values and assumptions of the powerful people in the North British society of his day. [...]he economic and social changes that took place in rural Scotland around the time of the Napoleonic Wars do not necessarily add to Progress. These changes may well have been good news for "a fine gentleman" (a farmer or a landowner), but they can be seen as very bad news indeed for a "menial" like Tibby, who has ceased to be "a member of a community," and has become "a slave; a servant of servants, a mere tool of labour." [...] In 'Tibby Hyslop's Dream' this exploration of a contrast between an older and a more modern set of values is very far from asserting that this move from old to new amounts to the Progress so valued by the North British elite of the early nineteenth century. [...] Gibby, the exploiter, is detached from any sense of community, and from any sense of religion. [...] Gibby and Tibby, then, embody a contrast between the new ways and the old; but in presenting this contrast, Hogg's story unexpectedly subverts some of the assumptions of the new North Britain about the nature of progress and social change. (2006: 58-62)

It can thus be argued that Tibby's spinsterhood performs a cultural role within Hogg's tale, pulling against the idealised matrimonial resolution of the national tale and the historical novel. The tale's magic realism questions constructions of Scottish nationhood in the nineteenth century revealing how they were strictly entangled with structures of power and wealth, where cultural assumptions about class, gender, and ethnicity played an important role for the benefit of the Edinburgh middle class. Tim Killick argues that '[i]n his tales, Hogg articulated the values of a section of society that did not necessarily share the ideals of urban Scotland',<sup>25</sup> while Mack observes that in the tales of *The Shepherd Calendar* 'the narrative voice is that of the Ettrick Shepherd speaking as a representative of the Ettrick community (2006: 57). This is why, though in a letter to William Blackwood of 28 May 1827 Hogg hoped that

---

<sup>25</sup> Tim Killick, 'Hogg and the Collection of Short Fiction in the 1820s', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 15 (2004), 21-31 (p. 29).

‘Tibby Hyslop will be accounted a good tale’, its reception was rather cold (*Collected Letters*, vol. 2, p. 266).

### **Queen Hynde and the critical debate with the ‘Maid of Dunedin’**

This final section will focus on James Hogg’s most ambitious work: his epic poem *Queen Hynde* published in 1824, soon after the release of his famous novel *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*. Choosing a literary genre associated with Virgil and Homer, as well as entering in competition with Macpherson’s *Ossian Poems*, was certainly ambitious, as ‘Hogg’s poem sets out, audaciously, to offer a shepherd-bard’s modern reinvention of the venerable epic genre’ (Mack 2009: 141).

The *Confessions* had been received negatively by contemporary reviewers for its double narrative and the value conferred upon marginal voices, among them a prostitute’s (see chapter three). Disappointed, Hogg resumed his modern epic *Queen Hynde* as a platform from which to defend himself against charges of indelicacy, attacking contemporary critics and mocking Edinburgh’s bourgeois ladies for hiding their hypocrisy behind a mask of politeness. *Queen Hynde* was written in two stages: in 1817 up to line 1071 of Book Third; and in 1824, when the poem was completed just before its publication.<sup>26</sup> The address to bad reviewers in the concluding lines of Book Fifth is dated just after the negative reception of Hogg’s *Confessions*.

Unfortunately for Hogg, *Queen Hynde* was not received well by contemporary reviewers. Gillian Hughes observes that ‘[i]t was described as incongruous in tone and characterisation, and even impious and irreverent’, and ‘six

---

<sup>26</sup> Suzanne Gilbert and Douglas S. Mack, ‘Introduction’, in *Queen Hynde*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Suzanne Gilbert and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1998a [1824]), pp. xi-lxix (p. xiv).

months after publication more than a thousand of the fifteen hundred copies printed remained unsold and most of the edition was eventually remaindered' (2007: 195). Hogg did not expect such failure and in a letter to William Blackwood of 24 February 1827 he claimed: 'I am grieved as well as disappointed that *Queen Hynde* should stick still. I cannot believe that she does not deserve notice and think some expedient should be fallen on to draw notice to her' (*Collected Letters*, vol. 2, p. 258).

*Queen Hynde* demonstrates again how Hogg challenged accepted ideas about literature, culture, and society in early nineteenth-century Britain, engaging with gender in sophisticated (though often contentious) ways. Hogg's transgression of conventional norms of literary politeness and delicacy, his skilful mixture of the serious and the burlesque, his overlapping of literary genres, and his unconventional rewriting of the marriage plot contributed enormously to the subversiveness of *Queen Hynde*. The anonymous commentator of the *Literary Gazette*, for example, was unsure 'whether [Hogg] mean[t] to be serious or burlesque',<sup>27</sup> and probably viewed him as failing to satisfy the expectations of the post-Enlightenment readership. This reviewer considered Hogg's poem to be 'the work of unquestionable talent, but miserably deformed by want of taste and judgment' (p. 817). He thus failed—or probably pretended not—to recognise the critique that Hogg was making of the gender roles which emerged in Britain during the period of imperial expansion (see introduction).

Chapters one and three demonstrate how the openness with which Hogg addressed prostitution and unwed motherhood clashed with bourgeois norms of

---

<sup>27</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *Queen Hynde*', *Literary Gazette*, 414 (1824), pp. 817-19 (p. 817).



decorum, as his lack of inhibition in dealing with such matters was perceived as threatening the positive face of bourgeois women, and their social function in the construction of the British Empire. Bourgeois women had an important role in the conceptualisation of nationhood; it is thus no wonder that Hogg was accused by *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine* of being 'too fond of calling some things by their plain names, which would be better expressed by circumlocution'.<sup>28</sup> Nevertheless, in *Queen Hynde*, Hogg declares his intellectual freedom from contemporary conventions of propriety, exploiting the conventional dynamics between the primary and the secondary heroine encountered in the nineteenth-century British novel.

Hogg conveys his declaration of independence in two different ways. Firstly, through the narrator's exophoric address to his implied readers Hogg's linguistic acts range from extreme impoliteness, when addressing bad reviewers, to mock impoliteness, when teasing bourgeois ladies' prudery. In *Queen Hynde*, the narrative voice threatens the positive face of both groups, with no regard for their social status and power; however, Hogg also manages to convey such threats with great irony, showing a degree of human respect for his ladies, as he alternates between 'leering gallantry and heavy-handed chaffing', as Ian Duncan observes.<sup>29</sup>

Yet, Hogg also communicates his poetic independence at a more implicit level, by setting the eponymous Queen Hynde, a textual representation of Edinburgh's bourgeois ladies, in intra-textual relation with her maid of honour: the unruly Wene. Mack claims that Wene mirrors the supernatural aspect of Hogg's poetry, performing an important aesthetic function in addition to being a 'mischief-

---

<sup>28</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *Winter Evening Tales*', *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, 7 (1820), pp. 148-54 (p. 154) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 2 May 2012].

<sup>29</sup> Ian Duncan, 'Review of The Stirling/South Carolina Research Edition of the Collected Works of James Hogg, Volume 6, *Queen Hynde*, ed. by Suzanne Gilbert and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1988)', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 9 (1998), 137-42 (p. 138).

making' player (2009: 143). Indeed, Hogg describes Wene's charm in the same 'witchery' terms as those in which he depicts the Queen of the Fairies, his poetic muse, addressing the latter soon after his attack on bad reviewers. A textual analysis of the Queen of the Fairies' passage exhibits noun and adjectival phrases reminiscent of the mischievous Wene, whom Hogg sets as a symbol of both women's freedom from bourgeois cultural constraints and of his own independence from literary conventions.

The epic poem *Queen Hynde* has to be read against a cultural context where Hogg failed to observe not only the polite norms of literary decorum, but also the expectations surrounding the literary transaction between author and reader, having engaged with a literary genre which was considered too sophisticated for a self-educated shepherd. Hogg's engagement with ballads and songs was received positively, as it embraced the Romantic ideal of the self-tutored peasant poet; but by addressing a more prestigious genre such as the epic, Hogg was destined to find a rather prejudiced reception.

New research on labouring-class poets and their engagement with epic has shown that Hogg was not the only self-tutored author who, during the Romantic period, went beyond the folk tradition of ballads and songs. For example, there are long epics such as John Nicholson's *Airedale in Ancient Times* (1825), 'a chronicle of the natural and human history of the Aire River valley in Yorkshire'; and James Bird's *The Vale of Slaughden* (1819), 'a story of the nineteenth-century invasion of Britain by the Danes'.<sup>30</sup> Both works are written in heroic couplets, like Hogg's *Queen Hynde*, thus breaking with the blank verse 'employed concurrently in

---

<sup>30</sup> See Scott McEathron, 'Labouring-Class Poetry', in *The Encyclopedia of Romantic Literature*, ed. by Frederick Burwick; associate editors Nancy Moore Goslee and Diane Long Hoeveler (Oxford: Blackwell, 2012), pp. 743-50 (p. 745).

Wordsworth's *Excursion* (1814), Shelley's *Alastor* (1816), and Keats's *Hyperion* (1820), [...] more traditionally associated with the epic legacy of Romanticism' (McEathron 2012: 745), and hence showing the authors' willingness to present themselves as intellectually capable of engaging with more sophisticated genres than ballads and songs, notwithstanding their social origins. Yet, even though 'these self-taught writers' could plausibly be assumed to be 'authoritative' voices, as they described local history and legends, they were still 'more artistically successful when [...] scal[ing] back their ambitions and wr[iting] in shorter forms' (McEathron 2012: 745). As Kirstie Blair claims, these authors suffered the influence and the 'role' of contemporary 'critics in constructing the figure of the labouring-class poet and defining traditions of labouring-class poetics'.<sup>31</sup>

In *Queen Hynde*, Hogg references and demystifies the melancholy of James Macpherson's *Ossian* poems, *Fingal* (1761) and *Temora* (1763), so much celebrated in the Romantic period. Similarly to Macpherson's epic, *Queen Hynde* describes the victory of Scotland 'over an invading Scandinavian army' (Mack 2009: 140); but while the action of Macpherson's poems 'is interwoven with tales of broken love and premature death' in an 'elegiac' tone (Fiona Stafford cited in Mack 2009: 140-41), Hogg presents a burlesque modern epic, which 'celebrates energy, liberation, hope and new beginning' (Mack 2009:141).

As Mack points out, Hogg's narrative strategy is also radically different from Macpherson's who '[f]amously and controversially, [...] had asserted that *Fingal* was a direct translation from the Gaelic poetry of Ossian, a third-century Scottish warrior bard' (2009: 141). On the contrary, *Queen Hynde* is presented as 'a modern

---

<sup>31</sup> See Kirstie Blair, 'Introduction', in *Class and the Canon: Constructing Labouring-Class Poetry and Poetics, 1750-1900*, ed. by Kirstie Blair and Mina Gorji (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), pp. 1-15, (p. 11).

performance by a nineteenth-century Scottish shepherd-bard, James Hogg', who addresses 'an equally modern poetry-reading audience', the 'Maid of Dunedin', where Dunedin is the old Gaelic name for Edinburgh (Mack 2009: 141).

The narrative voice, personifying the Ettrick Shepherd's himself, declares his intellectual freedom, 'mak[ing] no pretence of politeness' and presenting a 'literary impression' of 'a raucous oral performance' (Duncan 1998: 139):

Maid of Dunedin, thou may'st see,  
Though long I strove to pleasure thee,  
That now I've changed my timid tone,  
And sing to please myself alone;  
[...]  
Then leave to all his fancies wild  
Nature's own rude untutored child,  
And should he forfeit that fond claim  
Pity his loss but do not blame.<sup>32</sup>

Hogg, then, shows a teasing, flirtatious, and playful attitude towards his female implied reader, the Maid of Dunedin, claiming that

Have I not seen thy deep distress,  
Thy tears for disregarded dress?  
Thy flush of pride, thy wrath intense,  
For slight and casual precedence?  
And I have heard thy tongue confess  
Most high offence and bitterness!  
Yet sooth thou still art dear to me,  
These very faults I love for thee,  
Then, why not all my freaks allow?  
I have a few and so hast thou. (ll. 542-51, p. 18)

In these two passages Hogg shows, once again, a tension between a centripetal force towards social recognition and a centrifugal one towards his wish for independence, though he manages to celebrate his freedom without becoming an outsider thanks to his mocking and playful tone, thus striking the balance between his own individuality and his historical circumstances. Though some contemporary reviewers found

---

<sup>32</sup> James Hogg, *Queen Hynde*, ed. by Gilbert and Mack, ll. 1060-63, 1104-07, pp. 30-31.

Hogg's engagement with the epic genre rather ambitious for a self-tutored shepherd (Gilbert and Mack 1998a: xi), nor did they appreciate Hogg's mixture of the serious and the burlesque, the *Monthly Critical Gazette* judged Hogg's declaration of intellectual freedom as a passage of 'unequalled beauty in its kind; [...which] for tenderness, simplicity, and genuine feeling, cannot be excelled'.<sup>33</sup>

Hogg then engages in the dialectics between the primary and the secondary heroine of contemporary novels, juxtaposing Queen Hynde to her maid of honour, the wayward Wene. Yet, Hogg does not punish Wene with death for her defiant behaviour, but he actually rewards her with the title of Scandinavia's queen. In addition, Hogg endows Wene with a double critical function, as her character stands as a metaphor for both Hogg's and bourgeois women's freedom from hypocritical norms of propriety.

After a dream foretelling the Scandinavian invasion, where Queen Hynde is attacked by a 'roaring and foaming monster' (p. 14)—a dream reminiscent of the Scottish folktale 'The Black Bull of Norroway'<sup>34</sup>—the Queen, accompanied by her train of maids, goes to the isle of Iona to get some advice from Saint Columba who lives there in a monastery. Here Hogg sets one of the most hilarious passages of his epic, where the 'petul[a]nt and pesterous' (p. 27) Wene, who teases the friars of the community, is introduced as follows:

There was one maiden of the train  
Known by the name of wicked Wene;  
A lovely thing, of slender make,  
Who mischief wrought for mischief's sake,

<sup>33</sup> Anon., '[Review of] *Queen Hynde*', *Monthly Critical Gazette*, 2 (1825), pp. 343-47 (p. 345).

<sup>34</sup> Elaine E. Petrie, *Queen Hynde and the Black Bull of Norroway*, in *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference (Edinburgh 1985)*, ed. by Hughes, pp. 128-39.

And never was her heart so pleased  
 As when a man she vexed or teased.  
 By few at court she was approved,  
 And yet by all too well beloved;  
 So dark, so powerful was her eye,  
 Her *mein* so *witching* and so sly, [mein=mien, appearance]  
 That every youth, as she inclined,  
 Was mortified, reserved, or kind,  
 This day would curse her in disdain,  
 And next would sigh for wicked Wene.  
 No sooner had this *fairy* eyed  
 The looks demure on either side,  
 Than all her spirits 'gan to play  
 With keen desire to work deray.  
 Whene'er a face she could espy  
 Of more than meet solemnity,  
 Then would she tramp his crumpled toes,  
 Or with sharp fillip on the nose,  
 Make the poor brother start and stare,  
 With watery eyes and bristling hair.  
 And yet this wayward *elf* the while  
*Inflicted all with such a smile,*  
*That every monk, for all his pain,*  
*Looked as he wished it done again.*  
 (ll. 722-49, pp. 22-23, emphases mine)

Hogg presents Wene as endowed with magic power, a 'witching fairy', whose magnetism nobody resists. A comparison between Hogg's own manuscript and the first edition of *Queen Hynde*, however, shows that many passages where Wene plays her mocking tricks were deleted. The editors of the 1998 Stirling/South Carolina edition argue that though Hogg may have self-censored himself before delivering his manuscript to the publisher for the increasingly prudish climate of the 1820s, it is more probable that such deletions were the result of the alert activity of Ballantyne's copy-editors, who removed what they considered indelicate.<sup>35</sup> One of such omissions (not attributable to Hogg) describes Wene's delight at teasing the monks of Iona: 'O how the elf enjoyed the strife, | It was to her the balm of life; | But when her laugh could not be drowned, | She said 'twas thro' her sleep, and moaned!' (p. 30). Since

<sup>35</sup> See Suzanne Gilbert and Douglas S. Mack, 'Note on the Text', in *Queen Hynde*, written by Hogg, ed. by Gilbert and Mack (1998b), pp. 221-34 (p. 224).

Hogg places this passage just before his own declaration of intellectual freedom—  
 ‘Maid of Dunedin, thou may’st see, | Though long I strove to pleasure thee, | That  
 now I’ve changed my timid tone, | And sing to please myself alone’ (p. 30)—its  
 deletion in the first edition decreases enormously the impact of Wene’s symbolism of  
 freedom, hence blurring Hogg’s implicit critique of nationhood based on the gender  
 discourse of women’s sense of propriety.

At a more explicit level of literary communication, Hogg engages in another  
 exophoric address where the narrator, voicing the Ettrick Shepherd, attacks  
 contemporary bad reviewers and gently mocks Edinburgh bourgeois women, as  
 shown in the following:

He next debar[s] all those who dare,  
 Whether with proud and pompous air,  
 With simpering frown, or nose elate,  
 To name the word INDELICATE!  
 [...]  
 Such word or term should never be  
 In maiden’s mind of modesty.  
 [...]  
 But yet, for all thy airs and whims,  
 [...]  
 I must acknowledge in the end  
 To ’ve found thee still the poet’s friend,  
 [...]  
 Ah, how unlike art thou to those  
 Warm friends profest, yet covert foes!  
 (ll. 2260-63, 2268-69, 2276, 2278-79, 2286-87, p. 177)

In his linguistic act Hogg, once again, shows a tension between his own desire to  
 depict women without any hypocritical constraints of false delicacy and his own  
 wish to be accepted and acknowledged as a valuable author in his own right.

Significantly, Hogg’s defence from accusations of indelicacy in his exophoric  
 address to bad reviewers is followed by his address to the Queen of the Fairies, his  
 poetic muse and symbol of his Borders tradition—a narratorial strategy that

reinforces implicitly his freedom from cultural conventions. At a textual level, the charming description of the Queen of the Fairies is reminiscent of Wicked Wene:

Thou lovely queen of beauty, most bright,  
 And of everlasting new delight,  
 Of foible, of freak, of gambol and glee, [freak=whim]  
     *Of all that pleases,*  
     *And all that teases;*  
*All that we fret at, yet love to see!*  
 In *petulance*, pity, and love refined,  
 Thou emblem extreme of the female mind!  
 [...]  
 O well I know the *enchanting mein*  
 Of my loved muse, my Fairy Queen!  
 [...]  
*Her smile where a thousand witcheries play,*  
*And her eye that steals the soul away[.]*  
 (ll. 25-32, 43-44, 47-48, pp. 179-80, emphases mine)

The alluring effect of the Queen of the Fairies upon the Ettrick Shepherd is constructed by invoking the same adjectival, noun, and verbal phrases through which the narrator describes the enchanting effect of Wene upon the monks on the island of Iona—an aspect that confirms what Mack has argued in relation to Wene as a symbol of the ‘fairy’ nature of Hogg’s poetry. Thus, Hogg not only presents himself as the King of the ‘mountain and fairy school’, free from post-Enlightenment empiricist cultural conventions (Mack 2009: 147), but he also places this rebellious maid as a symbol of women’s freedom from bourgeois conventions of politeness.

Hogg declares his autonomy from conventions of propriety by arguing that in *Queen Hynde* he will represent women as they are, with all their flaws and qualities, and not as they should be:

Now I’ve called a patriot queen,  
 Of generous soul and courtly mein;  
*And I’ve upraised an unruly elf*  
*With faults and foibles like thyself.*  
*And these as women thou shalt see*  
*More as they are, than they should be.*  
 (ll. 1016-21, p. 56, emphasis mine)



To the dominant/centripetal language of the Maid of Dunedin, Hogg opposes the subversive/centrifugal voice of Wene, who thus becomes a symbol of women's freedom from bourgeois stereotypes of femininity, as well as a metaphor for Hogg's independence from nineteenth-century literary norms of decorum.

In *Queen Hynde*, both the primary and the secondary heroines engage in a marriage conducive to the political union between Ireland, Scotland, and Scandinavia. Even so, Hogg defies the national significance of the marriage trope in the way by which such unions are achieved. Wene is a sassy, outrageous secondary heroine, who manipulates events in order to gain the man she feels passionate about. By wearing the clothes of her Queen, Wene attracts the love of Prince Haco who will marry and transform her into a real queen. Her proactive behaviour has the effect of advancing her position in the social hierarchy—where women are usually allowed little power—providing an example to the Maid of Dunedin, so as not to be forced into unhappy marriages.

Hogg then interrogates assumptions of class and ethnicity through the marriage between Queen Hynde and M,Houston. Although later M,Houston is revealed to be King Eiden of Ireland in disguise as a Scots peasant, Queen Hynde takes the decision to marry him before such revelation takes place:

The queen descended to the green  
With lightsome step, but solemn mein;  
And passing Ross and Sutherland,  
She took M,Houston by the hand,  
And with a firm unaltered voice,  
Said, "Here I make my maiden choice.  
Since thou hast come without a meed  
To save me in my utmost need;  
And since, *though humbly born, thou art*  
*A prince and hero at the heart,*  
*So, next my saviour that's above,*  
*Hence thee I'll honour, bless, and love."*

(ll. 951-62, pp. 201-02, emphasis mine)

Similarly to the national tale and the historical novel contemporary to Hogg, in *Queen Hynde* Ireland and Scotland are united through the marriage of its main characters. In Hogg's text, however, the political significance of such a union is revealed only at the end because Hogg emphasises that M'Houston's sense of honour is what really leads to his final marriage with Queen Hynde. When disguised as a Scots peasant, M'Houston is the only warrior who offers to fight the Norse King Eric, the invader of Scotland; while the noble (by birth) warriors of Scotland lack the courage to defy the powerful King Eric in single combat:

The evening came, and still no knight  
Had proffered life for Scotia's right.  
The morning rose in shroud of gray  
That ushered in the pregnant day,  
Big with the germs of future fame,  
Of Albyn's glory or her shame!  
*And still no champion made demand  
Of fighting for his sovereign hand!*  
(ll. 374-81, p. 188, emphasis mine)

The Scots aristocrats, who 'made' no 'demand | Of fighting for his sovereign hand' do not accept M'Houston as their king because of his humble origins. Only when his real identity is revealed do they acknowledge him as their superior. Through this episode, Hogg exposes the cultural construction of social hierarchies: Queen Hynde respects M'Houston and chooses him as her husband because he is honourable at heart, while the Scots aristocrats value his social rank as King Eiden.

The class prejudices against M'Houston mirror the extra-literary snobbery that Hogg suffered from the Edinburgh literary élite, as has also been argued by Mack (2009: 151-53) and by Gilbert and Mack (1998a: xlv). Likewise, Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson have claimed that Hogg's humble social origins 'cause him

to question the political conservatism and inflexibility' of the Edinburgh literati.<sup>36</sup> They suggest that though Hogg was not a supporter of French revolutionary ideas, he did endorse the possibility of a flexible social order based on honourable values, showing that 'merit and heroism could and did exist outside the upper classes (Alker and Nelson 2001: 27). I argue that Hogg exploits the literary expedient of the marriage plot to communicate this point and to interrogate the prejudices against him on the part of the bourgeois literati of his time. Hogg then engages in the dialectics between primary and secondary heroine to show a proactive female character who enjoys the pleasures of life with no sense of shame and who, for this reason, advances her position in the social scale to the rank of 'Scandinavia's queen' with the man she chooses: Prince Haco who married and 'loved her to his latest day' (p. 216). Yet, Wene's advancement in the social scale also symbolises Hogg's freedom from literary conventions of propriety and his wish to situate himself at the top of the list as the 'king o' the mountain and fairy school'.<sup>37</sup>

---

<sup>36</sup> Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson, 'Marginal Voices and Transgressive Borders in Hogg's Epic *Queen Hynde*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 12 (2001), 25-39 (p. 26).

<sup>37</sup> James Hogg, *Anecdotes of Scott*, ed. by Rubenstein, p. 9.

## Conclusion

This project had two aims: to reveal Hogg's own awareness of how contemporary Scottish writers exploited gender stereotypes in promoting British ideology; and to show how new trends in the linguistic field of pragmatics can be used productively for the analysis of literary works, particularly when the author engages with criticism of social issues outwith the text at the time of writing. In the specific case of Hogg's work, a literary pragmatics supported by historical sources has shown theoretically Hogg's strategic use of language and narrative techniques, thereby shedding new light on why he parodied gender stereotypes, and on the ways in which these stereotypes then interacted with norms of class and ethnicity during emerging discourses of empire.

Being a self-educated author of humble origins, Hogg spoke from a position outside the Scottish literary élite. Paradoxically, this aspect allowed him to write more freely about the important issues of his age, including gender politics and Britain's imperial aims, which he revealed by giving voice to people from the margins. Chapter one has shown that Hogg did not shy away from the Edinburgh prostitution scandal of 1823, nor from critiquing the behaviour of the British élite towards the 'subaltern' classes. Indeed, Hogg's characters include some very memorable, proactive women from the margins such as Clifford in 'Basil Lee', Bell Calvert in the *Confessions*, and the title character in 'Tibby Hyslop's Dream'. Early critics, however, condemned Hogg's choice of subjects as too 'indelicate' for genteel audiences, and viewed his innovative narrative experiments as outrageous violations of literary decorum. Hogg's diverse texts, however, are remarkable for the alternatives they offer to the writing of the literary establishment of his day,

including Walter Scott. Hogg's style was received rather negatively because it infringed the rules of bourgeois readers' expectations; however, his persistence in addressing the same issues over and over again shows that his aim went beyond challenging such expectations.

Hogg voiced a different reality from the one represented in the *National Tale*, thereby challenging the assumptions upon which the identity of the bourgeoisie (the emerging class of the British Empire) was constructed. Today, Hogg's texts are being republished in their unbowdlerised versions to both critical and popular acclaim, and his works have met a favourable reception on the part of postmodern and postcolonial critics because they mirror twentieth-century criticism of issues related to class, gender, and ethnicity. Surprisingly, despite Hogg's engagement with these aspects in his works, there has been no substantial study of them. This project hence contributes to revealing Hogg's sophisticated approach to class, gender, and ethnicity in relation to early nineteenth-century discourses of empire, filling a significant gap in Hogg studies.

The four chapters of this project are linked by the trope of marriage, a thread which runs throughout the thesis, joining together the issues related to class, gender, and ethnicity that Hogg addresses in his works. Hogg deconstructs the trope of marriage by interrogating the ideology represented by the relationship between bourgeois heroine and fallen angel as portrayed in those contemporary novels that promoted the British Union at his time of writing.

Chapter two shows how Hogg parodies the cult of Highland masculinity based on ethnographic conceptualisations of strength and endurance, thereby questioning the imperial militaristic discourse that caused the death of so many

young men in the name of British patriotism during the Napoleonic Wars. Chapters one, three, and four expose how Hogg exploits consistently the motif of rape (resisted by female characters through cross-dressing) in order to expose the economic value of women's chastity at all social levels. Finally, chapters three and four reveal how Hogg fuses the two prototypes of delicate and transgressive heroine in one single character, thereby creating an unorthodox symbol for the Scottish nation.

Going beyond late twentieth-century feminist research into gender performativity, this thesis engages with new insights into the field of pragmatics, viewing Bakhtin's theory as a literary pragmatics in its embryonic phase. Exposing power relations in gender, class, and ethnicity through politeness theory, social deixis, and Bakhtin's socio-linguistics, this project traces how emerging discourses of British Empire contributed to the construction of *heteroglot* voices in Hogg's work, and how Hogg then co-adapted his own personal view about these power relations to the dominant discourse.

Chapter one shows how in *Perils of Man*, Hogg briefly hints at the celebration of the royal wedding between Princess Margaret and Lord Douglas, while conferring a longer narrative space to the comical performances of the friar's mule infuriated at the vain behaviour of one of the knights. Hogg then counteracts the symbolic significance of the royal wedding through the fantastic marriages between the witches and the devil. The hyperbolic description of the old wives' terrifying deaths after their first wedding night dashes any hope of happiness inherent in the previous royal marriages.

Chapter one exposes how in ‘Perils Two’ and ‘Three’ of *Perils of Woman* Hogg goes back to Culloden in 1745, retracing the negative consequences of the battle that determined the collapse of the Highland clans and the beginning of the Scottish Clearances. Hogg depicts a cyclical history which exhibits a reiteration of the same human errors rather than evolving in progressive stages: in that battle as much as in the Napoleonic Wars contemporary to Hogg. Sally Niven’s marriage of convenience leads to her death, and Hogg shows the negative effects of the battle of Culloden on this female protagonist’s and her little daughter’s neglected corpses. Hogg thus sets this tragic imagery as a metaphor for a Scottish nation with no promising future—a nation whose social contradictions cannot be healed in the political union with England.

Chapter two shows how the novella ‘Basil Lee’ questions constructions of the Highland myth by depicting a soldier scared to death when fighting against the enemy during the imperial wars in Quebec. The song ‘Donald Macdonald’ (1807) parodies the mystique of the Highlander by displaying a soldier so manipulated by ideological assumptions of loyalty that he would offer his soul to the devil to combat with valour for King George in the Napoleonic Wars. In *Perils of Woman*, Rickleton is an honourable model of sentimental masculinity, evolving from untamed to sensible man, and then truly sympathising with his wife by accepting her son (conceived with a previous lover) as his own. The long poem ‘Wat o’ the Cleuch’, a parody of Walter Scott’s poetic style, deconstructs the stereotype of the avaricious Lowlander by exposing the reality of a Lowland Scots from the margins, whose robberies and fixation on meat symbolise the exploitation of the peasantry by the Lowland upper and middle classes, the ones really prospering in the colonies. The

combat in *Perils of Man* between the English and the Scottish in Roxburgh castle, where the imagery of the pulsing heap of dying warriors shows the tragic consequences of war, conveys implicit criticism of the Napoleonic Wars: soldiers are manipulated by ideologies of ethnic difference to fight (at the expense of their life) for the economic gain of a few privileged men.

Chapter three argues that in early nineteenth-century Britain women's chastity was an important commodity at all levels of society. Among the higher classes, it guaranteed that properties were not transferred to an illegitimate child (Mitchison and Leneman 1998: 81); while among female servants, a good reputation was of the utmost importance when seeking a position (Symonds 1997: 2). The value of women's chastity, hence, affected both higher- and lower-class women's sexuality: the former were confined within the domestic sphere; while the reputation of the latter was constantly threatened by the sexual desire of the male bourgeoisie, a tool at the latter's disposal for containing the freedom of female servants to move between the public and the private sphere (Wills 2001: 94). Hogg counteracts the idealised representation of the devoted and loving heroine by exposing the reality of women at the margins of Lowland Scotland. Here, in the early nineteenth century, birth control was not an option, and women had to deal with more realistic problems. Illegitimate motherhood, infanticide, and prostitution affected the lives of a number of women, sometimes not only among the lower classes. Hogg's more realistic depiction, however, questioned the ideology inherent in contemporary representations of the delicate heroine.

Through analysis of *Mador of the Moor*, chapter three exposes the reality of two women from different social backgrounds: Ila Moore, the daughter of a tenant,



and Matilda, a lady from the gentry. Both women react in opposite ways to their illegitimate pregnancy: rather than committing a crime, Ila faces public repentance and keeps her child; while Matilda commits infanticide, in order not to tarnish the honour of her family's name and to keep the economic value of her supposed chastity. Hogg's contemporary critics were outraged by Hogg's implicatures. His use of the supernatural dimension to show the power of the fairies, the supposed unnecessary murder of the courtiers for plot development, and the obscure language of the song of the fairies flouted, respectively, Grice's maxims of quality, relevance, and manner. Hogg's critical goals were, on the one hand, to expose the strict morality of the Scottish Kirk through the plight of Ila, while simultaneously questioning the idealised heroine through the reality experienced by Matilda, who kills her child. Hogg then presents his own version of the marriage plot, by having Ila Moore, a lady at heart, married to the King of Scotland, the father of her child.

Analysed in the same chapter, *The Profligate Princes* exposes women's chastity as a patriarchal commodity among a declining aristocracy that cannot adjust to the advancements of the bourgeoisie: the latter have now the economic power to buy the noble titles of the former. Here Hogg poses the fictional voice of a shepherd, his own alter ego, as the bearer of the Christian values of forgiveness and acceptance by inviting a noble man, Sir March, to forgive his daughter pregnant out of wedlock. This request, however, clashed with contemporary bourgeois assumptions outwith the play, as it questioned the economic alliances inherent in the trope of marriage and the political interests of the British Union in the exploitation of the colonies.

In the short story 'Cousin Mattie', Hogg flouts Grice's maxims of manner and quantity by leaving an open end with a double line of asterisks, and the maxim of

quality by not rationalising the supernatural dimension of Mattie's foretelling dreams, which he offers as fictional tools to mirror gender issues in the female peasantry of the Scottish Borders. Hogg thus avoided threatening the positive face of his contemporary readers, who were left free to provide their own interpretation with regards to the causes for Mattie's and her illegitimate infant's death: a birth gone wrong during delivery; infanticide; or murder by her cousin Sandy, the child's father who flees after their death. Hogg here voices the failed cross-national marriage between the two protagonists, the Scottish Sandy and the English Mattie, depicting the less idealised reality of the rural Scottish Lowlands.

'Maria's Tale' voices blatantly the hardships of a female servant who loses her chastity, and hence her employment, after having being seduced and made pregnant by her master's son who then abandons her. Hogg published this tale three times with no revision during his lifetime, despite the negative reception of contemporary reviewers who felt outraged by the issues he addressed. In this tale, Hogg represents the female servant's body freely circulating between the domestic and the public spheres, whose freedom poses a threat to the male bourgeois identity. For this reason, Maria is tamed (seduced) and then expelled (abandoned).

In the *Confessions*, Hogg deconstructs the cultural dichotomy between the fallen angel and the pure heroine by merging these two stereotypes in one single character: Bell Calvert, a prostitute from the margins whose beautiful English marks a far different social origin. In addition, rather than leaving this controversial heroine in the background, Hogg has her counteract the reliability of the Editor, the narrator of the first part of the book, a prototype of the Edinburgh literary élite of his time.

In chapter four, ‘Tibby Hyslop’s Dream’ poses spinsterhood as a dignified solution to marriage when there are no heroes. The male characters of this short story are only interested in abusing Tibby’s body—a metaphor for the Scottish land exploited by selfish masters and a symbol of the gender grievances from which women of the peasant class suffered in the Scottish Borders in the early nineteenth century. Female servants had to defend their chastity to keep their reputation, but could also lose their position if they did not yield to their masters’ amorous requests.

Katharine Laidlaw, the strong heroine of the *Brownie of Bodsbeck*, saves her family from destruction with the help of the Covenanters, a persecuted religious sect in the late eighteenth century, whom she shelters and protects. Katharine, too, does not engage in any romance conducive to a final wedding because, in this novel, Hogg counters the discursive assumptions of the trope of marriage with the friendship between Katharine’s father, a Lowlander, and a Highland soldier, who saves the former from accusations of conspiracy against the king.

In the mock-epic *Queen Hynde*, the narrator in the person of the Ettrick Shepherd (namely Hogg) addresses directly his bad reviewers and bourgeois ladies, posing Wene (the secondary heroine) as a double symbol: of bourgeois women’s freedom from assumption of propriety and of his own intellectual freedom to depict women as they are and not as they should be, thereby refuting the principles of politeness established by his contemporary literary élite. Hogg then engages in his own re-elaboration of the marriage plot by having Queen Hynde, the primary heroine, marry the king of Ireland when disguised as a poor peasant because he is the only male character who behaves heroically, defending the Queen from the

Scandinavian invasion, while the male characters of the upper class are not brave enough to defy the Norse King Eric.

This project has shown that pragmatics can be applied productively to the analysis of literary texts because its eclecticism offers the possibility of developing a detailed discussion about three aspects of literary communication: the author, the text, and the reader. Analysis of an author's flouting of Grice's maxims enables a more theoretically based speculation about authorial intentions, as well as about how those intentions are then perceived by a historically positioned readership. Formal analysis of the text (enriched by historical and cultural information about the author's time of writing) is constructive when the linguistic features contribute to conveying the author's criticism of social issues outwith the text, which the reader has to recognise and evaluate in order to appreciate the literary work more fully. Relevance theory is productive in discussions about the reception of the text, particularly when negative reactions are influenced by class, gender, and ethnic prejudices, as in Hogg's case. Relevance theory is also important for its insight on the 'unitary context fallacy': no participant in the communicative process of literature will ever share the same cultural, historical, and social contexts—a fact which impacts on both the author's creation and the reader's recreation of the text and its world.

Likewise, a cultural and historical contextualisation of politeness theory offers an evaluative tool for discussing theoretically the author's intentions and the readers' reception of those supposed intentions. Both the production and the perception of politeness are a non-fixed continuum which changes through time, and which norms of class, gender, and ethnicity influence enormously: issues about prostitution and illegitimate pregnancy treated by Hogg may be acceptable to a

reader of the twenty-first century; yet, the British bourgeois readership of Hogg's time perceived the same topics as unacceptable. Hogg's failed observance of politeness principles, however, did not merely threaten social taboos but it also questioned bourgeois assumptions about contemporary emerging discourses of empire, thus exposing the economic exploitation of the lower classes inherent in the colonial enterprise both outwith and within Britain.

Brown and Levinson have developed politeness theories for face-to-face communication between two individuals, and only recently research in this field has focused on the dynamic within 'communities of practice', that is on the perception and evaluation of politeness by small groups of people. This project utilises politeness theory to explore the power relations at the level of social discourse among the Edinburgh literary élite in the early nineteenth century, whose members controlled what could be published according to their sense of propriety. New research should hence be developed into how both the production and the perception of literary politeness are influenced by historically conditioned norms of gender, class, ethnicity, age, education and so forth, and into how an author can then challenge such norms for critical purposes. The potentials of this phenomenon are enormous for literary criticism in Scottish literature and postcolonial studies, as well as for those literatures whose goal is to voice realities other than the socially accepted ones, as in Hogg's case.

Bakhtin was a literary pragmaticist in his first stage because carnivalesque and *heteroglot* voices challenge the rules of literary politeness by distancing themselves from what is considered to be the centripetal language of the dominant discourse. At the same time, however, these voices reveal a different reality of the

world outwith the text, thereby exposing that the perception of acceptable language represents only one side of society, namely the dominant class. English contemporary critics received negatively Hogg's use of the Scots language, judging it beyond their comprehension. This aspect of Hogg's *œuvre* violated the principles of what Sell (2000: 221-22) calls presentational politeness (how an author can flout Grice's maxims and then being perceived as impolite by his or her readers for this reason). Even so, Hogg kept voicing characters from the margins in broad Scots, and not for mere purposes of comic effects.

The literary pragmatics conceived of in this project does not concern only the dialogues of characters but literary communication in a broader sense. Literature is a case of language in use where an author conveys messages and a reader recreates the author's messages at different textual levels. A literary-pragmaticist critic should thus evaluate diverse aspects of the literary work: the words chosen by the author; the dialogues between the characters; the temporal and spatial settings of the text; the author's character constructions; the author's socio-historical position, gender, class, and ethnicity which certainly influence the textual writing; and the reader's socio-historical position, gender, class, and ethnicity which, on the other hand, affect the recreation of, reaction to, and interpretation of the text. All these features impact on the process of literary communication. Literary pragmatics thus provides the potential for discussing the author's supposed intentions, the text, and the historically positioned reader's reception of the text, without prioritising any of them.

The reactions to Hogg's supposed intentions by the critics of his time were prejudiced by Hogg's social origin. In the last issue of his weekly magazine *The Spy*, Hogg wrote that 'as his name became known the number of his subscribers

diminished. The learned, the enlightened, and polite circles of this flourishing metropolis, disdained either to be amused or instructed by the ebullitions of humble genius' (2000: 514). In her introduction to Hogg's periodical, Gillian Hughes observes that

[that was] a time when standards of politeness and delicacy were shifting rapidly towards later Victorian prudery' [...and] 'The Spy's Farewell to his Readers' also reveals that Hogg had utilised the work of his predecessors in the essay periodical in another way to expose the prejudices to which he was subject as a self-educated rustic. (2000a: xxxii)

In the same periodical, Hogg reflects on the 'impossibility of pleasing everybody', arguing that

[s]ince I began to publish *The Spy*, I am certain I have conversed with an [*sic*] hundred people about the best manner of conducting it, some who knew me, and some who did not; and I think there has never been three of them who proposed the same thing, or the same subjects: so as I find it is impossible to please every body, I will in future endeavour only to please myself; which I am convinced every writer must first do, before he can please others. (2000: 189)

Indeed, though Hogg failed to meet the expectations of a number of early nineteenth-century critics, he did not fail to please his own wishes, thereby fulfilling the expectations of postmodern and postcolonial critics, as well as those of twentieth- and twenty-first century readers.

## Bibliography

### Early Nineteenth-Century Criticism on Hogg

- Anon. 1807. '[Review of] *The Mountain Bard*', *Literary Panorama*, 2, August, pp. 957-60
- Anon. 1815. '[Review of] *The Hunting of Badlewe, A Dramatic Tale* [From the *Scottish Review*]', *Analectic Magazine*, May, pp. 353-67
- Anon. 1816 '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *British Lady's Magazine*, 4, October, pp. 251-55
- Anon. 1816. '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *Champion*, 9 June, pp. 181-82
- Anon. 1816. '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *Scots Magazine*, 78, June, pp. 448-51  
<<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 14 April 2014]
- Anon. 1816. '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *Critical Review*, 5th ser., 4, August, pp. 130-43 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012]
- Anon. 1816. '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *Literary Panorama*, n.s., 4, August, pp. 731-40
- Anon. 1816. '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *Monthly Review*, 81, December 1816, pp. 438-40 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012]
- Anon. 1816. '[Review of] *The Poetic Mirror*', *Eclectic Review*, 2nd ser., 6, November, pp. 507-11
- Anon. 1816. '[Review of] *The Poetic Mirror*', *Quarterly Review*, 15, July, pp. 468-75
- Anon. 1817. '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *Antijacobin Review*, 52, June, pp. 328-35 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012]



- Anon. 1817. '[Review of] *Mador of the Moor*', *Eclectic Review*, 2nd ser., 7, February, pp. 174-79 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012]
- Anon. 1818. '[Review of] *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*', *British Critic*, n.s., 10, October, pp. 403-18 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012]
- Anon. 1818. '[Review of] *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*', *Clydesdale Magazine*, 1, May, pp. 24-28 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012]
- Anon. 1818. '[Review of] *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*', *Clydesdale Magazine*, 1, July, pp. 121-25 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 24 March 2012]
- Anon. 1819. '[Review of] *Dramatic Tales* by the Author of "The Poetic Mirror"', *Monthly Review*, 88, February, pp. 183-85 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 25 June 2012]
- Anon. 1820. '[Review of] *The Jacobite Relics of Scotland (First Series)*, *Edinburgh Review*, 34, August, pp. 148-60
- Anon. 1820. '[Review of] *Winter Evening Tales*', *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, 7, pp. 148-54 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 2 May 2012]
- Anon. 1820. '[Review of] *Winter Evening Tales*', *British Critic*, n.s., 13, pp. 622-31 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 30 September 2011]
- Anon. 1820. '[Review of] *Winter Evening Tales*', [Gold's] *London Magazine*, 1, pp. 638-44
- Anon. 1820. '[Review of] *Winter Evening Tales*', *The Monthly Review*, 93, pp. 263-267 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 2 May 2012]
- Anon. 1820. '[Review of] *Winter Evening Tales*', *The Scotsman*, 29 April, pp. 143-44

- Anon. 1822. '[Review of] *The Three Perils of Man*', *La Belle Assemblée*, n.s., 26 October, pp. 429-30
- Anon. 1822. '[Review of] *The Three Perils of Man*', *Monthly Censor*, 1, pp. 467-69
- Anon. 1822. '[Review of] *The Three Perils of Man*', *Monthly Review*, 2nd ser., 99 (1822), pp. 439-40
- Anon. [John Wilson]. 1823. '[Review of] *The Three Peril of Woman*', *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, 14, pp. 427-37
- Anon. 1823. '[Review of] *The Three Perils of Woman*', *British Critic*, n.s., 20, pp. 357-61
- Anon. 1823. '[Review of] *The Three Perils of Woman*', *The British Magazine*, 1, pp. 364-74
- Anon. 1823. '[Review of] *The Three Perils of Woman*', *Literary Chronicle*, 228, 27 September, pp. 615-16
- Anon. 1823. '[Review of] *The Three Perils of Woman*', *Literary Gazette*, 345, pp. 546-48 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 3 May 2011]
- Anon. 1824. '[Review of] *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *British Critic*, n.s., 22, July, pp. 68-80
- Anon. 1824. '[Review of] *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *The Ladies' Monthly Museum*, 20, p. 106
- Anon. 1824. '[Review of] *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *The London Literary Gazette*, Saturday 17 July, pp. 449-51
- Anon. 1824. '[Review of] *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *Monthly Critical Gazette*, 1, pp. 436-38

- Anon. 1824. '[Review of] *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *New Monthly Magazine*, 12, p. 506
- Anon. 1824. '[Review of] *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *Westminster Review*, 2, pp. 560-62
- Anon. 1824. '[Review of] *Queen Hynde*', *Literary Gazette*, 414, pp. 817-19
- Anon. 1825. '[Review of] *Queen Hynde*', *Monthly Critical Gazette*, 2, pp. 343-47
- Gray, Mary. 1811. 'To the Spy', *The Spy: A Periodical of Literary Amusement and Instruction*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2000 [1810-1811]), No 32, Saturday 6 April, pp. 320-27

### Works by James Hogg

- Hogg, James [J.H. Craig of Douglas Esq.]. 1814a. *The Hunting of Badlewe: A Dramatic Tale* (London: Colburn)
- 1814b. 'Preface', in *The Hunting of Badlewe: A Dramatic Tale*, written by James Hogg (London: Colburn), pp. v-viii
- 1816. '[Review of] *The Hunting of Badlewe*', 28 February, Beinecke Rare Books and Manuscript Library, Yale University: James Hogg Collection GEN MSS 61, Box I, Folder 23
- 1816. 'Wat o' the Cleuch', in *The Poetic Mirror*, written by James Hogg (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme, and Brown; Edinburgh: John Ballantyne), pp. 55-129 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 6 December 2012]

- 1817. *The Profligate Princes*, in *Dramatic Tales*, written by James Hogg, 2 vols (Edinburgh: James Ballantyne), vol. 2, pp. 1-187 <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 2 August 2011]
- 1976 [1818]. *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press)
- 1985 [Feb. 1831–Sept 1832]. ‘On the Changes in the Habits, Amusements and Condition of the Scottish Peasantry’, in *A Shepherd’s Delight: A James Hogg Anthology*, ed. by Judy Steel (Edinburgh: Canongate), pp. 40-51
- 1996 [1822]. *The Three Perils of Man: War, Women and Witchcraft*, ed. by Douglas Gifford (Edinburgh: Canongate Classics)
- 1997 [1834]. *A Series of Lay Sermons on Good Principles and Good Breeding*, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)
- 1998 [1824]. *Queen Hynde*, ed. by Suzanne Gilbert and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)
- 2000 [1810-1811]. *The Spy: A Periodical of Literary Amusement and Instruction*, written by Hogg and others, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)
- 2002 [1823]. *The Three Perils of Woman; or Love, Leasing, and Jealousy: A Series of Domestic Scottish Tales*, ed. by Antony Hasler and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)
- 2002 [1824]. *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*, ed. by Peter D. Garside (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)

- 2002 [1829]. ‘Tibby Hyslop’s Dream, and the Sequel’, in *The Shepherd Calendar*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 142-62
- 2004 [1834]. *Anecdotes of Scott*, ed. by Jill Rubenstein (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)
- 2004a [1820]. ‘Cousin Mattie’, in *Winter Evening Tales*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 433-41
- 2004b [1820]. ‘Maria’s Tale: Written by Herself’, in *Winter Evening Tales*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 151-58
- 2004c [1820]. ‘The Renowned Adventures of Basil Lee’, in *Winter Evening Tales*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Ian Duncan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 3-79
- 2004-08. *The Collected Letters of James Hogg*, ed. by Gillian Hughes, Douglas S. Mack, Robin MacLachlan, and Elaine Petrie, 3 vols (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)
- 2005 [1813]. *The Queen’s Wake*, ed. by Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)
- 2005 [1816]. *Mador of the Moor*, ed. by James E. Barcus (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)
- 2005 [1832]. ‘Memoirs of the Author’s Life’, in *Altrive Tales*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Gillian Hughes (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 11-52

- 2007 [1807]. ‘Donald Macdonald’, in *The Mountain Bard*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Suzanne Gilbert (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 108-09
- 2008 [1815]. *The Pilgrims of the Sun*, in *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Jill Rubenstein, Gillian Hughes, and Meiko O’Halloran (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 3-50
- 2008a [1822]. ‘The Field of Waterloo’, in *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Jill Rubenstein and others (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 123-41
- 2008b [1822]. ‘Notes to *The Pilgrims of the Sun*’, in *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems*, written by James Hogg, ed. by Jill Rubenstein and others (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 148-52.
- 2010. ‘An Essay on Sheep-Farming and Population’, in *Highland Journeys*, written by James Hogg, ed. by H. B. de Groot (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 195-223

### Secondary Sources

- Anon. [An Anti-Papist]. 1757. ‘Letter to the Author of the *Scots Magazine*’, *Scots Magazine*, 19, 9 February, pp. 80-82
- Anon. [A Country Elder]. 1757. ‘Letter to the Author of the *Scots Magazine*’, *Scots Magazine*, 19, August, pp. 401-02
- Anon. 1957. ‘The Cruel Mother’ (Child 20B), in *The English and Scottish Popular Ballads*, ed. by Francis James Child, 5 vols (New York: The Folklore Press in Association with Pageant Book Company), vol. 1, p. 220

- Alker, Sharon, and Holly Faith Nelson. 2001. 'Marginal Voices and Transgressive Borders in Hogg's Epic *Queen Hynde*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 12: 25-39
- 2004. "'Ghastly in the Moonlight': Wordsworth, Hogg and the Anguish of War', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 15: 76-89
- 2006. 'James Hogg as Working-Class Autobiographer: Tactical Manoeuvres in a 'Memoir of the Author's Life'', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 17: 63-80
- 2009. 'Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author: An Introduction', in Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson (eds), *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author* (Farnham: Ashgate), pp. 1-20
- Anderson, Benedict. 2006 [1983]. *Imagined Communities* (London: Verso)
- Arnot, Hugo. 1785. *Collection and Abridgement of Celebrated Criminal Trials in Scotland, 1536-1784* (Edinburgh)
- Atkinson, David. 1992. 'History, Symbol, and Meaning in 'The Cruel Mother'', *Folk Music Journal*, 6.3: 359-80
- Bakhtin, Mikhail M. 1981. *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*, ed. by Michael Holquist, trans. by Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist (Austin: University of Texas Press)
- 1984 [1965]. *Rabelais and his World*, trans. by Hélène Iswolsky (Bloomington: Indiana University Press)
- 2004 [1986]. 'The Problem of the Text in Linguistics, Philology and the Human Sciences', in Mikhail M. Bakhtin (auth.), Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist

- (eds), Vern W. McGee (trans.), *Mikhail M. Bakhtin: Speech Genres and Other Late Essays* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2004 [1986]), pp. 103-31
- Barcus, James E. 1995. “‘When Beauty Gives Command, all Mankind must Obey!’: Gender Roles in Hogg’s *Mador of the Moor*’, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 6: 33-49
- 2005. ‘Introduction’, in James Hogg (auth.), James E. Barcus (ed.) *Mador of the Moor* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. xi-xlii
- Berger, Dieter A. 1988. ‘James Hogg as a Parodist in Verse: *The Poetic Mirror*’, in Gillian Hughes (ed.), *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference (Edinburgh 1985)* (Aberdeen), pp. 79-96
- Berger, John. 1972. *Ways of Seeing* (London: Penguin Books)
- Blair, Kirstie. 2013. ‘Introduction’, in Kirstie Blair and Mina Gorji (eds), *Class and the Canon: Constructing Labouring-Class Poetry and Poetics, 1750-1900* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan), pp. 1-15
- Bloedé, Barbara. 1992. ‘*The Three Perils of Woman* and the Edinburgh Prostitution Scandal of 1823: A Reply to Dr Groves’, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 3: 88-94
- Bold, Valentina. 1992. ‘Traditional Narrative Elements in *The Three Perils of Woman*’, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 3: 42-56
- 2007. *James Hogg: A Bard of Nature’s Making* (Oxford: Peter Lang)
- Brown, Callum G. 2006. ‘Religion’, in Lynn Abrams and others (eds), *Gender in Scottish History since 1700* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 84-110.



- Brown, J. Stewart. 2012. 'Religion and Society to c. 1900', in T. M. Devine and J. Wormald (eds), *The Oxford Handbook of Modern Scottish History* (Oxford: Oxford University Press), pp. 78-98
- Brown, Penelope, and Stephen Levinson. 1987. *Politeness: Some Universals in Language Usage* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press)
- Butler, Judith. 1997. *Excitable Speech: A Politics of the Performative* (New York: Routledge)
- Camden, Jennifer. 2010. *Secondary Heroines in Nineteenth-Century British and American Novels* (Farnham: Ashgate)
- Campbell, Ian. 2002 [2000]. 'Afterword', in James Hogg (auth.), P. D. Garside (ed.) *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 177-92
- Chambers, J. D. 1972. *Population, Economy and Society in Pre-Industrial England* (London: Oxford University Press)
- Child, Francis James (ed.). 1957. *The English and Scottish Popular Ballads*, 5 vols (New York: The Folklore Press in Association with Pageant Book Company)
- Christie, Christine. 2000. *Gender and Language: Towards a Feminist Pragmatics* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)
- Cohen, Stephen. 2007. 'Introduction', in *Shakespeare and Historical Formalism*, ed. by Stephen Cohen (Aldershot: Ashgate), pp. 1-27
- Cramond W. 1888. *Illegitimacy in Banffshire* (Banff)
- Culpeper, Jonathan. 1996. 'Towards an Anatomy of Impoliteness', *Journal of Pragmatics*, 25: 349-67

- Currie, Janette. 2010. “‘Betwixt the devil and the deep sea’: Hogg’s Harris Venture’, in James Hogg (auth.), H. B. de Groot (ed.) *Highland Journeys* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 231-42
- de Groot, H. B. 1995. ‘The Historicity of *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*’, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 6: 1-11
- 2010. ‘Introduction’, in James Hogg (auth.), H. B. de Groot (ed.), *Highland Journeys* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. xi-lxvii
- Devine, T. M. 2004 [2003]. *Scotland’s Empire 1600-1815* (London: Penguin Books)
- 2006a [1999]. ‘Highlandism and Scottish Identity’, in T. M. Devine (auth.), *The Scottish Nation 1700-2000* (London: Penguin Books), pp. 231-45
- 2006b [1999]. ‘The Parish State’, in T. M. Devine (auth.), *The Scottish Nation: 1700-2007* (London: Penguin Books), pp. 84-102
- Duncan, Ian. 1994. ‘Review of The Stirling/South Carolina Edition of James Hogg, Volume 2, *The Three Perils of Woman*’, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 5: 154-57
- 1997. ‘Scott, Hogg, Orality and the Limits of Culture’, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 8: 56-74
- 1998. ‘Review of The Stirling/South Carolina Research Edition of the Collected Works of James Hogg, Volume 6, *Queen Hynde*, ed. by Suzanne Gilbert and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1988)’, *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 9: 137-42
- 2004a. ‘Introduction’, in James Hogg (auth.), Ian Duncan (ed.), *Winter Evening Tales* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. xi-xli

- 2004b. 'Note on the Text', in James Hogg (auth.), Ian Duncan (ed.), *Winter Evening Tales* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 527-34
- 2007. *Scott's Shadow: The Novel in Romantic Edinburgh* (Princeton: Princeton University Press)
- Duncan, Ian, with Leith Davis, and Janet Sorensen. 2004. 'Introduction', in Ian Duncan, with Leith Davis, and Janet Sorensen (eds), *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 1-19
- Elphinstone, Margaret. 1992. 'The Brownie of Bodsbeck: History or Fantasy?', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 3: 31-41
- Enkvist, Nils Erik. 1991. 'On the Interpretability of Texts in General and of Literary Texts in Particular', in Roger D. Sell (ed.), *Literary Pragmatics* (London: Routledge), pp. 1-25
- Ferris, Ina. 2002. *The Romantic National Tale and the Question of Ireland* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press)
- Fielding, Penny. 2006. 'Burial Letters: Death and Dreaming in Hogg's 'Cousin Mattie'', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 16: 5-19
- Foucault, Michel. 1990. *The History of Sexuality: An Introduction*, vol. 1, trans. by Robert Hurley (New York: Vintage Books)
- Freedman, Jean R. 1991. 'With Child: Illegitimate Pregnancy in Scottish Traditional Ballads', *Folklore Forum*, 24.1: 3-18
- Garside, Peter D. 1995. 'Introduction', in James Hogg (auth.), Peter D. Garside (ed.), *A Queer Book* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. xi-xxxvii
- 2001. 'Hogg's *Confessions* and Scotland', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 12: 118-38

- 2006. 'The Origins and History of James Hogg's 'Donald Macdonald'', *Scottish Studies Review*, 7·2 (Autumn): 24-39
- Gavins, Joanna. 2007. *Text World Theory: An Introduction* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)
- Gifford, Douglas. 1976. *James Hogg* (Edinburgh: The Ramsay Head Press)
- 1982. 'The Development of the Fiction of James Hogg' (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Glasgow)
- Gilbert Sandra M., and Susan Gubar. 2000 [1979]. 'Preface to the First Edition', in *The Madwoman in the Attic: The Woman Writer and the Nineteenth-Century Literary Imagination*, 2nd edn (New Haven: Yale University Press), pp. xi-xiv
- Gilbert, Suzanne. 1997. 'Hogg's 'Kilmeny' and the Ballad of Supernatural Abduction', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 8: 42-55
- 2007. 'Editorial Notes to 'Donald Macdonald'', in James Hogg (auth.), Suzanne Gilbert (ed.), *The Mountain Bard* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 454-55.
- 2009. 'James Hogg and the Authority of Tradition', in Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson (eds), *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author* (Farnham: Ashgate), pp. 93-109
- 2012. 'Hogg's Reception and Reputation', in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Ian Duncan and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 37-45
- Gilbert, Suzanne, and Douglas S. Mack. 1998a. 'Introduction', in James Hogg (auth.), Suzanne Gilbert and Douglas S. Mack (eds), *Queen Hynde* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1998 [1824]), pp. xi-lxix

- 1998b. 'Note on the Text', in James Hogg (auth.), Suzanne Gilbert and Douglas S. Mack (eds), *Queen Hynde* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1998 [1824]), pp. 221-34
- Goode, Mike. 2009. *Sentimental Masculinity and the Rise of History, 1790-1890* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press)
- Graham, Henry Grey. 1906. 'Religious and Ecclesiastical Life', in Henry Grey Graham (auth.), *The Social Life of Scotland in the Eighteenth Century* (London: Black), pp. 267-392
- Gribben, Crawford. 2004. 'James Hogg, Scottish Calvinism and Literary Theory', *Scottish Studies Review*, 5·2, (Autumn): 9-26
- Grice, Herbert Paul. 1989. 'Logic and Conversation', in H. P. Grice (auth.), *Studies in the Way of Words* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press), pp. 22-40
- Groves, David. 1982. 'Myth and Structure in James Hogg's *The Three Perils of Woman*', *The Wordsworth Circle*, 13·4: 203-10
- 1986. 'Stepping Back to an Early Age: James Hogg's *Three Perils of Woman* and the *Ion* of Euripides', *Studies in Scottish Literature*, 21: 176-96
- 1987. 'James Hogg's *Confessions* and *Three Perils of Woman* and the Edinburgh Prostitution Scandal of 1823', *The Wordsworth Circle*, 18·3: 127-31
- 1988. *James Hogg: The Growth of a Writer* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press)
- 1992. 'Urban Corruption and the Pastoral Ideal in James Hogg's *Three Perils of Woman*', *Studies in Scottish Literature*, 27: 80-88

- Häcker, Martina. 1997. 'Literary Dialects and Communication in *The Tale of Old Mortality* and *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 8: 1-11
- Harris, Jason Mark. 2003. 'National Borders, Contiguous Cultures, and Fantastic Folklore in Hogg's *The Three perils of Man*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 14: 38-61
- 2008. *Folklore and the Fantastic in Nineteenth-Century British Fiction* (Aldershot: Ashgate)
- Hasler, J. Antony. 1988. 'Ingenious Lies: *The Poetic Mirror* in Context', in Gillian Hughes (ed.), *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference (Edinburgh 1985)* (Aberdeen), pp. 79-96
- 1990. '*The Three Perils of Woman* and John Wilson's *Lights and Shadows of Scottish Life*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 1: 30-45
- 2002. 'Introduction', in James Hogg (auth.), Antony Hasler and Douglas S. Mack (eds), *The Three Perils of Woman* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. xi-xliii
- Hendler, Glenn. 2001. *Public Sentiments: Structures of Feeling in Nineteenth-Century American Literature* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press)
- Hess-Lüttich, Ernest W. B. 1991. 'How Does the Writer of a Dramatic Text Interact with his Audience? On the Pragmatics of Literary Communication', in Roger D. Sell (ed.), *Literary Pragmatics* (London: Routledge), pp. 225-41
- Hughes, Gillian. 1982. 'The Critical Reception of *The Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *Newsletter of the James Hogg Society*, 1: 11-14

- 2000a. 'Introduction', in James Hogg (auth.), Gillian Hughes (ed.), *The Spy: A Periodical of Literary Amusement and Instruction* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. xvii-xlix
  - 2000b. 'James Hogg and the 'Bastard Brood'', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 11: 56-68
  - 2003. 'James Hogg, and Edinburgh's Triumph over Napoleon', *Scottish Studies Review*, 4·1, (Spring): 98-111
  - 2007. *James Hogg: A Life* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)
  - 2008. 'Essay on the Genesis of the Text', in James Hogg (auth.), Jill Rubenstein and others (eds), *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. xiii-xliii
  - 2012. 'Magazine, Annuals, and the Press', in *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg*, ed. by Ian Duncan and Douglas S. Mack (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 31-36
- Hume, David. 1965 [1739]. *A Treatise on Human Nature*, ed. by L. A. Selby-Bigge (Oxford: Clarendon Press)
- Inglis, Katherine. 2011. 'Maternity, Madness and Mechanization: The Ghastly Automaton in James Hogg's *The Three Perils of Woman*', in Deirdre Coleman and Hilary Fraser (eds), *Minds, Bodies, Machines: 1770-1930* (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan), pp. 61-82
- Innes, S., and J. Rendal. 2006. 'Women, Gender, and Politics', in Lynn Abrams and others (eds), *Gender in Scottish History since 1700* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 43-83

- Iser, Wolfgang. 1974. 'The Reading Process: A Phenomenological Approach', in Wolfgang Iser (auth.), *The Implied Reader: Patterns of Communication in Prose Fiction from Bunyan to Beckett* (Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press), pp. 274-94
- Jackson, Richard D. 2003. 'Gatty Bell's Illness in James Hogg's *The Three Perils of Woman*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 14: 16-29
- Kearns, Michael S. 1978. 'Intuition and Narration in James Hogg's *Confessions*', *Studies in Scottish Literature*, 13: 81-91
- Killick, Tim. 2004. 'Hogg and the Collection of Short Fiction in the 1820s', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 15: 21-31
- King, Judy, and Graham Tulloch. 2012. 'Introduction', in James Hogg (auth.), Judy King and Graham Tulloch (eds), *The Three Perils of Man or War, Women, and Witchcraft: A Border Romance* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. xi-lxiii
- Landsman, Ned C. 1985. 'A Scots Community: Settlement Patterns and Family Networks in the New World Environment', in *Scotland and its First American Colony, 1683-1765*, written by Ned C. Landsman (Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1985), pp. 131-62
- Leech, Geoffrey N. 1983. 'Pragmatics, Discourse Analysis, Stylistics and "the Celebrated Letter"', *Prose Studies*, 6·2: 142-57
- Leneman, Leah. 1999. 'Seduction in Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth-Century Scotland', *The Scottish Historical Review*, 78·1, no. 205, (April): 39-59



- Leneman, Leah, and Rosalind Mitchison. 1993. 'Acquiescence in and Defiance of Church Discipline in Early-Modern Scotland', *Records of the Scottish Church History Society*, 25: 19-39
- 1998. *Sin in the City: Sexuality & Social Control in Urban Scotland 1660-1780* (Edinburgh: Scottish Cultural Press)
- Letley, Emma. 1990. 'Some Literary Uses of Scots in *The Three Perils of Woman*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 1: 45-56
- Lindblom, Kenneth. 2001. 'Cooperating with Grice: A Cross-disciplinary Metaperspective on Uses of Grice's Cooperative Principle', *Journal of Pragmatics*, 33: 1601-23
- Lynch, Michael. 2003 [1992]. *Scotland: A New History*, reprint of revised edn (London: Pimlico)
- MacKay, Ross. 2001. 'The Scattered Ruins of Evidence: Non-Eventworthy History in *Old Mortality* and *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 12: 56-79
- Mack, Douglas S. 1976. 'Introduction', in James Hogg (auth.), Douglas S. Mack (ed.), *The Brownie of Bodsbeck* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1976 [1818]), pp. ix-xix
- 1984. 'Editing James Hogg' (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Stirling)
- 1988. 'Hogg, Blackwood and *The Shepherd's Calendar*', in Gillian Hughes (ed.), *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference (Edinburgh 1985)* (Aberdeen), pp. 24-31
- 1990a. 'Are We still Underestimating Hogg?', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 1: 1-5

- 1990b. 'Gatty's Illness in *The Three Perils of Woman*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 1: 133-35
- 1992. 'Hogg and the Blessed Virgin Mary', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 3: 68-75
- 1999. 'Revisiting *The Private Memoirs and Confessions of a Justified Sinner*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 10: 1-26
- 2006. *Scottish Fiction and the British Empire* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)
- 2008. 'Introduction', in James Hogg (auth.), Douglas S. Mack (ed.), *The Bush aboon Traquair and The Royal Jubilee* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. xi–lv
- 2009. 'Hogg's Bardic Epic: *Queen Hynde* and Macpherson's *Ossian*', in Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson (eds), *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author* (Farnham: Ashgate), pp. 139-55
- Malcolmson, R. W. 1977. 'Infanticide in the Eighteenth Century', in J. S. Cockburn (ed.), *Crime in England 1555-1800* (London: Methuen), pp. 187-209
- Mao, LuMing Robert. 1994. 'Beyond Politeness Theory: 'Face' Revisited and Renewed', *Journal of Pragmatics*, 21: 451-86
- Martin, Maureen M. 2009. *The Mighty Scot: Nation, Gender, and the Nineteenth-Century Mystique of Scottish Masculinity*. Albany: State University of New York Press.
- McClintock, Anne. 1995. *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Conquest* (New York: Routledge)

- McConnell-Ginet, Sally. 1998. 'The Sexual (Re)Production of Meaning: A Discourse-Based Theory', in Deborah Cameron (ed.), *The Feminist Critique of Language*, 2nd edn (London: Routledge), pp. 198-210
- McCracken-Flesher, Caroline. 2009. "'Perfectly Ludicrous": The Game of National Meaning in *The Three Perils of Man*', in Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson (eds), *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author* (Farnham: Ashgate), pp. 175-84
- McDonagh, Josephine. 2003. *Child Murder and British Culture, 1720-1900* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press)
- McEathron, Scott. 2012. 'Labouring-Class Poetry', in Frederick Burwick (ed.), Nancy Moore Goslee and Diane Long Hoeveler (associate eds), *The Encyclopedia of Romantic Literature* (Oxford: Blackwell), pp. 743-50
- McNeil, Kenneth. 2007. *Scotland, Britain, Empire: Writing the Highlands, 1760-1860* (Columbus: The Ohio State University Press)
- Mey, L. Jacob. 2000. *When Voices Clash: A Study in Literary Pragmatics* (Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter)
- 2001. *Pragmatics: An Introduction*, 2nd rev. and enlarged edn (Malden, MA: Blackwell)
- 2009a [2006]. 'Literary Pragmatics', in Jacob L. Mey (ed.), *Concise Encyclopedia of Pragmatics*, 2nd edn (Oxford: Elsevier), pp. 549-55
- 2009b [2006]. 'Pragmatic Acts', in Jacob L. Mey (ed.), *Concise Encyclopedia of Pragmatics*, 2nd edn (Oxford: Elsevier), pp. 747-53
- 2009c [2006]. 'Pragmatics of Reading', in Jacob L. Mey (ed.), *Concise Encyclopedia of Pragmatics*, 2nd edn (Oxford: Elsevier), pp. 775-79

- Mergenthal, Silvia. 2012. 'Hogg, Gender, and Sexuality', in Ian Duncan and Douglas S. Mack (eds), *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 82-89
- Mills, Sara. 2003. *Gender and Politeness* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press)
- 2009. 'Impoliteness in a Cultural Context', *Journal of Pragmatics*, 41: 1047-60
- Mitchison, Rosalind, and Leah Leneman. 1989. *Sexuality & Social Control: Scotland 1660-1780* (Oxford: Basil Blackwells)
- 1998. *Girls in Trouble: Sexuality and Social Control in Rural Scotland 1660-1780*, rev. edn of *Sexuality & Social Control: Scotland 1660-1780*, first published by Blackwells in 1989 (Edinburgh: Scottish Cultural Press)
- Morini, Massimiliano. 2009. *Jane Austen's Narrative Techniques: A Stylistic and Pragmatic Analysis* (Farnham: Ashgate)
- O'Halloran, Meiko. 2008. "'Circling the Pales of Heaven': Hogg and Otherworld Journeys from Dante to Byron", in James Hogg (auth.), Jill Rubenstein and others (eds), *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. lxxvii-ci.
- 2012. 'Hogg and the Theatre', in Ian Duncan and Douglas S. Mack (eds), *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 105-12
- Parker, Andrew, and Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick (eds). 1995. *Performativity and Performance* (New York: Routledge)
- Parr, Norah. 1980. *James Hogg at Home: Being the Domestic Life and Letters of the Ettrick Shepherd* (Dollar: Douglas S. Mack)

- Petrie, Elaine E. 1988. *Queen Hynde and the Black Bull of Norrway*, in Gillian Hughes (ed.), *Papers Given at the Second James Hogg Society Conference (Edinburgh 1985)* (Aberdeen), pp. 128-39
- Pettersson, Anders. 1990. *A Theory of Literary Discourse* (Lund: Lund University Press)
- 2000. *Verbal Art: A Philosophy of Literature and Literary Experience* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press)
- 2010. 'Meaning in Literature', *Neohelicon*, 37: 433-39
- 2012. 'Literary Practice', in Anders Pettersson (auth.), *The Concept of Literary Application: Reader's Analogies from Text to Life* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan,), pp. 163-85
- Pettersson, Bo. 2009. 'Three Fallacies in Interpreting Literature', in Jason Finch and others (eds.), *Humane Readings: Essays on Literary Mediation and Communication in Honour of Roger D. Sell* (Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company), pp. 145-56
- Pilkington, Adrian. 1991. 'Poetic Effects: A Relevance Theory Perspective', in Roger D. Sell (ed.), *Literary Pragmatics* (London: Routledge), pp. 44-61
- 2000. *Poetic Effects: A Relevance Theory Perspective* (Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company)
- (ed.) 1996. *Special Issue on Relevance Theory, Rhetoric, and Style, Language and Literature*, 5.3 (August): 157-230
- Pittock, Murray G. H. 1991. *The Invention of Scotland: The Stuart Myth and Scottish Identity, 1638 to the Present* (London: Routledge)

- 2002. 'Introduction', in James Hogg (auth.), Murray G. H. Pittock (ed.), *The Jacobite Relics of Scotland (First Series)* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. xi-xxxviii
- 2003a. 'Introduction', in James Hogg (auth.), Murray G. H. Pittock (ed.), *The Jacobite Relics of Scotland (Second Series)* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. xi-xix
- 2003b. 'Narrative Strategies in 'The Brownie of the Black Haggs'', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 14: 30-37
- 2008. *Scottish and Irish Romanticism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press)
- Pocock, J.G.A. 1985. *Virtue, Commerce, and History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press)
- Porter, A. Joseph. 1986. 'Pragmatics for Criticism: Two Generations of Speech Act Theory', *Poetics*, 15: 243-57
- Pratt, Mary Louise. 1977. *Toward a Speech Act Theory of Literary Discourse* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press)
- Radcliffe, David Hill. 2003. 'Crossing Borders: The Untutored Genius as Spenserian Poet', *John Clare Society Journal*, 22: 51-67
- Ragaz, Sharon. 2002. "'Gelding' the Priest in *The Brownie of Bodsbeck*: A New Letter', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 13: 95-103
- Reitzel, William. 1928. 'Sir Walter Scott's Review of Jane Austen's *Emma*', *PMLA*, 43.2 (June): 487-93
- Richardson, Thomas C. 2008. 'Introduction', in *Contributions to Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*, vol. 1, 1817-1828, written by James Hogg (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), pp. xiii-lxxx

- 2009. 'James Hogg and *Blackwood's Edinburgh Magazine*: Buying and Selling the Ettrick Shepherd', in Sharon Alker and Holly Faith Nelson (eds), *James Hogg and the Literary Marketplace: Scottish Romanticism and the Working-Class Author* (Farnham: Ashgate), pp. 185-99
- Rowland, Ann Wierda. 2004. "'The fause nourice sang': Childhood, Child murder, and the Formalism of the Scottish Ballad Revival', in Leith Davis, Ian Duncan, and Janet Sorensen (eds), *Scotland and the Borders of Romanticism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 225-44
- 2012. 'The Child is Father of the Man', in Ann Wierda Rowland (auth.), *Romanticism and Childhood: The Infantilization of British Literary Culture* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 25-66
- Rubenstein, Jill. 2008a. 'Editorial Notes to 'The field of Waterloo'', in James Hogg (auth.), Jill Rubenstein and others (eds), *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 212-21
- 2008b. 'Introduction', in James Hogg (auth.), Jill Rubenstein and others (eds), *Midsummer Night Dreams and Related Poems* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. xlv-lxxvi
- Scott, Walter. 2008 [1817]. *Rob Roy*, ed. by Ian Duncan, Oxford World's Classics (Oxford: Oxford University Press)
- 2007 [1814]. *Waverley*, ed. by P. D. Garside (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)
- 1815 [1808]. *Marmion: A Tale of Flodden Field*, 9th edn (Edinburgh: Archibald Constable) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 29 April 2014]

- Sedgwick, Eve Kosofsky. 2003. *Touching Feeling: Affect, Pedagogy, Performativity* (Durham: Duke University Press)
- Sell, Roger D. 1991a. 'Introduction', in Roger D. Sell (ed.), *Literary Pragmatics* (London: Routledge), pp. xi-xxiii
- 1991b. 'The Politeness of Literary Texts', in Roger D. Sell (ed.), *Literary Pragmatics* (London: Routledge), pp. 208-24
- 2000. *Literature as Communication: The Foundations of Mediating Criticism* (Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company)
- 2001. 'Decorum versus Indecorum in *Dombey and Son*', in Roger D. Sell (auth.), *Mediating Criticism: Literary Education Humanized* (Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company), pp. 165-93
- 2011. *Communicational Criticism: Studies in Literature as Dialogue* (Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company)
- Shakespeare, William. 2002 [1599]. *King Henry V*, ed. by T. W. Craik, The Arden Shakespeare, 2nd series (London: Thomson Learning)
- 2007 [1599]. *Julius Caesar*, ed. by David Daniell, The Arden Shakespeare, 3rd series (London: Routledge)
- Shepherd, W. G. 1992. 'Fat Flesh: The Poetic Theme of *The Three Perils of Man*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 3: 1-9
- Shields, Juliet. 2010. *Sentimental Literature and Anglo-Scottish Identity, 1745-1820* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press)
- Shumway, Suzanne Rosenthal. 1994. 'The Chronotope of the Asylum: *Jane Eyre*, Feminism, and Bakhtinian Theory', in Karen Ann Hohne and Helen Wussow



- (eds), *A Dialogue of Voices: Feminist Literary Theory and Bakhtin* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press), pp. 152-70
- Sinha, Mrinalini. 2004. 'Nations in an Imperial Crucible', in Philippa Levine (ed.), *Gender and Empire* (Oxford: Oxford University Press), pp. 181-202
- Smith, Adam. 1976 [1759]. *The Theory of Moral Sentiments*, ed. by D. D. Raphael and A. L. Macfie, Glasgow Edition of the Works and Correspondence of Adam Smith (Oxford: Clarendon Press)
- Smout, Christopher. 1980. 'Aspects of Sexual Behaviour in Nineteenth-Century Scotland', in P. Laslett and others (eds), *Bastardy and its Comparative History: Studies in the History of Illegitimacy and Marital Non-Conformism in Britain, France, Germany, Sweden, North-America, Jamaica, and Japan* (Harvard: Harvard University Press), pp. 192-216
- Sperber, Dan, and Deirdre Wilson. 1986. *Relevance: Communication and Cognition* (Oxford: Blackwell)
- St Clair, William. 2004. 'Reading, Reception, Dissemination', in William St Clair (auth.), *The Reading Nation in the Romantic Period* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), pp. 394-412
- Stevenson, David. 1988. *The Covenanters: The National Covenant and Scotland, Saltire Pamphlets*, n.s., 11 (Edinburgh: Lindsay & Co.)
- Symonds, Deborah A. 1997. *Weep not for Me: Women, Ballads, and Infanticide in Early Modern Scotland* (University Park, Pennsylvania: The Pennsylvania State University Press)

- Tait, William. 1840. *Magdalenism: An Enquiry into the Extent, Causes, and Consequences of Prostitution in Edinburgh*, 1st edn, (Edinburgh: P. Rickard, South Bridge) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 25 Aug 2012]
- 1842. *Magdalenism: An Enquiry into the Extent, Causes, and Consequences of Prostitution in Edinburgh*, 2nd edn (Edinburgh, Glasgow, and London: 1842) <<http://books.google.com>> [accessed 25 Aug 2012]
- Todorov, Tzvetan. 1973. *The Fantastic: A Structural Approach to a Literary Genre*, trans. by Richard Howard (Cleveland: Press of Case Western Reserve University)
- Towheed, Shafquat, William R. Owens, Rosalind Crone, and Katie Halsey. 2011. 'General Introduction', in Shafquat Towheed and others (eds), *The History of Reading: A Reader* (London: Routledge), pp. 1-8
- Trumpener, Katie. 1993. 'National Character, Nationalist Plots: National Tale and Historical Novel in the Age of *Waverley*, 1806-1830', *ELH*, 60: 685-731
- 1997. *Bardic Nationalism: The Romantic Novel and the British Empire* (Princeton: Princeton University Press)
- Tulloch, Graham. 2004. 'Writing "by advice": *Ivanhoe* and *The Three Perils of Man*', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 15: 32-52
- Ward, William S. (compiled by) 1977. *Literary Reviews in British Periodicals 1821-1826* (New York: Garland)
- Webb, Samantha. 2002. 'In-Appropriating the Literary: James Hogg's *Poetic Mirror* Parodies of Scott and Wordsworth', *Studies in Hogg and his World*, 13: 16-35

- Wills, Clair. 2001. 'Upsetting the Public: Carnival, Hysteria, and Women's Texts', in David Shepherd and Ken Hirschkop (eds), *Bakhtin and Cultural Theory*, 2nd edn (Manchester: Manchester University Press), pp. 85-108
- Wilson, Fiona. 2012. 'Hogg as Poet', in Ian Duncan and Douglas S. Mack (eds), *The Edinburgh Companion to James Hogg* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press), pp. 96-104
- Wilson, Kathleen. 2004. 'Empire, Gender, and Modernity in the Eighteenth Century', in Philippa Levine (ed.), *Gender and Empire* (Oxford: Oxford University Press), pp. 14-45
- Womack, Peter. 1989. *Improvement and Romance: Constructing the Myth of the Highlands* (Basingstoke: Macmillan)
- Wrightson, Keith. 1975. 'Infanticide in Earlier Seventeenth-Century England', *Local Population Studies*, 15: 10-22
- Wrigley, E. A. 1966. 'Family Limitation in Pre-Industrial England', *Economic History Review*, 2nd ser., 19: 82-109

### Online Databases

- Garside, P. D., J. E. Belanger, and S. A. Ragaz, *British Fiction, 1800–1829: A Database of Production, Circulation & Reception*, designer A. A. Mandal  
<<http://www.british-fiction.cf.ac.uk>> [accessed 3 May 2011]
- Karpenko, Tatyana. 1993. 'Pragmatic Aspects of Literary Communication', *Occasional Papers (3) PALA (The Poetic and Linguistic Association)*  
<<http://www.pala.ac.uk/resources/op/Paper03.pdf>> [accessed 13 October 2012]

Pateman, Trevor. 'Pragmatics in Semiotics: Bakhtin/Volosinov'  
<<http://www.selectedworks.co.uk/pragmatics.html>> [accessed 15 January  
2013] (para. 2 and 7 of 25), previously published in *Journal of Literary  
Semantics*, 18:3 (1989), 203-16