Older workers in the hospitality industry: valuing experience and informal learning

Roy Canning

Abstract

The research sets out to identify the learning processes adopted by older workers in the hospitality and visitor attraction industry in Scotland, with a view to determining how employers may better support their education and training within enterprises. The study was undertaken as part of the ESRC project on 'sustaining the employability of older workers in the hospitality sector: personal learning strategies and cultures of learning. The data collection period was from 2008-2010 and focused on six case studies; three in hospitality and three visitor attraction centres. The conceptual framework of the research is based upon the simple yet important notion of *experience* and how this enhances the learning lives of older employees. It will be argued that the learning processes used by older employees are primarily recognisable as *social practices,* based upon the utilisation of existing knowledge and skills. The analysis suggests that organisations should be encouraged to avoid using a 'one size fits all' approach to education and training and, in the case of older workers, to make more use of their past work and life experiences in order to facilitate their own and others' learning.

Introduction

There is an extensive literature on older workers and their experience of discrimination in the workplace. This discrimination often arises through the informal recruitment and selection practices of employers, the lack of access to formal training

1

(in comparison with younger workers) and the pressure to retire early in any economic downturn. The lifelong learning policy rhetoric also singles out the older worker as being disadvantaged by demographic trends, financial hardship and the lack of educational opportunity (Tuckett and McAulay 2005). This critique has a resonance with policy makers and does, indeed, reflect the experience of many older workers. However, there is another story to be told- one that is often omitted from the literature when discussing the experience of older workers. Put simply, many older workers enjoy their work and are valued by their employers, because they bring a type of experience to organisations that their younger counterparts are unable to offer. Namely, an accumulated lived experience of a lifetime of work. Indeed, it could be argued that, for particular organisations, this type of experience is invaluable and may result in a 'good fit' between the needs of the older worker and the employer. One such sector is the hospitality and visitor attraction industry, which uniquely combines an ageing customer base with the opportunity to employ a local and equally ageing workforce. However, like any other marriage of convenience, both employee and employer may have to make compromises in their working relationships, in order to gain the important benefits that can accrue to both parties.

A second, and equally intriguing, aspect to the discussion on the experience of older workers is the role played by formal learning in their education. Again, there would appear to be some important contradictions within the literature. For instance, older employees undertake less formal training yet take on more informal learning roles within their organisations. They have difficulty with new technology, yet older workers are the highest age band group to participate in computer-based educational courses (Aldridge and Tuckett 2007). They don't appear to strive for self-

development, or want to achieve qualifications as they get older, yet enjoy learning more, are self-confident and like meeting others *through* learning. Perhaps something not too unusual is happening here- that learning is becoming more informal, much more social and less amenable to measurement (Schuller and Watson 2009). A form of learning that may be more to do with the utilization of existing skills rather than the relentless acquisition of new ones.

The study explores the issue of how we may better identify, understand and support the learning of older workers within organisations. It will be argued that older workers' learning is primarily a social practice that relies upon the sharing of work and life experiences within organisations. The paper begins by describing the research methods used in the design of the study. A literature review then locates the research within a cross-disciplinary narrative that explores the nature of the phenomenon of experience, with particular reference to the work of Walter Benjamin (Bullock and Jennings 1996). Finally, the findings from the study are discussed, with the aim of identifying a number of emerging themes on how organisations may better support older workers' learning.

Literature and theoretical framing

To set the context for the study, it is important to acknowledge that older workers cannot be treated as a homogeneous group. Indeed, as researchers, we need to pay attention to the sheer diversity found in the older population (Chen et al 2008, Ferrier et al 2008 and Narushima 2008). It is also important to recognize that enterprises are very different from each other. The goodness of fit between an enterprise's skill needs and what older workers bring with them, and the ways the latter develop their

learning, depend critically on the specific organisational structure, business process, customer base, location, profitability and management style in the individual enterprise (Novotny 2006, Kump and Krasovec 2007, McNair 2008). Interestingly, much of the policy literature on older employees' education and training continues to emphasise formal training interventions and the achievement of qualifications, and not rather oddly the processes of informal and everyday learning (Chiva and Manthorpe 2009). This is not about privileging one over the other, or replacing one with the other (Boud et al 2009) but with considering the interplay between both the formal and informal aspects of learning at work. This finding should not be a surprise, as it supports the more recent literature on work-based learning that has emphasised 'expansive learning' approaches to workforce development (Felstead et al, 2009) the utilisation of skills (Warhurst et al, 2004) and a more balanced relationship between the supply and demand for skills within organisations (Evans, 2008). This informal learning may indeed reflect an ability to make reflective judgements that cannot be taught or acquired through training. As Biesta (2006) claims, this is about 'showing who you are and where you stand'. It is a relational aspect of learning that often requires collective competence (Boreham 2004 and Hager and Johnsson 2009) within a social context.

One of the defining characteristics of older workers is their accumulated *lived experiences*. This may sound rather obvious and banal, but nonetheless makes an interesting contrast with youth, 'for experience is the fruit of years'. In Latin *experientia* was denoted by 'trial, proof, or experiment'. This also embraced the notion of expereri (to try) which has the root of 'danger'. As Jay points out (Jay 2005: 10):

> There is a covert association between experience and peril, which suggests that it comes from having survived risks and learned something from the encounter (*ex* meaning a coming forth from).

The Greek word for experience is *empeiria*, which suggests an unmediated encounter with the empirical, and is often contrasted with the more privileged concepts of the theoretical and contemplative. Here, experience is more closely associated with the notion of *practice* and thus the abilities of 'to make' and 'to do', a practical knowledge that requires both *techni* and *phronesis* (Dunne 1993).

One of the more intriguing definitions of the word "experience" is to be found in the German language. The terms *Erlebnis* and *Erfahrung* both denote experience, but have totally different interpretations of the word. *Erlebnis* contains within it the root of life, and is sometimes translated as lived experience. This is often recognised as an immediate, pre-reflective and untheorised practice. In contrast, *Erfahrung* has been associated with the senses and with reason. However, this is an elongated notion of experience, based on a learning process that suggests a journey or adventure- an experience that is both collective and cumulative, and links to memory and a sense of what has gone before.

Older workers have clearly gathered the fruits of experience, and the ability to learn and evolve through practice (Luppi 2009). This, of course, does not always necessarily embrace the Aristotelian notion of practical wisdom. Experience can also bring forward the years of 'compromise, impoverishment of ideas, and lack of energy'. As a young Benjamin claimed, experience can be a 'mask of the adult that is expressionless, impenetrable and ever the same' (Bullock and Jennings 1996). However, we are reminded that age also brings with it 'the fields and vast palaces' of

the *memoria,* and the possibilities of learning through the association of past events and the trial and error of practice. The research used this broad definition of experience that encompasses the notion of *Erfahrung* and explored how this type of experience can be used by older workers to enhance their learning opportunities within organisations and assist others in learning.

Methodology

The research was undertaken as part of the 'sustaining the employability of older workers in the hospitality sector', a joint bilateral project with Griffith University in Brisbane. The data was collected over the period 2008-2010 and a case study methodology was employed based upon the hospitality sector and visitor attraction centres. The conceptual framework of the research is based upon the simple, yet important, notion of *experience* and how this enhances the learning lives of older employees and their co-workers.

The overall aim of the research was to better identify and understand the learning processes used by a sample of older workers in the hospitality industry in Scotland. This also involved identifying the educational practices of the organisations included in the study, with a view to recommending improvements to work based training practices. The research included both quantitative and qualitative methods and was structured into three distinct phases:

- consolidation of the existing literature on the notion of *experience*, with particular reference to the learning of older workers
- the use of cross-sectional case studies

- engagement with employer groups from the hospitality industry on how to support the learning of older workers.

There were six case study organisations and one pilot study. The case studies involved undertaking 30 interviews with older workers, line managers and Human Resource Managers from across the participating organisations. It was important here not to rely solely on self report mechanisms, but rather to encourage multiple perspectives of issues from different stakeholders (Billett and Van Woerkom 2008). With this in mind, the qualitative data was collected through interviewing groups of older workers, managers and Human Resource professionals. The number of interviewees by each organisation is given in Table 1 and Table 2. The identities of the organisations and the individuals involved have been kept confidential.

Insert tables 1 and 2

The companies represented in the study covered large international hotels, family owned leisure groups, outdoor tourist attractions and historical visitor centres. All were commercially owned organisations. The case studies are not intended to be representative of the sector, but rather to offer a more in-depth insight into the issues involved and to provide a basis for developing good practice for other enterprises in the industry.

'Older workers' in this context means primarily those who have retired from their main careers and are now employed in a different role in the hospitality industry, such as hotel concierges and visitor attraction guides, although some longstanding employees who have remained in employment after retirement age are also included.

The interviewees selected for the study may not therefore be particularly typical of older workers in the labour market, but rather represent those who have retired and returned to work. In the US this group are referred to as 'encore workers'. The ages of the older workers included in the research ranged from 50 (the UK government threshold to becoming an 'older worker') to 80+.

Case Studies

The first case study is a family owned hotel and leisure company. It is a large employer in the area and caters for both UK and overseas visitors. The interviewees were known to each other, and two in particular had a direct line management connection. At the outset, the older workers interviewed challenged our stereotypes of age. In particular, the HR and IT administrator brought with him extensive experience of computers and finance systems. This was not acquired from being employed in prior professional or technical roles, but from what had been learned indirectly on-the-job. This was a very practical set of skills that could be used in a very pragmatic problem solving way:

> I'm self taught and I find the accounts department will come and ask me can you give me a report on such and such....(Older Worker)...he actually designs the databases for us...he has a lot of experience that we tap into..(Human Resources).

For this older worker, learning is a social practice that involves sharing prior knowledge and experience with others. This can be experience of technical problems or life experiences that, for instance, may involve just keeping calm in stressful situations or being able to think 'out of the box':

> Well you actually kind of look out of the box and solve the problem..most of the time you have already been through this type of experience (Older Worker)....For example yesterday we had a few issues with staff...somebody really quite ill...I was flapping but to the older workers it was no big deal..they fixed it..calmly (Human Resources).

This ability by older workers to share experiences was often used by training departments as a developmental tool within their organisations:

> They're very good at passing on knowledge that they have (reference to older workers)...our training is of a buddy type....we train staff by actually shadowing other people....from watching our experienced workers (staff development)

In terms of learning approaches, older workers in this case study tended to learn on-the-job and through and with other people. This of course meant bringing their experience to problems and making judgements based upon the similarities and differences from past events. The managers of the older workers acknowledged this experience and valued it enormously- particularly the IT experience and the ability to communicate with a younger and international labour force. The managers also learned, through working with older people, not to assume a "one size fits all" approach to the training of staff. Rather, they recognised that different people offered different things to the organisation and that over time this mix would change, depending on age and experience.

The second case study is a large hotel located in Edinburgh. It is part of an international group, with a distinctive and popular brand. We were able to conduct six interviews, including three with older workers, an HR manager and two line managers. Like the previous case study, the managers highlighted the invaluable experience that older workers brought to the organisation and the contribution this made to the learning environment within the company. In particular, they identified the ability that older workers had in establishing good working relationships based upon a set of core values about how to be in the world:

> Well that's my philosophy.. treat everyone with respect and they will treat you as well with respect..you need to trust people..

This value-driven approach taken by older workers towards their working relationships often made it difficult for the organisations to shape their identities through corporate cultural training programmes. As one older worker explained:

> By the time you get to my age you are what you are and you know to some extent you are not as malleable as you have been in the past

This, at times, also presented problems for the training of older workers through the use of standardised and centralized training programmes:

> You go to these courses and you think..ah did this 20 years ago this is the same course it's just a different name..they simply don't hone it in to the people who really need it.

This assumption that there existed a 'deficit model' of skills, whereby everyone began with the same learning needs, irrespective of age and experience, was often challenged by the older workers in the interviews. They generally argued that learning was more about utilising existing skills, rather than continually acquiring new ones. This meant for them organising more personalised training events that reflected the diversity of learners within the organisations:

> They could do a pre-interview with us...finding out what skills we have..then using these skills..this would be much more beneficial

Most of the formal training courses, it was claimed, were designed for younger employees with little experience. It was acknowledged, however, that this 'revolving door' approach to training attracted a majority of younger staff and often was required to meet basic health and safety requirements.

The third and final hospitality case study is from a large international hotel located in the north of Scotland. Interestingly, the hotel combines a strong corporate culture alongside an equally strong local identity. The overseas employees living at the hotel come from over 20 countries from around the world. In contrast, the local staff had very close ties to the area and links with the surrounding social groupings, operating within a strong Highlands and Islands culture. This combination of the global and local provided an unexpected, yet interesting, dimension to the research.

Like the other case studies, the managers in the hotel valued highly the experience of older workers:

> I think in general they are more engaged...they've got more experience and ah think in general most of them are happy to share that.
>   and
> No ah think experience is very valuable…ehm tappin' in on older people's experiences and what they've done and how they can help us to do things.

Again, the managers acknowledge the important role older workers played in supporting younger employees, even to the extent of providing a family environment within their work surroundings. This often extended to social activities and the use of informal networks and support groups. It was noticeable here, that even within a global corporate culture, there existed equally strongly local and informal spaces of learning, based upon a form of kindred-ship.

One distinct advantage of employing older workers in this particular case study was their attachment to and knowledge of local geographical spaces. This sense of being an insider and having an accumulated knowledge and experience of the area was valued by the employer:

> It is good to have somebody in the team who has an extensive knowledge of the local area...the concierge has that...a knowledge of not only where

> restaurants are but how good they are....he knows the small things about places..something a younger person would not have...(local manager).

The concept of *Erfahrung* is apparent here, as older workers valued indigenous knowledge and were prepared to spend a considerable amount of time acquiring a detailed knowledge of the locality.

The visitor attractions are very different types of organisations from the hotels. They are mostly privately owned and feel much more like family organisations, with strong local identities and staff that have been with the companies for some considerable time. The first case study is an historical site that is a medium sized business, with an international reputation. The older workers are highly prized by the staff, as they value their flexibility and loyalty to the organisation:

> Older people are inclined to work through dislikes and find something positive out of it…they are also very reliable...they don't let you down…they will also vary their hours to help out..

All the staff talked about the positive working relationships that characterised the visitor attraction centre. In fact, they declared that 'we're like a close knit family'. This seemed very important, even in the area of training and development, where they would go off together as a group to visit other attractions in order to improve their organisation. Indeed, much of the learning was self-directed and team-based. The role of informal mentoring was also important, particularly with the guides who learned through watching and listening, while working with other tour members.

The second visitor attraction case study is an outdoor centre in the Highlands. It again has a strong family culture, with older workers providing informal learning support to

others. The managers of the attraction valued the older workers and the experience they offered to others, including the management staff:

> He is really experienced and I think sometimes I can learn more from him..

and

> People gather so much life experience from their other professions and they put it to good use when they work here....

and

> They don't want to just retire...because they feel that they have something to offer...they feel that their life experiences are valuable ...they enjoy the company of the other people here...

In the case of older workers, the HR managers emphasised the need to recruit people who already had extensive experience and, interestingly, strong personalities based upon clear values and work ethics. The issue here was often characterised as one about skill utilization rather than skill acquisition:

> The way that we are working with them (older workers) is that we are actually utilising the skills they've already got

Again much of the training for the older workers was highly personalised and team-based. Few of the older employees made any explicit connection between learning and the need to acquire nationally recognised qualifications:

> Many of the younger managers don't have the practical experience but have got the qualifications on paper....but this doesn't particularly help them with dealing with the issues from the job.

This did not mean that they wanted to avoid formal education, but rather saw no need to accredit such learning:

> I'm hoping to do a module at the Open University in Scottish history..because when people ask you questions it is good to have a more in depth knowledge about the subject.

The final case study is another historical site based in the outdoors. This again is a family type organisation employing many older workers who are retired from other jobs, with a basic pension. There is a strong local connection with an emphasis on older workers having an historical knowledge of the locality. The training of staff was also undertaken on an informal basis and involved team visits to other attractions:

> We describe it as a learning journey….we all went down the West Coast…then over to Edinburgh to visit a number of attractions.

The centre also used an informal coaching and mentoring system for new employees. Much of this development work was undertaken by the older workers. The entire culture of the organisation was older worker friendly and drew no distinction at all between younger and older workers. Indeed, the manager interviewed at the attraction saw no particular difficulties related to the age of employees. This, in fact, was a feature of all the interviews, with very few examples being offered of tensions between younger managers and older workers.

Discussion

Notwithstanding the sheer diversity of the participants and organisations in the study, there was clearly a match between the demands of the world of work in the hospitality and visitor attraction industries, and the experience and learning offered by older workers. The older employees in our research consistently offered their prior experience of work to support and assist in the learning of co-workers and managers. This was primarily concerned with the reframing of their existing knowledge and skills to meet the challenges of new workplace contexts. Here, it is possible to theorise learning as a *social process* (the need to integrate the individual with their social environment) - one dependent on the utilization of existing skills, rather than the acquisition of new ones. Within the work-based learning literature, the emphasis

on the acquisition of new knowledge is often underpinned by a 'deficit model' of skills. Instead, we would like to suggest that a 'ready formed' model of skill development could usefully be assumed for many older workers, based upon their previous work and life experiences within different organisational and social contexts. This 'ready formed' model also assumes that the most valuable educational interventions that can be made by organisations to support older workers, will primarily be concerned with the utilisation of existing knowledge and skills through work-based social practices that provide ample opportunities for co-learning. Here, learning is not acquired through assimilation but rather brought forth through responding to, or being responsive towards others. This understanding of learning as a social practice is especially relevant for older workers, who can offer a wealth of previous experience that can be used to support others within the workplace.

The data suggests a degree of tension between the perceptions of what older workers felt would be useful training for them and the approach to training adopted by their employers. Much of the training within the larger organisations was standardised and centralized. A one-size fits all approach was used to ensure common standards and an adherence to basic health and safety requirements. Often these formal courses were dominated by younger employees. Many of the older workers felt that their prior experience was not recognised in this formal training environment and believed that a more personalised learning approach would be more appropriate. This could simply mean a more learner-centred approach to training, or indeed a willingness to work with a diverse range of employees in a more flexible way. In reality, many of the older workers preferred on-the-job learning and team-based learning approaches, which emphasised interactivity, personalization and informal learning. This, of

course, meant bringing their experience to problems and making judgements based upon the similarities and differences from past events (Erfahrung).

It is also important to acknowledge the role older workers played in supporting younger employees, even to the extent of providing a family environment within their work surroundings. This often extended to social activities and the use of informal networks and support groups. This informal mentoring and coaching of other staff featured strongly in the social practices of the older workers. In essence, they became informal teachers and although not formally recognised as such, became part of the learning environment of the organisation. It is important here to acknowledge that learning for this age group can be better characterised as having an *exchange value,* rather than learning that is based simply upon the notion of consumption. It is not just about finding out what training older workers need, but also recognising that they will contribute to others' learning within the organisation, whether this is formalised or not. This is an important finding for workforce educators, given the labour intensive nature of the sector and the dominance of small and medium sized companies that are often geographically dispersed.

Another important finding from the research was the apparent absence of prejudices found towards older workers. Although we did not set out to surface any such discrimination, we found few examples of this happening in practice. In particular, the lack of inter-generational problems between older workers and younger managers was notable, which interestingly was a specific concern of the employer groups at the start of the study. However, a word of caution should be noted here concerning the potential for discrimination. One limitation of the study was the lack of analysis of

gender issues in exploring the learning opportunities afforded to older workers in the sector. There is evidence to suggest that in Scotland, access to workplace learning is unevenly distributed with many women in part-time low paid jobs having fewer opportunities to undertake formal training (Small and Rabb 2003, Riddell et al 2009). Further research into age related issues connected with gender and ethnicity would be welcome here, given the likely growth in numbers of older workers employed within the hospitality and tourism industry.

Although absent from much of the workplace learning literature, an important issue emerging from the study was the significance attached by the older workers to their relationship with *place.* This may, of course, be a distinct feature of the hospitality and visitor attraction sector; nevertheless there was a strong attachment to locality based on the age of the workforce. For many of our older workers *place* mattered and offered the opportunity to pass on their experience and learning to others and, consequently, to support their own development through feeling more valued by others. Local knowledge was recognised as powerful knowledge and valued by customers and co-workers alike. Many of the older workers in the study deliberately invested time and their own money in upgrading their personal knowledge of the local area, in order to be helpful and informative to others. This local knowledge was also used to support and advise co-workers, particularly those from overseas. An interesting future research topic here is the theorizing of how 'local knowledge is produced, recognised and employed in educational practices' (Walter 2009) particularly in the tourist and hospitality industries.

Of course, much of the social learning that takes place by older employees' remains largely invisible, when using traditional methods of assessing workplace educational outcomes. The older workers often learned *through* supporting others, by participating in social work-based activities and offering their accumulated work and life experiences in a flexible way within the organisations. This type of learning rarely appears in the sector's annual training statistics, which are normally based upon the number of formal days of training completed by employees in the past quarter, or the number of formal qualifications achieved. What counts in terms of measuring lifelong learning is a contested issue and it is generally recognised that broader and more informal measures of learning are required. If the informal social practices of learning are not directly measured in the annual statistical returns, they should at least be identified as an important informal source of learning that impacts positively on particularly age groups within the workforce. Perhaps by becoming more visible in terms of measurement (or non-measurement in this case) older workers' learning may become more valued by organisations and, in turn, acknowledged more explicitly within adult education policy discourses.

Conclusion

The case study examples of older workers' learning help us understand how organisations and governments may better support workforce development practices in the sector. We have theorised here that, for this group of workers, learning can be better thought of as a set of *social practices,* based upon the sharing of accumulated lived experiences (Erfahrung). The type of learning, we have argued, is not particularly based upon a deficit model of skill acquisition but rather a 'ready formed' model of development, that focuses upon the utilization of existing knowledge and

skills. Indeed, a model that conceptualises learning as having an exchange value, rather than one simply based upon the notion of the consumption of goods, albeit educational services. This exchange dimension posits a relational aspect of learning with work and acknowledges that social and work practices can be developed and enhanced *through* learning.

The more useful learning activities engaged with by the older workers in the case studies tended to be informal, group-based and involve an element of personalisation. The less useful learning interventions were the more formal and standardised training courses, and those involving certification and qualification processes. It was also about valuing and utilizing existing skills and knowledge that have been accumulated over time, rather than continually prioritising re-skilling. For organisations in the hospitality and visitor attraction sector, an important question in this respect is "how can informal learning be fostered as part of their workforce development strategy?" The case studies provide useful insights here, as they identify the social processes of learning that can be encouraged by employers, alongside the more formal mentoring roles adopted by older workers. There is also a need for further research into the importance of local knowledge within the skill-sets possessed by older workers, and the attractiveness of such skills for employers in the hospitality and visitor attraction industries.

Finally, it is important to restate the limitations of the study. The overall data-set is a complex one. and the themes identified represent a range of different perspectives from, at times, competing sources. It is, therefore, not possible in these circumstances to claim that the findings are uniform across all the interviews. However, it was

noticeable that the notion of experience and learning as a social practice was highly valued by the vast majority of interviewees. Differences within the respondent groups tended to emerge mainly around the issue of fairness, with employers emphasising the importance of being seen to treat all employees with a degree of fairness, irrespective of age, race or gender. The exclusive use of qualitative data within the study is also a limitation and points to the need to gather additional quantitative data, in order to make more general statements about the population of learners under consideration. It has also not been possible to discern the more nuanced trends in equality and diversity issues when considering these cohorts of learners, although the larger longitudinal labour force data-sets do provide evidence that discrimination persists towards women, in particular, part-time employees across the workforce. Although the issue of age discrimination did not explicitly emerge from the research data, this may simply reflect that the appropriate research questions were not used within the study to surface such discrimination. It is entirely feasible to postulate from other studies, that age discrimination may be linked to heath issues later in life and that more physically demanding work may be used by employers to exclude older workers from undertaking particular types of employment. It should also be acknowledged that the older workers included within the study are within a sector that generally values older employees, unlike perhaps other sectors of the economy, for instance the IT sector.

References

Aldridge, F. and Tuckett, A. (2007) *What Older People Learn*, (Leicester: National Institute of Adult Continuing Education).

Billett, S. and Van Woerkom, M (2008) Personal epistemologies and older workers, *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, **27**, 3, 333-349.

Biesta, G.J.J. (2006). *Beyond learning. Democratic education for a human future.* (Boulder, Co: Paradigm Publishers).

Boreham, N. (2004) A theory of collective competence: challenging the neo-liberal individualization of performance at work, *British Journal of Educational Studies*, **52**, 5-17.

Boud, D., Ronney, D. and Solomon, N. (2009) Talking up learning at work: cautionary tales in co-opting everyday learning, *International Journal of Lifelong Education* **28**, 3, 323-334.

Bullock, M. and Jennings, M. (eds) (1996) *Benjamin, W. Selected Writings Vol 1. 1913-1926*, (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press).

Chen, L., Kim, Y., Moon, P. and Merriam, S. (2008) A review and critique of the portrayal of older adult learner in adult education journals, 1980-2006. *Adult Education Quarterly*, **59**, 3, 3-21

Chiva, A. and Manthorpe, J. (Ed) (2009) *Older Workers in Europe* (Maidenhead: Open University Press)

Dunne, J. (1993) *Back to the Rough Ground*, (London: University of Notre Dame Press).

Evans, K. (2008) *Putting Knowledge to Work*, Teaching and Learning Research Briefing (Swindon: ESRC)

Felstead, A., Fuller, A., Jewson, N. and Unwin, L. (2009) *Improving Working as Learning* (London: Routledge).

Ferrier, F., Burke, G. and Selby Smith, C. (2008) *Skills development for a diverse older workforce*, (Monash University, Australia: A National Vocational Education and Training Research and Evaluation Programme Report).

Hager, P. and Johnsson, M.C. (2009) Learning to become a professional orchestral musician: going beyond skill and technique, *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, **61**, 2, 103-119.

Jay, M. (2005) *Songs of Experience*, (London: University of California Press).

Kump, S. and Krasovec, S. (2007) Education: a possibility of empowering older workers, *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, **26**, 6, 635-651.

Luppi, E. (2009) Education in old age: an exploratory study, *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, **28**, 2, 241-277.

McNair, S. (2008) *Demography and Lifelong Learning*, Inquiry into the Future for Lifelong Learning, (Leicester: National Institute of Adult Continuing Education)

Narushima, N. (2008) Heterogeneity of older people: need for education, *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, **27**, 6, 673-693.

Novotny, V. (2006) *Older People and Employment in Scotland*, Centre for Lifelong Learning, (Glasgow: University of Strathclyde).

Riddell, S., Ahlgren, L. And Weedon, E. (2009) Equity and Lifelong Learning: lessons from workplace learning in Scottish SMEs, *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, **28**, 6, 777-795.

Schuller, T. And Watson, D. (2009) *Learning through Life: inquiry into the future of lifelong learning* (Leicester: NIACE).

Small, G. and Rabb, G. (2003) On-the-job training in Scotland: its contribution to social exclusion *Journal of Adult and Continuing Education* **8**, 2, 132-146

Tuckett, A. and McAulay, A. (2005) *Demography and Older Learners*, (Leicester, National Institute of Adult Continuing Education).

Walter, P. (2009) Local knowledge and adult learning in environmental adult education: community-based ecotourism in southern Thailand, *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, **28**, 4, 513-532

Warhurst, C., Grugulis, I. and Keep, E. (2004) *The Skills That Matter* (London: Palgrave Macmillan)